**Building State Capacity in the Caribbean: The State of the Civil Service in Haiti**

**Barbara Nunberg**

**August 24, 2018**

**ABSTRACT**

The potential of public policies and the services provided by any State are closely linked to the quality of its civil service. The ways in which the civil service is managed—in other words, the human resource planning policies, recruitment and selection, professional development, and the incentives for professionalization, among other factors—are critical conditioning factors when it comes to attracting, retaining, and motivating suitable staff to carry out these tasks. This report presents the main findings of Haiti’s civil service diagnostic assessment carried out in early 2018. It evaluates the quality of the human resource management (HRM) systems in the civil service. The analysis takes as reference the methodology used by the Inter-American Development Bank (IDB) in Latin American countries (Longo and Iacoviello, 2010), and the Charter for Caribbean Public Services led by the Caribbean Centre for Development Administration (CARICAD). This is the first evaluation for the country and it contributed as an input to the series “Building State Capacity: The State of the Civil Service in the Caribbean.”

JEL Codes: H10, H11, J45

Keywords: civil service, human resources, public employment, public management, Haiti

Contents

[Acronyms 4](#_Toc526170539)

[Executive Summary 5](#_Toc526170540)

[1. Context 8](#_Toc526170541)

[1.1 Background 8](#_Toc526170542)

[1.2 Institutional Context 9](#_Toc526170545)

[1.3 Legal Framework 9](#_Toc526170546)

[1.4 Institutional Framework for the Civil Service 11](#_Toc526170547)

2. Analysis of HRM Subsystems………………………………………………………………………………………13

[2.1 Human Resource Planning 13](#_Toc526170553)

[2.2 Work Organization 20](#_Toc526170560)

[2.3 Employment Management 20](#_Toc526170563)

[2.4 Performance Management 23](#_Toc526170566)

[2.5 Compensation Management 23](#_Toc526170567)

[2.6 Development Management 27](#_Toc526170570)

[2.7 Human Resources and Social Relations Management 29](#_Toc526170572)

[2.8 Organization of the HRM Function 30](#_Toc526170574)

[2. 9 HRM Subsystems table 30](#_Toc526170575)

[3 Analysis of the Civil Service Quality Indices 33](#_Toc526170576)

[3.1 Efficiency 34](#_Toc526170577)

[3.2 Merit 34](#_Toc526170578)

[3.3Structural Consistency 35](#_Toc526170579)

[3.4 Functional Capacity 36](#_Toc526170580)

[3.5 Integrative Capacity 37](#_Toc526170581)

[3.6 Management Capabilities 38](#_Toc526170582)

[3.7 Diversity Management 38](#_Toc526170583)

[4. Recommendations 39](#_Toc526170584)

**5. Conclusions**……………………………………………………………………………………………………………...**47**

[6. Sources of Information 50](#_Toc526170587)

# Acronyms

CNRA National Commission for Administrative Reform

CSAFP Supreme Court of Administration and Public Service

DGHR General Directorates of Human Resources

ENAPP National School of Administration and Public Policies

FY Fiscal Year

GDP Gross Domestic Product

GNI Gross National Income

HRIMS HR Information Management System

HRM Human Resource Management

IDB Inter-American Development Bank

MEF Ministry of Economy and Finance

OMRH Management Office of Human Resources

OPM Office of the Prime Minister

PAR Performance Appraisal Record

PCRE Framework Program for State Reform

PHTK *Parti Haïtien Tèt Kale*

PM Prime Minister

PSC Public Service Commission

# 

# Executive Summary

Of the many factors that contribute to building state capacity, human resources are among the most important. The potential of public policies and the services provided by any State is closely linked to the quality of its civil service. It is civil servants whom we trust every day to carry out the tasks of public service in our countries.

The ways in which the civil service is managed—in other words, human resource planning policies, recruitment and selection, professional development, and incentives for professionalization, among other factors—are critical determinants in attracting, retaining, and motivating suitable staff to carry out these tasks. Effective management of the State’s human resources is also important because of the amount of resources that taxpayers invest to finance this workforce.

In 2004, the Inter-American Development Bank (IDB) helped design and implement a methodology for measuring how the central government civil service operates in Latin American countries with respect to the reference points identified by the Ibero-American Charter. These assessments, implemented at different times in the last 14 years, helped generate a reform agenda and contributed to important progress in several countries (Cortazar, Lafuente, and Sangines, 2014).

In 2017 the IDB, persuaded of the importance of this subject, started an initiative to replicate this work in the Caribbean. The process began with the adaptation of the original methodology and analytical framework to align them with Caribbean realities and priorities. [[1]](#footnote-1) In this regard, the Charter for Caribbean Public Services served as an essential reference point.

This report analyzes the management of the civil service in Haiti. It begins with an examination of the status of the civil service along the parameters detailed in the adapted methodology. The analysis culminates in a report card on the quality of the HRM systems in the civil service of Haiti. The analysis relies both on a desk review of relevant primary and secondary sources as well as an in-country field visit to Haiti that took place in February 2018 in conjunction with an Inter-American Development Bank project preparation mission[[2]](#footnote-2). The field research entailed data inspection along with discussions with central and de-concentrated government officials, international donor representatives, and private and non-profit sector and citizen actors.

For purposes of this diagnostic assessment of the Human Resource Management (HRM) functions, the definition of the Civil Service refers to the central government’s statutory employees (the *Fonction Public*). In as much as Haiti is a unitary state, this definition subsumes civil servants deployed to sub-national, de-concentrated entities. To the extent that there appears to have been an uptick in the employment of contracted workers both as daily laborers as well as for higher-level tasks across government, some references are also made to this adjunct work force. State enterprise employment or donor-paid staff working in specialized project units fall outside the present analysis, however.

Good management of the civil service entails having in place solid workforce planning routines; reliable data on staff and pay; adequate organizational structures with updated and relevant job profiles; a merit-based system for recruitment, selection, and promotion with a reasonable level of flexibility; competitive and fair pay; a solid performance framework; career development opportunities for staff and good relations with staff associations, among others. In addition, having a high-performing organization in charge of the system is critical to make all this happen.

This report assesses 38 critical points to calculate aggregate scores for the eight HRM subsystems[[3]](#footnote-3) and the seven quality indices[[4]](#footnote-4) that are aligned with the practices described in the paragraph above. The maximum score for each HRM subsystem and quality index is 100. Higher scores are indicative of greater maturity, as evidenced by the degree of instrumentality (i.e., the availability of technical rules and instruments that enable the management practice established in the critical point to be developed), coverage (i.e., the extent to which the practice exists in the various public organizations in the country) and implementation (i.e., the degree of effective implementation and ultimately institutionalization of the practice). The following table summarizes the main results for Haiti.

**Table 1: Quality Indices and HR Subsystems**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Quality Indices** | **2018** |
| **Civil Service Development (aggregated index)** | **27** |
| Efficiency | 40 |
| Merit | 33 |
| Structural Consistency | 18 |
| Functional Capacity | 13 |
| Integrative Capacity | 30 |
| Management Capabilities | 12 |
| Diversity Management | 50 |
| **HR Subsystems** |  |
| Human Resources Planning | 30 |
| Work Organization | 0 |
| Employment Management | 27 |
| Performance Management | 13 |
| Compensation Management | 25 |
| Development Management | 12 |
| Human and Social Relations Management | 30 |
| Organization of HRM Function | 20 |

Source: Author’s elaboration.

The aggregated Civil Service Development Index enables both civil service development and degree of implementation of the CPS Charter to be measured. Countries can be classified into three levels of civil service development: (i) low, with scores between 0 and 39 points, (ii) medium, with scores between 40 and 59, and (iii) high, or professional systems levels, with scores above 60. A score of 27 out of 100, low level of civil service development, shows that Haiti has significant room for improvement.

The best-performing index for Haiti were Diversity Management and Efficiency. Diversity Management evaluates the extent to which opportunities in the Civil Service may be curtailed due to differences associated with race, ethnicity, language, gender, disability, and others. The relatively good performance under the efficiency index relates to the affordability of the wage bill compared to the economy’s fiscal capacity, and the fact that salaries are not excessive compared to the wider labor market.

At the other end of the spectrum, two quality indices tied for the lowest score of 12 and 13. They were Management Capabilities and Functional Capacity respectively. Management capabilities covers the spectrum from Transactional Management to Transformational Leadership. In the case of management capabilities, Haiti faces significant gaps in people management which means a gap in strategic management and alignment, given the capacity constraints and pressing developmental challenges confronting civil servants at all levels; and in stakeholder engagement, due to the lack of coordination between the OMRH, the MEF and the DGHR of individual ministries, which often face informational and capacity difficulties. The low score for Functional Capacity is attributable to the need of increasing formal degrees on the higher-echelon staff, absence of job descriptions for most positions, scarce functional and geographical mobility, absence of a means for feeding evaluation information into a well-structured career and grading system, and lack of link between pay and performance.

The report concludes with a series of recommendations designed to help strengthen the less mature HRM subsystems and quality indices. Based on the results of the assessment, four broad recommendations are offered for government’s further consideration as it takes its civil service reform program forward in the next years: i) Strengthen establishment control , ii) Find the reservation wage for civil servants which requires to conduct a comparative pay survey and to develop a strategy and policy framework for recruiting contracted employees that includes conditions of pay, among other things iii) Develop strategies for re-dimensioning (the size, distribution and cost) the civil service, and iv) Develop HR systems, institutions and incentives.

# Context

## **1.1** Background

Haiti shares approximately one third of the Caribbean island of Hispaniola with the Dominican Republic. The country’s complex history includes not only its early iconic declaration of independence from France in 1804 - the result of the only successful slave revolt in human history – but also its post-colonial record of sometimes violent political instability, weak governance and stalled economic development, relegating much of its population of just over 11 million destitute and vulnerable to natural disasters. The country’s government institutions have yet to recover from the one-two punch of the 2010 earthquake that killed more than 150,000 (including 35,000 civil servants, about 20% of the public administration) and 2016’s Hurricane Matthew that caused 600 deaths and left multitudes homeless. While economic growth, poverty reduction, and social indicator outcomes have improved during the last decade, sustained development remains deeply challenging, due in large part to the country’s underperforming public sector. Haiti consistently ranks among the weakest states in the World, and citizen trust in government, as evidenced in voter participation rates below 30%, is low.[[5]](#footnote-5) After a period of extended political instability and institutional upheaval, the 2017 election of a new President and appointment of a new cabinet with a declared commitment to state transformation offers a potential opportunity to make tangible progress on the civil service reform agenda.

For purposes of this diagnostic assessment of the Human Resource Management (HRM) functions, the definition of the Civil Service refers to the central government’s statutory employees (the *Fonction Public*). In as much as Haiti is a unitary state, this definition subsumes civil servants deployed to sub-national, de-concentrated entities. To the extent that there appears to have been an uptick in the employment of contracted workers both as daily laborers as well as for higher-level tasks across government, some references are also made to this adjunct work force. State enterprise employment or donor-paid staff working in specialized project units fall outside the present analysis, however. This report assesses the current quality and capability of the civil service in Haiti. The objective is to diagnose both weaknesses and opportunities for strengthening institutional capacity in order to address the critical developmental challenges facing the country.

The methodology utilized in the diagnostic assessment is a modified version of the [Longo methodology](https://publications.iadb.org/handle/11319/6636), which the IDB has used to conduct similar assessments in Latin America. The principal modifications to the Longo model were designed to secure optimal alignment with the Caribbean’s priority agenda as reflected in the [Charter for Caribbean Public Services](http://www.caricad.net/wp-content/uploads/2017/01/Draft-Charter-for-Public-Services.pdf).[[6]](#footnote-6) This modified methodology is provided in Appendix 1.

### Institutional Context

Haiti has a formal separation of powers between executive, legislative and judicial branches, with an elected President who designates a Prime Minister to form a cabinet and manage government through a National Assembly-ratified Council of Ministers. The alternation of illiberal democratic rule and elected regimes over the country’s distant – and even recent – history, however, has undermined the credibility and effectiveness of the political and administrative institutions. Public policy has been captured by vested interests and patrimonial behaviors have reputedly dominated and, in many instances, corrupted all three branches of government.[[7]](#footnote-7)

The current President emerged with a low voter participation (just 21%) in the 2017 election, engendering difficulties for the Government to implement its reform roadmap. These difficulties prevail despite the relative strength (64 out of 118 seats) of the governing majority in the lower house of Parliament, the Chamber of Deputies. That strength is belied, however by the relatively smaller share (around 30 percent) of total lower house seats held by the President’s party (the *Parti Haïtien Tèt Kale*, PHTK)[[8]](#footnote-8), as well as with the party composition of the upper chamber, the Senate, which is highly fragmented. Political participation at the decentralized level is channeled through regional assemblies, which legislate matters of concern to individual departments.

Some of the difficulties in Haiti’s administrative institutions entails bureaucratic inefficiency, lack of basic service coverage and corruption. Pointed critiques of police and judges focus on the role of low pay, and inadequate training, in distorting incentives away from performance.[[9]](#footnote-9)  With 21 ministries (including 19 sector ministries and the Offices of the President and of the Prime Minister who exercise political leadership and coordination.) Autonomous agencies account for approximately G.1.3 billion of staff compensation ($21.5 m). [[10]](#footnote-10) In addition, a range of decentralized administrative departments and representative institutions (at departmental, municipal, communal and neighborhood levels account for substantial employment as do State Enterprises, which operate under the commercial code and are beyond the scope of this analysis.[[11]](#footnote-11)

## Legal Framework

The Haitian public administration was first established in Law on August 26th, 1870. More than a century later, in September 1982, a General Statute, delineating the more coherent set of structures, norms, procedures and general principles underpinning the Civil Service, was promulgated.[[12]](#footnote-12) The tenets of this statute were enshrined in the 1987 Constitution that briefly ushered in a democratic polity and a unitary state with limited decentralized governance structures and provided the broad statutory basis for the creation of a professional public administration. In this 1987 Constitution there is a traditional “career” model, the Civil Service Statute, and the 2005 Decree that revised the regulatory and normative framework for the Civil Service and lays out four broad employment categories that could provide the underpinnings of an eventual structure: Category A comprises the high-level director personnel, requiring university or “*licence*” credentials; Category B includes supervisory staff with some tertiary or certificate education; Category C includes technical and operational staff with secondary education credentials; and Category D is composed of semi-skilled and menial staff with educational levels of primary school or above.

Subsequently, in episodic actions taken throughout periods of political instability and authoritarian rule, various subsidiary decrees and regulations were introduced to amend the overall Civil Service General Statute. Most significant were the creation, in 1995, of the National Commission for Administrative Reform (*Commission Nationale pour la Reform Administrative* - CNRA) whose remit focused on developing the organizations of the central state and codifying practices to modernize the civil service. This work laid the basis for the legal changes taken by the transition government that came to power after the political upheaval of 2004, resulting in the May 17, 2005 decrees that set forth parallel reforms to restructure organizations of the central state and to update the operations of the civil service, presaging the 2007 State Reform Framework Program. This framework provided broad normative guidance for civil service practices and established broad employment categories that began the process of building a formal civil service hierarchical structure. The institutions put in place to guide these reforms were *the Conseil Superieur de l’Administration et de la Fonction Public* (CSAFP) and the Office of Management of Human Resources (Office de Management et des Resources Humaines) in the Office of the Prime Minister (Cabinet Office). In particular, as articulated in the Office’s By-Law (Arête) of May 25, 2009, OMRH was charged with dismantling and revising antiquated, dysfunctional prior legal and regulatory provisions for civil service employment management, recruitment, training, classification, pay, and career advancement of the civil service and replace them with more modern approaches and systems. A By-law (Arête) (Circular 006) was introduced on April 2, 2013 to standardize civil service recruitment procedures on the basis of meritocratic criteria. And a by-law establishing a system of individual performance evaluation for civil servants was introduced in September 2014 (Moniteur 179). A recent draft law (*Statut Generale de la Fonction Publique*), tabled before Parliament in April 2018, proposes a new general statute of the Public Service, including 213 articles that strengthen the rights and obligations of civil servants and the de-politicization of the public administration. It also proposes to introduce a modern classification structure to better incentivize civil service performance (see below.) A companion bill (115) to reorganize the central administration of the state was also sent to Parliament at this time. A list of some relevant legal framework documents is detailed below. For a comprehensive list, see Annex II.

**Table 2: Relevant Legislation and Regulation**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Law/Regulation/Directive | Scope |
| The Constitution of Haiti (June 20, 2012) | Especially articles: 136, 160, 171, 235, 236-1, 236-2, 237, 238, 239, 240, 241, 242, 243 et 244; |
| By-law (Arête) of May 25, 2009 | Revises regulatory provisions for civil service training, recruitment, career advancement and HR management, under auspices of the OMRH. |
| By-Law of April 2, 2013 (Circular 006) | Standardizes civil service recruitment, strengthening merit-based selection criteria. |
| By-Law of September 2014 | Introduces individual performance evaluation. |
| Draft law of April 2018 | Revises and modernize the civil service general statute |

## Institutional Framework for the Civil Service

### Prime Minister’s Office of Management of Human Resources

The highly centralized political and administrative structure – and the weak administrative capacity- of the Haitian state has resulted in a relatively spare and concentrated institutional arrangement for development and reform of the Civil Service. The Office of the Prime Minister (*Primature*) has responsibility for government policies and programs, under the broad aegis of the Presidency. This is where the (OMRH) (*Office de Management et des Resources Humaines* -- Office of Management and Human Resources) is located.

### OMRH

OMRH was created as the strategic organ of inter-ministerial coordination on human resource management with the full authority of the Primature in 2005 to carry out a high-profile remit to oversee the modernization of the administrative apparatus of the State and to build the capacity of the Civil Service. In its state modernization role, it is engaged in overseeing organizational mandates, improving management systems, communications and information technology across government, and simplifying administrative and regulatory frameworks and operations.

### DGHR (Directeurs Généraux des Ressources Humaines)

*OMRH* interacts with other national institutions involved in particular aspects of the operation of the civil service, including the Directorates General for Human Resources within individual line or sectorial ministries. Each ministry, in theory, has an HR Directorate which has responsibility for maintaining HR records and overseeing all personnel matters for ministry civil servants, but it is not clear how fully developed this function is across government. These DGRH report to the sectoral Minister and are also responsible for providing information on any relevant personnel changes to the payroll function in the Ministry of Finance.

### *Conseil Superieur de l’Administration et de la Fonction Publique*

The *Conseil Superieur de l’Administration et de la Fonction Publique* (Supreme Council of Administration and Civil Service) is an inter-ministerial council which counts designated Cabinet Ministers among its members. The exact role of this High Council on Public Administration and the Civil Service, led by the Prime Minister with ultimate political authority over decisions concerning remuneration policy or directional changes in provisions of legal, statutory frameworks for the civil service, is not fully articulated in practice. It would appear that the OMRH acts as the secretariat for the CSAFP, preparing technical inputs as the basis for its rulings.

### Ministry of Economy and Finance

The *Payroll Directorate* of the Ministry of Finance plays a key institutional role in civil service management in Haiti. The MEF intakes updated personnel information both on statutory civil servants as well as on contractual employees from the Human Resource Directorates of the Ministries as an input to the preparation of its monthly payroll expenditures and authorizes budget for line ministry recruitment.

**L’ENAPP, the National School of Administration and Public Policies**

L’ENAPP is the main civil service training body for higher-level civil servants. Itwas created in the context of the 2005 Decree revision of the General Statute of the Civil Service and receives support from donors, such as France and the U.S. on an ongoing basis both in terms of assistance on curricular design as well as through training of trainers and direct provision of instruction. L’ENAPP’s premises and resources are, at present, highly constrained, limiting its capability in reaching large numbers of staff or acting as a significant agent of public administration transformation.

**2. Analysis of HRM Subsystems**

The assessment utilized thirty-eight critical points[[13]](#footnote-13) organized under eight HRM Subsystems. This section of the report presents a narrative on the status of each of the Subsystems as well as a table with the aggregate score for each subsystem for Haiti. The findings are based on secondary research as well as a series of one-on-one interviews, focus groups and other consultations with both internal and external stakeholders.

## 2.1 Human Resource Planning

### This HRM subsystem addresses the degree to which the organization has the necessary human capital—both quantitative and qualitative—in place to effectively implement its strategy. This extends to the existence of appropriate HRM policies and procedures as well as the availability of information systems to enable management to gather, store, retrieve, analyze, and interpret staff-related information and use it to inform effective decision making.

### Strategic Alignment

* ***Critical point 1:*** *Staff planning needs usually result from the organization’s priorities and strategic orientation. The degree to which they are adjusted to one another tends to be high.*

Strategic planning focused on reforming the public administration has featured in governmental priorities under successive Haitian political administrations in recent years. The May 17, 2005 decrees set in motion the preparation of the Framework Program for State Reform (Program-Cadre de Reforme de L’État) (PCRE) of 2007, which framed a five-year effort to move civil service reform forward. It included plans to de-concentrate some public services and to decentralize some decision making to the department and communal levels. It also emphasized modernization of the physical facilities for public service and the introduction of e-government systems. The implementation of the first (2007-2012) PCRE was interrupted by the 2010 earthquake, which decimated the civil service (reportedly, 20% of serving civil servants perished in the disaster) and redirected development priorities to the urgent task of physical recovery and rehabilitation.

In 2012, the government of Prime Minister Laurent Lamothe, sought to resume the state reform policies, declaring them a major pillar of the national development plan (*Plan Strategique de Developpement (PSDH)*. A second PCRE laid out the institutional reforms to be emphasized for the 2012-2017 period, including reconstruction and modernization of Haiti’s already eroded – but now devastated -- civil service capability as well as heightened attention to reinforcing efforts to strengthen de-concentrated services to meet community needs outside the capital of Port-au-Prince. As this latest program cycle began to come to a close in 2017, a short-term Action Plan for the April through September period was launched in OMRH. The Action Plan covered a set of high-priority tasks that included:

* Evaluating the impact of the previous PCRE
* Reorganizing the OMRH
* Advancing the program to deploy civil servants to the decentralized territory
* Address the problem of contractual employee recruitment
* Recreate a forum of ministerial Director Generals
* Restructure the HR departments in line ministries (Directorates of HR)
* Implement a robust classification system for the Civil Service
* Design a proper Pay and Grading System (a Salary Scale) for the Civil Service
* Design a new ministerial civil service recruitment system
* Install a modern, computerized HRMIS in OMRH with links to the HR functions in Ministries
* Introduce modern IT throughout the Civil Service
* Develop diversity promotion programs focused on gender, sexual orientation and disability equality in the Civil Service
* Convene the Second Roundtable on Civil Service Training

The PCRE planning process continues, and the preparation of a third PCRE is programmed for the fall of 2018, centered in the OMRH with external technical support from one or more international development partners. In planning for the next five-year period, the PCRE exercise would depart from the impact evaluation that is still to be carried out of PCRE 2 in order to determine which activities were indeed carried out and which priorities are important and feasible to emphasize for the next program cycle.

Over the last decade, there has been a commendable effort made on an ongoing basis by successive Prime Minister’s Offices (*Primature*) to prepare both national strategic plans that emphasized the institutional weaknesses in government as well as more focused strategic documents – and even accompanying action plans – that highlighted, in some detail – the reform needs of the Civil Service human resource management function. The degree to which these strategic documents and the actual programs needed to implement them – or to align them to the workforce plans and controls across central government – has been very limited, however.

This lack of alignment and follow-through are explained by several factors. One is the disruption of orderly prioritization and policy making caused by the recent natural disasters; as mentioned above, these calamities both depleted capacity and diverted the national agenda towards emergency reconstruction and away from longer-term institutional development goals. The very constrained capacity of the civil service – even in OMRH, which received donor assistance for its agenda – further inhibited the country’s ability to move the civil service reforms forward. And with the political vicissitudes that characterized the last number of years, garnering sufficient stakeholder support to carry out needed institutional reforms may have proved difficult.

During this period, donors may also have played a part in derailing the alignment between plans to build institutional capacity and the installation of the means to do so. (As will be discussed later in this assessment), donors themselves were focused on rebuilding Haiti’s hard – rather than the softer, institutional – infrastructure and in bypassing the civil service to deliver on their own urgently needed service delivery projects in crucial economic and social sectors. While most line ministries were left out of the strategic planning process, two exceptions – the Ministry of Public Works, Transportation and Communications (MTPTC) and the Ministry of Agriculture (MARNDR) – did, with IDB support – pilot extensive strategic planning and functional review exercises that aimed at adjusting workforce capacity to the shifting priorities of the sectors. These efforts have so far been inhibited by the same constraints as affect the government more broadly as well as by a serious system-wide information and data weakness, discussed below.

In 2014, the OMRH issued a Strategic Planning Guide for Civil Service Human Resources[[14]](#footnote-14), with support from the UNDP. The document presents a well-conceived but abstract technical approach to HR planning, including: needs assessments for basic functions such as recruitment, career advancement, training, personnel evaluation and IT, among others. It does not appear, however, that the principles outlined this guide have yet been applied operationally.

### Information-based Decision Making

* ***Critical point 2:*** *The HR information systems (HRIS) enable a reasonable awareness of the quantitative and qualitative resources available, now and in the future, in the different organizational areas and units.*

Haiti’s human resource management information functions are weak, providing only minimally reliable information on the nature, placement and rewards structure of civil service employment across government. One long recognized problem is the lack of a robust database with accurate, updated information on current civil service employment. In a recent effort to remedy this problem, a civil service census was carried out under OMRH auspices in 2014 with technical assistance from Haitian consultants and France’s L’ENA. The census count included both statutory civil servants as well as contractual employees. Unfortunately, this initiative was conducted on a voluntary basis, with an estimated 15 percent of staff and/or whole agencies opting out, amidst rumored concerns the count was a prelude to an involuntary departure program. The point of departure for the exercise was the MEF payroll, which, the designers of the census concede, fails to capture at least 10,000 employees (not clear if these are civil servants or contracted staff, however). Although the census was conducted by field enumerators, it relied on non-validated questionnaires rather than more robust identification measures (such as biometric markers, etc.) Thus, the likelihood of under-estimate or of the inclusion of fraudulent payrollees in the form of “zombie” employees is non-trivial. Even with these flaws, the utility for general HR planning and policy purposes of even a gross estimate of the size and deployment of the public sector employees – including contractual labor – particularly after the extreme chaos experienced in recent years in Haiti should not be dismissed. Nonetheless, the data base created is far from robust and, the absence of a well-functioning HRMIS system with strong integration into the country’s financial management systems via the MEF-administered payroll into which to feed these partial data have already made the 2014 census outdated for information management purposes.

The current HR information system is composed of a central registry in OMRH (the SIGRH) and very rudimentary systems in the line ministries. Both rely on outdated and partial technology to keep track of basic personnel movements, with no apparent electronic link to the MEF payroll function, which itself is far from comprehensive and offers little facility to retrieve key data for policy analysis, planning or management purposes. The current system utilizes the Syst-Dev system. In line ministries, such as the Ministry of Public Works, Transportation and Communications, the HR Directorates manually input each individual employee personnel file and update movements into the ministry’s own HR data base, mainly using a spreadsheet format. Alone technician works on a computer, as most staff do not have easy access to terminals. These lists are updated based on paper files, which continue to be maintained manually and include personnel changes that have been approved by senior managers within the ministry and vetted by the OMRH. The hard copy of authorized personnel changes are hand-delivered by courier to the MEF Payroll Division for incorporation into the remuneration calculation and disbursement.

In addition, the sectorial ministries generally keep (at least partial) lists of contractual workers, with names, tasks and monthly remuneration. The degree to which accurate information of these contractual workers is supplied to the Ministry of Finance is as yet uncleared. The MEF does, however, appear to have at least partial reports on the total personnel expenditure on contractuals employment across government if not the precise number of contracted staff. Furthermore, the IT unit of the MEF seems to have been able to extract incomplete data on contractual employment (but these data are still to be verified)[[15]](#footnote-15).

MEF’s payroll system, which uses the Sys-Pay modality (in place, thanks to IDB resources, since around 2009), relies on line ministries – again, through hard copies of paper records --, with OMRH validation, to “clean” their rolls of any fraudulent civil service employees – “zombies” – who might be receiving pay in place of a deceased or transferred official. The MEF Payroll also likely contains duplications of some number of serving civil servants, such as teachers who are legally permitted to hold more than one teaching position. Confidence in the system as a whole is quite low.

Serial efforts to upgrade the current technology to a more comprehensive, integrated system have been initiated but not implemented. OMRH has argued, reasonably, that such a system must be predicated on an accurate database for civil service employment, which requires either a relatively high-tech identification-based civil service census – or re-census – or a sophisticated opt-in payroll and bank-card mechanism to ensure proper identity. A recent consultancy to OMRH estimated that an integrated HRMIS in OMRH and the line Ministries, with robust links to the MEF’s Payroll, could build on what is indeed already in place in the basic system infrastructure, assessing the percentage of coverage and capacity for each existing module (see Table 1). The presumed reform objective is to move to a fully integrated, off-the-shelf Integrated Financial Management System (IFMS) of the type now conventionally installed in many governments of varying capacity around the world. This proposition is discussed in the recommendation section of this report.

**Table 3**

**Technological Readiness of Current HRMIS System**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Module | % of achievement | Comments |
| Personnel file, movements and positions | 80 |  |
| Time and activities | <20 | In part |
| Professional relationships |  | Not implemented yet |
| Compensation, Social Benefits and Payroll |  | Not implemented yet |
| Hygiene, insurance and health |  | Not implemented yet |
| Recruitment Process Management (Back-end and Front-end) | <50 | It remains the front-end (job portal) to develop |
| Training and Performance Evaluation |  | Not implemented yet |
| Job Position and Classification | 50 | New design to consider |
| Planning and workforce planning |  | Not implemented yet |
| Reporting and custom query space |  | Dysfunctional |
| Security | <50 |  |
| Pay | <50 | In progress |
| Sanctions Management |  | Not implemented yet |
| Pension |  | Not implemented yet |

# Source : OMRH (2017) *SIGRH Etat des lieux et perspectives*

### Effectiveness of Planning

*•****Critical point 3:*** *In general, there are neither significant staff shortages nor overages.*

*•****Critical point 4****: Overall costs of civil service staff is maintained within reasonable parameters that are compatible with the country’s economic situation.*

*•****Critical point 5****: The technical level of the workforce is commensurate with a knowledge-based society. Skilled labor represents a significant proportion of the workforce.*

While accurate information on the size, cost, nature and distribution of government employment will require eventual validation through a data collection; preliminary figures suggest a very small civil service relative both to needs and to comparator countries in the region and around the world with similar economic endowments.

Notwithstanding these public employment data problems, which are discussed in greater detail below, it would appear that Haiti’s ratio of civil servants to population is very low, especially when compared with Governments of the Caribbean and some Central American countries (see Table 2). For instance, Haiti shows a ratio of 0.8% which is significantly lower than that of Costa Rica (2.5%), Dominican Republic (3.1%), Jamaica (2.7%) and Nicaragua (1.8%). A relevant factor to consider at analyzing these numbers is that in Haiti the outsized role of donor-sponsored personnel has eclipsed that of national civil service cadres.

**Table 4**

**Ratio of civil servants to population**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Country** | **Number of civil servants (year)** | **Population** | **Ratio** |
| Dominican Republic | 319,312 (2013) | 10,257,724 | 3.1% |
| Jamaica | 77, 936 (2017) | 2,844,000 | 2.7% |
| Costa Rica | 116,314 (2013) | 4,713,168 | 2.5 % |
| Nicaragua | 107,448 (2013) | 6,080,500 | 1.8% |
| **Haiti** | **87,511 (2017)** | **10,983,000** | **0.8%** |

Source: OMRH Census, ILO, OECD, World Bank, various recent years.

Civil Servants possess more formal education than the population at large - Haiti’s overall labor force was relatively un-educated; over 45.7% have not completed primary education[[16]](#footnote-16) -in contrast, nearly 75% of all civil servants have completed high school. - Nonetheless, capacity issues are a concern. A surprising 12% of the A category and 7% in the B category staff[[17]](#footnote-17) report having no formal education degree. Many with degrees lack the appropriate skills to carry out functions, reflecting the overall quality of secondary and tertiary education in Haiti. And only 35% of civil servants report having any familiarity with IT and computers.[[18]](#footnote-18)

Article IV IMF Consultations notes that Haiti’s wage bill has been trending upwards in recent years. Wage expenditure increased from 5.1% of GDP in 2012 to 6.7% of GDP in 2017. Wages as a percentage of total expenditure also increased from 17.8% of total expenditure in 2012 to 34.9% in 2017 (see graph 2). The current levels in Haiti are well behind the Caribbean countries.

**Graph 2:**

**Comparison of government wage bill in Caribbean countries**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
|  |  |

Source: IMF

### Strategic Human Resource Management

*•****Critical point 6:*** *The staffing policies, decisions, and practices in each area of HRM arise from intentions that are determined during the planning process.*

*•****Critical point 35:*** *Management proactively identifies mission-critical positions and builds capacity to fill those positions as incumbents transition out.*

*•****Critical point 36****: Senior civil servants go beyond managing day-to-day operations and craft strategies for taking the Service to the next level of performance and success.*

*•****Critical point 38****: Senior civil servants collaborate across ministries and sectors to secure coherence in policies and programs.*

Discussions with counterparts in OMRH revealed a deep understanding of the key constraints on civil service. They identified key problems that needed to be remedied in concert in order to move the public administration to its rightful place as a leader of change in meeting Haiti’s developmental challenges: low pay and lack of career incentives; weak establishment management controls; and the need to strengthen capacity and replenish cadres through modern, merit-based recruitment strategies. However, there is no evidence of succession planning in the Service even though management proactively could help Haitian Government to identify mission-critical positions and build capacity to fill those positions as incumbents transition out. Given the capacity constraints and pressing developmental challenges confronting civil servants at all levels, long-term strategic thinking regarding performance enhancement is not a high priority. Nonetheless, managers did have views about what kinds of steps might be taken to improve civil service HRM in the future.

## 2.2 Work Organization

### Work Organization establishes and specifies the contents of the tasks for each job and the characteristics of the people who carry them out. This is reflected in the job design, that is, the description of activities, functions, responsibilities, and targets assigned to each position and the profile definition, that is, the competencies, skills, and aptitudes required for successful performance in the given role.

### Quality of the Structure of Job Profiles

1. ***Critical point 7:*** *Job descriptions conform to managerial criteria rather than to legal considerations or collective agreements. The legal framework and the employment agreements are limited to establishing a broad framework in which work is organized in accordance with organizational needs.*
2. ***Critical point 8:*** *Grading arrangements and job hierarchies result from rational criteria, which are adapted to each organizational environment.*
3. ***Critical point 9:*** *Job profiles include the selection of competencies that in each case are considered key for the success of the job-holder’s performance.*

Haiti’s civil service is distinguished by its lack of a well-structured classification or a job grading system.[[19]](#footnote-19) The need to create a more complete career system, with clear designations of progressive level of responsibilities and competencies, required educational and experiential qualifications, and job titles is articulated in the OMRH guidance manual for human resource management and was expressed in the strongest terms by interviewed OMRH leadership in the course of this assessment.[[20]](#footnote-20) The lack of a classification system is closely linked to the defects in the pay and promotion systems, discussed shortly, and contribute to a dysfunctional incentive system to reward merit and to motivate civil service performance across the public administration.[[21]](#footnote-21)

This task is not only about outlining broad classes of employees but also of creating detailed consistent job competencies and performance benchmarks in a standardized format for each post.[[22]](#footnote-22)

## 2.3 Employment Management

Employment management addresses the policies and procedures associated with an employee’s recruitment, selection, induction/orientation, mobility, and separation from the organization. The most mature employment management subsystems help to ensure that the right talent is brought into the organization, effectively introduced to the organizational culture, provided with appropriate opportunities for upward mobility, reward and recognition and optimally supported through all phases of their tenure up to and including their transition out of the organization. Hallmarks of effective employment management include equity and transparency.

**Recruitment, Transfers and Appointments**

*•****Critical point 10****: Hiring to fill vacancies is open, by right and in fact, to all candidates possessing the required qualifications. These are established according to suitability and technical considerations, not arbitrarily.*

*•****Critical point 11****: The necessary safeguard mechanisms and procedures are in place against arbitrariness, politicization, patronage, and clientelism throughout the entire hiring process.*

*•****Critical point 12****: Staff selection is based on competency profiles for the potential job holders.*

*•****Critical point 13:*** *The mechanisms for functional and geographic mobility respond flexibly to the demands of personnel redeployment.*

In accordance with the career management policy, the OMRH is responsible for "planning the mobility and professional progression of public servants in different types of employment, with rules for moving from one job in a lower category to another in a higher category, for competition according to the current regulations (Article 99), as well as a clear definition of the modalities to change the category of work (Article 98) in the conditions of academic training and of the professional requirements, explicitly provided for by the particular status. [[23]](#footnote-23)All positions are advertised (in newspapers, the government gazette (*Moniteur*) and on the OMRH and ministerial websites. Candidates must be pre-sorted on the basis of formal qualifications and then subjected to a competitive process that might entail a written exam or an approved interview panel. Recruits are hired for an initial probationary period or internship and then approved for induction, if the ministry can confirm to OMRH and MEF that it has the budgetary resources to cover the statutory position. While these reforms appear to have had real impact – indeed, ministries are reported to have pushed back against the strict new rules that constrain patronage hiring – it is not clear how extensively these merit-based recruitment mechanisms have actually been enforced and are in wide use across government since they were put into legal effect. Other forms of government hiring not subjected to the rigors of civil service recruitment appear to be on the rise, in particular, the employment of contract workers (*contractuels)* may be a way to evade merit rules as well as MEF budgetary scrutiny.

### Discipline and Termination

*•****Critical point 14****: Dismissals or terminations of employment that affect professional positions are not motivated by a change in the government’s political leanings.*

*•****Critical point 15****: There is the possibility of terminating the employment relationship due to objectively verified technical, economic, or organizational reasons that justify workforce reductions.*

The Civil Service Manual does provide for sanctions for inappropriate behavior, but does not elaborate on the nature of those penalties or the conduct that would elicit them. Interviews with ministerial HR staff did indicate that manual record keeping to track absenteeism was still commonplace and, it was reported, effective. Civil servants who are absent from their posts repeatedly receive reprimands and can see their salaries docked.

The HR guidance on “termination” is equated with procedures related to “retirement.” It would appear that although it is, in principle, possible to be terminated, it occurs rarely, if ever. Articles 198 and 199 in the 2005 “*Status Géneral de la Fonction Publique Haïtienne*” decree prohibit the government from arbitrarily dismissing employees. Article 198 expresses that dismissal is justified solely in the cases of professional incompetence, in the event of job cuts due to the release of executives in the public service or following the loss of Haitian nationality. Article 199 expresses that revocation takes place in the case of abandonment of post, if sentenced to an afflictive or infamous sentence or in case of illicit enrichment. Generally, only those who occupy a political position are the ones whose contract may not reconducted in case of a government change (ex: chief of cabinet of a Minister). It is also important to note that in practice, instead of dismissing a civil servant for professional incompetence, the person is usually transferred to another department or entity.

There has been occasional experience with departure programs that are voluntary in nature or that are seeking to enforce statutory retirement provisions. The 2013 separation scheme piloted at the Ministry of Agriculture and the one that is now under preparation in the same ministry would be important to analyze in greater depth to probe both the legal and policy considerations in removing personnel from service in order to renew staffing profiles and recruit skills that are more aligned with the civil service’s changing mission. Functional and geographical mobility is possible depending on availability of funds and the needs of an institution. While personnel may be reassigned to de-concentrated offices of ministries, the practice of inter-agency, cross-government rotation does not appear to be applied in Haiti. If so, it is very scarcely and even less for women.

### Safeguards against Discriminatory Practices

*•****Critical point 34:*** *Men, women, minorities, and people from historically marginalized groups are treated fairly in the distribution of benefits and responsibilities.*

*•****Critical point 35****: Decisions related to hiring, promotion, compensation, discipline, and termination are free from institutional biases associated with variables such as gender, race, ethnicity, class, religion, or place of origin.*

The 2005 *Révision du Statut Général de la Fonction Publique* as well as the 2013 Recruitment Regulation (*Arête)* guarantee equal access to employment in the civil service, prohibiting discrimination on the basis of gender, disability, or sexual orientation. The 2013 Civil Service CensusWomen represent 33 % of staff, well below average OECD female participation rates (58%) but above worldwide comparators (22%.)[[24]](#footnote-24) There is no official breakdown of the level or type of positions filled by women, but female participation is reported to be highest in the capital, Port-au-Prince, although in some main ministries such as the Ministry of Agriculture and the Ministry of Transportation, it is below the constitutional mandate of 30%. The degree to which language policy in the civil service may be an issue that bears on questions of discrimination or equal treatment is not clear. Information on the employment and placement of (exclusive) speakers of the native language, *Kreyol*, among serving civil servants and/or among prospective recruits is not available. Finally, regarding management to identify mission-critical positions, Haiti does not have succession plan in place at this time.

## 2.4 Performance Management

Performance management is the process of planning and evaluating the employees’ contribution to the organization. Ideally individual as well as departmental performance should be cascaded down from the organization’s strategic priorities and associated goals and objectives. In practical terms, this means that each employee should have specific performance targets which are systematically monitored, and feedback should be provided to help ensure that all targets are met during each assessment period.

**Performance Planning and Monitoring**

*•****Critical point 16:*** *Management normally defines guidelines and standards regarding expected personnel performance in accordance with the organization’s priorities and strategy. Consequently, employees are aware of the aspects of their performance for which they will be evaluated.*

*•****Critical point 17****: Throughout the management cycle, management monitors, observes, and supports improvements in employee performance, provides resources, and removes obstacles wherever necessary.*

*•****Critical point 18:*** *The organization evaluates employees’ performance against expected performance standards.*

The by-Law of September 2014 was issued outlining the performance evaluation system for Haitian civil servants. Performance is to be evaluated each fiscal year for every civil servant by his or her superior, under the policy guidance of OMRH. Performance evaluation templates are not uniform across the civil service. But ministerial HR interviewees did report that performance is appraised on a regular basis. As in many settings, there are serious questions as to how rigorous this process is and how ratings affect individual performance and/or unit results, however. Moreover, to the extent that the pay and career advancement arrangements do not have meaningful mechanisms for incorporating performance differentials, performance evaluation itself is unlikely to be viewed seriously in the current context.

## 2.5 Compensation Management

This subsystem covers both cash and non-cash benefits. The goal is to achieve both internal and external equity. As such, there should be a clearly defined job classification system with rewards linked to either individual or group performance.

Competitiveness and Efficiency of the Compensation Policy

*•****Critical point 19****: The pay structure, including cash and non-cash components, is adequate for attracting, motivating, and retaining suitable people with the necessary competencies for the positions that they organization requires.*

*•****Critical point 20****: Pay levels, including cash and non-cash benefits, are not excessive compared with labor market costs for any similar sector or grade.*

*•****Critical point 21:*** *The compensation mechanisms encourage people to make more effort and encourage individual or group performance, learning, and competency development.*

***•Critical point 22:*** *Compensation policy is set according to previously established criteria and consistent with the organization’s structural design parameters.*

### Pay Levels

A recent IDB study estimated that average civil service wages represented a ratio of about 8.77 to GDP in 2015, making the Haitian remuneration appear above other countries in the region but reasonable by international standards considering Haiti’s relatively low GDP per capita (Graph 3)[[25]](#footnote-25).

**Graph 3**

Average Wages to Per Capita GDP Ratio

Source: IMF

Civil service pay levels in Haiti need to be understood in the context of alternative labor markets for the kind of skills the government would need to carry out its developmental mission. In this light, pay may indeed be low. Indeed, anecdotal reports in mission interviews suggested severe compression between top and bottom rates, a signal that high-level skills are under-rewarded.[[26]](#footnote-26) A review of the formal salary schedule suggests the absence of a coherent remuneration system that aligns compensation incentives properly with skills and responsibility assignments. Moreover, the degree to which this official remuneration schedule reflects actual pay distribution across the civil service could not be determined.

**Graph 4**

(Monthly Salary Schedule in Haiti*/ Bareme de Salaires*)

Source: OMRH

The range of alternative employers for civil service skills is enormous in Haiti, where the proliferation of international donor agencies, NGOs, domestic and international private sector firms is still, post-natural disasters, extremely high. In addition, significant numbers of skilled workers are absorbed by the diaspora – across the island to the Dominican Republic, and to North America and Europe. Careful analysis of these alternative markets is required, but they are presumably significantly more remunerative than civil service positions, even at the highest level, so identifying the reservation price to attract quality human capital to government is a complex task. A very crude illustration is provided in Table 3, which shows the monthly market reference salaries for the Port-au-Prince IDB office staff. The *minimal* market rate for locally hired Level IV contractors, at US$2,947 is nearly three times the *maximum* monthly compensation for the highest civil servant (US$1,021).[[27]](#footnote-27) The highest IDB fee (US$4,580) is between four and five times the civil service remuneration maximum.

**Table 5**

**IDB Local Office Fee Matrix (US$)**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Contract Level | Minimum | Market Reference | Maximum |
| D/TCS\* | 634.6 | 1,009.0 | 1,383.3 |
| D/TC I | 1,029.3 | 1,879.2 | 2,729.1 |
| D/TC II | 1,604.0 | 2,401.0 | 3,198.0 |
| D/TC III | 2,200.7 | 2,983.7 | 3,766.7 |
| D/TC IV | 2,947.1 | 3,763.5 | 4,580.0 |

Given Haiti’s extreme aid dependence - Haiti generated only 12.6% of its GDP in 2014 through its own fiscal revenues[[28]](#footnote-28), relying on multilateral development partner assistance and private donations for 40 percent of its fiscal revenues in 2013 - the solution to the low-pay problem that is draining the talent from the domestic Civil Service will need to be found in the context of the larger international development assistance strategy, either through pooling aid more directly through national institutions or pairing civil service compensation hikes with enhanced own-generated revenue performance over a period of years.[[29]](#footnote-29)

### Compensation Packages and Systems

As in many countries, the Haitian compensation system for civil servants is complicated by a set of opaque non-wage allowances and benefits that are not connected to performance and make it difficult to rationalize remuneration policy. Table 4 shows a typical array of wage and non-wage civil service compensation elements.

**Table 6: Typical Elements of Employee Remuneration**



Senior civil servants are entitled to a position-related indemnity that effectively raises the base salary. And many civil servants receive all manner of monetized social benefits and in-kind rewards as well as specific allowances determined by each ministry. These may or may not appear as a personnel expenditure item in the budget or payroll.

Perhaps the most problematic feature of the Haitian civil service compensation system is that it is static, offering no possibility of reward progression. It is unaffected by years of service or experience, let alone by performance. So, a technical officer makes no more in year twenty of his tenure than he did in year one. Combined with the absence of a career system through which civil servants might advance up a ladder of positions with greater responsibilities and rewards, the civil service offers little to incentivize employees to excel.

Civil servants are entitled to pension benefits through a fund that is maintained off the budget. Analysis of this system is needed to determine its viability, both in terms of its impact on current retirement policies (some number of civil servants who have reached retirement eligibility at age 58 opt not to retire for lack of confidence in the likelihood of a pension pay out) and future government obligations.

Pay is not currently linked to performance. Pay increases are generally across the board. There has been an innovative effort to design a performance contract arrangement within an IDB-financed project in the MARNDR, however. This scheme assigns a portion of the project staff compensation to be determined by their achievement of agreed-upon, measurable results. This effort should be carefully analyzed with an eye to potential application or incorporation into broader civil service pay reform policies, perhaps for selected types of functions or staff.

## 2.6 Development Management

This subsystem covers promotion policies, career paths, training and development, and succession planning. At its best, it ensures that employee development aligns with organizational development, thereby optimizing the likelihood of retaining high-performing talent.

**Effectiveness and Quality of Promotions**

*•****Critical point 23****: The promotion criteria and mechanisms link promotion to performance as well as to competency potential and development.*

*•****Critical point 24:*** *There are alternatives to positions that are strictly hierarchical, such as horizontal career progress, or remaining in the same position, based on recognition of professional excellence without necessarily increasing the formal authority of those affected.*

The lack of a career system and the absence of formal promotion criteria has had a stultifying effect on civil service motivation and is doubtless connected to difficulties in recruiting talent into government away from more attractive alternative labor markets. That said, it should be noted that some civil servants have indeed advanced into positions with greater responsibility and higher compensation. They must do this on the basis of informal networks rather than a strategically managed, coherent – and transparent - career development system, however. It is also worth noting that the lack of a structured career system offers the opportunity for Haiti to adopt a “job” rather than a “rank” or “position” or “career” system. Job systems can be adapted to changing skill requirements more easily than career systems, which often are not as good at clarifying the functional duties and profiles of each position.

The Civil Service manual details provisions for the temporary detachment of staff or secondment within the government. These are exceptional movements, however, that do not pertain to a sustained system of mobility through career advancement or promotion.

**Effectiveness and Quality of Training**

***•Critical point 25:*** *Training supports the development of collective learning, thereby building organizational capacity to tackle problems and provide effective responses.*

*•****Critical point 26:*** *Investment in training is made through plans based on a needs assessment and designed to support the organization’s stated priorities*

***• Critical point 27:*** *Training is subject to evaluation, which extends to the satisfaction of all parties concerned, the cost-results relationship, and the impact on the performance of people in the workplace.*

The PCREs and enabling statutes and decrees/regulatory framework for the Haitian civil service assign high priority to training, given the capacity shortages acknowledged throughout government. L’ENAPP, the ***National School of Administration and Public Policies*** was created in the context of the 2005 Decree revision of the General Statute of the Civil Service. The organizational procedures and the financial resources for its establishment were only put in place in 2013, however. L’ENAPP operates an in-service training institute for sitting civil servants, under the oversight of several boards (*conseils)* that guide its curriculum and overall policies and administration. Its first Director was appointed through a competitive search process at that time, and it recruited several full-time faculties through a specially designed *concours,* including an interview process and a competitive exam. It receives budgetary resources, but it is also the recipient of support grants and technical support from external development partners, including French AFD and Canadian CIDA, which have both provided direct training for cadres as well as training of Haitian trainers. L’ENAPP provides a certificate to civil servants who pass its program, although there is no connection between this certification and career advancement when they have returned to their posts. The courses are provided only to those in the highest leadership posts at present and are mainly focused on general management and strategic planning skills. The physical capacity of L’ENAPP is quite limited (there is only one classroom) and the number of civil servants who have received training so far is small (60 civil servants per 7-month term.)

Training is provided to civil servants through their particular sectorial ministry as well. For example, reorganization and modernization plans of the Ministry of Agriculture and the Ministry of Public Works, Transport and Communications each envisions a significant investment in skill upgrading for technical and managerial staff, based on a needs’ assessment carried out in the context of an IDB-supported functional review.

### Learning Evaluation

To the extent that it exists, the evaluation of training is at the level of satisfaction/reaction and does not extend to relevance, transfer of learning, impact or return on investment.

## 2.7 Human Resources and Social Relations Management

This subsystem focuses on the relationship between the organization and its employees. It covers industrial relations, employee engagement, the maintenance of organizational culture, and the overall impression of the HRM function.

**Management of the Work Climate and Communication**

* ***Critical point 28:*** *The organization makes efforts to learn about its work climate, using reliable instruments for periodic evaluation.*
* ***Critical point 29****: The organization has specific communication instruments that serve to reinforce the sense of belonging and the commitment of employees to the overall organizational project.*
* ***Critical point 30****: Labor relations are preferably and habitually oriented toward agreement and consensus building rather than confrontation and denigration of adversaries.*
* ***Critical point 31****: The degree of labor conflict is not excessive in terms of either the number of conflicts, their effects, or the forcefulness of the means employed.*

While freedom of association is formally guaranteed by the National Law (Article 35.3, and by Article 151 of the Decree of May 17, 2005 of the general statute of the Civil Service that bestows the right of public sector workers, including civil servants, to organize, there do not appear to be strong, dedicated organizations in place that currently represent civil servants in negotiations with Government regarding workplace relations and/or remuneration policy. That said, the CTSP (Confederation of Public and Private Sector Workers of Haiti) a confederation of 12 public sector unions represents the interests of public sector workers in various sectors, such as health and education and of state enterprise workers. Strikes for higher wages and improved conditions were reported as commonplace, according to the counterparts interviewed in OMRH, but it was not clear in which sectors they have occurred. External partners, in particular, the Public Sector Alliance of Canada and the Canadian Union of Public Employees have provided direct support to public sector unions in the context of the post-earthquake reconstruction process. Concerns that the government has actively suppressed public sector union activism, including through dismissing members of union leadership from their positions has been voiced.[[30]](#footnote-30)

### Employee Engagement

No examples of civil service satisfaction surveys were provided, but the civil service manual does provide criteria and advice on the conditions required for an employee-friendly workplace. In addition, guidance on how to conduct a (modest) satisfaction survey appears in the manual. The manual lays out a work program and a set of attributions for the HR directorates in ministries that focus on preventing conflict and developing mechanisms to channel employee grievances and concerns. It also proposes preparation of legislative norms to formalize constructive dialogue between managers and public sector workers, but it would appear that this is more abstract that actual at this point.

## 

## 2.8 Organization of the HRM Function

This subsystem covers the centralized structure for the management of the HRM function as well as how the rest of the Public Service views them.

*•****Critical point 32****: Managers take responsibility and appropriately exercise their responsibilities as managers of the personnel within their sphere of formal authority.*

*•****Critical point 33****: The central civil service agency responsible for the system is viewed by the rest of the organization as a department that adds value to the achievement of the common goals.*

*Public Service Commission*

As suggested earlier, OMRH, within the Prime Minister’s Office, is regarded as a proactive leader both in setting policy and in overseeing administrative functions within the civil service. Its limitations mirror that of the rest of government and society, however. Resource and legitimacy constraints have been exacerbated by successive political and natural crises.

In terms of role of senior civil servants as people managers, without a system by which the senior civil service is groomed and rewarded for a leadership role, these responsibilities are not recognized or developed within the current system.

The day-to-day “people management” function in Haiti’s civil service falls upon HR directorates in the line ministries. While OMRH is working with these units to professionalize their management practices, these units are largely focused on registering personnel transactions that bear on compensation, leave and other immediate HR concerns. As such, they are not generally engaged in longer-range HR management issues such as those that concern career development or performance management. Without a system by which the senior civil service is groomed and rewarded for a leadership role, these responsibilities are not recognized or developed within the current system.

## 2. 9 HRM Subsystems table

The following table presents the scores assigned to each subsystem as well as an explanation of what is covered by the Subsystem.

| # | HRM Subsystem | Aggregate Score (Max score = 100) | Comments |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1 | Human Resources Planning | 15 | This HRM subsystem addresses the degree to which the organization has the necessary human capital – both quantitative and qualitative – in place to effectively implement its strategy. This extends to the existence of appropriate HRM policies and procedures as well as the availability of information systems to enable management to gather, store, retrieve, analyze and interpret staff-related information and to utilize said information to drive effective decision-making.  A mature HR Planning Subsystem enables management to identify any existing HR gaps and to develop strategies to close such gaps. |
| 2 | Work Organization | 15 | Work Organization establishes and specifies the contents of the tasks for each job and the characteristics of the people who will carry them out. This is reflected in the job design – i.e. the description of activities, functions, responsibilities and targets assigned to each position; and the profile definition – i.e. the competencies, skills and attitudes required for successful performance in the given role. |
| 3 | Employment Management | 10 | Employment Management addresses the policies and procedures associated with an employee’s recruitment, selection, induction/orientation, mobility and separation from the organization. The most mature Employment Management subsystems help to ensure that the right talent is brought into the organization, effectively introduced to the organizational culture, provided with appropriate opportunities for upward mobility, reward and recognition and optimally supported through all phases of their tenure up to and including their transition out of the organization. Hallmarks of effective Employment Management include equity and transparency. |
| 4 | Performance Management | 5 | Performance Management refers to the process of planning and evaluating the employees’ contribution to the organization.  Ideally individual as well as departmental performance should be cascaded down from the organization’s strategic priorities and associated goals and objectives. In practical terms, this means that each employee should have specific performance targets which are systematically monitored, and feedback provided to help ensure that all targets are realized during each assessment period.  In a mature performance management system, supervisors/managers work with their direct reports to identify performance gaps and any training and development needs that may be contributing to said gaps. They then create a plan to help eliminate any such gaps. |
| 5 | Compensation Management | 5 | This Subsystem covers both cash and non-cash benefits. The ultimate goal is to achieve both internal and external equity. As such, there should be a clearly defined job classification system with rewards being linked to either individual or group performance. |
| 6 | Development Management | 5 | This Subsystem covers promotion policies, career paths, training and development. It also covers succession planning. At its best, it ensures that employee development aligns with organizational development thereby optimizing the likelihood of retaining high performing talent. |
| 7 | Human and Social Relations Management | 20 | This Subsystem focuses on the relationship between the organization and its employees. It covers industrial relations, employee engagement, the maintenance of organizational culture and the overall impression of the HRM function. |
| 8 | Organization of HRM Function | 30 | This subsystem covers the centralized structure for the management of the HRM function as well as way in which said centralized structures are viewed by the rest of the Public Service. |

# 

# 3. Analysis of the Civil Service Quality Indices

This diagnostic assessment uses the five quality indices of the methodology the IDB applied in Latin America, along with two additional indices, namely, Management Capabilities and Diversity Management, which have been developed specifically for use in the IDB’s Caribbean Civil Service Diagnostics. These seven quality indices contribute to the Civil Service Development Index (aggregated index).

Countries can be classified into three levels of civil service development according to the Civil Service Development Index: (i) low, with scores between 0 and 39 points out of 100; (ii) medium, with scores between 40 and 59; and (iii) high or professional systems, with scores higher than 60.

A score of 27 points shows that Haiti has significant room for improvement. Within the quality indices, Haiti’s scores at a Medium level in Efficiency (with 40 points) and low level in the remaining four. (see Table 7)

**Table 7. Haiti’s** **Civil Service Development Scores, by Quality Index (2018)**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Civil Service Development Index (aggregated index)  Simple average of the following indices. Measures the overall development of HRM in the civil service | 27 |
| 1. Efficiency  Reflects the degree of optimization of the organization’s investment in its human capital | 40 |
| 2. Merit  Reflects the extent to which the organization has well established policies designed to safeguard employees against arbitrary actions and favoritism in managerial decision making | 33 |
| 3. Structural Consistency  Reflects the level of strategic coherence, management and process consistency existing in the organization’s HRM systems | 18 |
| 4. Functional Capacity  Captures the degree of provision, development, and encouragement of relevant competencies in the organization along with the effectiveness of existing performance incentives and overall flexibility/adaptability in the face of changing organizational priorities | 13 |
| 5. Integrative Capacity  Measures the extent to which management, employees, and other key stakeholders experience a sense of belonging and the absence of conflict | 30 |
| 6. Management Capabilities  Covers the spectrum from Transactional Management to Transformational Leadership | 12 |
| 7. Diversity Management  Measures the extent to which opportunities in the Civil Service may be curtailed due to differences associated with race, ethnicity, language, gender, disability, and others | 50 |

The sections below describe each of the quality indices and present Haiti’s scores per critical point under each of them. Scores of critical points range from 0 (lowest) to 5 (highest).

## 3.1 Efficiency

This index measures the civil service system by considering the degree of optimization of investment in human capital, as well as the relationship of this investment to fiscal policy and its reference markets. It links the results obtained by the civil service system with the resources invested in its operation, as well as other considerations, such as expenditure efficiency in decision-making processes.

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Index** | **No.** | **Critical point** | **Score** |
| Efficiency | 3 | In general, there are neither significant staff shortages nor overages. | 1 |
| 4 | The overall cost of civil service staff is maintained within reasonable parameters that are compatible with the country’s economic situation. | 3 |
| 20 | Salary levels, including cash and non-cash benefits, are not excessive compared with labor market costs for any similar sector or grade. | 3 |
| 27 | Training is subject to evaluation, which extends to the satisfaction of all parties concerned, the cost-results relationship, and the impact on the performance of people in the workplace. | 1 |
| 35 | Management proactively identifies mission-critical positions and builds capacity to fill those positions as incumbents transition out. | 0 |

## 

## 3.2 Merit

This index measures the guarantees of professionalism in the way that the civil service system works, placing a value on impartiality in decision making in each management subsystem. Specifically, it measures the degree of effective protection against arbitrariness, political capture or clientelism, and the different ways that interested groups or sectors engage in rent-seeking.

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Index** | **No.** | **Critical point** | **Score** |
| Merit | 10 | Hiring to fill vacancies is open, by right and in fact, to all candidates possessing the required qualifications. These are established according to suitability and technical considerations, not arbitrarily. | 1 |
| 11 | The necessary safeguard mechanisms and procedures are in place against arbitrariness, politicization, patronage, and clientelism throughout the hiring process. | 2 |
| 14 | Dismissals or terminations of employment that affect professional positions are not motivated by a change in the government’s political leanings. | 2 |

## 

## 3.3Structural Consistency

This index measures the civil service’s systemic soundness and integrity, considering the basic structural elements of which it should be composed. It includes the development of fundamental management processes, their coherence with other management systems, and the development of senior management.

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Index** | **No.** | **Critical point** | **Score** |
| Structural consistency | 1 | Staff planning needs usually emanate from the organization’s priorities and strategic orientation. The degree to which they are adjusted to one another tends to be high. | 1 |
| 2 | The HR information systems enable a reasonable awareness of the quantitative and qualitative resources available, now and in the future, in the different organizational areas and units. | 1 |
| 6 | The staffing policies, decisions, and practices in each area of HRM arise from intentions that are determined during the planning process. | 1 |
| 8 | Grading arrangements and job hierarchies result from rational criteria, adapted to each organizational environment. | 0 |
| 22 | Compensation policy is set according to previously established criteria and consistent with the organization’s structural design parameters. | 2 |
| 26 | Investment in training is made via plans that are based on a needs assessment and designed to support the organization’s stated priorities. | 0 |
| 32 | Managers take responsibility and appropriately exercise their responsibilities as managers of the personnel within their sphere of formal authority. | 0 |
| 33 | The central civil service agency responsible for the system is viewed by the rest of the organization as a department that adds value to the achievement of the common goals. | 2 |

## 

## 3.4 Functional Capacity

This index measures the system’s capacity to positively influence the behavior of public employees. It includes professional qualifications, the quality of incentives for good performance, and pay flexibility.

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Index** | **No.** | **Critical point** | **Score** |
| Functional capacity | 5 | The technical level of the workforce is commensurate with a knowledge-based society. Skilled labor represents a significant proportion of the workforce. | 0 |
| 7 | Job descriptions conform to managerial criteria rather than to legal considerations or collective agreements. The legal framework and the employment agreements are limited to establishing a broad framework in which work is organized in accordance with organizational needs. | 0 |
| 9 | Job profiles include the selection of competencies that in each case are considered key for the success of the job holder’s performance. | 0 |
| 12 | Staff selection is based on competency profiles for the potential job holders. | 1 |
| 13 | The mechanisms for functional and geographic mobility respond flexibly to the demands of personnel redeployment | 0 |
| 15 | There is the possibility of terminating the employment relationship due to objectively verified technical, economic, or organizational reasons that justify workforce reductions. | 2 |
| 16 | Management normally defines guidelines and standards regarding expected personnel performance in accordance with the organization’s priorities and strategy. Consequently, employees are aware of the aspects of their performance for which they will be specifically evaluated. | 0 |
| 17 | Throughout the management cycle, management monitors, observes, and supports improvements in employee performance, provides resources, and removes obstacles wherever necessary. | 0 |
| 18 | Employees’ performance is evaluated by the organization and compared to the expected performance standards. | 0 |
| 19 | The pay structure, including cash and non-cash components, is adequate for attracting, motivating, and retaining suitable people with the necessary competencies for the positions that the organization requires. | 1 |
| 21 | The compensation mechanisms encourage people to make more effort and stimulate individual or group performance, learning, and competency development. | 1 |
| 23 | The promotion criteria and mechanisms link promotion to performance as well as to competency potential and development. | 0 |
| 24 | There are alternatives to positions that are strictly hierarchical, such as “horizontal” career progress or remaining in the same position, based on recognition of professional excellence without necessarily increasing the formal authority of those affected. | 0 |
| 25 | Training supports the development of collective learning, thereby building organizational capacity to tackle problems and provide effective responses. | 0 |

## 

## 3.5 Integrative Capacity

This index measures the effectiveness of the civil service system in harmonizing the expectations and interests of the different actors, increasing the sense of belonging, and reducing conflict.

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Index** | **No.** | **Critical point** | **Score** |
| Integrative capacity | 28 | The organization makes efforts to learn about its work climate, using reliable instruments for periodic evaluation. | 1 |
| 29 | The organization has specific communication instruments that serve to reinforce the sense of belonging and the commitment of employees to the overall organizational project. | 1 |
| 30 | Labor relations are preferably and habitually oriented toward agreement and consensus building rather than confrontation and denigration of adversaries. | 2 |
| 31 | The degree of labor conflict is not excessive in terms of either the number of conflicts, their effects, or the forcefulness of the means employed. | 2 |

## 

## 

## 3.6 Management Capabilities

This index covers the spectrum from Transactional Management to Transformational Leadership. Transactional managers are concerned with the status quo and day-to-day progress toward goals. Transformational leaders operate at a more strategic level as they work to enhance the motivation and engagement of followers by directing their behavior toward a shared vision. The lower the score, the more transactional the nature of the current approach to management.

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Index** | **No.** | **Critical point** | **Score** |
| Management capabilities | 32 | Managers take responsibility and appropriately exercise their responsibilities as managers of the personnel within their sphere of formal authority. | 0 |
| 36 | Senior civil servants go beyond managing day-to-day operations and craft strategies for taking the Civil Service to the next level of performance and success. | 0 |
| 38 | Senior civil servants collaborate across ministries and sectors to secure coherence in policies and programs. | 1 |

## 

## 3.7 Diversity Management

This index provides information on the extent to which workers’ access to employment and/or advancement opportunities in the Civil Service may be curtailed due to differences associated with race, ethnicity, language, gender, disability, and others.

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Index** | **No.** | **Critical point** | **Score** |
| Diversity management | 34 | Men, women, minorities, and people from historically marginalized groups are treated fairly in the distribution of benefits and responsibilities. | 0 |
| 37 | Decisions related to hiring, promotion, compensation, discipline, and termination are free from institutional biases associated with variables such as gender, race, ethnicity, class, religion, or place of origin. | 1 |

# 

# 4. Recommendations

The seven quality indices, along with the associated critical points and supporting narrative, are presented in the following subsections.

4. 1 Efficiency

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| # | Critical points | Supporting narrative |
| 3 | **•Staff Shortages and Overages**: There is a clear disproportion between the workforces in the different areas of government. | **Staff Shortages and Overages:** At .8% of population, the size of the civil service (subject to an eventual, accurate head count) is relatively small, so “surpluses” are not aggregate but rather may occur (as evidenced in a few ministerial functional reviews) in individual functions and ministries with under- or inappropriately skilled (or over-aged) staff. The outsized role of donor-sponsored personnel has eclipsed that of national civil service cadres.  **•Overall Cost of the Civil Service:** The wage bill burden of the civil service is also comparatively low, given the limited employment numbers and the under-market remuneration levels. But in this case, low expenditures probably reflect the low investment in civil service institutions as much as adherence to a policy of fiscal prudence.  **Pay Levels:** Pay levels are sometimes buttressed by non-cash benefits, but fail to compete with alternative (donor, private, and off-shore) labor markets.  **Training Evaluation:** L’ENAPP does, through donor programs, carry out some evaluation of its activities. Its annual report focuses on descriptive rather than analytic findings, however.  **Planning:** There is no succession plan in place at this time |
| 4 | **•Overall Cost of the Civil Service:** Measures to contain the wage bill are implemented, although with difficulties in striking the right balance. |
| 20 | **Pay Levels:** Pay levels are slightly above that paid in the reference labour markets. |
| 27 | **Training Evaluation**: There are no formal agencies for evaluating satisfaction, efficiency, or the impact of training activities. |
| 35 | **Planning:** There is no evidence of succession planning in the Service. |

4.2 Merit

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| # | Critical points | Supporting narrative |
| 10 | **•Recruitment and Selection:** There are no rules and procedures for open recruitment of candidates to fill public sector vacancies. | **Recruitment and Selection:** The OMRH has been working to develop and disseminate the use of merit-based criteria and procedures for civil service recruitment. Progress in applying these norms to ministerial hiring (for civil servants, if not contracted employees) is noted, but it is an ongoing process. The 2005 Revision of the General Statute of the Public Administration as well as a 2013 Recruitment Regulation guarantee equal access to civil service employment. |
| 11 | **Meritocratic regulations and procedures:** There are rules, regulations and procedures for meritocratic staff recruitment, which are effectively applied in certain areas of the State | **Meritocratic regulations and procedures:** While safeguard mechanisms and procedures exist and have been codified in a 2013 regulatory framework to centralize and standardized recruitment practices, the degree to which this has achieved the reduction of heretofore prevalent patrimonial hiring practices is yet to be systematically assessed. |
| 14 | **•Vacancy Notices**: There are effective legal safeguards against arbitrary dismissals whenever there is a change of government, although these are not uniformly applied throughout the public sector. | **Vacancy Notices:** Shifts in government positions took place with administrative change at the higher levels of political appointments. However, there are very few or non-existent at the lower levels. Generally, only those who occupy a political position are the ones whose contract may not be reconducted in case of a government change. |

## 4.3 Structural Consistency

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| # | Critical points | Supporting narrative |
| 1 | **Staff planning**: The government’s strategic priorities and orientation have yet to be defined, or, at most, are set out in formal documents without sufficient support or effective implementation in the institutions. | **Staff planning**: While there has been an ongoing planning process embodied in successive PCRE exercises, the degree to which these high-level plans have been aligned with workforce planning and implementation has been at best limited. |
| 2 | **HR Information systems (HRIS):** There is limited availability of human resource information. Information systems are in very early stages of development. | **HR Information systems (HRIS):** Establishment information and control systems are weak; confidence about the actual number of public servants is low. Recent civil service censuses have been flawed, and HRMIS systems (in ministries, OMRH, and Ministry of Finance) to capture and maintain accurate personnel data are deficient. |
| 6 | **•Alignment of HRM Policies:** The existing initiatives in the different areas of HRM are not coordinated | **Alignment of HRM Policies:** There has been an effort to integrate ministerial policies under the guidelines of the OMRH, but this is still a work in progress, with considerable variation among line ministries and agencies. |
| 8 | **Grading arrangements and job hierarchies:** There are no established grading arrangements that determine levels of responsibility and that act as an effective guide for grading arrangements for institutions. | **Grading arrangements and job hierarchies:** There is no in-force grading or career structure, other than a skeletal pay scheme (*bareme de salaires)*. AS above, this is a major HRM deficiency. This is so despite the existence of a constitutional and legal basis for the broad classification of employees into four bureaucratic levels. OMRH’s recent (2017) Action Plan calls for consultant support to help design a robust scheme for job classification. |
| 22 | **•Compensation Policy**: Introduction of organizational criteria in compensation management is applied with partial implementation in public organizations. | **Compensation Policy:** Salaries are established in the bare-boned *Bareme de Salaires* (salary grill), with a set of additional indemnities outlined in a succession of civil service regulations. |
| 26 | **Training based on needs assessment:** There are no systemic assessments of training requirements. | **Training based on needs assessment:** A comprehensive training needs assessment does not appear to have been undertaken. |
| 32 | **• Talent Management:** There is weak development of the senior civil service in terms of HRM responsibilities as heads of working groups. | **Talent Management:** Without a system by which the senior civil service is groomed and rewarded for a leadership role, these responsibilities are not recognized or developed within the current system. |
| 33 | •**Organization of HRM Function:** Measures to strengthen the central civil service agency reinforce its position and the perception of other institutions with regards to the value of its contribution. | •**Organization of HRM Function:** OMRH, within the Prime Minister’s Office, is regarded as a proactive leader both in setting policy and in overseeing administrative functions within the civil service. Its limitations mirror that of the rest of government and society, however. Resource and legitimacy constraints have been exacerbated by successive political and natural crises. |

4.4 Functional Capacity

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| # | Critical points | Supporting narrative |
| 5 | **Skills at the Public Service**: The proportion of civil servants with higher education is growing, although still below the reference labor market. | **Skills at the Public Service:** While Haiti’s civil service is relatively better educated than the broader population (75% of civil servants have secondary degrees), there are still significant numbers of higher-echelon staff with no formal degrees. Beyond this, recent surveys suggest two-thirds of civil servants have no IT skills. |
| 7 | **Job descriptions:** There are no specific job descriptions as such, although there may be only a generic reference to a grading scale. | **Job descriptions**: Job profiles are absent for most positions. The lack of a career or job system linked to a pay and grading structure is a notable HRM weakness. |
| 9 | •**Job** profiles for vacancies: There are neither job descriptions nor profiles for vacancies in most public organizations. | **Job profiles for vacancies**:Job profiles are skeletal at best. |
| 12 | **Merit-based mechanisms:** Public staff recruitment is carried out on the basis of informal criteria, such as trust or political or personal favors. | **Merit-based mechanisms:** The prevalence of these merit-based mechanisms is still to be determined. Reports of ministerial resistance to the introduction of these norms suggests they are indeed being taken seriously, but that patrimonial, informal practices may persist. |
| 13 | **Staff mobility:** The rules and procedures fail to promote staff professional and geographic mobility. | **Staff mobility:** Functional and geographical mobility is possible depending on availability of funds and the needs of an institution. However, it is very scarcely and even less for women. |
| 15 | **Dismissal rules & procedures:** The current rules and procedures envisage the possibility of dismissal for objectively verified technical, economic, or organizational reasons, although this only occurs in isolated cases. | **Dismissal rules & procedures:** While the Civil Service Manual does provide for sanctions for inappropriate behavior, it does not elaborate on the nature of penalties or disciplinary action that would ensue. The HR guidance on termination is equated with procedures related to retirement. While it appears that it is possible in principle to be terminated, it appears to happen rarely, if ever. |
| 16 | •**Performance Standards:** There are no systemic rules and procedures for establishing objectives and performance standards. | **Performance Standards:** A 2014 regulation outlined performance evaluation for the civil service, providing for yearly evaluations under the guidance of OMRH. The degree to which these formal provisions are undermined by informal practice is not clear, the absence of a means for feeding evaluation information into a well-structured career and grading system undermines the value of the performance evaluation mechanism. |
| 17 | **•Performance Management:** The technical tools that enable managers to support their staff’s performance are lacking. | **•Performance Management:** No information on compliance is available. |
| 18 | * **Performance evaluation:** There are no systematic rules and procedures for evaluating performance. | **Performance evaluation:** A system exists, and ministries do reportedly carry out performance evaluations on a regular basis. But no formal assessment of the performance evaluation practices is available to adequately assess its effectiveness or the degree to which it has any meaningful consequences for pay, performance, discipline, or career development. |
| 19 | **•Pay Structure:** There are difficulties in attracting and retaining qualified staff in most areas of the State. | **Pay Structure:** Civil service remuneration (compared with alternative markets for relevant skills) is largely inadequate to attract and motivate suitable candidates to government service. |
| 21 | **Payment based on performance:** The compensation mechanisms fail to consider either individual or group performance or the incorporation of competencies. | **Payment based on performance:** Pay is not linked to performance. Pay increases are generally across the board. |

4.5 Integrative Capacity

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| # | Critical points | Supporting narrative |
| 28 | * **Work climate**: The work climate is not measured in public institutions. | **Work climate:** No examples of civil service satisfaction surveys are available, but the civil service manual does provide guidance on the conditions required for an employee-friendly workplace and it outlines the need for legislative norms to formalize constructive dialogue between managers and public sector employees. This appear more abstract than actual, however. |
| 29 | * **Employee Engagement:** There is a lack of communication instruments designed to reinforce the sense of belonging and commitment by employees. | **Employee Engagement:** While some ministries or departments have regular staff meetings, utilize an intranet and newsletter to communicate with staff, and recognize outstanding employees through awards, the practice is not institutionalized. |
| 30 | * **Labour relations & organization:** Situations of denigration and confrontation persist in labour relations in a few specific areas of the State. | **Labour relations & organization:** There is no formal recognition of public sector unions but the CTSP has been active in organizing some civil servants as well as state enterprise employees. |
| 31 | * **Conflicts:** Points of intense conflict persist in certain areas of the State. | **Conflicts:** Strikes for higher wages and improved conditions are not uncommon |

4.6 Management Capabilities

This index covers the spectrum from Transactional Management to Transformational Leadership. Transactional managers are concerned about the status quo and day-to-day progress toward goals. Transformational leaders operate at a more strategic level as they work to enhance the motivation and engagement of followers by directing their behavior toward a shared vision.

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| # | Critical points | Supporting narrative |
| 32 | * **People Management:** There is weak development of the senior civil service in terms of HRM responsibilities as heads of working groups. | **People Management:** Without a system by which the senior civil service is groomed and rewarded for a leadership role, these responsibilities are not recognized or developed within the current system. |
| 36 | * **Strategic Management and Alignment**: Most senior civil servants spend the vast majority of their time at the operational level, focusing on administrative tasks required to maintain the status quo. | **Strategic Management and Alignment**: Given the capacity constraints and pressing developmental challenges confronting civil servants at all levels, long-term strategic thinking regarding performance enhancement is not a high priority. Nonetheless, managers did have views about what kinds of steps might be taken to improve civil service HRM in the future. |
| 38 | * **Stakeholder Engagement**: There is little evidence of the integration of stakeholder consultations in the formulation and implementation of government policies and programs. | **Stakeholder Engagement:** Coordination mechanisms, such as the CSAFP, led by the Prime Minister and for which the OMRH acts as Secretariat, offers a viable mechanism for coordination, subject to the many centrifugal pressures that make national policy coherence challenging in many (especially aid-dependent) country contexts. HR policy in Haiti also requires coordination between the OMRH, the MEF and the DGHR of individual ministries, which often face informational and capacity difficulties. |

4.7 Diversity Management

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| # | Critical points | Supporting narrative |
| 34 | * **Discriminatory practices:** While they exist, the legal and regulatory provisions designed to protect public officers against discriminatory practices in the distribution of benefits and responsibilities are either weak/ineffective or not consistently applied. | **Discriminatory practices:** The 2005 Revision of the General Public Service Statute, reinforced by the 2013 Recruitment Regulation, guarantees equal access to civil service employment, prohibiting discrimination on the basis of gender, disability, or sexual orientation. In 2013, women represented on-third of staff, below OECD averages but above worldwide comparators. Female participation is highest in the capital, although in some ministries their participation is below the constitutional mandate of 30%. Language discrimination has not been well studied to see the degree to which Kreyol speakers are well integrated into the civil service, and at what bureaucratic levels. |

# 

# 5. Conclusions

This diagnostic assessment utilizes the five quality indices described by Longo (2006) along with two additional indices – namely **Management Capabilities** and **Diversity Management** – which have been developed specifically for the use in the IDB’s Caribbean Civil Service Diagnostics. The assessment of Haiti’s systems on these indices, along with the associated critical points, are presented in **SECTION 3** to this report.

More generally, this review exercise has identified a set of core civil service challenges that continue to constrain Haiti’s institutional capacity. These issues are highlighted below, along with recommendations for reform measures that should be considered to address them.

Broadly, the assessment found that Haiti’s civil service, decimated by recent natural disasters and weakened by both recent and longstanding political instability, is operating with very low capacity and is lacking the institutional structures and systems needed to raise its level of administrative performance and service delivery in order to meet its most basic developmental challenges. Three fundamental problems are emphasized:

First, the civil service lacks an adequate establishment management information and control needed to ensure sound fiscal policy on employment and pay and to formulate and implement policies to develop an appropriately dimensioned cadre of well-paid, well-trained talent pool. Some of the features of this weakness include a weak HR Management Information system (with poor articulation of linkages among MEF, OMRH and the ministries) non-credible information on numbers, placement and compensation status of civil servants, and lack of accurate information on the growing numbers of contracted workers.

Second, the civil service lacks very basic rules, structures and systems for classifying, paying and advancing the careers of civil servants. Elements of this problem include the lack of a robust classification and pay and grading system for the civil service and the absence of mechanisms for incentivizing civil servants’ performance or attracting quality candidates to service.

Third, the overall remuneration system offers inadequate rewards to compete with alternative labor markets, including donor operations. A feature of this low reward system is the over-reliance on perverse, largely opaque and therefore unmanageable incentives such as position inflation and non-performance allowances. Possible consequences include poor performance, absenteeism and corruption.

Fourth, the investment in training and capacity building to raise the quality and autonomy of civil service institutions has been inadequate and under-performing.

There has been ongoing discussion about the above challenges and some efforts to introduce reforms have been initiated. The following constitute broad recommendations that are offered for government’s further consideration as it takes its civil service reform program forward in the next five to ten years.

* Improve establishment management control
  + Carry out a robust (probably with some biometric validation) civil service census with wide coverage, possibly with links to universal ID system, once a sound retrieval system to capture, maintain and update HRMIS data is in place.
  + Build a comprehensive computerized HRMIS system, with links in OMRH, line ministries. It should cover all budget entities, contain basic personnel information for both civil servants and contracted employees.
  + Link this to an integrated payroll system, perhaps through the installation of an appropriately designed IFMS that takes on board the need to sequence the capacity building, institutional infrastructure, required for the Haitian context.
* Develop HR systems, institutions and incentives
  + Design a classification system that selects the best fit for Haiti as regards a “career” based vs. a “job” system.
  + Link job or position classifications to a pay and grading system that contains a salary scale with steps that progress up a defined, performance-based ladder.
  + Design a promotion or career advancement system to incentivize civil servants, possibly embracing a higher civil service leadership cadre.
  + Revise recruitment to accommodate new skills and profiles.
  + Invest in training (further developing L’ENAPP along with other mechanisms) for in- and pre-service capacity development.
* Find the (probably higher) reservation wage for civil servants
  + Conduct a comparative pay survey with benchmark job information on private, donor, NGO, offshore labor markets for skills desirable to recruit into civil service
  + Develop a strategy and policy framework for recruiting contracted employees that includes conditions of pay, tenure, types of roles, information and monitoring trends
* Develop strategies for re-dimensioning (the size, distribution and cost) the civil service
  + Model pay and employment options
  + Design early retirement and voluntary departure schemes (gleaning lessons from pilot ministries)
  + Perform pension analysis to determine financial and legal requirements of future re-dimensioning initiatives.

**5. ANNEX I**

**Foundational Civil Service Legal Framework**

* The Constitution of Haiti (June 20, 2012) especially articles: 136, 160, 171, 235, 236-1, 236-2, 237, 238, 239, 240, 241, 242, 243 et 244;
* Law of August 26, 1870 assigning responsibilities for public servants and state employees in the Public Administration.
* Law of August 15, 1871 elaborating public servants’ responsibilities.
* Law of December 19, 1946, introducing diplomatic career specialization.
* Law of September 17, 1958 conferring position stability to diplomatic personnel.
* General Statute of the Public Service, September 19, 1982.
* Law of August 20th, 1996, establishing the Customs Service Statute.
* Law of February 12, 2008.
* Law of March 12, 2014 on anti-corruption.
* Decree-Law of December 28, 1943 on public official responsibilities.
* Decree Law of May 17, 2005, revising the general statute of the public service and reorganizing the structure of the central administration of the state.
* Decree of November 23, 2005, establishing the organization and operational directives of the Superior Court of Accounts and its administrative responsibilities.
* By-law (Arête) of May 25, 2009 revising regulatory provisions for civil service training, recruitment, career advancement and HR management, under auspices of the OMRH.
* By-Law of April 2, 2013 (Circular 006) to standardize civil service recruitment, strengthening merit-based selection criteria.
* By-Law of September 2014 introducing individual performance evaluation.
* Draft law of April 2018 to revise and modernize the civil service general statute.

# 

# 6. Sources of Information

Azam-Pradeilles, (julio, 2017) Auditoría Organizacional del Ministerio de Obras Públicas, Transporte y Comunicaciones y apoyo para el rediseño de la reforma de la ley orgánica, Unión Europea

*Better Spending, Better Services – A review of Public Finances in Haiti*. The World Bank, 2016.

Dan Beeton, “New Report Details Persecution of Public and Private Sector Union Activists in Haiti,” Center for Economic and Policy Research. CEPR.net. April 2014.

*Decret Statut General Fonction Publique* May 17, 2005, Art. 90-100.

Election Guide: Democracy Assistance and Elections News [www.electionguide.org/elections/id/2985/](http://www.electionguide.org/elections/id/2985/)

[Garcia-Zamor, Jean-Claude](https://search-proquest-com.proxy.library.nyu.edu/indexinglinkhandler/sng/au/Garcia-Zamor,+Jean-Claude/$N); [Mayo-Smith, Ian](https://search-proquest-com.proxy.library.nyu.edu/indexinglinkhandler/sng/au/Mayo-Smith,+Ian/$N?accountid=12768), “Administrative reform in Haiti: problems, progress and prospects,” Public Administration & Development**,**[Vol. 3, Iss. 1,](https://search-proquest-com.proxy.library.nyu.edu/indexingvolumeissuelinkhandler/37735/Public+Administration+$26+Development++$28pre-1986$29/01983Y01Y01$23Jan-Mar+1983$3b++Vol.+3+$281$29/3/1?accountid=12768) (Jan-Mar 1983):

*Guide de Planification Stratégique des Ressources Humaines dans la Fonction Publique*, OMRH, 2014.

HA-L1131 “Strengthening Public Management for Improved Service Delivery.”

IMF, Selected Issues, 2015 p 54 and Sixth Review under the Extended Credit Facility Arrangement and Rephasing of Disbursements, 13/260; <http://primature.gouv.ht/?page_id=28>.

Inter-Parliamentary Union Parline. [www.ipu.org](http://www.ipu.org)

Lafuente and Molina (2018) “Building State Capacity: The State of the Civil Service in the Caribbean.” Inter-American Development Bank, Washington, DC.

La Primature, décembre 2014. Manuel de politiques, normes et procédures de gestion des ressources humaines.

*Manuel de Politiques, Normes et Procédures de Gestion des Ressources Humaines*, OMRH 2014.

Nunberg, B. and Taliercio, R., “Sabotaging Civil Service Reform in Aid-Dependent Countries,” *World Development*, Vol. 40, No. 10, 2012.

OMRH Census, ILO, OECD, World Bank, various recent years.

OMRH’s recent Action Plan calls for consultant support to help design and put in place a robust scheme for classifying jobs and/or positions. *Plan d’Action*, OMRH, 2017.

Tentative de Bilan de mise en œuvre du Plan de Réforme institutionnelle du MARNDR tentative de Bilan – période 2013-2017

The Economist, “A Sorry State.” June 8, 2017

Tommaso, Giulio. 2017. “The State of the Haitian Public Administration. A preliminary assessment.”

1. [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. Please see the full details of the methodology in the publication Lafuente and Molina (2018) “Building State Capacity: The State of the Civil Service in the Caribbean.” Inter-American Development Bank, Washington, DC. HA-L1131 “Strengthening Public Management for Improved Service Delivery.” [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. The subsystems in question are Human Resource Planning, Work Organization, Employment Management, Performance Management, Compensation Management, Development Management, Human and Social Relations Management, and the Organization of the HRM Function. [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
4. The seven quality indices are Efficiency, Merit, Structural Consistency, Functional Consistency, Integrative Capacity, Management Capabilities, and Diversity Management. [↑](#footnote-ref-4)
5. Election Guide: Democracy Assistance and Elections News [www.electionguide.org/elections/id/2985/](http://www.electionguide.org/elections/id/2985/) [↑](#footnote-ref-5)
6. In March 2017, 12 CARICOM member states endorsed the Charter for Caribbean Public Services. The Charter was designed to inform how member countries achieve public sector transformation by focusing on governance and productivity. [↑](#footnote-ref-6)
7. The Economist, “A Sorry State.” June 8, 2017. [↑](#footnote-ref-7)
8. Inter-Parliamentary Union Parline. www.ipu.org [↑](#footnote-ref-8)
9. Inter-American Commission on Human Rights, *supra* note 6, para. 126. [↑](#footnote-ref-9)
10. IMF, Selected Issues, 2015 p 54 and Sixth Review under the Extended Credit Facility Arrangement and Rephasing of Disbursements, 13/260; http://primature.gouv.ht/?page\_id=28. [↑](#footnote-ref-10)
11. Haiti has ten administrative divisions, also called departments. These ten departments are further divided into arrondissements, which are further divided into communes. In total, there are 42 arrondissements and 145 communes, the latest of which were created only a couple of years ago. Further dividing the municipalities are 571 communal sections. [↑](#footnote-ref-11)
12. Whether the constitutional establishment of a public administration also created a civil service is subject to interpretation, inasmuch as a cross-system set of norms and rules unifying disparate ministerial behaviour was not put in place until the 1982 Civil Service Statute referenced above. See, [Garcia-Zamor, Jean-Claude](https://search-proquest-com.proxy.library.nyu.edu/indexinglinkhandler/sng/au/Garcia-Zamor,+Jean-Claude/$N?accountid=12768" \o "Click to search for more items by this author); [Mayo-Smith, Ian](https://search-proquest-com.proxy.library.nyu.edu/indexinglinkhandler/sng/au/Mayo-Smith,+Ian/$N?accountid=12768), “Administrative reform in Haiti: problems, progress and prospects,” Public Administration & Development**,**[Vol. 3, Iss. 1,](https://search-proquest-com.proxy.library.nyu.edu/indexingvolumeissuelinkhandler/37735/Public+Administration+$26+Development++$28pre-1986$29/01983Y01Y01$23Jan-Mar+1983$3b++Vol.+3+$281$29/3/1?accountid=12768) (Jan-Mar 1983): 39. [↑](#footnote-ref-12)
13. Please see Appendix I for particulars of the critical points. [↑](#footnote-ref-13)
14. *Guide de Planification Stratégique des Ressources Humaines dans la Fonction Publique*, OMRH, 2014. [↑](#footnote-ref-14)
15. An analysis is being undertaken through a separate IDB supported exercise, which is forthcoming in the following months. [↑](#footnote-ref-15)
16. Better Spending, Better Services – A review of Public Finances in Haiti, p. 8. [↑](#footnote-ref-16)
17. Category A comprises the high-level director personnel, requiring university or “licence” credentials; category B includes supervisory staff with some tertiary or certificate education [↑](#footnote-ref-17)
18. Tommaso, Giulio. 2017. “The State of the Haitian Public Administration. A preliminary assessment.” [↑](#footnote-ref-18)
19. *Decret Statut General Fonction Publique* May 17, 2005, Art. 90-100. [↑](#footnote-ref-19)
20. *Manuel de Politiques, Normes et Procédures de Gestion des Ressources Humaines*, OMRH 2014. [↑](#footnote-ref-20)
21. OMRH’s recent Action Plan calls for consultant support to help design and put in place a robust scheme for classifying jobs and/or positions. *Plan d’Action*, OMRH, 2017. [↑](#footnote-ref-21)
22. Initial work was undertaken in functional reviews of the Ministries of Agriculture and Transport, Works and Communications begun this kind of analysis, but more systematic work is needed. See : « Tentative de Bilan de mise en œuvre du Plan de Réforme institutionnelle du MARNDR tentative de Bilan – période 2013-2017 » and « Audit organisationnel du Ministère des Travaux Publics, des Transports et des Communications et appui à la refonte de la loi organique. » [↑](#footnote-ref-22)
23. La Primature, décembre 2014. Manuel de politiques, normes et procédures de gestion des ressources humaines. p. 246 [↑](#footnote-ref-23)
24. OECD cited in De Tommaso. [↑](#footnote-ref-24)
25. De Tommaso. [↑](#footnote-ref-25)
26. Ad hoc reporting in the Ministry of Public Works suggested an ultra-compressed salary ratio of top to bottom (Chief of Service and Clerk) of 1.1. [↑](#footnote-ref-26)
27. This compensation does not include allowances, which are difficult to calculate for any given individual, since they vary significantly and are assigned on a case-by-case basis. [↑](#footnote-ref-27)
28. *Better Spending, Better Services – A review of Public Finances in Haiti*. The World Bank, 2016. [↑](#footnote-ref-28)
29. Nunberg, B. and Taliercio, R., “Sabotaging Civil Service Reform in Aid-Dependent Countries,” *World Development*, Vol. 40, No. 10, 2012. [↑](#footnote-ref-29)
30. Dan Beeton, “New Report Details Persecution of Public and Private Sector Union Activists in Haiti,” Center for Economic and Policy Research. CEPR.net. April 2014. [↑](#footnote-ref-30)