

## **PROFILE I**

### **JAMAICA**

**FEBRUARY 4, 2003**

<b>Program name:</b>	Post-Secondary Education Program (Post-Ed)		
<b>Program number:</b>	JA-0125		
<b>Country team:</b>	Leader: Michelle Fryer (RE3/SO3); other members: Mario Loterszpil (RE3/SO3); Everett Allen (COF/CJA); Sabine Aubourg (COF/CTT); Valnora Leister (LEG/OPR); and Amparo Omana (RE3/SO3) also assisted in the preparation of this document.		
<b>Borrower:</b>	Government of Jamaica (GOJ)		
<b>Executing agency:</b>	Ministry of Education, Youth and Culture (MOEYC)		
<b>Financing plan:</b>	IDB:	US\$	16,000,000
	Local:	US\$	4,000,000
	Total:	US\$	20,000,000
<b>Tentative dates:</b>	Next mission:	1 <sup>st</sup> Quarter, 2003	
	Analysis mission:	3 <sup>rd</sup> Quarter, 2003	
	Board of Directors:	4 <sup>th</sup> Quarter, 2003	

## **I. BACKGROUND**

- 1.1 To overcome its current macro-economic problems and to move forward in the coming years, the Government of Jamaica (GOJ) considers the development of a skilled and well-educated labor force to be indispensable for economic growth and prosperity. Increasingly, workers in Jamaica have to compete with workers in other countries in the context of a world economy that places a premium on strong basic skills, opportunities for lifelong learning, and the ability to adapt, problem solve, and communicate in diverse settings. The demands of the information intensive, knowledge-based, global economy have vastly increased the need for greater access to quality post-secondary education and technical training in Jamaica; and Community Colleges (CCs) constitute the fastest growing segment of the tertiary system. Nevertheless, rapid growth of the Colleges during the

1990s has resulted in challenges of relevance, efficiency, flexibility, and effectiveness. To become economically viable, CCs must provide education at an affordable cost and with maximum sensitivity and responsiveness to both customer and client needs. They are deeply committed to focusing program priorities and offerings to meet the needs of nation building.

## A. The education sector

- 1.2 ***Enrollment.*** Since independence in 1962, the Government of Jamaica has had considerable success in delivering educational services. The country has constructed a complete education system from pre-school<sup>1</sup> to postgraduate university, and universal primary education has been achieved<sup>2</sup>. At the secondary level, Government is presently focusing on quality improvement and the expansion of secondary coverage<sup>3</sup> with the objective of achieving full cohort access by 2007. Presently, 16.5%<sup>4</sup> of the population flows from pre-school through the post-secondary/tertiary levels.
- 1.3 ***Post-Secondary Education.*** Until 1990, Jamaica's post-secondary education<sup>5</sup> system was limited to nine Teachers' Colleges, four Community Colleges, and one regional university. At that time, both Teachers' Colleges and Community Colleges were non-degree granting institutions. The mission of the Teachers' College was to provide a three-year diploma for entry-level teachers; while community colleges provided a two-year pre-university program that would prepare the best secondary school graduates to take Advanced Proficiency examinations for University placement.
- 1.4 Since 1990, the post-secondary system has begun a process of transformation in response to the demand for increased access to pre-university preparatory education, as well as technical degree training and continuing adult education. Today, a variety of post-secondary programs are offered in tertiary institutions. The University of West Indies offers undergraduate and post-graduate programs in the faculties of Agriculture, Arts and Education, Law, Medicine, Social Sciences and Natural Sciences. Five Teachers' Colleges offer professional training in teacher education for early childhood, primary, secondary, and special education. Five Community Colleges and two Multi-disciplinary Colleges<sup>6</sup> offer pre-university, professional, commercial, and vocational training as well as community-oriented courses. In addition, there are several small institutions

<sup>1</sup> With a net enrollment of rate of approximately 93% (144,000) of the 3-5 age cohort, Jamaica's early childhood education program has the highest coverage in the region.

<sup>2</sup> In 2000/2001, primary level enrollment in Grades 1-6 was about 99% (312,000). (MOEYC, 2002)

<sup>3</sup> In 2000/2001, secondary enrollment in grades 7-9 was about 95% (228,000) and 77% (78,112) in grades 10-11. (MOEYC, 2002)

<sup>4</sup> Post-secondary gross enrollment, including adult students at all levels. (MOEYC, 2002)

<sup>5</sup> Reference to post-secondary education in this document refers to all post-grade 11 education, including tertiary.

<sup>6</sup> Bethlehem Moravian College and Moneague College (former Teachers' Colleges, whose course offerings have been expanded to include other subjects, but which do not grant Associate-level degrees);

(such as the College of Agriculture, Sciences, and Education, the G.C. Foster College of Physical Education, and the Edna Manley College of Visual and Performing Arts) that offer highly specialized programs. The distribution of enrollment at the post-secondary level during the period 2000/2001 follows:

INSTITUTIONS <sup>7</sup>	ENROLLMENT
Teachers' Colleges (5)	3,027
Multi-Disciplinary Colleges (2)	1,511
Special Colleges <sup>8</sup> (2)	654
Community Colleges (5)	4,735
College of Agriculture, Science, and Education (CASE); Universities <sup>9</sup> (2)	716
	15,111
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>25,754</b>

- 1.5 The diversification of post-secondary education from a system that was largely oriented to the preparation of teachers and academics, to a more flexible system with a greater range of degree options, has attracted a considerable cadre of students. It has also resulted in the establishment of a second national university, the University of Technology, which offers technical programs in various disciplines; Northern Caribbean University, a private denominational university; and a plethora of private and off-shore tertiary-degree programs, both accredited and non-accredited.<sup>10</sup>
- 1.6 In part, the transformation of the system is testimony to the value that Jamaicans place on educational opportunities. It has also evolved in response to the need for greater coverage, in terms of both access and program variety, than offered through the regional university. Nevertheless, while this transformation shows some level of responsiveness to the public demand for continuing education, the community college system remains, by and large, supply driven. According to a recent MOEYC report<sup>11</sup>, the demand for post-secondary education on behalf of both students and employers is high, however, a mismatch of program offerings with demand, timetabling constraints, and inefficient utilization of physical space have resulted in some community colleges working at approximately 40% under-capacity.

<sup>7</sup> MOEYC Educational Digest, 2000/2001.

<sup>8</sup> G.C. Foster College of Physical Education & Sports and Edna Manley College of the Visual & Performing Arts are small colleges that specialize in a thematic area and offer both Associate as well as Bachelor's Degrees.

<sup>9</sup> University of the West Indies (UWI), University of Technology (UTech).

<sup>10</sup> Data on student participation in private tertiary programs varies greatly by source, and will need to be dimensioned under the proposed diagnostic study to be financed through the TC.

<sup>11</sup> Policy Analysis and Research Unit (2000).

- 1.7 ***Vocational Education and Training.*** Besides the technical education programs offered in the University of Technology and the College of Agriculture, Sciences, and Education, HEART Trust/National Training Agency (HEART/NTA) is the primary provider of short-term, entry-level vocational skills training for school leavers in the 17-24 age group. Programs offered by HEART/NTA are financed largely through a levy of 3% of the wage cost of enterprises. They are open to individuals with at least a grade-9 education. In 1999/2000, the skill training programs of HEART/NTA had a total enrollment of approximately 31,000 trainees. In addition, there are a number of private providers that offer training in an uncoordinated fashion. Although post-secondary technical education is not part of HEART's mandate, the successful expansion of the sub-sector will be most effective if articulated with HEART programs for secondary school leavers and secondary-level technical and vocational training.

## **B. Constraints**

- 1.8 ***Tertiary policy.*** Jamaica's current tertiary education policy was developed in the 1980s with a focus on "academic" university education. Since then, MOEYC commissioned several "issues papers" focusing on sector efficiency, effectiveness, and expansion. While these papers emphasized the need to rationalize provision within the context of an updated tertiary policy, the diagnostic work required to inform new policy was not initiated. As a result, the growth of Jamaica's post-secondary system has evolved in a somewhat ad-hoc fashion, and remains largely supply-driven. Recognizing the importance of establishing a modern policy framework that is demand driven, MOEYC has requested Bank assistance to articulate Jamaica's tertiary policy with the needs of business and industry for quality technical, non-university education.
- 1.9 ***A case for rationalization.*** A recent review by MOEYC<sup>11</sup> indicates that there is significant fragmentation, duplication, and lack of articulation of programs in some sub-sectors of the education and training system. In 1996, a task force on institutional strengthening of Community Colleges<sup>12</sup> concluded that a better use of resources could be achieved by clarifying the role and functions of the Colleges. Because of a lack of clarity, there is also duplication in the programs offered by Community Colleges, secondary schools, HEART Trust/NTA, and the Teachers' Colleges. Teachers' Colleges report that many of their programs are small in size, with low enrollments, and thus produce relatively high unit costs. In addition to the duplication of under-subscribed programs across the system, there is also a lack of articulation among programs at the certificate, diploma, and degree levels. The opportunity costs associated with not being able to transfer credits from one program to another is extremely high, and serves as a disincentive for continuing education and professional development.
- 1.10 ***Unit cost for post-secondary.*** In 2000/2001, Government budgetary allocations to the tertiary education sector, including adult and continuing education,

---

<sup>12</sup> MOEYC Tertiary Unit, 1996.

consumed J\$3,373 million or 18.31% of the total education budget. The relative unit cost of post-secondary education in Jamaica is about 15 times that of primary, and about two to three times that of several Latin American countries (which ranged between 5.0-6.9).<sup>13</sup> This is primarily because of the small size and low enrollment in many post-secondary programs, and low student-teacher ratios.

- 1.11 ***Demand vs. supply.*** With the enhancement of primary education and the current expansion of secondary education, the demand for relevant technical education from qualified students and employers outpaces supply. This situation is further accentuated by the lack of appropriate mechanisms and weak capacity of the colleges to develop the demand-driven programs that are required to fuel the country's economic growth. Because of a lack of flexibility and adaptability, post-secondary technical education at the CC level has lagged behind the changing skill demands of the economy. Overall, while the sector falls short of meeting the needs of some expanding industries, technical programs in slow-growing industries dominate it.
- 1.12 Jamaica has requested Bank loan resources to build a dynamic post-secondary education system that is in line with Jamaica's industrial policy, which is responsive to the needs of an evolving labor market, and which extends opportunities for participation to all social and economic groups, including the poor. As a next step in the construction of an educated, skilled, and competitive human resource base, GOJ has requested a loan from the Bank to transform the system from supply driven to demand driven, including the development and implementation of a comprehensive strategy to enhance relevance and efficiency, to improve articulation and cost-effectiveness, to enhance coordination, to upgrade staff and facilities, and to extend access within the context of a modern tertiary policy.

### **C. The country's sector strategy**

- 1.13 Human development is at the center of Jamaica's push for sustainable economic transformation, and education is the engine that drives the process. In its White Paper, Education: The Way Forward (MOEYC 2000), Government expresses its commitment to engage its citizenry in partnership for development through education and training. At the post-secondary/tertiary level, pressure will be placed on the system to: (i) increase opportunities for access and enrollment through capacity expansion and new technologies; (ii) improve quality provision through the development of standards and expanded accreditation services; (iii) increase opportunities for life-long learning through the establishment of an articulated system for the transfer of credits, degrees, certificates, and diplomas; (iv) increase internal efficiency through the rationalization of programs; and (v) improve external efficiency through strong linkages with the service and production sectors, and the alignment of programs with demand.

---

<sup>13</sup> Education In Jamaica: Policy Issues And Financing Strategies, Mun Tsang, 2001.

- 1.14 GOJ's broad vision of post-secondary education and technical training focuses on: rationalization of programs and resources; increased participation; more responsive/client-oriented modes of delivery; mechanisms for management and coordination; articulation, accreditation, and regulation; responsiveness to labor market needs, coherence and efficiency; consideration of the technological demands of the modern workplace; and active private-sector partnership in program development and delivery. It is aimed at the gap in the education system between secondary education and university. It supports the development of an accredited Community College system that is fully articulated with academic institutions of higher learning as well as the secondary education system, HEART/NTA, and the employment sector. Community colleges would become good, cost-effective alternatives for secondary school graduates who are either not able or not interested in continuing their education at university. A network of Community Colleges would also provide a response to the longer-term employment and manpower needs of the society. These institutions would offer clear advantages in terms of cost, proximity, quality, flexibility, better articulation to both prospective employers and secondary schools, and a more technical/practical orientation of courses. Even for students who wish to pursue a professional career, a community college would become a feasible entree into tertiary education, making it possible to transfer later to a traditional program.
- 1.15 Through the expansion of student services for associate degrees, CCs will be able to become relevant players in the tertiary sector in Jamaica. In addition to being the primary providers in key program areas such as pre-university "A levels", information technology, applied health sciences, tourism and hospitality, telecommunications, agriculture, and applied and performing arts, Community Colleges are well positioned to become the most important linking institutions between the craft/vocational level courses offered by Heart Trust/NTA, other public and private educational providers and the baccalaureate/professional degree programs offered by the Universities. GOJ's program would also enhance the capacity of Community Colleges to franchise a greater proportion of entry-level university courses, thus enabling the University of West Indies (UWI) and the University of Technology (UTech) to potentially expand their intake of upper-level students and focus more on research. In addition, it would provide the Community College system with extended opportunities to offer diplomas for middle-level supervisory skills, and associate degrees in many new areas that are currently underdeveloped, but which hold tremendous potential for generating new employment opportunities, goods, and services.

#### **D. The Bank's strategy and rationale for involvement**

- 1.16 The Bank's strategy in Jamaica, as described in the country paper (GN-2025), has two overriding objectives: (i) to support the establishment of a sound macroeconomic environment; and (ii) to promote an improved environment for long-term private sector-led growth and development, paying particular attention to the strengthening of social sector performance, among others. In support of the above objectives, there is an urgency to increase the efficiency, cost-effectiveness,

and access to demand-driven post-secondary education and technical training opportunities through the development of a viable community college system. These colleges could also provide one response to the longer-term employment and manpower needs of the society by facilitating the flow of beneficiaries from other IDB and World Bank programs in youth development, social safety net reform, and primary and secondary education, into the world of work. (See below section for a broader description.)

#### **E. Experience of the Bank and other development partners**

- 1.17 In the education sector, the Bank is actively supporting Jamaica's efforts to upgrade early childhood policy through the provision of TC resources to monitor the developmental status of young children upon their entry into primary school. (Profiles of the Learning Environments of Young Children, ATN/SF-5629-JA). Under the current Primary Education Support Program (1264/OC-JA), the Bank is also supporting Jamaica's renewed emphasis on giving each child a strong basic education as reflected in improved rates for literacy, numeracy, and attendance. At the secondary level, World Bank funding for the Reform of Secondary Education II program has enabled Jamaica to address inequities in educational quality and access through the establishment of a common core program for the first three grades of secondary school, and the provision of universal secondary access by 2007. In post-secondary/tertiary education, the Bank has provided loan resources to strengthen the professional capacity of University of the West Indies (RG-0038) to deliver programs in science and technology, to conduct research, to extend distance education, and to enhance its library.
- 1.18 The main international partner agency in the area of vocational education is the Deutsche Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit (GTZ), which has been providing technical assistance to HEART/NTA for the reform of vocational training. Specialized training in telecommunications will also be delivered through the new Information and Communication Technology Project (JA-0116). Presently, the Bank is preparing a new Youth Development Project (JA-0119) to upgrade the skills of youth who are not attached to the formal education system, in order to prepare them for the labor market.
- 1.19 Under a separate Technical Cooperation project (TC-0201047), diagnostic studies and stakeholder workshops will be initiated to assist MOEYC clarify its vision and priorities for the articulation and expansion of Jamaica's post-secondary education sector, including: non-university technical education, general academic education, continuing adult education, student services, and higher education. The studies to be conducted include: (i) Post-secondary Education and Training Sector Assessment; (ii) Analysis of Policy and Legislative Framework; and (iii) Labor Market Dynamics. The results of the project will inform MOEYC efforts to rationalize teachers' college and community college programs within the context of a fully articulated post-secondary system, including the expansion of opportunities for specialized technical education, skills certification, and life-long learning. A key feature of post-secondary education is its multi-sector nature,

thus requiring an integrated approach to public/private sector partnership; hence the conduct of extensive stakeholder workshops will play a central role in informing MOEYC's strategy. .

## II. PROGRAM OBJECTIVE AND DESCRIPTION

### F. Program Goal and objectives

- 2.1 The goal of the program is to contribute to the establishment of a dynamic post-secondary education system that is in line with Jamaica's industrial policy, and responsive to the needs of an evolving labor market. To achieve this goal, the program will enhance quality through the introduction of uniform standards; increase cost-effectiveness through the rationalization of post-secondary programs and institutions; improve internal efficiency through the articulated movement of students within and between levels of the secondary and tertiary system; and optimize relevance through the establishment of sustainable mechanisms for private-sector articulation and participation.
- 2.2 The following program description is illustrative. The final breadth and scope of Bank support will be determined as an outcome of the diagnostic studies described in ¶1.19 above.

### A. Program Description

- 2.3 **Component 1: Quality Enhancement and Relevance.** This component will provide resources for technical assistance, training, materials and equipment to: (i) Rationalize and expand adult and continuing education programs, student services, general studies, technical education, and intervention programs in line with demand. (ii) Develop diversified curriculum that closely aligns post-secondary technical education with the expectations of communities and the labor market. (iii) Modernize teaching and learning through improved programs, instruction and assessment methodologies, use of technologies, replenishment of learning resources, and the expansion of educational services. (iv) Professionally develop principals, teaching and learning staff, administrators and support personnel, including student services staff. (v) Develop learning outcomes and competency-based standards for technical education across sectors, in close collaboration with the business and industry.
- 2.4 **Component 2: Policy and Institutional Strengthening.** This component will provide resources for technical assistance, training, materials, and equipment to: (i) Establish mechanisms and incentives to broaden private sector investment in the sector, and to provide MOEYC with continuous information on workforce demands and trends. (ii) Inform the development of a modern tertiary policy that aligns governance, accreditation, certification, and other regulatory frameworks under MOEYC and the various councils and agencies. (iii) Strengthen MOEYC, regulatory bodies, coordination bodies, and the CCs. (iv) Facilitate the articulation and integration of the post-secondary general education and technical



- training systems at all levels, including school to work programs. (v) Support Colleges' upgrading of EMIS capacity, and their integration into MOEYC's wide-area network in order to meet administrative and academic needs of the system. (vi) Update human resource policies, including recruitment, salaries, and incentives for CC teaching and management personnel.
- 2.5 **Component 3: Physical Plant, Furniture, and Equipment.** The program will provide resources for enhanced learning environments, and the rehabilitation, upgrading, and replacement of existing plants, furniture, equipment, and laboratories. A rationalization plan for existing infrastructure and resources, to be conducted during program preparation, will precede the design of this component.
- 2.6 **Component 4: Monitoring and Evaluation.** Loan resources will be provided to: (i) Establish a monitoring system of program outcomes within MOEYC. (ii) Conduct a mid-term, final, and an ex-post evaluation. (iii) Develop capacity of CCs to self-assess their performance, and hence facilitate external accreditation. This could include evaluation of student performance, completion rates, job placement, quality of programs and staff, coverage, tracking/tracer studies upon graduation, quality; diversity of program offerings, student support services (to include remediation, CXC repeaters, special targeted programs (i.e. young men). An initial baseline for project monitoring will be developed as an outcome of the diagnostic studies referenced in ¶1.19.

### III. MAIN ISSUES

- 3.1 **Stakeholder Participation.** This program is dependent upon the political will and support of a myriad of stakeholders in Government, business and industry, local communities, and the CCs. The process of building interest in and identifying accommodations that can be broadly supported across interest groups will rely upon the level of access to stakeholders and data during project preparation. Ownership will be facilitated through the funding of consultancies, consultations, and workshops that will enable stakeholders at all levels to participate in the identification of issues and options for sector modernization, coordination, and development. An action plan to guide the strategic development of the sector, including the responsibilities of major stakeholders and the phasing of institutional strengthening, rationalization, and reform initiatives supported by the loan, will be orchestrated during project preparation by MOEYC, with broad stakeholder input.
- 3.2 One example of a lesson learned about the importance of stakeholder ownership to program sustainability is evident in the recently concluded Human Capital Development Pilot Project (ATN/MH-4630-JA, see ¶1.18). This project sought to establish a Work Force Development Center that would help to broker the non-formal training of workers. Its genesis came out of an initiative by the trade unions to provide re-training opportunities for workers, following a spate of redundancies in the private and public sectors. It incorporated the private sector.

The partnership between unions and employers was not fruitful because of the longstanding distrust between the two groups, which was exacerbated by the unstable industrial relations climate during project implementation. The project was never owned by the trade unions, which provided minimal support in the form of irregular attendance at board meetings. The employers, as a group, through the Employers Federation, also kept their distance. There were also conceptual issues, whereby a significant level of resources were channeled into an innovative project to set-up a brand new organization with partners that are historically combatants. When the flow of resources ended, so did the organization. Although the Human Capital Pilot Project was not an attempt at post-secondary technical training in the formal sense, the design of Post-Ed will be enhanced through the analysis of this experience.

- 3.3 ***Program Execution.*** The GOJ has committed to work with the Bank to identify appropriate institutional arrangements for program execution. To enhance sustainability, MOEYC will need to coordinate its implementation effort with the Council of Community Colleges of Jamaica. The mandate and institutional capacity of the Council to deliver the package of services envisioned under the program will be analyzed during program preparation, along with the preferred execution modality.
- 3.4 A Technical Cooperation (TC-0201047) using FSO net income to finance diagnostic studies for program orientation was approved on December 19, 2002. A workshop involving key players in civil society, business, industry, the CCs, Government, and the Bank to discuss strategic directions for the development of Jamaica's post-secondary Community College system will be held in Kingston, February 2003. Following the completion of the diagnostic studies and related stakeholder consultations, a second workshop will be held to prioritize lines of intervention prior to the presentation of the Profile II during the second quarter of 2003. The analysis mission for the operation is expected in the 3<sup>d</sup> quarter of 2003, with presentation to the Board of Directors in the final quarter.