

TC Document

I. Basic Information for TC

▪ Country/Region:	BRASIL
▪ TC Name:	Evidence-based Public Security Policies Platform
▪ TC Number:	BR-T1420
▪ Team Leader/Members:	Serrano Berthet, Rodrigo (IFD/ICS) Team Leader; Celeste Marzo, Cristina (LEG/SGO); De Araujo Esteves, Fernando Henrique (CSC/CBR); De Oliveira Santos, Lorayne (CSC/CBR); Mahfouz, Giovanna L. (IFD/ICS); Rodrigues Gomes, Camila (IFD/ICS); Valente Lins, Paula (CSC/CBR); Vieira De Andrade Dias, Julia (CSC/CBR); Zwi, Sergio (ORP/GCM)
▪ Taxonomy:	Client Support
▪ Operation Supported by the TC:	
▪ Date of TC Abstract authorization:	07 Apr 2019.
▪ Beneficiary:	State and Municipal governments of Brazil through their Secretariats of Public Security"
▪ Executing Agency and contact name:	Inter-American Development Bank
▪ Donors providing funding:	OC Strategic Development Program for Institutions(INS)
▪ IDB Funding Requested:	US\$150,000.00
▪ Local counterpart funding, if any:	US\$70,000.00 (In-Kind)
▪ Disbursement period (which includes Execution period):	24 months
▪ Required start date:	July 15, 2019
▪ Types of consultants:	Firm and individual
▪ Prepared by Unit:	IFD/ICS-Innovation in Citizen Services Division
▪ Unit of Disbursement Responsibility:	CSC/CBR-Country Office Brazil
▪ TC included in Country Strategy (y/n):	yes
▪ TC included in CPD (y/n):	no
▪ Alignment to the Update to the Institutional Strategy 2010-2020:	Institutional capacity and rule of law

II. Objectives and Justification of the TC

- 2.1 The objective of this TC is to strengthen the capacities of public officials from state and municipal Public Security Secretaries in Brazil to adopt evidence-based public security policies in Brazil by (i) training them on how to design and implement Randomized Control Trials (RCTs) that assess the impact of some of their key interventions, and (ii) facilitating their access to the knowledge base about what works and what does not in public security.
- 2.2 Brazil has been suffering for the last four decades with epidemic rates of violence without being able to implement policies that have successfully reversed this situation. One of the reasons of this failure is the little use of evidence-based knowledge in the decision-making process. Brazil is trapped in a cycle of "short-term urgencies" that repeats itself incessantly without accumulating knowledge about what works and what does not work to reduce violence. At the international level, the Evidence-Based Public Security (EBPS) paradigm has been driving the accumulation of scientific knowledge

in the area and making policing, crime prevention, and criminal justice efforts much more effective.

- 2.3 There have been no Randomized Control Trials done on any public security topic in Brazil so far. A Systematic Review of impact evaluations in Brazil identified 44 evaluations conducted with rigorous methodology (at least level 3 in the Maryland Scale) but none of them was an RCT, which is considered the gold standard in terms of scientific knowledge generation to identify causal effects (Kopittke, 2019). In the US, Canada, and UK, RCTs have played a key role in promoting the adoption of evidence-based interventions. In prevention, the Chicago Crime Lab has demonstrated how well-crafted RCTs can have large scale policy impacts, for instance with its program BAM (Becoming a Man). In policing, Lawrence Sherman's triple T approach (Target, Test, and Track) from the University of Cambridge has spearheaded the evidence-based policing movement. In criminal justice, the Laura and John Arnold Foundation (LJAP) and Arnold Ventures Foundation have been active promoters of RCTs, for instance, in the field of pre-trial risk assessments.
- 2.4 This operation will help Brazil to catch up with the global movement towards evidence based public security policies. To do this it will build on, and further strengthen, an effort that has already begun to form a community of practice with top Brazilian security experts focused on evidence-based policies, as part of CBR's outreach civil society strategy. This community of practice has decided to create a *Plataforma de Políticas de Segurança Pública Baseadas em Evidências*, which will have as its main initial product an on-line repository of EBPS interventions. The objective of this Platform is twofold, (i) to disseminate available scientific evidence on public safety interventions implemented around the world, and (ii) to generate new scientific evidence from interventions implemented in Brazil. Modest initial funding has been secured to develop this repository with resources from IDB. This operation will further strengthen it by supporting the generation and dissemination of evidence in Brazil. The results from this TC will help improve the portfolio of citizen security operations being implemented in the country (BR-L1331, BR-L1343, BR-L1387, BR-L1497) as well as those being designed, through better access to international and national evidence on what works in public security.
- 2.5 This TC is consistent with the Institutional Strategy Update (UIS) 2010-2020 (AB-3008) and strategically aligns with the cross-cutting themes of institutions and the rule of law, by supporting government agencies to strengthen their decision-making processes through greater use of evidence base knowledge. In addition, the program contributes to the 2016-2019 Corporate Results Framework (GN-2727-6) in the cross cutting them of institutional capacity and rule of law, in particular since improved knowledge of what works will help agents to have confidence in and abide by the rules of society, and, in particular, improve the quality of the police and the courts, as well as the likelihood of crime and violence. This TC is aligned with the objectives of the Strategic Program for the Development of Ordinary Capital-Financed Institutions (GN-2819-1), in particular with the objective of strengthening the rule of law, citizen security and the fight against corruption, and the quality of institutions and policies (evidence-based policy decisions). It is also aligned with the Sectoral Strategy on Institutions for Growth and Social Welfare (GN-2587-2) since it will support the planning of public policies for citizen security, and the Sectoral Framework for Citizen Security and Justice (GN-2771-7) since it advances two of its core principles (expand knowledge and empirical evidence, and strengthen evaluation; see para 5.5). This cooperation is aligned with the Country Strategy with Brazil 2019-2022 (GN-2973), with regards to the strategic

area of reducing inequity and improving public services, especially by contributing to better public security management).

III. Description of activities/components and budget

- 3.1 **Component 1. Supporting the creation of evidence (US\$110,000, of which US\$ 20,000 are counterpart).** This component aims to strengthen the capacity of public officials working in Public Security Secretaries at the state and municipal level on how to design and implement RCTs. Key units within these Secretaries are the Crime and Violence Observatories, Crime Analysis Units, and Monitoring and Evaluation Offices. To achieve this objective, two calls for proposals for potential RCTs will be organized, one aimed at state level and the other one at municipal level Secretaries. The call will request Secretaries to propose interventions that they are implementing or planning to implement, and that they would like to evaluate their impact through Randomized Controlled Trials. The top three to five proposals in each call will be selected to participate in a four-day workshop to train government officials on basic methods for RCTs and assist them in thinking how to develop an RCT to answer some of the key strategic or operational questions that are relevant to their intervention.
- 3.2 Criteria for selecting the proposals will include: (i) the quality of the intervention being evaluated (based on the extent to which it is informed by the available evidence base); (ii) the capacity to access/produce the data required for the RCT (either through existing administrative data or through funding for data gathering), (iii) the quality of the technical team (with bonus points for partnerships between local universities and government agencies); and (iv) the feasibility of implementing the RCT in a period of 6 to 8 months. In each of the competitions the TC will finance technical assistance to design and supervise the implementation of RCTs as well as the travelling costs of all participants to the workshop. The main products of this component will be at least two RCTs designed and implemented; one for state level and one for municipal level.
- 3.3 The 24 months' timeline will be roughly divided in four periods:
 - first semester: launching the call for proposals, organizing two workshops and selecting at least two RCTs for further design.
 - second semester: work with the two winners in refining RCT design and planning implementation;
 - third semester: RCT implementation and supervision;
 - fourth semester: analyzing and writing up the results.
- 3.4 The 6 to 8 months requirement for the duration of RCT implementation is not unusual for experiments in public security. The initial results of many types of interventions should be already visible in that period. For instance, License Plate Readers, CCTV, the dosage of patrolling in hot spot policing, are all experiments that have been done in short periods of time. Indeed, there is a long list of experiments that have been conducted in developed countries for which we know nothing about in developing countries and that will be good candidates for testing in the institutional and crime and violence context of Brazil.
- 3.5 The main motivation is not necessarily to produce the most sophisticated and cutting edge RCTs, but rather to demonstrate, to decision makers and the public, that it is

possible to produce highly rigorous, policy relevant and timely answers to know whether what the police and public security forces are doing is delivering results or not.

- 3.6 **Component 2. Supporting the dissemination of evidence (US\$110,000 of which US\$ 50,000 are counterpart).** The objective of this component is to facilitate access of public officials from state and municipal Public Security Secretaries in Brazil to the knowledge base about what works and what does not in public security. To do that this component will support two products. First, it will finance the development of content material for the website of the Plataforma de Políticas de Segurança Pública baseadas em Evidências. This will consist mainly of written summaries for each type of intervention that has been selected to be in the platform, containing a description of the methodology and a review of the evidence using the available meta-analysis, systematic reviews, and other materials accessible through platforms like Campbell Collaboration, Crimelutions.gov, as well as reviews from Latin America and Brazil. Second, it will finance the production of a Brazilian/Portuguese version of the Citizen Security MOOC that is being prepared by KIC and ICS for 2019 and which will feature what we know about what works in security. It will finance the translation from Spanish to Portuguese of MOOC contents so that the MOOC is available in Portuguese and from Portuguese to Spanish of videos, written summaries, and training materials about successful interventions from Brazil to feed into the Spanish version of the MOOC.
- 3.7 The total budget of the project will be US\$220,000, of which US\$150,000 will be financed by the OC Strategic Development Program for Institutions (INS), and US\$70,000 by local counterpart. The Counterpart funding will be provided in species in component 1, consisting of workshop venues, catering, communication equipment, and personnel from the participating subnational governments; and in cash in component 2, from a TC (BR-T1406, and a cutting-edge fund from KIC). The following table summarizes the main activities and their cost.

Indicative Budget

Activity/ Component	Description	IDB/Fund Funding (OC/INS)	Counterpart Funding	Total Funding
Component 1. Supporting the creation of evidence				
Two RCT Workshops	Tickets, hotel and per diem, and workshop expenses	30,000	10,000	40,000
Training and technical assistance to design and implement 2 RCTs	Hiring Consultants and firm	60,000	10,000	70,000
Component 2. Supporting the dissemination of evidence				
Written and visual communication products for the Platform	Consulting services	40,000	30,000 (CT-BR-T1406)	70,000
Input for Brazilian version of MOOC (translation, communication materials)	Hiring consultants	20,000	20,000 (admin budget KIC/CBR)	40,000
TOTAL		150,000	70,000	220,000

- 3.8 Arrangements Progress reports will be presented to report on progress in the activities and in the intermediate and final results of this TC. The results and products of the TC will be disseminated through seminars and workshops on socialization and consultation with specialists, as well as through publications and working documents, and the Bank's institutional blogs. The products and results of the TC will be shared with the Technical Secretariat of the INS, and the fund will be adequately recognized in the knowledge products and dissemination of TC results. An assessment of the achievements and challenges of the TC will be made at the time of its closure.

IV. Executing agency and execution structure

- 4.1 This TC will be implemented by the Bank. The executing agency will be the Bank, through the Innovation Division to Serve the Citizen (IFD / ICS). This operation will benefit from the Bank's execution with regards to all the hiring and procurement processes, which will be done directly and exclusively by the Bank given the comparative advantage to articulate the efforts of different actors and entities involved at the national, state and municipal level, both in public, civil society, and private sectors. The UDR will be located in CBR, where the team leader is located. The justification for Bank execution has to do with the nature of the activity which does not have a natural single institutional counterpart in government, with different skills and mandates spread through different agencies (government think tanks that can do research but not always have the same view as the sectoral ministries/secretaries or of the academic or practitioner specialists to involve in the process).
- 4.2 All activities to be executed under this TC have been included in the Procurement Plan (see Annex III) and will be contracted in accordance with Bank policies as follows: (a) AM-650 for Individual consultants; (b) GN-2765-1 and Guidelines OP-1155-4 for Consulting Firms for services of an intellectual nature and; (c) GN-2303-20 for logistics and other related services.

V. Major issues

- 5.1 There are three main risks: The first one, and most important relates to the potential low interest of government counterparts in participating in a national contest to evaluate their interventions and policies. To mitigate this risk, there will be an explicit effort to reach out to the various national membership associations that group public security agencies (such as the Colegio Nacional de Secretarios Estaduais de Seguranca Publica, Colegio de Comandantes da Policia Militar, Colegio de Chefes da policia civil, etc) using their regular meetings and communication channels to reach their members. Communication materials developed for the Platform will showcase the impact that some of the most well-known RCTs have had in the field of public security in developed countries.
- 5.2 The second risk relates to the lack of a tradition among public security experts in Brazil for doing RCTs. To mitigate this risk, the Bank has already formed a core group with Brazilian experts who have expressed their interest in being part of the Platform and that come from different fields (including economics, and statistics) and some of which have expertise developing RCTs in other sectors. The TC will also draw from IDB's pool of professionals in SPD, RES, and ICS with expertise conducting RCTs to strengthen capacities in Brazil.

- 5.3 The third risk relates to the risk of this being an isolated, one time shot, which lacks sustainability and impact at the systemic level. To mitigate this risk, there will be an effort to mobilize additional resources to give more visibility, volume and sustainability to the efforts to promote an evidence-based culture in public security in Brazil. For instance, informal conversations have taken place with Brazilian corporate foundations and private universities, some of which have expressed interest in contributing funds to support RCTs. In addition, the Bank is promoting through its loans and other Technical Cooperations the implementation of RCTs and other types of impact evaluations in Brazil, contributing to give more visibility to the generation of evidence in the country.

VI. Exceptions to Bank policy

- 6.1 This TC does not have exceptions to Bank policy.

VII. Environmental and Social Strategy

- 7.1 Given the characteristics of the project, no negative environmental or social risks are expected, so the classification of this operation according to the Environment and Safeguards Compliance Policy (OP-703) is "C". [See Safeguard Policy Filter \(SPF\) and Safeguard Screening Form \(SSF\).](#)

Required Annexes:

[Request from the Client - BR-T1420](#)

[Results Matrix - BR-T1420](#)

[Terms of Reference - BR-T1420](#)

[Procurement Plan - BR-T1420](#)