|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Citizen Security and Justice Programme III (JA-L1043)** | | |
| ***Overall problem*** | ***Causal Factors*** | ***Corresponding Component Result*** |
| High crime and violence rates in inner-city communities in Jamaica.  Particular concentration of crime and violence among youth (as perpetrators and victims) | 1. Gangs in the communities are responsible for much of the crimes and violence committed; community residents are often the victims and are fearful and/or affected by exposure to violence. Gang presence also leads to inter- and intra-community divisions and conflicts, and using violence to resolve disputes and command respect. 2. Social and gender norms that promote violent actions, tolerance of violence (including domestic violence), and intolerance of engagement with law enforcement (anti-snitch culture). 3. Community organizations (e.g. CDCs) do not have the capacity to address safety needs in the community, to promote positive social norms, or to advocate to government authorities for resources related to safety. | Result 1: Improved improve behaviors for non-violent conflict resolution in target communities |
| 1. Low employment levels, especially among youth. 2. Low education levels, especially among youth. 3. Low cognitive skills, especially those required for employment. 4. Few links between inner-city communities and potential employers and opportunities for job experience. | Result 2: Increased labor market attachment and employability among youth in target communities. |
| 1. Lack of access by vulnerable communities to justice system options, which can foment the use of extra-judicial/vigilante methods for resolving disputes. 2. Overburdened justice system, due in part to low use of alternatives to litigation and detention/incarceration. This reduces the state’s ability to apply the rule of law efficiently. 3. Courts cannot always fulfill victims’, offenders’, and community residents’ needs for non-adversarial dispute resolution and possible reconciliation and/or restitution options. 4. Juveniles in conflict with the law who are detained/incarcerated face worse prospects and risk factors for future recidivism. | Result 3: Increased access to effective community and alternative justice services. |

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Component 1: Culture Change for Peaceful Coexistence and Community Governance**  **Intermediate Outcome**: Improved behaviors for non-violent conflict resolution and increased responsiveness of CDCs to community safety needs in target communities. | | | | |
| *Overall Approach / Strategy*:  1. Risk & Protective Factor Model: Youth with more than two risk factors and with few protective factors have a much higher likelihood of involvement in criminal activity. Protective factors are equally important, accounting for the fact that 75%-85% of youth in “at-risk” situations do not become criminally active.  2. “Epidemiological” analysis of gang violence & spin-off violence transmitted by groups and social norms  3. Capacity-building of community-level governance and community-based organizations so that they can develop local solutions for crime and violence, increase citizen engagement, and advocate to local and national government entities for implementation of policies and programs.  4. Build inclusiveness, trust, and positive interactions among all “factions” within a community. | | | | 1. Risk/Protective Factors:   Wilson, J.Q. and Petersilia,J. eds. 2011. Crime and Public Policy. Oxford University Press).   * Center for Disease Control, US Government, “Youth Violence: Risk and Protective Factors.” * Risk Factor Matrix, Strategic Planning Tool, Office of Juvenile Justice and Delinquency Prevention, US Department of Justice.  1. Gang violence:   Gary Slutkin / Cure Violence (US)  Horace Levy / Peace Management Initiative (Jamaica)   1. Multi-Sector interventions:  * Programa Fica Vivo (Belo Horizonte, Brazil): Combines vocational training and education, psychosocial support, addictions treatment. (Silverira et al. “Impact of Staying Alive Program on the reduction of homicides in a community in Belo Horizonte, Revista Saude Publica Vol. 44 No 3 Sao Paulo, junio 2010.) |
| ***Intervention*** | ***Problem or Causal Factors Addressed*** | ***Theoretical Framework*** | | ***Relevant Evidence / Models*** |
| Sub-Component 1.1:  Immediate Outcome: Improved knowledge and attitudes of individuals, families, and groups to resolve conflicts and address violence in target communities. | | | | |
| 1111; 1114) Parenting and conflict resolution training in the community and in schools | *Risk Factors*:  Abusive parents; neglect by parents; proviolence attitudes by parents; parent use of violent discipline tactics; low parent-child attachment  *Protective Factors*:  Connectedness to family or adults outside the family; Ability to discuss problems with parents; Perceived parental expectations are high; Frequent shared activities with parents;  Consistent presence of parent in morning or evening.  *Domestic Violence:*  Research shows that boys exposed to domestic violence are more likely to engage in delinquent behavior as adolescents and to use VAW as adults (Whitfield et al. 2003, Heise 2011). Girls exposed to violence are more likely to become victims of intimate partner violence in the future (Morrison et al. 2004). | 1. Risk Factors: Risk Factor Matrix, Strategic Planning Tool, Office of Juvenile Justice and Delinquency Prevention, US Department of Justice 2. Risk & Protective Factors: Center for Disease Control, US Government, “Youth Violence: Risk and Protective Factors.” 3. It is important to address family and inter-generational risk factors through a parenting and family-based approach. (CDC Violence Prevention Best Practices Manual, Chapter 2.) 4. Boys “learn” violence (or, in contrast, caregiving) from their parents, especially fathers. (PROMUNDO 2013, Manual of the Program H initiative, “From Violence to Peaceful Coexistence”) 5. Parenting interventions are effective at reducing disorder and anti-social behavior (Heise 2011; David-Ferdon and Simon 2012; Shaw 2001). 6. Trainings focused on communications skills and social/emotional skills contribute to conflict resolution capacity. 7. School-based conflict resolution and peer mediation programs are effective interventions for reducing violence among at-risk youth (Cornel 1999) | | * Parenting: Triple P is a multilevel parenting intervention founded over 30 years ago and implemented in close to a dozen countries. The primary goal is to reduce the use of coercive parenting techniques by increasing parental self-sufficiency and self-efficacy around child management. Secondary goals include reducing parental depression and anxiety, improving knowledge and attitudes around positive parenting techniques, and reducing problem behaviors among children. The core program principles promote: a safe and engaging environment for the child, a positive learning environment, use of assertive discipline that is age-appropriate and consistent, realistic expectations, and parental self-care. Population-based intervention has five levels of increasing intensity and narrowing population reach: 1) media/communications outreach, 2) large group positive parenting seminar series, 3) brief primary care interventions, 4) more intensive small group and individual programs, and 5) enhanced family intervention for parents who require more intensive intervention services. Individual-based intervention centered around levels 4 and 5 are often conducted as an alternative to population-based intervention; both types have yielded positive effects in RCTs. * Parenting + Gender Norms: Program H, Promundo (Brazil, El Salvador): This program teaches parenting and caregiving skills to men through a methodology that encourages conceptions of masculinity/manhood that are based on positive family interactions rather than aggression. (“A South-South application model to foster gender equality (and prevent violence against females and between males) is promoted by the Brazilian organisation Promundo. Originally developed in Latin America in collaboration with national and international partners, Programmes H and M have now been adapted for use in the Balkans, India and Tanzania, and, as explained later in this report, these programmes have also been well evaluated.” This is the only gender-violence reduction programme in Latin America with an experimental evaluation. Moestue, Moestue, and Muggah. 2013. “Youth Violence Prevention in Latin America and the Caribbean: a scoping review of the evidence.” Norwegian Peacebuilding Resource Centre.) * Los Angeles Gang Reduction and Youth Development program: This integrated program applies a risk assessment tool at the beginning and end of the program (Youth Services Eligibility Tool). Only youth presenting 4 or more of the 9 risk factors are selected, and a control group is created (eligible but not treated). The intervention consists of a 3-person team working with the families of the selected individuals over six months, using Family Systems Theory activities. The effects are positive (sample 1288 youth; 397 control). On risk factors, the treated group exceeded the control group: anti-social behavior (18% points difference), parental supervision (24.4% points difference), critical life events (22% points difference), impulsiveness (18.3% points difference), negative family influence (26.1% points difference), family involvement in gangs (19.1% points different). On behavior, the treated group exceeded the control group: gang fights (7% points difference), hanging out with gangs (19.9% points difference), participation in gangs (4% points difference), hitting someone to hurt them (26.9% points difference), and carrying a concealed weapon (5.6% points difference). * CSJP II: Evaluation suggests that the interventions were appropriate to address overall risk factors, but could be more tailored to individual or family assessments, with an emphasis on those showing multiple risk factors. This coincides with the approach used in the Los Angeles (only youth presenting 4+ risk factors are selected, even though all youth in the area have some risk factors). |
| 1112) Counselling and psychosocial services | *Risk Factors*:  Exposure to violence; conduct disorders; low social-cognitive skills | 1. Exposure to violence is a risk factor for violent behavior. Quality psychological treatment to address trauma and build social /emotional/ cognitive skills can help to reduce the severity of this risk factor. 2. Counselling (including groups) can improve youth’s social, cognitive, and emotional skills overall (e.g. self-regulation, impulse control, social-information processing, personal responsibility, conflict resolution). (University of Chicago Crime Lab Research and Policy Brief on “Becoming A Man – Sports Edition”, July 2012)  * Counselling is a key element of the Peace Management Initiative approach for intervening in gang violence situations in Jamaica. This is especially important for men, who are afraid to access counselling services. (Violence Prevention Alliance, Small Arms Survey, and Geneva Declaration, 2011. Peace Brokers: Understanding Good Practice in Violence Prevention and Reduction in Jamaica.) | | * Becoming A Man (Sports Edition): Chicago. The University of Chicago Crime Lab found positive results from social-cognitive skills counselling programs targeting male adolescents: “The intervention also reduced violent-crime arrests during the program year by 8.1 per 100 youth, or 44 percent. Student surveys provide suggestive evidence that social-cognitive skills mediate these impacts. Dollar-valued benefits to society range from 3 to 31 times the $1,100 per-participant program cost.” (University of Chicago Crime Lab Research and Policy Brief on “Becoming A Man – Sports Edition”, July 2012) * Peace Management Initiative in Jamaica offers counselling/therapy to gang members engaged in efforts to reduce retaliatory violence and has shown positive results. * The Kingston YMCA program demonstrated positive results in reducing aggressive behavior among young men who had dropped out of school. Evaluation: Guerra, N. G., Williams, K. R., Meeks-Gardner, J. M., & Walker, I. (2010). The Kingston YMCA Positive Youth Development Programme: An effective anti-violence intervention for inner-city youth in Jamaica. In J. Hoffman, L. Knox, & R. McMahon (Eds.), *Beyond Suppression: International Perspectives on Youth Violence Prevention.* Guilford Press. |
| 1113; 1117) Gang violence interruption, including in crisis situations | Retaliatory violence by gangs  Social norms imposed by gangs that demand dispute resolution using violence and disengagement from law enforcement and local government | 1. The Peace Management Initiative (PMI) has worked with gang members in Jamaica for over a decade. It uses mediation, counselling, and livelihoods projects to pre-empt retaliatory violence when tensions flare up. Horace Levy, 2009. Inner-City Killing Streets: Reviving Community. Arawak Publications, Kingston 2. The PMI model is comprised of: Closed-door mediation and hotspot responses; community trauma and reprisal reduction programme; healing and reconciliation / community gang resiliency activities; gang demobilization activities (Moncrieffe 2013). | | * The PMI Model is “credited with significantly reducing community violence in August Town, Brown’s Town and Mountain View” (Kingston). (Violence Prevention Alliance of Jamaica, Small Arms Survey, and Geneva Declaration. October 2011. Peace Brokers: Understanding Good Practice in Violence Prevention and Reduction in Jamaica. Issue Brief.) PMI reached ceasefire agreements lasting more than 6 months in 25 of 44 communities where it intervened between 2008-2012. * The CureViolence, which is very similar to the PMI model, has been applied in high-violence neighbourhoods in Chicago, Brooklyn, and Baltimore. External evaluations have shown promising results in reducing shootings, homicides, and gang involvement. “The Cure Violence Model is a public health approach to violence prevention that understands violence as a learned behavior that can be prevented using disease control methods. The model prevents violence through a three-prong approach: 1) Interrupt transmission; 2) Identify and change the thinking of highest potential transmitters; 3) Change group norms.” It uses trusted, appropriate “interrupters” to detect potential shooting incidents and to mediate and de-escalate these disputes.” (cureviolence.org) * The US DoJ CrimeSolutions.gov ranks the evidence as “promising”: <http://www.crimesolutions.gov/programdetails.aspx?id=205>   “Skogan and colleagues (2008) found that the Cure Violence intervention (known as CeaseFire—Chicago at the time of the study) was associated with decreases in shootings, killings, and retaliatory homicides, and appeared to make shooting hot spots cooler in some neighborhoods but not others. Overall, the results were mixed.  **All Shots:** In four of the seven areas, there was a statistically significant decrease in the number of all shots (measured as the number of gun-related batteries and assaults reported to police) that was associated with the introduction of Cure Violence. These areas included Auburn Green (17.4 percent decline in all shootings), Logan Square (21.7 percent decline), Southwest (24.2 percent decline), and West Garfield Park (24.4 percent decline).”  **Actual Shootings**: There was consistent evidence of an effect of Cure Violence on the number of actual shootings (measured as gun-related batteries and assaults combined with gun-related homicides known to police) in three areas: West Garfield Park (23.4 percent decline), Southwest (26.6 percent decline), and Englewood (34.5 percent decline). In these areas, there were no significant declines in shootings in the matched comparison areas that paralleled the significant declines in the program areas. Cure Violence appears to have contributed to a reduction in actual shootings in three of the seven communities. **Killings**: The program contributed to the decline in gun homicides in only one of the seven study sites (Auburn Gresham), where the decline in the program area was twice that in the comparison area. Cure Violence appears to have contributed to a reduction in killings in only one of the seven communities. **Gang Violence:** The analysis of gang-related homicides within and among gangs found that for all program areas there was no significant drop in gang homicides using the most basic indicator of change. However, the percentage change in the overall level of activity within gang networks declined significantly more for three of the seven programs areas than the matched comparison areas. These three areas were Auburn Gresham (28 percent change), Englewood (42 percent change), and West Humboldt Park (58 percent change). The level of activity in the remaining program areas either increased or did not decrease as much as the comparison area. The proportion of gang homicides that were reciprocal in nature (killings in retaliation for earlier events) decreased significantly more in five program areas (Auburn Gresham, Englewood, Logan Square, Southwest, and East Garfield Park) than in comparison areas. In these five program areas, there was a 100 percent reduction in retaliation killings. |
| 1115; 1116) Public awareness and behavior change campaigns to promote a culture of lawfulness, including on gender norms and citizen-police relations | Social norms that promote violence, including:  - “Manhood” is associated with aggression, violence, guns  - Tolerance or lack of attention to domestic violence  - Anti-snitching culture (social group punishes those who report crimes to police)  - Negative perceptions about police as untrustworthy, corrupt, not part of the community. | 1. Social norms created by some music, cultural activities, and gang discourse in inner-city neighbourhoods discourage people reporting crimes to law enforcement by framing this as the “betrayal” of a “snitch” or “informer.” These discourses evolve over time and alternative norms projected through music or other media may counter-act this social norm. (Christopher A.D. Charles. 2012. The Anti-informer and Anti-Snitch Discourses in Dancehall and Rap Songs. Department of Government, University of the West Indies, Mona.) 2. When men are unable to fulfill their “traditional role” as a male provider, they may resort to violence (at home or on the streets) to reassert male power. Interventions focused on changing social norms and individual attitudes about manhood can achieve measurable changes in beliefs and behaviors related to the use of violence. (PROMUNDO 2013) 3. Social norms about snitching and about masculinity negatively influence citizen-police relations. Police often use aggression to demonstrate power, while the community perceives the police as “on the other side.” | | * An example of a successful mass communications campaign is the “Somos Diferentes, Somos Iguales” initiative in Nicaragua. “Although its main aim was to limit HIV infection, a two-year longitudinal study found that young people “greatly exposed” to the programme were 33% more likely than those “less exposed” to know of a domestic violence support centre in their area and 48% more likely to have attended one in the last six months.” (Mostue, Mostue, and Muggah, 2013, p 5). * The experience of Promundo in Brazil suggests that public awareness campaigns meant to change attitudes are most effective for addressing “deep-seated attitudes on gender” when they are delivered through “intense interactive processes”, rather than just mass marketing. (Mostue, Mostue, and Muggah 2013, p 5) |
| Sub-Component 1.2:  Immediate Outcome: Increased capacity of community governance mechanisms to address safety issues in target communities. | | | | |
| ***Intervention*** | ***Problem or Causal Factors Addressed*** | ***Theoretical Framework*** | | ***Relevant Evidence / Models*** |
| 1121) Training to community governance leaders/members;  1123) Community safety plans and women’s safety audits;  1125) Coordination among local actors on safety issues. | Distorted dynamics caused by gang dominance in a community can break the social contract between the local state/government and citizens.  In the absence of effective local governance, citizens may more easily opt for vigilante violence as a way to address problems.  *Risk Factors (Community Level):*  Community Disorganization | 1. Community governance systems can create collective actions and informal social norms to discourage and regulate crime and violence and to build actions for prevention. (Dammert, Lucia. *Seguridad pública en America Latina: qué pueden hacer los gobiernos locales?*, Nueva Sociedad, número 212, 2007) 2. Local crime prevention efforts based on positive cooperation among neighbours can contribute to reduced crime. (National Crime Prevention Council Research Brief, July 10, 2008. “Does Neighborhood Watch Reduce Crime?”) 3. Local safety audits are a tool for communities – ideally through a local committee or organization – to identify and analyze local crime and victimization dynamics and select appropriate local responses. (Guidance on Local Safety Audits: A Compendium of International Practice, European Forum for Urban Security, 2007.) | | * The IDB has a training course for local officials (government and community-based) on crime and violence prevention, designed with the University of Chile. (“Construcción de capacidades locales para la prevención del Delito y la Violencia”, que fue elaborado con conjunto con el Centro de Estudios de Seguridad Ciudadana de la Univ. de Chile.) Local crime prevention strategies require training and active engagement of local committees and other community actors. (International Centre for the Prevention of Crime, 2011. Practical Approaches to Urban Crime Prevention. Montreal) * Research shows that, when conducted according to best practices, women’s safety audits empower women in local safety governance issues and reduce physical and social risk factors affecting women’s safety. (Carolyn Whitzman, Margaret Shaw, Caroline Andrew, and Kathryn Travers, 2009. The effectiveness of women’s safety audits. Security Journal Vol. 22, 3, 205–218; UN Habitat, 2008. Women’s Safety Audits: What Works and Where?) * Best practices suggest that crime prevention strategies must be tailored to local contexts and co-designed with local actors. (Hugo Frühling, 2008. “Cómo avanzar en la reducción del delito y la violencia en américa latina?: reflexiones sobre aspectos a mejorar.” Centro de Estudios en Seguridad Ciudadana, Universidad de Chile) |
| 1122) Community infrastructure (multi-purpose centers) and situational prevention projects (fencing; lighting);  1124) Community cultural and sporting events to promote peacebuilding | *Risk Factors (Community Level):*  Low levels of community participation  *Protective Factors (Individual and Peer):*  Involvement in social activities  Communities lack safe and inclusive spaces for holding trainings, events, meetings, etc.  *Crime Prevention through Environmental Design:*  Lack of public spaces and prevalence of physical opportunities for crime (e.g. isolated or dark areas) can increase likelihood of crime. | 1. “Situational crime prevention a) reduces the opportunities for criminals to commit crime, b) changes criminals' ideas about whether they can get away with a particular crime, c) makes it seem harder, riskier, and less rewarding to commit crime.” (Rutgers University, Crime Prevention Special Topics Portal.)   Situational crime prevention techniques in physical spaces are a key element of criminological theory, as a prevention measure (Clarke, 1998).   1. Sporting and cultural activities in at-risk neighbourhoods use several (simultaneous) approaches. First, they appeal to young people and act as a “hook” to get them involved in conflict resolution training. Second, they occupy idle time. Third, they may convey pro-social messages in youth-friendly way. (Asociación de docentes de Educación Física “Actividad física, inserción y jóvenes socialmente desfavorecidos: aspectos fundamentales de las experiencias”, en La enseñanza de la Educación Física y el Deporte Escolar, , Santander 2001 | | * Street lighting as a crime prevention strategy requires more research, but in general shows promising potential for reducing opportunities for crime. B.C. Welsh, D.P. Farrington (2008): Effects of improved street lighting on crime, Campbell Systematic Reviews, 2008:13. * A key intervention in Los Angeles’ Gang Reduction and Youth Development program is “Summer Night Lights,” which offers inclusive activities in public spaces, with participation by police and governance representatives, 4 nights per week in summer months. Under GRYD, crime rates have declined by 37% in at-risk areas. (LA Deputy Mayor presentation, Nov 2013.) Also see effect sizes listed above. * Best practices in urban infrastructure development for social inclusion purposes (e.g. Medellín) are outlined in the World Bank’s 2011 report “Violence in the City: Understanding and Supporting Community Responses to Urban Violence.” * There is some evidence that sports programs can contribute to crime prevention. Dave Robins, Keith Waldman & Julia Waldman. 1996. “Sport and crime prevention: the evidence of research.” Criminal Justice Matters. Vol 23, Issue 1, pp 26-28. * USAID’s “A Ganar” program operates in 16 countries in LAC, combining sports and music to improve life skills and resilience of youth, and is noted as a promising model. (Mostue, Mostue, and Muggah, 2013, p7) * Right to Play International is a major international NGO that uses sports to “educate and empower children facing adversity.” It uses sports programs as a method to teach and practice life skills, particularly around tolerance and peace.  |  | | --- | |  | |
| **Component 2: Labour Market Attachment and Employability**  **Intermediate Outcome:** 1200 Increased labour market attachment\* among residents of target communities. | | | | |
| Overall Theory / Approach:   1. Youth from target communities cite lack of employment as the primary reason they have turned to or may turn to crime (Moncrieffe 2013; CSJP II evaluation). 2. Vocational and education training programs can strengthen protective factors – notably, a sense of purpose and social interactions – as well as life skills, regardless of the actual job-placement outcomes for an individual youth. 3. In order to enable a range of strategies for different target groups, this component uses the concept of Labour Market Attachment (a spectrum of levels of attachment) rather than solely job placement. This requires identifying and specifying target groups according to educational, vocational, and cognitive skill level and setting plans, goals, and indicators according to their needs and capacities. 4. In line with established best practices, all training and work experience programs should integrate Life Skills training into their methodology, particularly for those targeting groups of participants who are less job-ready. 5. More detailed analysis of labour market needs and more targeted outreach to sectors and specific companies/organizations with hiring potential is required to improve employment outcomes. | | | | * Given the nature of the unemployment problem in Jamaica and the current economic situation McArdle (2013) recommends to implement a comprehensive training program that will feature classroom components for life and employability skills, as well as for technical skills theory, workplace training for practical training, and a package of employment services including job preparation and job placement, complemented by a needs assessment and individual training case plan, more counselling services, remedial and second chance education programs, and business development training for entrepreneurship. (Tom McArdle, November 2013. Labor Market Analysis, Training Programmes, and Linkages to Employment for CSJP III in Jamaica. IDB Consultancy Report for CSJP III) * The Youth Employment Inventory data showed an increasing incidence of positive impacts from programs that offer multiple services, i.e., combinations of vocational training, job and/or life-skills training, job search assistance, entrepreneurial services, and a range of other social and employment-related support services (Betcherman, G., Godfrey, M. Puerto, S., Rother, F. and Stavreska,A. “Global Inventory of Interventions to Support Young Workers Synthesis Report,” World Bank, July 2007) * In Latin America and the Caribbean impact evaluations of training programs that incorporate participation of private suppliers, demand driver mechanisms, a significant labor intermediation component, and a strong emphasis on on-the-job training show more promising results for workforce integration of young people. (Carolina González-Velosa, Laura Ripani, David Rosas-Shady. May 2012. “How Can Job Opportunities for Young People in Latin America be   Improved?” IDB Technical Note 345). |
| Sub-Component 2.1: Vocational Training and Formal Education  Immediate Outcome: Increased vocational and cognitive skills and other job-relevant (e.g. education) credentials of target community residents | | | | |
| ***Intervention*** | ***Problem or Causal Factors Addressed*** | ***Theoretical Framework*** | | ***Relevant Evidence / Models*** |
| 1211) Developing a client-centred case management system | Risk Factors – Individual risk factors should be assessed and addressed through a tailored plan. | 1. Research on youth at-risk generally recommends individualized plans of intervention/support through case management. This applies to programs for vocational training and employment for at-risk youth. (González-Velosa, Ripani, Rosas-Shady, IDB, 2012) | | * Los Angeles Gang Reduction and Youth Development program uses a tailored case management approach for target youth. Add main findings/arguments – See effect size listed above * A detailed study on Jamaica recommends that youth training programs should provide a needs assessment, case planning/individual training plan, and counseling services to steer the program. It should contract out or purchase technical training services, but should define a clear program of life skills and employability skills training. (Tom McArdle, November 2013. Labor Market Analysis, Training Programmes, and Linkages to Employment for CSJP III in Jamaica. IDB Consultancy Report for CSJP III) |
| 1212) Job-readiness and vocational training | Risk factors: unemployment; lack of vocational skills; lack of life skills.  Community residents (particularly youth) lack the vocational skills required for many employment opportunities. | 1. Vocational skills training courses should be designed based on an analysis of skill demand by employers and skill gaps among participants, with adaptations for particular groups (e.g. gender-, age-, community-specific characteristics). (McArdle 2013; González-Velosa, Ripani, Rosas-Shady, IDB, 2012 (Recommendation 9). | | * The PROCAJOVEN which intended to “improve prospects for jobless youths and disadvantaged groups” through job readiness skill, technical and on-the-job training in Panama was studied by Ibarrarán and Rosas Shady (2006). The results show a 5% improvement in the employment rate for participants versus controls, but this difference was not significant. Employment rates and earnings were better for women (44% for treatment and 32% for controls) especially for those living in Panama City (47% for treatments, 32% for controls). (Ibarrarán, P., Rosas, D. and Soares, Y. “Impact Evaluation of a Youth Job Training Program in the Dominican Republic: Ex-Post Project Evaluation Report of the Labor Training and Modernization Project (DR0134)”, Ex-Post Project Evaluation Report: OVE/EPPER-03/06, Inter-American Development Bank, 2006) * Ibarrarán and Rosas (2009) studied job training programmes supported by the IDB, in the Chile, Colombia, Argentina, Peru and Mexico. The results suggest that employment effects range from modest to meaningful –increasing the employment rate by about 0 to 5 percentage points—although higher and significant for some groups such, as women in Colombia and Panama –with impact of 6 to 12 percentage points in the employment rate. In most cases there is a larger and significant impact on job quality, measured by getting a formal job, having a contract and/or receiving health insurance as a benefit. (Ibarrarán, P., and D. Rosas Shady (2009). “Evaluating the Impact of Job Training Programmes in Latin America: Evidence From IDB-Funded Operations.” Journal of Development Effectiveness, vol. 1, no. 2, pp. 195-216). * Attanasio and al. (2011) who did an impact evaluation with randomized design of the youth training programme Jóvenes en Acción in Colombia (a country with high informality rates as Jamaica) found that a 5% higher probability of employment for those offered training, mainly in formal sector jobs. (Attanasio, O., A. Kugler and C. Meghir. 2011. “[Subsidizing Vocational Training for Disadvantaged Youth in Colombia: Evidence from a Randomized Trial](http://www.aeaweb.org/articles.php?doi=10.1257/app.3.3.188)”. American Economic Journal: Applied Economics. 3 (3): 188-220.) |
| 1213) Support for access to and completion of secondary and tertiary education | Risk factor: low education level; lack of attachment to education system; school dropout.  Most jobs require secondary high school credentials (CXCs) and an increasing number of jobs require university degrees. In the target communities, many low-income youth require some financial support to cover school expenses. | 1. Formal education credentials are an important piece of vocational skills training. (McArdle 2013; Mazza 2013) 2. Particularly in a low-growth period where jobs are scarce, the most effective investment for future employment outcomes is an investment in formal education (secondary and tertiary) (McArdle 2013). For example: “The overall low level of secondary level qualification of the workforce suggests that so called “second chance” programmes for workers and the unemployed to achieve secondary education credentials may be important.” | | * YouthBuild El Salvador (CRS): As of 2012, the program has achieved reinsertion results above the average of other programs: 85% of participants graduates, and, of these, 77% achieve reinsertion (35% obtain employment, 23% self-employment, and 19% returned to school). The program includes secondary education credentials. * McArdle 2013 (labour market consultancy report) specifically recommends a focus on education credentials, given the challenging job market. (Tom McArdle, November 2013. Labor Market Analysis, Training Programmes, and Linkages to Employment for CSJP III in Jamaica. IDB Consultancy Report for CSJP III) |
| 1214) Remedial education (literacy and numeracy), with integrated life skills training. | Risk factor: low education level.  Many community residents do not yet have the grade 9 literacy level required for eligibility for vocational programs. The majority (70-90%) of people with elementary-school school credentials actually read at functionally lower literacy levels, according to the CSJP II evaluation.  Community residents also often need to learn and practice life skills oriented to employability (e.g. time management, discipline, professional communications). | 1. Remedial education courses are an essential element of a vocational training strategy, as often the “standard” courses are not appropriate for the most-disadvantaged groups (González-Velosa, Ripani, Rosas-Shady, IDB, 2012). 2. Integrated life skills are the area most often cited by employers (public and private sector) as in need of improvement by trainees/new hires from at-risk populations. | | * Jamaica Foundation for Lifelong Learning has implemented both community-based and out-of-community course models for residents of CSJP communities who require basic literacy and numeracy skills. (Moncrieffe 2013) * An impact evaluation on the program Juventud y Empleo in the Dominican Republic conducted by Ibarraran, Ripani, Taboada and Villa in 2012 revealed an impact of the life skills training included in this program (self-esteem, responsibility, and team-work). The evaluation documented positive impacts in terms of perceptions and expectations about the future, in particular for young women who simultaneously reduce their pregnancy rates by 5%. There was also positive impact on non-cognitive skills such as leadership, conflict resolution, self-organization and persistency of effort (Measured by three different scales; scores improved between 0.08 and 0.16 standards deviations with the program). (Ibarraran, P., Ripani, L., Taboada, B., Villa, J.M.and Garcia, B. “Life Skills, Employability and Training for Disadvantaged Youth: Evidence from a Randomized Evaluation Design,” IZA *Forschungsinstitut zur Zukunft der Arbeit* (Institute for the Study of Labor) Discussion Paper No. 6617 June 2012). |
| Sub-Component 2.2: On-the-job training and business development  Immediate Outcome 1220: Increased access to on-the-job training and experience for target community residents. | | | | |
| ***Intervention*** | ***Problem or Causal Factors Addressed*** | ***Theoretical Framework*** | | ***Relevant Evidence / Models*** |
| 1221) Job-seeking, placement, and training services | Risk factor: unemployment  Even when they have vocational and life skills required for a given job, residents of marginalized communities often knowledge and skills in job-searching (finding, applying, interviewing, etc). This is especially true for marginalized communities that face stigma by employers. | 1. Vocational programs that offer individualized support for job-seeking and job-placement generally have better employment results. Support for the transition to a job is crucial: “The data on first seekers are encouraging, but again the transition from obtaining qualifications to obtaining employment needs work.” (McArdle 2013) 2. Particularly among youth with many risk factors, individualized case management for job-seeking and placement can be the key factor in obtaining a job for which the youth is qualified. (Katharine Andrade, Catholic Relief Services / YouthBuild program manager, El Salvador, presentation November 2013). | | * YouthBuild El Salvador (CRS): As of 2012, the program has achieved reinsertion results above the average of other programs: 85% of participants graduates, and, of these, 77% achieve reinsertion (35% obtain employment, 23% self-employment, and 19% returned to school). The program attributes this in large part to individualized job-placement services. * Labor intermediation services and job-seeking placement, play a role in periods of low economic activity (like the current situation in Jamaica), linking and directing individuals to the offer of interventions specifically designed to alleviate the situation of low job creation during economic crises (Finn, D. Sub-contracting in public employment services, Centre for Economic and Social Inclusion, The European Commission Mutual Learning Programme for Public Employment Services, May 2011, accessed December 8, 2913 at http://ec.europa.eu/social/BlobServlet?docId=6964&langId=en). |
| 1222) On-the-job training opportunities, including through JDF, Police Cadets, Summer Employment, Employment Internships. | Risk factor: unemployment; idle time; lack of life skills  Even among community residents who have some skills and certification, it is difficult for them to obtain employment if they do not have practical work experience. | 1. Public sector internships and apprenticeships can be “win-win” – they provide valuable work experience and life skills practice to at-risk youth, and they provide a structured and stipended source of labour to the public sector agency. As an additional benefit, if implemented properly, the interaction can positively influence public workers’ perception of youth and vice versa. (Moncrieffe 2013, CSJP II Evaluation) 2. Job experience is a key gap for the unemployed who do have qualifications: “The data on both training and certification and educational qualifications tend to show that there is not much difference between the employed and the unemployed, and this suggests the employment problem in Jamaica may be less a skills mismatch than a simple lack of job creation. The unemployed actually appear slightly more educated and trained, on the whole. Getting more job experience for the unemployed who have education and training and certification is likely needed.“ (McArdle 2013). 3. Training programs are integral to an overall employment policy and to improving employment outcomes for at-risk youth. (González-Velosa, Ripani, Rosas-Shady, IDB, 2012; Mazza 2013) 4. Training programs that place youth full-time in a structured environment reduces the time they spend “idling” on the streets, thus reducing the “opportunity” to commit crime. This is also an advantage acknowledged by the participants themselves. (Moncrieffe 2013) | | * RCT of a program in the DR shows improvements in the formality of work for men and in wage levels, though results are less clear in actual employment rates. Pablo Ibarraran Laura Ripani, Bibiana Taboada, Juan Miguel Villa and Brigida Garcia. May 2012. “Life Skills, Employability and Training for Disadvantaged Youth: Evidence from a Randomized Evaluation Design.” IDB Working Paper Series No. IDB-WP-342. * The CSJP II Evaluation (Moncrieffe 2013) contends that employability skills were improved by 3 points on a scale of 5 through the JDF internship program. * The CSJP II Evaluation summarizes the pre- and post-test results and survey/focus group findings of JDF internship participants: “50% of people who had been in conflict with the law and 85.2% of people who had not been in conflict with the law confirmed that the programmed had helped a lot with increasing their ability to provide for their family.” “54.2% of those who had been in conflict with the law and 61% of those who had not said that the programme had helped them better deal with issues that limited their earning potential.” * Using job training programs at the community level is also a good strategy for re-connecting youth in conflict with the law (including those leaving prison) with society and for occupying their time as they transition through reentry. (Bullis, M. et al. (2002) “Idle hands: community employment experiences of formerly incarcerated youth”, Journal of emotional and behavioral disorders, vol. 14, no.2; Anthony, E.K. et al. (2010)) * Attanasio et al. (2011) find that increasing the duration of classroom training does not affect the programme’s returns, while increasing the hours of on-the-job training does have an impact. This result suggests that on-the-job training is of greater importance than classroom-based training, an observation that coincides with some available results from the United States and Europe (Betcherman and others, 2004; Heckman and others, 1999; Sianesi, 2003). (Attanasio, O., A. Kugler and C. Meghir. 2011. “[Subsidizing Vocational Training for Disadvantaged Youth in Colombia: Evidence from a Randomized Trial](http://www.aeaweb.org/articles.php?doi=10.1257/app.3.3.188)”. American Economic Journal: Applied Economics. 3 (3): 188-220.) |
| 1223) Business development services for building community enterprises | Jobs are scarce even for those who have qualifications and experience. Self-employment through entrepreneurship is an important potential source of employment. | 1. Given the challenging context for job growth, business development services should be given greater attention as a means for creating job opportunities. (McArdle, 2013) 2. Entrepreneurship training can contribute to building leadership skills and self-initiative, which have positive effects on community cohesion. | | * There are promising models in the Caribbean for integrating business development training into broader vocational and employment programs. For example, Education for Employment (funded by Canada); Compete Caribbean (IDB/Canada). * There is evidence in countries such as Brazil and Chile that programs to stimulate self-employment may boost income and increase the likelihood of being employed for highly vulnerable workers who, prior to the intervention were unemployed or inactive (Martínez, C., E. Puentes and J. Ruiz-Tagle (2013). “Micro-Entrepreneurship Training and Asset Transfers: Short-term Impacts on the Poor” Working Papers Series. Universidad de Chile. School of Economics, March.). |
| **Component 3: Community Justice Services**  **Intermediate Outcome:** Increased use of gender-responsive justice services in target communities.  . | | | | |
| Overall Theory / Approach:   1. Lack of access to & capacity of justice services negatively affects citizens’ trust in the justice system and their willingness to engage with it. 2. If a dispute cannot be resolved in the justice system (because of lack of access, resources, or mismatch of service to the problem), this can lead to the escalation of disputes to violence or extra-judicial measures. 3. Alternative and community-based justice services can a) offer responses/solutions to community justice needs that are not adequately addressed through the court system, and b) alleviate some of the caseload pressure on the formal court system. | | | | * Dennis Darby “Jamaica Justice System Policy Reform Agenda Framework” (2009) * Ministry of Justice Restorative Justice Policy (2012) * Fiadjoe, Albert. 2004. Alternative Dispute Resolution: A Developing World Perspective. Cavendish Publishing. |
| Sub-Components 3.1 & 3.2: Community Justice Services – Capacity & Access  1310 Increased capacity of gender-responsive justice services in target communities.  1320 Increased access by residents of target communities to gender-responsive justice services. | | | | |
| ***Intervention*** | ***Problem or Causal Factors Addressed*** | ***Theoretical Framework*** | ***Relevant Evidence / Models*** | |
| 1311) Technical assistance and resources provided to community justice service entities;  1312) Training provided to community volunteers, facilitators, and leaders involved in community justice service delivery.  1321) Sensitization training and material provided to target community residents and justice system officials on community justice services.  1322) Community justice service points improved (including mobile units) that are accessible to target communities.  Key Services:  - Victim Support Unit  - Legal Aid Council  - Justices of the Peace  - Dispute Resolution Foundation (mediation)  - Restorative Justice  - Child Diversion (alternatives to incarceration for juveniles in conflict with the law.) | 1. Low usage of justice services by residents of vulnerable communities is due to two dimensions of constraints: barriers to access by users, and limitations to availability of services by the provider.  2. Insufficient use of justice services can lead to escalation of conflicts and/or resolution of disputes outside of the rule of law.  3. Low public trust in the justice system is due in part to its delays and inefficiencies. Low use of alternatives to prosecution and incarceration may exacerbate existing delays and inefficiencies. | 1. This component aims to address both elements, by providing b) improved office facilities, staff training, and volunteer facilitators to the service providers, and b) improved knowledge among community members about services and reduced distance for accessing them (e.g. via mobile units and increased numbers of service points).  2. Access to alternative and community-based justice services has been identified as one of the strategic priorities for improving the overall justice system in Jamaica. (Dennis Darby “Jamaica Justice System Policy Reform Agenda Framework” (2009), prepared for the Ministry of Justice; Inter-American Commission on Human Rights Report on Jamaica, 2012).  3. Insufficient access to and/or response from justice services can lead to citizens losing trust in the state and/or taking extra-legal actions to resolve their disputes. (US Human Rights Report on Jamaica (2012)).  4. Justice services offered at the community level and outside of the formal courts system can more effectively address some aspects of victims’ and offenders’ needs for satisfaction, closure, reconciliation, and restitution.  5. Increased use of alternatives and community-based justice services can alleviate the burdens of an overloaded court and prison system (UNODC 2007). | On overall needs and priorities in the justice system reform process: Dennis Darby “Jamaica Justice System Policy Reform Agenda Framework” (2009), prepared for the Ministry of Justice. Issues identified as especially strategic include: access to justice; community-national links; social dimensions of justice reform.  On the negative effects of pre-trial detention (which can be reduced through alternatives to detention): Open Society Foundations and UNDP, The Socioeconomic Impact of Pretrial Detention, Global Campaign for Pretrial Justice. 2011, New York.  Alternative justice services outside of the courts can address challenges related to victim and offender satisfaction with the process and can be effective in terms of resolving crime and preventing recidivism. For example, the Ministry of Justice Restorative Justice Policy (2012) notes that Restorative Justice (RJ) reduces feelings of revenge/reprisal, alleviates post-traumatic stress among victims, and decreases recidivism in some offences (page 9). It can also contribute to reducing overcrowding in prisons through offering alternatives to incarceration.  Victim awareness programs attempt to change offenders’ perception of their victims as people, to understand the full impact of their actions on others and to assist offenders in developing empathy (see MacKenzie, D.L. “Reducing the Criminal Activities of Known Offenders and Delinquents” in Lawrence Sherman, et al eds. (2002) Evidence-Based Crime Prevention, Routledge.  The Office of the Children’s Advocate noted concerns about minors (especially girls) being detained in adult facilities, and being detained for non-criminal “uncontrollable behavior.” Jamaica Information Service, 18 March 2013. <http://www.jis.gov.jm/news/list/33267>. The purpose of the Child Diversion Program is to design, offer, and implement a series of options as alternatives to prosecution and incarceration of minors in conflict with the law. The decision about which option to apply is taken by the Parish Child Diversion Committee in collaboration with the relevant judicial officials.  Studies from the UK demonstrate promising results in terms of reoffending rates for those who participated in restorative justice and mediation programmes. They also note significant cost savings for the government when litigation and/or incarceration are avoided, and (in some cases) improved victim satisfaction with the justice process. Joanna Shapland et al. 2008. Does restorative justice affect reconviction? The fourth report from the evaluation of three schemes. Ministry of Justice Research Series 10/08 <http://webarchive.nationalarchives.gov.uk/+/http:/www.justice.gov.uk/restorative-justice-report_06-08.pdf>. See also David Miers et al. 2001. An Exploratory Evaluation of Restorative Justice Schemes Paper 9 <http://www.ibarj.org/docs/miers.pdf>  Fiadjoe, Albert. 2004. Alternative Dispute Resolution: A Developing World Perspective. Cavendish Publishing. This overview of international experiences of restorative justice and mediation (including in Jamaica) suggests that these approaches can be “more effective than the criminal justice system” in achieving victim and offender satisfaction, reducing recidivism, achieving completion of restitution orders, and fostering “societal control of crime,” including in the Caribbean.  Diversion programs are generally worthwhile from the perspective of the cost-benefit analysis of an altenrative to incarceration versus a formal trial and incarceration period. This is one of the justifications for alternative options such as Restorative Justice and Child Diversion. UNICEF Toolkit on Alternatives and Diversion (Costs and Recidivism): <http://www.unicef.org/tdad/index_56509.html>  Child Diversion programmes also try to prevent future recidivism by the juveniles who are in conflict with the law. Any contact with the corrections system as a juvenile increases a person’s risk factors and likelihood of future criminal involvement, and therefore diversion is recommended in almost all cases. American Psychological Association, 2011. “Better Options for Troubled Teens.” <http://www.apa.org/monitor/2011/12/troubled-teens.aspx>  On alternative justice services leading to positive effects for reducing case overload in the courts system: Report No. 37820, 2007. Crime, Violence, and Development: Trends, Costs, and Policy Options in the Caribbean: A Joint Report by the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime and the Latin America and the Caribbean Region of the World Bank: “[In Jamaica,] the small court and prosecution systems are swamped, and the non-use of plea bargaining and alternative dispute resolution (ADR) for minor crimes tends to delay trials inordinately.” Page 111. | |
| 1313) Technical assistance provided to the Social Justice Consortium (a unit within MoJ) to support the management and delivery of community justice services. | MOJ requires additional capacity to ensure that the community justice services are delivered with sufficient strategic planning, assessment of a particular community’s needs, assets, and constraints, and coordination with entities offering related services. | 1. Increasing alignment of community justice services delivery with the Justice Reform Process (funded in part through DFATD’s JUST program) will improve the quality and efficiency of services.  2. Increasing alignment of community justice services delivery with Jamaican policies (e.g. RJ) and with international best practices will improve the quality of services. | * General jDarustice reform framework: Dennis Darby “Jamaica Justice System Policy Reform Agenda Framework” (2009). * National Restorative Justice Policy of Jamaica. Ministry of Justice. March 2012. * Best practices of community-oriented policing show integration with other forms of community-based justice, particularly mediation and restorative justice: Nicholl, Caroline G. *Community Policing, Community Justice, and Restorative Justice: Exploring the Links for the Delivery of a Balanced Approach to Public Safety.* Washington, DC: U.S. Department of Justice, Office of Community Oriented Policing Services, 1999. * Best practices in community-oriented and problem-solving courts require close coordination with a range of community-level justice services: Center for Court Innovation, <http://www.courtinnovation.org/community-justice-case-studies> | |
| 1323) Public education/outreach campaigns conducted to promote a rights-based culture and awareness of justice services in target communities. | Many community residents are not aware of their rights under the law, of their right to complain if due process or human rights are violated by justice officials, or of the services and resources that exist to assist them in their interactions with the justice system. This lack of knowledge constitutes a barrier to accessing justice services. | 1. Numerous reports and NGO comments during consultations suggest that there is a general lack of awareness among Jamaicans in vulnerable communities about their basic rights and services under the justice system. (CSJP analysis missions 2013; Darby 2009; Jamaicans for Justice reports.) | * The prominent NGO Jamaicans for Justice has identified key areas and various media and training platforms for communicating messages about human rights, justice services, etc. <http://jamaicansforjustice.org/whoweare/programme-areas/public-education-and-advocacy/> * The shareholder coalition submission to the UN Human Rights Universal Periodic Review (UPR) for Jamaica (HRC 9th Session, 2009) notes the need for increased awareness about rights and responsibilities under the law and under the UN human rights frameworks. | |