*ANNEX*

*EZ-Share#*

# **TERMS OF REFERENCE**

REGIONAL

RG-T3126

**Research and Analytical Support – Gender Analysis**

1. **Background and Justification**
   1. Established in 1959, the Inter-American Development Bank (“IDB” or “Bank”) is the main source of financing for economic, social and institutional development in Latin America and the Caribbean. It provides loans, grants, guarantees, policy advice and technical assistance to the public and private sectors of its borrowing countries.
   2. On March 20, 2016, the IDB Board approved the creation of the Compete Caribbean Partnership Facility (CCPF) as a multi-donor Trust Fund jointed funded by the United Kingdom’s Department for International Development (DFID) and the Caribbean Development Bank (CDB). The ultimate goal of the Compete Caribbean Partnership Facility is to support the Caribbean region in increasing productivity and Caribbean firms’ contribution to economic growth. The specific objectives are to (i) support firms to grow, innovate and enter new sectors and markets; and (ii) to promote an environment that enables innovation and growth. The Facility will support productivity and economic growth in the Caribbean by focusing on two thematic pillars: (i) productivity and innovation in firms; and (ii) enhancing the business and innovation climate. The Facility is being executed by Inter-American Development Bank and henceforth all procedures related to operations and implementation thereof must comply with IDB policies.
   3. Phase 1 of Compete Caribbean (2010-17) supported the creation of 12,000 jobs (80% for women and youth); increased revenue generated by participating firms and clusters (USD$153m or a 41% increase); increased exports by participating firms and clusters (USD$37m or a 23% increase); introduction of environmental technologies or adoption of change innovations through nine private sector project; and improvements in the business environment in several Caribbean countries (e.g.: Jamaica’s ranking for Access to finance improved to 12 from 189).
   4. The CCPF which will be implemented over the period (2017-2020), is the second phase of Compete Caribbean and builds on the success of the first phase. CCPF comprises two program pillars: Productivity and Innovation in Firms (Pillar I); and Enhancing the Business and Innovation Climate (Pillar 2). It is intended that CCPF should (a) focus on the specific needs of the more vulnerable countries (Belize, Dominica, Grenada, Guyana, Jamaica, Saint Lucia, Saint Vincent and the Grenadines); (b) support gender and diversity initiatives; (c) promote climate change activities; (d) foster the strengthening of institutions; and (e) promote scalability. During Phase 1, a much higher proportion of proposals submitted by the more vulnerable countries were declined by the screening process, in part, due to the quality of the proposals.
   5. The first phase of Compete Caribbean involved a comprehensive survey called PROTEqIN[[1]](#footnote-1) to obtain detailed information at the firm level about PROductivity, TEchnology and Innovation in 13 Caribbean countries. The results were then compared with similar data obtained through the World Bank’s Enterprise Survey in the Rest Of Small Economies (ROSE) of the world. Overall, the Caribbean private sector is characterized by smaller firms that are older, less export oriented, and benefit less from foreign ownership. A more surprising finding by Dr. Moore et al (2017) is that Caribbean businesses are likely to have a relatively higher ratio of female participation in management and in ownership, even though women are more likely to be part of the management structure than being one of the owners. Because these characteristics matter for productivity and growth, a statistical analysis of the data available enabled the identification of some issues that deserve the attention of policy makers, donors and program designers.
   6. One of these issues is a gender gap in productivity measured by (1) value-added per worker, (2) sales per worker, and total factor productivity (TFP). The researchers found that once controlled for firm characteristics other than industries and countries, the productivity gap vanished for firms predominantly owned by women. The performance gap survived only for firms with a dominant or top female manager, ie. “women-managed”. The gender analysis revealed other interesting findings:
      * + Both women-owned and women-managed firms are less likely to request Technical Assistance than their male counterpart, despite their similar interest in innovative activities related to products, marketing and processes.
        + The gender composition of a firm is not a significant predictor of the likelihood of being present in international markets (ie. exporting).
        + Women-led firms are less likely to ask for credit from a bank but also to consider access to financing as a severe obstacle to business activities than other types of firms, even controlling for firm characteristics.
   7. This information led to a follow-up survey called FINGEN focused on assessing the constraints to firm growth that women experience. It provides statistically significant indicators that are comparable across countries. Such wealth of data already collected must be analysed through regressions and other methods to identify facts and patterns that raise key research questions or provide useful explanations about the obstacles that inhibit women from growing businesses. Any missing information deemed critical to better understand the growth constraints of women in business must be identified and captured into a short survey instrument. This terms of reference seeks to develop a study about gender in the Caribbean to determine how the CCPF can better support business women.
2. **Objectives**

* 1. This consultancy will investigate the key research questions to unravel two main quests and offer recommendations for program designs and business practices that are conducive to productivity growth and competitiveness of firms managed and owned by women.
     + QUEST #1: How can the Compete Caribbean Partnership Facility and its partners better assist women-owned firms in implementing innovative practices that generate employment and exports?
     + QUEST #2 Why are Caribbean firms managed by women less productive than those managed by men, and how can we help them become more productive?
  2. A comprehensive analysis of data and qualitative information obtained through literature review, interviews and focus groups shall be used to assess potential causalities and provide recommendations for program design and delivery. These programs include but are not limited to those funded or supported by Compete Caribbean, Caribbean Export, Caribbean Development Bank and the World Bank’s WINC. These organisations are interested in understanding how entrepreneurship programs, Technology Extension Services, Innovation Fund, cluster initiatives, policy reforms and financing schemes can be used to drive the growth of women-led firms. The information obtained must also be used to build the capacity of institutions, business support organisations and business leaders – male and female – in better engaging women in fostering productivity and innovation in the Caribbean private sector.

1. **Scope of Services**
   1. The scope of services includes the use of a quantitative and qualitative data collection and analysis, including consultation with specialists in gender, psychology and psychiatry, to assist the program in improving its understanding of women led firms and how the program can better support the growth and productivity of these firms through its technical assistance and targeted grants.
2. **Key Activities**

The contractual will carry out the following key activities that will facilitate the achievement of the objective:

* 1. **Background:** Review CCPF program documents to develop an understanding of the scope and objectives of the Facility; specific results to be achieved; and operating regulations and procedures. Review other relevant background documents such as national development plans, studies/reports, Country Strategies, gender assessments, and/or evaluation reports to identify synergies and avoid duplication; and identify lessons learned and risks from the implementation of similar projects.
  2. **Desk work:** Literature review on gender gaps related to productivity at the firm level in the Caribbean. Review of Compete Caribbean Innovation Window material, including the database that collects information on the +500 applicants to the Challenge Fund. Data analysis using the PROTEqIN, FINGEN and other data available.
  3. **Country consultations:** Targeted consultation through interviews and focus groups with COMPETE CARIBBEAN, the World Bank WINC program, UN Women, Caribbean Export, Caribbean Development Bank, as well as other representatives of the private and public sectors such as SMEs, financing and alternative financing institutions, women associations, Business Support Organisations, government, etc.
  4. **Workshops**: Once sufficient facts have been gathered and the problem more clearly defined, a workshop with relevant specialists (especially gender) and stakeholders using problem solving methodologies such as Simplexity will be used to review the research questions, and discuss the next steps. Another workshop will be organized to discuss potential solutions and recommendations.
  5. **Survey design and administration**: Develop an instrument based on the information gap identified while answering the research questions to be administered online through a representative sample of women business owners, leaders and managers across the region. This may be obtained from the World Bank’s WINC program, TEN Habitat’s bootcamp for women-owned firms, the Caribbean Export database, the Professional Women Association, the Compete Caribbean’s Enterprise Innovation Challenge Fund, etc.. The consultancy is expected to submit the following:

1. English versions of the questionnaires which include the variable names used for data entry entered into the questionnaire that correspond to the appropriate question prior to launching the survey. The questionnaire including a description of the codes, information on the full sample contacted, results of screening, details of changes to the questionnaire, method for interviewing, and participation rates.
2. Provide the IDB with a clean, labeled database of completed and approved surveys in the STATA, SPSS and Excel formats. The database will contain all variables included in the questionnaires. Each entrepreneur or establishment should have a unique numeric identifier.
3. Detail how the data was cleaned and any other relevant observations on the acquisition and use of the data
4. Document major aspects of the survey including: the survey’s objectives, organization, implementation, methodology used, sampling process, data processing
5. Profile of respondents in a summary manner
6. Pilot the survey on a small sample
7. Confirm with the Coordinator any necessary or suggested changes on the questionnaire based on the results of piloting the survey.
8. Provide at least two informal Progress Reports that include response rates differentiating between refusals and other problems
9. Enter the data into an electronic database using quality control methods that ex-ante or ex-post restricts out of range variables, checks for inconsistencies, does not allow missing fields where they are not appropriate, and ensures the accuracy of the entered data.
10. Clean the data if needed after data entry.
11. Maintain a key relating each unique numeric code from the data set of the interviews with the alpha code from the location data set. This will protect the anonymity of the respondents. The IDB can ask the Consultant to provide this key to a third party designated by the Bank and that the Consultant destroys its version of the same. The Consultant will keep the key for at least five years unless otherwise instructed to eliminate or transfer the key prior to the end of that period.
12. **Confidentiality, Data Ownership and Future Use of Questionnaires:** The implementing Consultant will protect the confidentiality of establishments and individuals participating in the survey at all stages. All data are confidential and the property of the IDB. Its sole purpose is for research on the IP environment and is not for commercial use. No data or other information from this survey will be released by the Consultant to third parties without the written approval of the IDB. The Consultant will be able to use the questionnaire for future surveys. The IDB gives consent to such use.
    1. **Country presentation**: Presentation of provisional findings and conclusions at a location to be announced.
    2. See Annex 1 for potential Research Questions
13. **Expected Outcome and Deliverables**

The expected outcomes and products under this assignment are the following:

* 1. Work Plan: Work plan, including methodological approach and proposed survey instrument, within one week of contract signature.
  2. Survey Instrument and Database: The survey instrument and database of results will include a technical report with the sampling methodology and approach.
  3. Report; A detailed report with key findings, answers to the research questions and specific recommendations on how Compete Caribbean and other development partners can assist women-led firms in improving their productivity, generating exports, and creating employment. The details of the regression and data analysis will be provided in appendix.
  4. Presentation: A Power Point presentation with the key findings, business case and recommendations that encourage the implementation of the right approach and business practices identified through this consultancy, targeting business leaders, financial institutions, government, business support organisations and development agencies.

1. **Reporting Requirements**
   1. Deliverables will be presented in English. Each deliverable will be submitted in electronic format, and will include cover page, body, references (sources cited), and any annexes. Documents electronically in both Microsoft Word (.docx) and Portable Document Format (.pdf) formats. A final draft should be delivered electronically on both Microsoft Word (.docx) and Portable Document Format (.pdf) formats. All charts with their corresponding source data will be provided on an Excel file delivered electronically to the Technical Coordinator along with the final paper. The final draft will be consistent with all of the formatting guidelines specified below:

a. The font to be used will be Times New Roman 12 point, black color and white background

b. 1.5 line spacing, justified

c. The cover page will include the IDB logo including a short disclaimer from the IDB. This will be provided. Reports must be submitted to the Bank in an electronic file. The report should include cover, main document, and all annexes. Zip files will not be accepted as final reports, due to Records Management Section regulations.

* 1. Database files should be submitted in .do and .dta (STATA) and .csv .

1. **Supervision and Reporting**
   1. The technical and administrative responsibilities of this consultancy will be coordinated by Sylvia Dohnert, Private Sector Development Lead Specialist (IFD/CTI), Inter-American Development Bank.
2. **Schedule of Payments & Qualifications**
   1. Payment terms will be based on project milestones or deliverables. The Bank does not expect to make advance payments under consulting contracts unless a significant amount of travel is required.

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Payment Schedule** | |
| ***Deliverable*** | **%** |
| 1. Submission and approval of work plan 1 week after contract signing | 10% |
| 1. Survey instrument and database, approved and accepted by the Bank | 30% |
| 1. First draft of report on findings | 30% |
| 1. Final report with findings and PPT presentation | 30% |
| **TOTAL** | 100% |

**Qualifications**

Academic Degree / Level & Years of Professional Work Experience:

* Minimum of an advanced university degree (Master's degree or equivalent) in Economics, Social Sciences, or related field with quantitative skills. Gender Studies or psychiatry certification would be a plus.
* Five years of experience in the design and implementation of qualitative and quantitative research
* At least three years of gender study and analysis research experience and experience in private sector development within a developing country context, particularly in the Caribbean

Core Competencies

* Strong analytical skills and demonstrate leadership ability; very strong qualitative and quantitative research skills with the ability to manage complete databases, conduct econometric analysis and present results in concise, policy-oriented manner.
* Strong knowledge and experience in STATA statistical software. Candidate should also be familiar with firm level surveys from different jurisdictions.
* Fluency in oral and written English.

**Characteristics of the Consultancy**

* + - Consultancy category and modality: International, Products and External Services Contractual, Lump Sum
    - Contract duration: Three (3) months from the start date, including 30 non-consecutive working days
    - Place(s) of work: External consultancy which will be developed at the place of residence of the contractual. For international contractual, missions to the location of the potential beneficiaries with a maximum of 3 days on the ground.

1. **Payment and Conditions of Employment:** Remuneration will be determined in accordance with Bank regulations and criteria.
2. **Consanguinity:** Individuals with relatives working for the IDB within, and including the fourth degree of consanguinity and the second degree of affinity are not eligible for employment as staff or contractual. Candidates must be citizens of a member country of the Inter-American Development Bank.
3. **Diversity:** The IDB is committed to diversity and inclusion and to providing equal opportunities in employment. We embrace diversity on the basis of gender, age, education, national origin, ethnic origin, race, disability, sexual orientation, religion, and HIV/AIDs status. We encourage women, Afro descendants and persons of indigenous origins to apply.

**Annex I**

**Research questions – solving two main quests**

This consultancy will investigate the key research questions to unravel two main quests and offer recommendations for program designs and business practices that are conducive to productivity growth and competitiveness of firms managed and owned by women.

**QUEST #1: How can the Compete Caribbean Partnership Facility and its partners better assist women-owned firms in implementing innovative practices that generate employment and exports?**

To provide relevant recommendations, the consultant will perform an assessment of whether Caribbean women-owned firms faced specific and distinct challenges in applying for and benefitting from the Compete Caribbean Innovation Window offered in phase one as compared to other firms. If a gender gap is found in the ability of the program to benefit women-owned firms, the consultancy will analyse the reasons for the variance and propose recommendations of how to better support their innovation challenges in the future. The assessment will also involve an investigation about the challenges that women-owned firms face in benefitting from other business support programs in the Caribbean such as the services offered by Caribbean Exports or WINC, as well as a desk research and analysis of the survey responses filtered by gender.

**QUEST #2 Why are Caribbean firms managed by women less productive than those managed by men, and how can we help them become more productive?**

The researchers who used the PROTEgIN data found that more than 50% of the gap identified in the performance of firms managed by women are due to unobserved factors[[2]](#footnote-2). In other words, the performance gap in Total Factor Productivity (TFP) cannot be mainly explained by firm characteristics such as size, age, export orientation, foreign ownership, access to finance and technical assistance. What makes these firms with female as dominant or top manager less productive then? Anecdotal evidence and experience in the region suggest the following hypothesis which should be refined and tested:

1. Many professional/business women in the Caribbean have a greater share of responsibility in managing their household. A potentially larger proportion of female-headed households could explain more strain on productivity at work, simply due to a lack of time or an adequate support system for the family, as opposed to a lack of interests and commitment. [FAMILY CONTRAINTS]
2. Many professional/business women in the Caribbean do not feel that their contribution at work is sufficiently valued, either because of historical stigma, gender bias, sexual pressure, low compensation or lack of recognition. As a result, they do not have any incentives or the motivation to express their opinion and achieve more than the minimum expectations. They may simply not believe that they are able or allowed to move up the corporate ladder, especially if the top positions are reserved for male or family members. [MOTIVATION]
3. Many professional/business women in the Caribbean lack the opportunity to build their self-esteem, self-awareness and resilience. Emotional struggles are generally not considered as a critical problem to be addressed but rather as part of surviving. Women also lack professional role models and the necessary skills development opportunities to feel empowered to make certain choices with confidence. This insecurity translates into slower progress towards leadership and productivity at work. [EMOTIONAL INTELLIGENCE]
4. Many professional/business women in the Caribbean are vulnerable to issues they perceived as beyond their control such as domestic violence, legal restrictions, access to resources, corruption, extortion, crime, etc which affects their ability to perform at work in a safe and secure environment. [SAFETY]
5. Other reasons to be determined based on the data analysis such as the higher concentration of women in sectors with low productivity [ECONOMY]

More specifically, the following questions should be investigated by comparing answers obtained from male and female to provide thoughtful recommendations:

1. What are the differences found between male-owned/managed and female-owned/managed firms in awareness of the availability of technical assistance programs related to entrepreneurship, innovation, competitiveness and export?
2. What are the differences found between male-owned/managed and female-owned/managed firms in accessibility to technical assistance programs related to entrepreneurship, innovation, competitiveness and export? Are there any constraints limiting access to female-owned/managed firms?
3. What are the differences in awareness of the availability and accessibility of financing options provided by development agencies, angel investment networks, and financial or non-financial institutions?
4. How do they obtain their information about the programs and funding opportunities available?
5. How can business support organisations and programs better inform and attract them?
6. To what extent do women business leaders have access to networking opportunities (e.g. business associations, etc) that might allow them to grow their business? Do they differ from male-owned or male-managed firms?
7. What are the main reasons for rejecting applications submitted by women-owned and women-managed firms? Do they differ from male-owned or male-managed firms?
8. Do female managed/owned firms utilise performance management frameworks and best practices to enhance productivity, e.g. productivity payment schemes, balanced scorecards, etc to a lesser extent than male-managed/owned firms?
9. Do women managers perceived access to position of authority? Are family-owned businesses also passed on to female members of the family?
10. Do female business managers and professionals see a progression in their career?
11. What financial and non-financial incentives do they have to improve their productivity at work? Are these worth it, ie motivating?
12. When was their last promotion? Are they satisfied with their compensation?
13. What are their constraints to productivity at work?
14. What emotional issues affect their productivity at work?
15. What are the key drivers of their motivation at work?
16. What are the differences in terms of domestic violence, legal restrictions, access to resources, corruption, extortion, crime?
17. What are the differences in the numbers of hours spent at work? Taking care of family members? Social activities? Housework and errands?
18. Are firms managed/owned by women also single-headed households? How many children to they have?
19. Do they have access to a supporting social infrastructure to manage the care of their family?
20. What are the level of preparation for the jobs taken? Were there social pressure along the career development process?

If the information obtained from the analysis of the current data available is insufficient to provide answers to these questions and provide conclusive recommendations, the consultant will design and administer an online survey involving a representative sample of women business owners and managers across the region, and include a comparable control group of male-owned/managed firms to enable comparison. The questions will have to be simple and unambiguous in order to be answered relatively quickly online without bias. The support of a psychiatrist or psychologist with a deep understanding of the local culture may be needed to define some of the questions. The analysis of results will enable the consultants to provide answers to the questions and suggest recommendations on how the Compete Caribbean program and its partners could address the root causes of the problem identified.

If excellent quality and rigorous diagnostic products are developed through this facility it will provide a solid platform on which the private sector, COMPETE CARIBBEAN and other Development Partners in the region can develop a harmonised agenda to reform the business environment in the region.

1. <http://competecaribbean.org/proteqin/> [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. EXPLORING Firm-Level INNOVATION and PRODUCTIVITY in developing countries. “*The Perspective of Caribbean Small States*”, Chapter 6-The gender gap in the Caribbean: The Performance of Women-Led firms,, [www.publications.iadb.org/handle/11319/8138](http://www.publications.iadb.org/handle/11319/8138) [↑](#footnote-ref-2)