

EXTENSION OF PRIMARY EDUCATION AND TEACHER EDUCATION II

(HA-0028)

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

BORROWER AND GUARANTOR: THE GOVERNMENT OF HAITI

EXECUTING AGENCY: THE MINISTRY OF EDUCATION, YOUTH AND SPORTS

AMOUNT AND SOURCE:

IDB:	US\$17.6 million (SF)
Local counterpart funding:	US\$ 2.0 million
Total:	US\$19.6 million

FINANCIAL TERMS AND CONDITIONS:

Amortization period:	40 years
Disbursement period:	18 months
Interest rate:	1% during the 10-year grace period, 2% thereafter
Inspection and supervision:	1%
Credit fee:	0.50%

OBJECTIVES: The objectives of the program are to improve internal efficiency and promote equity in the basic cycle of primary education. It will seek to reduce dropping out, increase pupil performance and increase the efficiency of primary education. (See Annex 1, The Logical Framework)

DESCRIPTION: Though the program accords with long-term needs and objectives, it is a stop-gap measure to complete and consolidate the achievements of IDB loan 774/SF-HA (PR-1432), to help build education as a bulwark to democracy, while allowing time to complete the consultative and disseminative process required for the new National Education Plan. The project has four components:

1. Fonds de Parrainage National (FPN) (US\$5.4 million) would, in school year 1995 - 96, provide scholarships to 80,000 disadvantaged children completing the first and second cycles of primary schooling in approved private schools who are considered to be at risk of leaving school in two critical years in the cycle, grades IV and VI, due to the poverty of their parents.
2. Textbooks and School Supplies (US\$9.9 million) This component would, in school year 1996 - 97, subsidize the printing and distribution of new

textbooks for all, provide free supplies of consumables for public schools and distribute teaching manuals to teachers in the public and private sector.

3. Training (US\$3.3 million), for teachers, school directors, school supervisors and pedagogical supervisors in both public and approved private schools, in school years 1995 to 1997.
4. Support to the National Education Plan (PNE) (US\$333,000) to facilitate the national dialogue and public participation in the process of finalizing the National Education Plan.

This project has the same objectives as Loan 774/SF-HA which was interrupted in 1991. Two principal components of this project match components of 774/SF-HA, the provision of texts and the training of teachers. *Fonds de Parrainage National* is new and will be included to combat dropping out due to acute poverty. Support to the National Education Plan is a small additional component which will permit the GOH to develop a long term plan and better coordinate aid. Outstanding school construction and rehabilitation objectives of 774/SF-HA will now be met by the FAES. The increased size of the loan, compared to 774, reflects the increased needs generated by the embargo and the greatly increased public interest in education.

**ENVIRONMENTAL
CLASSIFICATION:**

The Environmental Management Committee, at its meeting of August 25, 1995, classified this as a Category II operation.

RISKS:

The political uncertainty of the country, along with the coordination efforts needed to manage multi-source financing, pose the greatest risks to the operation.

BENEFITS:

The proposed project aims to improve efficiency, pupil performance and equity with the greatest benefits accruing to the poor who attend school. It has no recurrent cost implications. It facilitates a national dialogue and public participation in the process of finalizing the National Education Plan in order to inform and acquaint all sectors of society with both the scale of needs and the level of constraints under which the country works.

**THE BANK'S
COUNTRY AND
SECTOR STRATEGY:**

Haiti's education faces massive structural and resource problems which require a consolidated commitment of funds and longer term development of education, based on the needs reflected in the emerging National Education Plan. The Bank's assistance strategy will focus on a long-term approach towards improving quality, increasing access, strengthening management, institutional building, promoting community participation, norm setting for all education levels and ensuring the long-term sustainability of the system.

**EXCEPTIONS TO
BANK POLICY:**

None.

**SPECIAL
CONTRACTUAL
CONDITIONS:**

As a condition for disbursement of funds for the scholarship program and the training of teachers, directors and supervisors, the borrower will be required to present evidence that it has signed contracts with the Fond de Parrainage National and the FONHEP, stipulating the commitments, obligations and duties of each party.

POVERTY TARGETING:

The proposed program qualifies as a poverty targeted investment as set forth in the Eighth Replenishment Document. The poverty head count ratio in Haiti is above 50%. The program supports basic education while a significant majority of the beneficiaries, according to the conditions prevailing in Haiti, are poor children already in school.

PROCUREMENT:

The limit above which international public bidding for the procurement of goods will be done is US\$250,000. No works are anticipated.

I. FRAME OF REFERENCE

A. Introduction

- 1.1 Economic and social conditions deteriorated after the coup d'etat in September 1991, the subsequent embargo and government neglect. The country was characterized by debilitated institutions, macroeconomic imbalances, dilapidated infrastructure, depleted productive assets and pervasive poverty. Between 1992 and 1993 Haiti's real per capita income declined to below \$250, the lowest in the Hemisphere. The return of Aristide in October 1994 coincided with the lifting of sanctions and a multidonor effort to stabilize and rehabilitate the economy. With the opening of the economy and improved policies, inflation declined to 43% in December, 1994 (from 52% in September), and the Gourde appreciated to around G14 per US\$ (from G21 in August) where it has since remained.
- 1.2 Despite the progress since the lifting of the embargo and the adoption of significant policy reforms, the changes that will ensure sustained and equitable growth are still far from complete and many obstacles to growth remain. There are institutional obstacles, which have their foundation in decades of government neglect and socioeconomic stagnation. As a result, institutions possess limited capacity for the formulation and implementation of public policy. In terms of economic obstacles, major impediments to growth and investment are the poor condition of the economic infrastructure and the deficient provision of basic services, most notably electricity. There is a lack of skilled labor and an excess of low productivity employment, which has seriously affected the competitiveness of the productive sectors. One of the major social obstacles to development is the concentration of economic power in the hands of a tiny elite. The middle class is small. An overwhelming majority of the population live in deep poverty. This inequitable distribution of wealth has resulted in a sub-optimal use of capital and of the country's natural and human resources.
- 1.3 A major challenge to Haiti's sustainable development is the growth of its population. It has one of the highest fertility rates in the Western Hemisphere (6 children per woman). The current population of around 7.4 million is expected to increase to more than 8 million by the year 2000, straining an already deficient health system. Primary health care services reach no more than 60% of the population, the quality of service is low and the incidence of malnutrition and contagious diseases is alarming. The education sector is characterized by low coverage, inequitable access and low efficiency.
- 1.4 The task faced by Haiti's leadership is to maintain democratic order while laying the basis for sustained economic growth and social equity. A medium term strategy of the government is the development of a social policy that will contribute to the

alleviation of poverty and provide the foundation of a healthy, educated and flexible labor force that can adapt to dynamic economic conditions. Action on poverty and the social sectors will require major reallocation of resources to increase funding for programs in health, education and nutrition among others.

- 1.5 Assuming political stability and a sound macroeconomic reform agenda, a reliable flow of donor support can be expected. Thus, during the 1996-1998 period, international donors will be expected to provide the bulk of financial support to the country to carry out public investment to rehabilitate, modernize and enhance infrastructure and improve the provision of services.

B. The Basic Education Sub Sector

1. Coverage and Equity

- 1.6 Article 33 of Haiti's 1834 constitution declared "l'instruction primaire est gratuite et obligatoire." Every subsequent constitution has included the same noble objective. "Haiti gradually moved from having no schools at independence [in 1804] to having one of the highest rates of primary school enrollment relative to comparable developing countries." ^{1/} Despite these ideals, educational attainment is among the lowest in the region, while at the same time Haitian families bear a proportionately higher private burden for the education of their children than any other parents in the Americas, and perhaps the world. Thus while public spending on education is estimated ^{2/} at about 2% of GDP, total spending appears to be almost 14%.

Table 1.1 Projections of School Age Population

POPULATION	1990	1995	2000	2005
Total	6,486,047	7,180,294	7,958,964	8,821,709
School Age (5-11 yrs)	884,700	967,000	1,057,400	1,156,000
school age (% of pop)	14%	13%	13%	13%

- 1.7 The population of primary school age is increasing and the dependency ratio will not improve significantly for the near

1/ Political Economy in Haiti: The Drama of Survival. Fass S. Transaction Publishers, New Brunswick, 1988.

2/ Diagnostic Global du Secteur d'Education d'Haiti Research Triangle Institute / Academy for Educational Development, 1995.

future, as shown in Table 1.1. Primary school enrollment of over 920,000, as shown in line 3 of Table 1.2, appears high but in reality only includes about 50% of the age group. Approximately half of the children are over age for their grade. The adult literacy rate is about 35%. The country has neither the school space nor the legal apparatus to support the obligation of parents to educate their children. Nor does the State currently have the resources to provide education freely to more than a tiny minority of children.

Table 1.2 Composition of Primary School Enrollment by Age 1991/1992

AGE	BOYS	GIRLS	TOTAL	% GIRLS
5-11 (1)	219,481	225,055	444,536	46%
12-18+ (2)	260,229	221,458	481,757	50%
Total(1+2)	479,780	446,413	926,293	48%
% Overage (2/1)	118.6%	98.4%	108.37%	
(source: Annuaire statistique 1987-1992 de la DPCE)				

- 1.8 The education system is predominantly private, both in terms of provision and financing. Recent rapid growth in the private sector means that about 90% of all children in preschools, 85% in primary schools and 83% at secondary level now attend private institutions. Three main private institutions operate, the Protestant and Catholic Churches and the lay sector. In the primary sub-sector they operate about 8,000 schools, enroll just over one million pupils, utilize 42,800 class groups in 21,100 classrooms and employ 30,300 teachers. The distribution of private schools by sponsor and location is shown in Table 1.3 below. 3/

3/ Annuaire Statistique des Ecoles Primaires Privées, (1993-94)
August 1994 FOHNEP Port au Prince.

Table 1.3 Distribution of Schools by Ownership and Location 1993/4

SPONSOR	URBAN	RURAL	SHANTYTOWN	TOTAL
CATHOLIC	287	839	30	1156
PROTESTANT	700	2,634	133	3467
LAY	1,032	2,048	279	3359
NO RESPONSE	nr	nr	nr	418
TOTAL	2,019	5,521	442	8400

- 1.9 The structure of schooling and the terminology used to describe it differs considerably from most other member countries and even within the country there are variations according to ownership of the school, whether it is urban or rural and the degree to which the school has participated in the 1982 education reform referred to below. In ideal circumstances children's education begins with a multi year program of pre schooling (education pré scolaire) beginning as early as three to four years of age. This is followed by the first obligatory four year cycle of schooling at age six or seven, which aims to establish literacy in Creole for those children in schools which have reformed. This is followed by a two year cycle intended to establish literacy in French. Finally a third cycle of three years, divided into "cycle général" or "cycle technique et professionnel" completes basic education or "éducation fondamentale". After the nine years a select group of children may enter one of four streams: "école normale" for teacher training and leading to employment as a teacher; "lycée classique" leading to the baccalaureate general and probably university; "lycée technique" leading to baccalaureate and perhaps higher technical institutes; or "école professionnelle" leading to employment. For people aged 12 and over a system of non formal professional education and training is intended to lead to employment. Within each cycle each year has a name, thus grades 1 and 2 are called "cours préparatoire I et II", grades 3 and 4 are "cours élémentaire I et II" and grades 5 and 6 are called "cours moyen I et II".
- 1.10 In the primary cycles school begins between 7.30 and 8.00 and should end by 12.30 to 1.30 giving an average attendance of 4.5 to 5 hours per day for about 170 days per year. In practice, days are shortened by late arrival and early departure due to thirst and hunger and the inability of schools to meet these needs. In addition the number of days is often reduced by unplanned holidays, and disruptions due to politics, weather and sundry other causes. Thus the intended annual number of hours schooling, which at 800 falls short of world norms of 1000, is further reduced to as little

as 400 or 500 per year. The content of schooling is largely a matter of chance.

- 1.11 It should be noted that only 2,740 schools (or 34%) offer the full six year cycle which is intended to establish literacy in French, and a further 1,500 (or 19%) offer the four year cycle which seeks to establish literacy in Creole.
- 1.12 In the 1980s there was a rapid growth in the number of rural and *bidonville* (shantytown) schools, many of appalling quality, partly in response to the failure of government to provide schooling. Since August 1986 the *Fondation Haitienne de l'Enseignement Privé* (FONHEP) has tried to establish for private schools some of the standards which are normally set by government or specialized education agencies. These standards include simple tests of teacher and pupil knowledge, recommended curricula and books, and even some kind of recognition/accreditation system. Without any legal authority and with high levels of parental ignorance, the system can only operate to guide FONHEP and the government as to which schools are worth supporting. FONHEP has undertaken a diagnostic of training needs, mounted training programs for teachers, (*journées pédagogiques*), principals and supervisors and has been successful in raising foreign funds to improve the quality of private schools. Furthermore, the lessons acquired by FONHEP through its own routine evaluations and through the "*diagnostique*" recently undertaken for the "*Plan National d'Education*" (PNE) will enable improvements to be made in the delivery of future training, including that proposed to be financed under this operation.
- 1.13 In most countries, access to education is usually regarded as a question of coverage, and for remote and rural areas of Haiti this is true. Seventy percent of the population is rural and Haitian farmers live on dispersed small holdings of less than three acres. The historical reasons for this include a fear of dispossession which binds farmers to their plots, an inheritance system based on the Napoleonic code of "*morcellement*" which divides the land equally among the children on a farmer's death rather than the system of "*primogeniture*" which maintains the integrity of the holding while dispersing the family, and an extractive social and political system which makes an advantage of isolation. The most rapid recent growth in educational coverage has been through the Private Voluntary Organization, (PVO) and lay schools serving this population. Poor parents, eager for the betterment of their children will often spend their meager resources on wholly inadequate schools. The rapid rate of population growth, both rural and urban, shown in Table 1.4, presents an additional challenge in maintaining access.

Table 1.4 Projections of Population 1990-2005

Year Population	1990	1995	2000	2005
Urban	1,920,829	2,338,843	2,835,433	3,417,549
Rural	4,565,218	4,841,451	5,123,531	5,404,160
Total	6,486,047	7,180,294	7,958,964	8,821,709
Source: RTI, IHSI				

- 1.14 However, the problem of access has three additional dimensions in Haiti. Firstly, many of the poorest families can not afford either the direct or indirect private costs of schooling. The Government estimates that one million children aged 6-12 are not enrolled due either to the inability of their families to meet the direct costs of attendance or, in rural areas, their inability to bear the opportunity cost of foregoing the contribution of children's labor to family income.
- 1.15 One response to family poverty has been the establishment of an organization, *Fonds de Parrainage National* (FPN) which channels funds to private schools to pay the fees of poor families who are unable to meet tuition fees. FPN calculates the cost of its sponsorship as Gourdes 1000 per year. The size of the annual grant is based on the average school fees charged over a wide sample of approved schools and fixed periodically; currently it is G800 per year and this is the maximum the schools can receive. Schools with higher costs than G800 receive only the scholarship, schools with lower charges receive only the amount they charge, thereby avoiding inflation of the fees. FPN uses the balance, G200, for its administrative overhead and development costs: pupil selection; applications; school monitoring; pupil monitoring; management of the monthly payments to school; publicity; and annual auditing by an independent firm.
- 1.16 The scheme is publicized by the schools, which in turn have to meet criteria of efficiency established by the FPN. Poor children who have performed well academically are identified by the school. Their parents are encouraged by the schools to apply for the funds to FPN. On approval of the application by the FPN, the child is entered in a computerized register which enables FPN to follow the pupils progress and attendance throughout the year. The FPN records the performance of all children it sponsors. It requires at least two participating schools per *departement* but prefers around twenty. It produces lists of pupils and forms one of the few routinely collected measures of pupil performance and proxy measures of school quality.

- 1.17 In order to become eligible to receive funds the schools have to enter a regional competition at the level of *departement* and only the highest scoring schools are selected. The criteria judged in the competition are the past academic record of the school in terms of examination successes at the end of the second cycle of primary school, the reasonableness of the tuition costs - very high cost schools are excluded, the age of the school - very recent and possibly short lived schools are excluded, the licensing status of the school, the qualification and experience of the teachers and the remoteness of the school - more isolated schools receive a heavier weight.
- 1.18 The criteria for selection of children include the poverty of their parents, the fact that they are already overage for their grade (for largely non academic reasons), or that they are about to enter grade IV (*CE 1*) or grade VI (*CM 2*). It is an explicit objective of the FPN to avoid creating discrimination between boys and girls in Haitian schools, therefore, FPN will adjust the allocation in this project to counter any apparent tacit or overt discrimination against girls reflected in local enrollment data. FPN limits the percentage of children in each school.
- 1.19 Private individuals, expatriate Haitians and a variety of organizations sponsor children through the FPN. With the help of UNICEF, FPN has recently collected considerable funds in Germany. However, despite its good work, FPN can only fund a small number of children each year. It therefore has to target the poorest, limit its sponsorship to those children already in school with the highest likelihood of success and try to widen its fund-raising base. For the foreseeable future the FPN will be unable to meet the fees for children not in school; there are simply too many.
- 1.20 A second problem of access is that the quality of education within the grasp of the poor is so low that for many Haitian youngsters their education is purely nominal, its main manifestations being the symbolic wearing of school uniform and the daily attendance at a building called a school. Lacking books, skilled teachers and a national curriculum mean that whatever cognitive development occurs is as likely to arise from maturation and interaction with peers as from the pedagogics of the institution.
- 1.21 Thirdly, even after investing in the education of their children, the poor face the added burden that their children are more likely to repeat, thereby incurring additional costs, and perhaps dropout before achieving irreversible literacy in either Creole or French.

2. Quality - Internal and External Efficiency

- 1.22 Education, both public and private, is usually poor but both the best and worst schools are private. In terms of quality, public schools fall in between. High quality, high cost schools and low quality, penny pinching, profit seeking schools ("*écoles*

borlettes") are found in cities and towns. In rural and poor urban areas, church, NGO and community run schools exist and vary in quality according to their mission and their access to resources from outside the communities they serve. For many indigent children in poor schools the main benefit of going to a church or NGO school is the food supplied by foreign and local charities which offsets the obligatory costs of school attendance - registration, examinations, identity cards, uniforms, shoes and, in some cases, transport. Public schools also charge fees, and require the purchase of books, supplies, uniforms and shoes.

- 1.23 Academic failure is the norm; desertion and repetition rates are extremely high. Only about one-third of all children entering primary school complete the cycle. The repetition rate averaged 13% during 1980-1988 and the dropout rate was even higher. Many children who fail to be promoted in one private school simply move to another with less exacting standards, thereby progressing in the administrative but not in the cognitive sense. The scale of this phenomenon is unknown. Nor is much known about the criteria for promotion used in private schools and whether the private sector uses promotion and repetition as revenue raising or marketing strategies. It is estimated that 89% of the children in the last year of primary education are overage (15.3 years old on average) instead of the normal 12. The structure of the education cycle make dropping out in or before completing the fourth and sixth years a particularly acute inefficiency.
- 1.24 External efficiency is low; the curricula are usually orientated towards university admission even though only 14% of total enrollment is at secondary level and less than 1% of primary school entrants will eventually reach university. The curricula are more apt to 19th century France than 20th century America. Rather than developing mass education for the poor, Haiti's system has evolved by expanding an elite education, where, "... in the French tradition the purpose of schooling was to bring enlightenment, intellectuality and culture to individuals who had no other means of acquiring them. ...education was a means to an end in which graduates would not have to earn their livelihood in manual work". 4/
- 1.25 The tripartite structure of the private sector - comprising churches, charities and charlatans, each often having their own limited and singular view of the world and the purpose of education, resembles the highly imperfect education market which thrived in 19th century England, before the intervention of the state brought some sense of purpose, order and equity into popular education.

4/ Fass S M op cit.

3. An Analysis of Causes

- 1.26 The reasons for the problems of Haitian education are manifold but can be grouped into four categories, the first of which is the weaknesses of the state as provider. State support for education is relatively weak. Little attention has been paid to planning, and planning and management skills are in short supply. Standards for subject courses, schools, teachers, texts and tests, have never really been developed and those regulations and norms which do exist are often disregarded. There is a lack both of school supervision and of any objective measures of performance. The country lacks an enforceable framework within which private schools operate. Finally, there has been widespread use of a school place, as quid pro quo for political fealty or a gratuity.
- 1.27 A second major cause of poor education is the prevalence of public and private poverty which severely limit the availability of school resources. "...the Haitian state has traditionally intervened in the economy only to extract money" 5/ Public spending on education is below 2% of Haiti's low GDP and about 20% of total public expenditure. What little government spending exists, is also highly inequitable. Public outlay per student at university level is twenty times primary education per pupil expenditure. 6/ The allocation of public spending is inefficient. Of the 1988/89 estimated per capita cost of public primary schooling of \$71.90, fully \$69.70 went to pay the salaries of teachers and only \$2.20 went to all other operating costs. 7/ Given that Haitian teachers have poor levels of education and qualifications, given the high pupil to teacher ratios, given the heavy reliance on the oral transmission of facts implied by an operational expenditure of \$2.20 per year and given that pupils' linguistic abilities and attention spans are likely to be limited, it is easy to envisage that learning would be confined to lower cognitive skills and that low levels of attainment would be the norm.
- 1.28 Apart from low family income, which directly limits the ability of families to buy education services, poor social conditions produce children who are not able to benefit fully from education. Illiterate parents, a lack of literacy and reading materials in the home, a lack of light, widespread ocular deficiencies, poor nutrition, sporadic illnesses and chronic attention reducing ailments all detract from the ability of children to learn, even when children do enroll at school.

5/ Haiti: The Failure of Politics Weinstein B and Segal A Preager, New York 1992.

6/ World Bank Estimates LATHR, 1980

7/ Analyse Economique et Financière du Secteur de l'Education en République d'Haïti, Bourdon J. et Perrot J. Université de Bourgogne, MENJS, UNDP & UNESCO. Oct 1990.

- 1.29 Another reason for low efficiency relates to low school attendance due to family cash flow and child employment. While the school year runs from October 1 to June 1, for many rural families the peak cash availability is January. Many children delay entry into school therefore until fees are available. In addition, school holidays conflict with peak demands for family farm labor. (In contrast, the Dominican Republic has different school years according to the location, thus allowing the harvesting of shrub crops without missing school).
- 1.30 A third set of factors centered on cultural and political isolation add to Haiti's educational problems. Being nominally Francophone in a predominantly Anglophone and Hispanophone hemisphere, has placed Haiti in a philosophical backwater. Such pedagogical influences as child centered learning, problem and theme based education, integrated studies, etc, have not been readily absorbed into the curriculum.
- 1.31 The use of Creole in education, while serving to popularize education and thereby increase one aspect of efficiency, has imposed diseconomies of scale in other aspects such as the development of educational materials, courses, examinations, etc. alone, rather than as part of regional consortia. Access to basic references and texts is limited by the need to reproduce them in Creole, and while Haiti has an impressive number of publishing houses for such a poor country, local production of all the resources needed by a comprehensive school system will prove burdensome. In social terms, unless the system of mass education provides a vehicle to achieve bilingualism with French (or even trilingualism with English or Spanish), schooling will continue to be a cause of and not a cure for social division.
- 1.32 A particularly acute result of these structural defects is poor teacher and school principal quality. Their general level of education, their professional training (only about 15% are qualified teachers), their salaries and their opportunities for in-service training are all low. They receive little classroom supervision. They do not have pupil assessment, they have not participated in the development of curriculum and instructional materials or been trained in their use, they lack reference materials and visual aids, and have pupils who lack textbooks and materials. Finally they work in poor school facilities. Given the importance of teachers in the system and given the proven positive impact a good, inspiring principal has on the operation of a school and its successful integration with the community it serves, upgrading these two professions is both an urgent need and a long term goal.
- 1.33 A comprehensive program of training for the private sector has been undertaken by FONHEP with external support and the World Bank has previously provided for teacher training. However in both these programs emphasis was placed on training which contributed to the

adoption of a reformed but unproven curricula which only half of the schools have adopted (see below). Many needy teachers were therefore excluded from training. In addition, it should be noted that in the absence of a well developed curriculum, standardized and approved teaching texts and materials and validated assessment procedures, the importance of the teacher's role in student achievement is amplified.

- 1.34 The problems are intensified by deficient sector management. The relationship between the Ministry and the private education institutions is largely undefined. The Ministry lacks the capacity and influence required to effectively design, plan and implement sector wide policies and programs. It also lacks equipment and supplies to perform basic management and planning functions. Central and local departments performing planning and management functions are largely staffed by former teachers, not necessarily qualified to carry out these functions. And the same is true of teacher supervisors - *moniteurs*.
- 1.35 The lessons of past reforms are inconclusive. A reform of basic education introduced in 1982 was only partially implemented and as a result there is inconsistency in the structure of school cycles, curricula and the use of Creole as the language of instruction. No difference has been noted in the academic performance of children between reform and non-reform schools. The GOH policy, aided by multilateral and bilateral financiers has tended to offer support only to schools participating in or introducing the reform. It would be wise to review the reform strategy before undertaking major new investments in education.
- 1.36 USAID together with UNESCO and UNICEF are currently assisting the MENJS in the development of a National Education Plan, aimed at defining the major operational strategies and guidelines to orient the Haitian education system in the medium and long-term, and establish concrete mechanisms in order to address the basic learning needs of the population. A chronic complaint of donors has been the absence of a long term vision for education. Previous plans have been overambitious, under-researched and introduced without major public consultation. Clearly the development of the National Education Plan should precede any major investment in education. Furthermore, the contents of the Plan and an investment program to carry it out require a considerable degree of donor coordination and long term donor commitment. In the meantime, there is a pressing need to maintain the impetus of education improvement and expand participation, especially given the important role education has played in bringing democratic government to Haiti.

C. Bank Strategy and Lending Program in Haiti

- 1.37 When the Bank suspended operations in Haiti in 1991 in response to the OAS and United Nations imposed embargo, it had made 34 loans

totalling US\$356 million. Cumulative disbursements at the end of 1991 totalled US\$223 million, leaving US\$132 million in undisbursed and frozen resources. The loans were reactivated in February 1995, and currently there are 13 loans in execution totalling US\$250.9 million, of which US\$60.8 million has been disbursed.

- 1.38 Specifically, the IDB's involvement in the education sector to date has been modest. Two loans have been approved, loan 508/SF-HA in 1977 for US\$9.6 million and a parallel technical cooperation for US\$1.3 million to improve rural education in Haiti, loan 774/SF-HA in 1985 for US\$11.5 million and a parallel non-reimbursable technical cooperation for US\$1.5 million for the expansion and improvement of the primary and normal school education system. The Economic and Social Fund (FAES Loan 854/SF-HA) approved in 1991 has provided funds for the rehabilitation of existing primary schools.
- 1.39 A project to improve the efficiency and equity of technical and professional education and training is under preparation. The Environmental Profile and Profile II were approved in 1991. Initial preparation and appraisal was undertaken with the financial support of the Canadian Government and the technical team are currently updating the appraisal both in the light of the recent changes and with a view to integrating the long term strategy for this level of education with the emerging overall comprehensive strategy for education development. The expected value of this project will be about \$10 million.
- 1.40 According to the Bank's strategy in Haiti, a substantial portion of the FSO allocation for Haiti will be devoted to the social sectors in keeping with the mandate of the 8th Replenishment. In education, the Bank will play an important role, taking a long-term approach toward improving quality and equity, increasing access, strengthening management, institutional building, norm setting for all levels of education and ensuring the long-term sustainability of the system. In this regard, a new project is being conceptualized considering the longer-term development of education based on the needs reflected in the emerging National Education Plan.

D. Participation of Other International Agencies

- 1.41 The World Bank's activities in Haitian education have involved partial financing of four projects in Haiti, for the building and equipping of primary schools (rural and urban), primary teacher training colleges, secondary vocational schools, vocational training center and an agricultural training school. It has also provided assistance for functional literacy for adults and over-aged dropouts of primary schools, improvement in educational planning, administration and supervision, in service teacher training and support to the implementation of the education reform.

- 1.42 Prior to the coup, the World Bank had prepared, evaluated and approved its Fifth Education Program designed to support the definition of a sustainable sector development policy and improve primary education through teacher training, textbook provision and school rehabilitation. The credit never became effective and was canceled in 1993.
- 1.43 The Agency for International Development (USAID) has also provided funds for education in Haiti, particularly training programs for unskilled and semiskilled workers, literacy programs, reconditioning of pre-school centers and financing of school lunches and installing kitchens, in cooperation with CARE Programs and support to rural primary education to repair, reequip and furnish private rural primary schools as well as literacy. It is currently assisting the Ministry, together with UNESCO, in the development of the National Education Plan. The European Union will also assist in this endeavor by providing the services of a consultant for the final integration of the Plan.
- 1.44 The French and Canadian Governments have provided and continue to provide assistance for rehabilitation of primary and secondary schools through the government and NGOs. UNESCO has provided funds for non-formal education, literacy and to a lesser degree to strengthen the ministry, UNICEF for basic education to children in difficult situations and UNDP in scholarship programs, literacy and education.

II. THE PROGRAM, ITS COST AND ITS FINANCING

A. Program Objectives

1. A qualification

- 2.1 Haiti's education faces massive structural and resource problems which require a consolidated commitment of funds and intellectual effort and a long term, carefully staged and conditioned pipeline. The current project has limited scope both in terms of time and objectives. It accords with the long term needs and objectives but is a stop-gap measure to complete and consolidate the achievements of IDB loan 774/SF-HA, to help build education as a bulwark to democracy, while allowing time to complete the preparation of the consultative and disseminative process required for the new National Education Plan. While the project will focus its help on the poorer members of the school population it should be noted that targeting methods currently available in Haiti do not permit the kind of targeting often used elsewhere to exclude the better off from participation in the benefits of the project. Furthermore, the country's poorest children cannot be reached by conventional educational methods until they attend school and such an expansion of coverage will require the injection of major resources.
- 2.2 The objectives of this program are to improve internal efficiency in the existing schools and promote equity in the basic cycle of primary education by increasing the achievement of the more disadvantaged pupils.

B. Program Components

- 2.3 The Program consists of four components:
- a. The provision of scholarships to 80,000 disadvantaged children completing the first and second cycles of primary schooling in approved private schools who are considered to be at risk of leaving school in two critical years in the cycle, grades IV and VI, due to the poverty of their parents.
 - b. The program will subsidize the printing and distribution of new textbooks for all, provide free supplies of consumables for public schools and distribute teaching materials to teachers in the public sector.
 - c. The training of teachers, schools directors, and school supervisors in both public and approved private schools.

- d. Support to facilitate the national dialogue and public participation in the process of finalizing the National Education Plan.

C. Program Description

1. Fonds de Parrainage National (\$5,420,000 - 17.6%)

- 2.4 This component contributes to the objectives of promoting equity and internal efficiency. The specific objective is to reduce the dropping out rate among 80,000 means tested children in selected private schools whose families are unlikely to be able to afford the tuition fees for the academic year October 1995 to June 1996. The component will operate through the Fonds de Parrainage National (FPN). The project will fund each pupil to the extent of G1,000 (\$67) ^{8/}. The funds will make a payment to the school of G800 (US\$54) for the selected pupils to meet the cost of tuition, i.d. cards, consumable school manuals, tests and sundry supplies.
- 2.5 The IDB Program would also provide funds to strengthen FPN, particularly in the evaluation and publicizing of its activities and the development of mechanisms to attract alternative sources of financing in the future, in the belief that evidence of a good track record will facilitate the flow of charitable donations.
- 2.6 In the state sector, the MENJS will waive the fees for selected poor parents as its contribution to facilitating the attendance of poor students.

2. Subsidize the Printing and Distribution of Texts, Pupil Workbooks and Teachers Manuals and School Supplies (\$9,913,000 - 50.5%)

- 2.7 This component also contributes to the objectives of promoting equity and internal efficiency. The specific component objective is to increase the quantity and quality of learning, especially for poor children who would not otherwise have access to books. It will also increase participation among the poor by reducing the financial obstacles to school attendance.
- 2.8 Almost 50% of pupils have no texts. This results from the inability of the parents to buy them and the inability of the state to provide them. To resolve this problem the project will subsidize the production and distribution of 2,500,000 diverse texts which will then be offered on sale through extant commercial channels, through warehouses operated by the FONHEP and through the MENJS in the ten *Départements scolaire* in clearly marked editions at approximately 20% of the former cost.

^{8/} US\$1.00 = 15 Gourdes

- 2.9 The project will also finance the preparation and distribution of 45,000 teachers' guides to cover the whole primary school curriculum, the objective being to increase the levels of pupil cognition and promote an improved quality of learning, for distribution through warehouses operated by the FONHEP and through the MENJS in the ten *Départements scolaires*.
- 2.10 The component will include the purchase of 3,000,000 varied exercise books, pens and pencils, 200,000 boxes of chalk and 200,000 simple sets of geometrical instruments, for distribution to approved schools.
- 2.11 The cost of packaging, delivery, and storage has been included in the costs of each element of the component and the final distribution will be overseen by a committee comprising school inspectors, pedagogical supervisors, members of parents' associations and others judged creditable. It should be noted that this component will finance purchases of textbooks for the school year October 1996 to June 1997, as the textbooks for the October 1995 to June 1996 school year have been financed by the balance of funds remaining from 774/SF-HA, the IDB's original primary education improvement loan. It is expected that by the *rentrée scolaire* of 1997, a major program of education development will be under execution and the economic and budgetary crisis will have diminished.
3. In service training of teachers and supervisors (\$3,295,000 - 16.8%)
- 2.12 The objective of this component is to raise the internal efficiency of education. The mediating objective is to equip 5,800 unqualified teachers of pre school children and the first four grades of school with the essential pedagogic skills of certified teachers, although the program itself will not certify them. A particular aim is to ensure that the most inexperienced and least qualified teachers are no longer placed in charge of the entry classes. This has been the practice, based on the mistaken belief that the older children need the better teachers. In fact the reverse is true. The training is oriented to the efficient use of the teachers' manuals and text books. The process of training includes a mixture of attendance on a two week course and distance education through the use of sixteen exercise modules (ten for languages, six for mathematics) over a period of sixteen months and supported by sixteen timely days of instruction. The program will also upgrade the teachers' subject knowledge in critical areas.
- 2.13 A second mediating objective is to train 2,000 directors of basic schools in the application of more up to date teaching methods, in monitoring and evaluation of teaching and learning and in other aspects of school administration such as community participation and resource allocation. This training is of short duration, approximately one week, organized at regional centers during the

vacations, followed by a second stage of two weeks. The training is accompanied by provision of a manual "*Guide du directeur*" to serve as a reference.

- 2.14 200 teacher trainers and directors of *Ecoles Normales* will be trained in depth to equip them with the skills necessary, both for the retraining program described above and for the future preservice training of new teachers.
- 2.15 Finally, a long term program for approximately 500 school inspectors and pedagogical advisors will be mounted over a period of 900 hours with the objective of establishing a new level of professionalism in this much neglected area of educational management. An additional objective is to create local teacher inservice training capacity. Training of the teacher trainers, supervisors and inspectors will be conducted by the University and other agencies with proven recent experience on FONHEP upgrading programs. The overall training program will be preceded by a thorough diagnostic accompanied by formative evaluation. The training will begin in 1995 and this stage will end by 1997.

4. Support for the completion of the National Education Plan
(\$333,000 - 1.7%)

- 2.16 Support for the National Plan contributes significantly to the objectives of equity and efficiency by laying the groundwork for a major investment program to revamp Haitian education in accordance with the nation's needs. The preparation of the Plan has involved an unusual consultative process, considering the state of political development in Haiti. Expert groups and representatives of civic society have researched and reflected upon the country's educational needs. Their ideas have been put to the population through grass roots meetings countrywide, both to inform the population and to solicit their opinions and ideas. The objectives of this consultation have been to acquaint all sectors of society with both the scale of need and the level of constraints under which the country works. At the same time, this has been the first step in establishing popular participation in the governance of education. In the absence of large scale government involvement in education, there seems to be little alternative to this lengthy and necessarily costly process of consultation, if democratic education is to be established.
- 2.17 The process of consultation has been costly both because of the inexperience of the country in the process and consequent lack of formal channels of communication and because of the high levels of illiteracy and lack of media coverage which have necessitated considerable personal contact. Nevertheless, in the mandate of the Eighth Replenishment, the Bank attaches considerable importance to beneficiary participation and deems the costs worthwhile.

- 2.18 There has been extensive contact between the expert groups and groups of teachers, pupils, parents, community associations, entrepreneurs, regional authorities, religious communities, department, arrondissement and commune representatives and representatives of the private schools. Regional working groups will consider particular themes and form the nascent administrative structures for the local administration and implementation of the Plan. This process which began in March 1995 will be completed by the passage of a law in early 1996, formalizing the new education structure.
- 2.19 Related to this component, remaining funds from a technical assistance grant will be used to establish a financial planning and review capacity for the education sector, building on the work of a previous study of 1991 on the financing of education in Haiti. A key task of this group will be to determine the financial feasibility of the National Education Plan. The terms of reference, structure and material requirements to establish the group have already been presented for the approval of the IDB. It remains to recruit the necessary professionals to be trained and to staff the group.

5. Studies (US\$300,000 - 1.5%)

- 2.20 Finally two studies will be commissioned. One will evaluate the role of Creole as a mediating instrument to help learning, and the wider issues relating to the problem of exotic monolingualism in an increasingly international environment. The second study will evaluate the curriculum and curriculum development strategy, since the reform of 1982.

D. **The Link Between This Operation And Previous And Future IDB Operations**

- 2.21 This project has the same objectives as Loan 774/SF-HA which, though near to completion, was interrupted by the events of 1991. The increase in the size of this loan compared to the original 774 reflects both the increased needs generated by the neglect of education during the embargo and the greatly increased interest of the current government in education. The two principal components of this project are identical in concept to two of the major components of 774/SF-HA, the printing and distribution of texts and the training of teachers. Their execution has been changed to reflect experience gained during implementation and a changed institutional framework. There are two additional components.
- 2.22 Loan 774 was intended to support the reform of 1980 by increasing the coverage and efficiency of basic education and basic teacher training, especially in rural areas. The contents of that loan were to continue work begun on an earlier loan, 508/SF-HA. Loan 774's components were the rehabilitation and equipping of 71

primary schools and three teacher training colleges including the building of 41 new classrooms, the 247 classrooms already begun, the renovation of 299 classrooms in dangerous conditions, provision of supporting sanitary facilities and the construction of 49 houses attached to remote schools, for resident teachers. Any remaining school construction and rehabilitation objectives of 774/SF-HA will now be met by the FAES, which has in place both a swifter contracting procedure than the MENJS and coordination mechanism with the MENJS.

- 2.23 The project of 1985 also funded 240,000 packages of texts to be supplied to schools, for loan to successive cohorts of pupils in the first four grades of rural schools. It also paid for 5,000 sets of teachers' guides. Haiti had very little experience of pupil book loan or book rental schemes; parents who can afford them are used to paying for books. It appears that the stock dwindled. The new operation will work through the market by subsidizing books for sale at about 20% of their normal price. By this method, parents whose children maintain the books in good condition should recoup some of their outlay through the sale of the texts on the secondhand textbook market.
- 2.24 Loan 774 paid for the training, travel and subsistence and materials for training 3,000 teachers, with the help of the *Institute Pedagogique National (IPN)*. The training covered the contents of the new (1980) curriculum in communications - Creole and French, mathematics, social sciences and natural sciences as well as fundamental primary education method. Based on a limited evaluation the new loan will continue this activity under a slightly different administrative arrangement. Instead of single courses during the vacations the new training will continue throughout the academic year and include not just teachers but principals, regional supervisors and pedagogical advisers. In addition, in place of the IPN the main suppliers of training services will be the FONHEP and the Universities.
- 2.25 Loan 774 also sought to improve the quality of pre service teacher training by providing training and learning materials for teacher trainers and improving the physical state of three rural teacher training schools. It is proposed to await the outcomes of evaluative studies and the deliberations of the team preparing the National Education Plan before making significant long term investment in the teacher training process. The whole question of teacher training will need to form part of the longer term national education development program. Finally 774 provided for support to the MENJS in the areas of curriculum development but not in educational planning and management. The current project and a related TC reformulation will support the planning process and develop a capacity for financial and economic analysis of the education sector.

- 2.26 The first of the two new components is support for the FPN. This will try to prevent wasteful early leaving due to the acute poverty caused by the economic embargo and the economic adjustment process. As the economy improves and other sources of funds are developed with the help of this project the need for *Parrainage* will contract. The second new component is the support to the National Education Plan. This is a small additional component which will permit the GOH to better coordinate the aid intended for the education of Haitian children.
- 2.27 Furthermore, it is expected that upon completion of this program two other significant IDB activities in the education sector will be under, or ready for execution. Firstly, a Technical and Professional Education and Training Project which is currently being prepared with assistance of *Consortium Intercollégial de Développement en Education*, CIDE (Canada) will be improving the operating efficiency and market responsiveness of the technical and professional education subsector. Secondly, the PNE, the preparation of which is supported by this project, should have been agreed and the necessary donor support harnessed to begin a long term strategy to overhaul the entire formal education system.

E. Project Costs

- 2.28 The total costs of the project have been estimated at US\$19.6 million equivalent, of which US\$17.6 million would consist of IDB financing. The funds available will come from the IDB's Fund for Special Operations, which represents 90.0% of the total cost. The Banks resources will be transferred by the Government to a special account opened in the *Banque de la Republique d'Haiti*. The equivalent of US\$2.0 million, 10% of total cost, would be provided by UNICEF, the Haitian Government and the FPN. Following is a summary of the total estimated cost of the Program.

Table 2.1 Project Costs
(thousands of US\$)

CATEGORIES	FSO	LOCAL	TOTAL	%
1.0 Direct Costs	<u>16,508</u>	<u>1,985</u>	<u>18,493</u>	<u>94.2</u>
1.1 Fonds de Parrainage National	3,435	1,985	5,420	27.6
1.2 Textbooks	6,478	0	6,478	33.0
1.3 School supplies	3,300	0	3,300	16.8
1.4 Training	3,295	0	3,295	16.8
2.0 Technical Assistance				
2.1 Support to National Education Plan	<u>333</u>	<u>0</u>	<u>333</u>	<u>1.7</u>
3.0 Studies	<u>300</u>	<u>0</u>	<u>300</u>	<u>1.5</u>
3.1 Evaluate Creole as medium of instruction	150	0	150	0.8
3.2 Evaluate impact of reform	150	0	150	0.8
4.0 Institutional Support				
4.1 Project Executing Unit (UPED)	134	0	134	0.7
5.0 Financial Costs	<u>337</u>	<u>25</u>	<u>362</u>	<u>1.8</u>
5.1 Interest	161	0	161	0.8
5.2 Credit commission	0	25	25	0.1
5.3 FIV	176	0	176	0.9
TOTAL	17,612	2,010	19,622	100.0
PERCENTAGE	90.0	10.0	100.0	

1. Direct Costs (US\$18,628,000)

2.29 The direct cost component will finance the provision of scholarships to 80,000, disadvantaged children completing the first and second cycles of primary schooling through the Fonds de Parrainage Program, as well as funds to develop new contacts and mechanisms to make it more sustainable. It will also subsidize the printing and distribution of new textbooks and school supplies for public schools, as well as the audit and the evaluation of the pricing and distribution of textbooks (US\$35,000) and the purchase and distribution of teaching materials to teachers in the public schools. It will also finance the training of some 5,800 primary school teachers in the use of these guides, as well as the training of 2,000 school directors, 200 normal school teachers and 500 school inspectors and pedagogical advisors in public and approved private schools.

2.30 Estimate costs for the textbooks, didactic materials and school supplies are based on unit prices of goods procured recently by the Ministry of Education.

2. Technical Assistance (US\$333,000)

2.31 This component would provide funds to support the national dialogue and public participation in the process of finalizing the National

Education Plan. To this effect, the funds would be used to cover expenses related to the consultative process, exchange of ideas and debate of the various sectors of the country necessary to define the major operational strategies and guidelines that will orient the Haitian education system in the medium and long term, and design the concrete mechanisms that will address the basic learning needs of the population and reform the education system.

3. Studies (US\$300,000)

- 2.32 Studies to evaluate the use of Creole as a medium of instruction and the impact of the reform on education, will be carried out. The results of these studies will contribute to the preparation of the Basic Education program currently being formulated.

4. Institutional Support (US\$134,000)

- 2.33 This component includes the salaries for key personnel and support staff assigned to the Project Executing Unit for a period of nine months (July 1996 to March 1997). These functionaries are currently working with the EXENP I Program and their salaries will be covered by that program to June 1996.

5. Contingencies

- 2.34 No contingencies have been estimated for the Program, and any increase in the cost would be reflected in a reduction in the number of books, supplies or students benefiting from the scholarships.

6. Financial Expenses (US\$337,000)

- 2.35 The remaining portion of the Bank loan would be used to finance the interest and IDB inspection and supervision fee.

7. Local Contribution (US\$2,010,000)

- 2.36 Local counterpart funds would be provided by UNICEF, the FPN and the Government of Haiti, equivalent to US\$1,985,000 to finance scholarships to 30,000 of the 80,000 disadvantaged children attending the first and second cycles of selected primary schools. The Government of Haiti would cover, from its own resources the equivalent of US\$25,000 for the Credit fee of the Bank.

III. PROGRAM EXECUTION

A. Borrower, Guarantor and Executing Agency

- 3.1 The borrower and guarantor of the loan will be the Government of Haiti. The Ministry of National Education, Youth and Sports (MENJS), responsible for the direction and supervision of public education at all levels and literacy training, will be responsible for the execution of the project, through the Project Executing Unit (UPED). The UPED was established for the execution of the Expansion and Improvement of the Primary and Normal School Education System (EXENP I), currently under execution, and has the experience to undertake the activities required of the proposed Program. It is currently staffed with a director, required technicians and support personnel.
- 3.2 The UPED's functions will be to (i) serve as liaison with the Bank, (ii) prepare and submit to the Bank all documentation for compliance with conditions specified in the loan contract; (iii) plan, organize, direct and execute the program's activities, (iv), direct and supervise the technical and academic aspects of the project, particularly those matters dealing with the preparation, production and distribution of textbooks, (v) maintain proper coordination with the other agencies that will be used to execute the training and scholarship programs; and (vi) prepare and submit disbursement requests to the Bank for approval.
- 3.3 The activities related to training will be done through the FONHEP, local universities and specialized agencies, while those related to the awarding of scholarships will be done through the FPN. Contracts between each of these institutions and the borrower, stipulating the commitments and responsibilities of each party will be required. It is, therefore, recommended that prior to the disbursement of the funds related to these activities, the borrower present evidence to the Bank, that it has signed said contracts.
- 3.4 Execution would be over a 16-month period, beginning with the re-entry of the 1995-1996 school year and covering the re-entry of the 1996-1997 school year.

B. Fonds de Parrainage National

- 3.5 The awarding of the scholarships will be done using the selection criteria and mechanisms established and currently being used by the Fonds de Parrainage National (Paragraph 1.13). These have been reviewed by the Bank and found acceptable. The selection process is done in two stages, The first is the selection of schools from the nine departments that will participate in the program and the

second is the selection of the specific children who will benefit from the scholarships.

- 3.6 It will be required that the use of IDB funds be qualified so that in the selection criteria for IDB sponsored children the FPN continues to seek equity between boys and girls and in the selection of families, for each dual parent unit sponsored, two female headed households should be supported. The MENJS should also be requested to bias its fee waiver accordingly.

C. Procurement of textbooks and school supplies

- 3.7 The procurement of textbooks, manuals and guides for teachers and school supplies will be done according to Bank procedures as stipulated in Annex B of the loan contract. International public bidding will be done for the procurement of goods over US\$250,000. Procurement of goods costing less will be done using national public bidding. The procurement plan is found in Annex II.
- 3.8 Most of the books to be purchased for the re-entry of the 1995-1996 school year will be purchased under Loan 774/SF-HA. The list of selected textbooks was presented to the Bank, and publishers--who also happen to be the owners of the copyrights--were invited to present their bids. Six publishers presented bids and they were all accepted. The experience learned from this year's process will be evaluated to guard against monopolistic practices and ensure that transparent mechanisms are in place for the pricing and distribution of next year's textbooks.

1. Costs not Involving Procurement

- 3.9 Approximately 48% of the project cost, or the equivalent to US\$9,3 million would not involve procurement, and are related to training, the provision of scholarships, the support to the National Education Plan and the studies.

D. Training

- 3.10 Training for teachers and school directors will be done using a training methodology developed and currently being used by the FONHEP, which was reviewed by the Bank and found acceptable. The training will be done at nine selected centers throughout the country, through:
- a. Distance education, through exercise modules during a 10-month period.
 - b. One-day educational seminars, alternating between the study modules and evaluation of what was learned in each module and targeting eventual problems. It will also teach specific improvement practice outlined in the training plan.

- c. A 60-hour training course for teachers will be undertaken during school vacation. Time will be included for the discussion of individual problems and the interchange of ideas and experiences which will harness the experience and creativity of practicing teachers and gain greater poignancy than might be achieved through more traditional training.
- 3.11 Training for Directors, Supervisors and Pedagogical Advisors will be carried out by the local universities, and specialized institutions such as ACCT. It will consist of a 900-hour course given during the school vacation. The first one would be given during the 1996 school vacation. The Ministry is currently in discussion with these institutions to organize these courses. These would consist of:
- a. A five-day seminar at the regional level. This will provide trainees with basic knowledge on administrative procedures and practices, supervision techniques and pedagogical assessment of teachers.
 - b. A Ten-week course during vacation time, to go in greater depth into the knowledge acquired during the initial five-day seminar, to share personal knowledge with other directors and put into practice theoretical knowledge acquired. At the end of this course, directors will receive a "Director's Guide" which will help as a reference document in the exercise of their responsibilities.
- E. Support to the National Education Plan
- 3.12 This component would provide the funds to cover the activities required to set up the regional consultation process, provide logistical support, supplies, and equipment for a period of 4 months. Funds would also be provided for the establishment of the technical sub-commission for development and establishment of an economic and financial assessment model.
- F. Review by IDB
- 3.13 The Bank's Country Office would review the contracts for the purchase of books and supplies, regardless of value, and all the supporting documentation.
- G. Advance of Funds
- 3.14 Once the Program has been declared eligible for disbursement, an advance of funds would be established for up to 10% of the total amount of the financing. The advance would be replenished once the MENJS has justified its utilization. 9/

9/ See Loan Contract, Clause _____.

H. Retroactive Financing

- 3.15 In order to have the textbooks and school supplies ready for distribution to students on school re-entry date, provide the scholarships to the selected students and begin training for teachers and directors, the Ministry may have to procure bridge financing until the Bank's funds are available. It is, therefore, recommended that the Bank recognize costs equivalent to US\$5.7 million for retroactive financing, provided that the procurement of the textbooks and school supplies is done according to Bank procedures.

I. Environmental Classification

- 3.16 This operation is classified as a Category II operation.

J. Disbursements

- 3.17 Disbursements will be made over an 18-month period, with the last disbursement occurring no later than March 31, 1997. The proceeds of the Program would be as follows:

Table 3.1 Disbursement Schedule
(thousands of US\$)

SOURCE OF FUNDS	YEAR 1	YEAR 2	TOTAL	%
IDB	7,512	10,100	17,612	90.0
Local Counterpart	1,335	675	2,010	10.0
TOTAL	8,847	10,775	19,622	100.0

K. Inspection and Supervision

- 3.18 The Bank would carry out its inspection and supervision of the Program through its Country Office in Haiti, as well as through monitoring missions by the project team, including a mid-term review with the participation of the UPED, FONHEP, FPN and the auditor.

L. Auditing

- 3.19 The UPED will establish and maintain separate accounts and records to reflect, in accordance with sound accounting practices, the sources and expenditures related to all activities of the Program.
- 3.20 During the execution period of the Program, the Government, through the Executing Unit, would submit to the Bank financial statements for the Program, including the activities executed through the

FONHEP and the Fonds de Parrainage National. Such statements should be submitted not later than 120 days from the conclusion of each fiscal year, beginning with the first year of execution and at the end of the Program, certified by a firm of independent public accountants designated by the Ministry and acceptable to the Bank. 10/ The auditor's report would include an opinion and comments, as necessary, on the project accounts, methods employed in compiling the statements of expenditures, their accuracy, relevance of supporting documents and their eligibility for financing in terms with the loan contract, standards of record keeping and internal controls. The auditor would also be required to accompany the mid-term mission to assist, in particular, in the evaluation of this year's experience in the printing and distribution of textbooks--their cost norms, profit margins and proper distribution incentives to publishers, etc. This would be financed with the loan from the resources allocated to textbooks.

10/ See Loan Contract, Clause _____

IV. THE PROGRAM, ITS FEASIBILITY AND RISKS

A. Feasibility and Benefits of the Program

- 4.1 The program does not pretend to solve all the problems of basic education in Haiti. Many children will remain outside the school system, and many children within the system will continue to receive a low quality education for some time to come. Many buildings will remain in poor condition and many schools will continue to lack water and sanitary facilities, despite the work of the FAES.
- 4.2 However, with the exception of the support for the National Education Plan, all the components are firmly based on tried and tested, cost effective methods of improving pupil performance and equity. They all satisfy a need for which there is a strong demand. They have no recurrent cost implications because they are either one off activities or because they make improvements in the performance of existing staff of the MENJS. They do not raise questions of sustainability; however they have sustainability implications as mentioned below.
- 4.3 The provision of scholarships to 80,000 disadvantaged children uses methods of selection which guarantees that only children committed to staying in school will be eligible for the scholarships. It targets those years where dropping out would cause the greatest waste of resources, that is the years when literacy in Creole and later in French would have been established. Finally it uses an administrative mechanism which is an experienced Private Quasi Voluntary Organization, which has the recognition of Government and major providers of education as well as broad public confidence, and which is subject to a public annual audit. The major part of this activity will take place in the first year. However, by developing the fund raising and publicity capacity of the FPN it will make future fund raising campaigns more effective.
- 4.4 The program to subsidize the printing and distribution of new textbooks for all, provide free supplies of consumables for public schools and distribute teaching materials to teachers in the public sector provides a basic input to successful teaching. Because of the public and private poverty cited above, and with the prevailing structure of recurrent costs the country is unable to provide at this time, sufficient texts and consumables, out of its own resources. The impact of the availability of books on pupil performance is well documented. The cost effectiveness of the texts and teacher guides is enhanced because it makes more effective use of the most expensive teaching resource, the teacher. The National Education Plan will have to consider a long term textbook policy. In the interim, this component will increase the supply of new texts in one year and the supply of second hand texts for several years thereafter, thereby reducing the burden of education for the poorer families who will buy second hand texts.

- 4.5 The question of distribution has been addressed by contracting with the vendors the distribution of the books. The vendors will still have the incentive to get the books into the hands of the end users, the pupils, thus the profit motive will drive the delivery of the inputs. To promote demand and ensure that even illiterate parents are familiar with the scheme, a major publicity program is underway. The overall quality of books in use will improve because selection will now be confined to a list of titles evaluated by authorities deemed educationally worthwhile.
- 4.6 The training of teachers, schools' directors, and school supervisors in both public and approved private schools is a small investment to improve the effectiveness of a major item of expenditure, teacher costs. The executors of this component will be aided by FONHEP who have had extensive recent experience of providing the same type of training in similar circumstances. There has been the benefit of a partial evaluation of the past programs and the opportunity to incorporate the lessons learned. Once the training activity is complete the trainees who are already on the payroll will improve their working habits. Although there is no incentive payment scheme or other material rewards, past training programs indicate that teachers have been motivated intrinsically by the increased satisfaction of being able to do their job better, and with the added satisfaction of having been recognized as worthy of investment. A particular aim is to ensure that the most inexperienced and least qualified teachers are no longer placed in charge of entry classes as has been the practice in the past.
- 4.7 Support to facilitate the national dialogue and public participation in the process of finalizing the National Education Plan is a new experience. It is hard to measure the benefits of consultation and assess the feasibility of the planning process with and without the consultative process. In the pursuit of fairness it should be noted that many member countries of the IDB have financed protracted processes of public consultation in the strengthening of their democratic institutions. Haiti does not have a good record of education planning and plan execution. Popularization of education has been through a process of imitation and dilution of a largely inappropriate education model. What little say people have had before has been through the use of a market characterized by very imperfect product knowledge. Popular participation and familiarization with the issues would appear a logical method to allocate resources to a good which has both merit and social dimensions.
- 4.8 The components are mutually reinforcing but each alone is feasible and produces proven benefits.

B. Risks

- 4.9 The political uncertainties of the country, along with the administrative requirements imposed by multi-source financing, pose the greatest risk to the operation. The political risk will be reduced to the extent that Haiti's leadership can maintain democratic order. In all cases there is the risk of handling large amounts of funds from different sources. Both FONHEP and the FPN have tested criteria as well as yearly external audits. To the extent that concurrent donor coordination is maintained, transparent mechanisms in resource allocation are evident and strong project management is attained, the risk is minimized.

C. Impact on Women

- 4.10 Women represent 54% of total population in Haiti and women account for around 46% of heads of households. Female participation in education is the lowest in the region, and though their participation has increased, they attend school for fewer years than boys and are more frequently illiterate. Girls have 0.5 to 2.1 less years of schooling than boys ^{11/} In the metropolitan area 34.4% of the female population had not received any education as compared to 18% for males.
- 4.11 Increasing the level of literacy in Haiti means increasing women's participation in education. Given the overall evidence of greater social benefits on family and production and given the relative disadvantage of girls in education, the program would have the provision that in the selection criteria for IDB sponsored children, preference be given to girls over boys in the ratio to which girls are discriminated against as reflected in percentage participation of the local cohort. The MENJS should also be requested to bias its fee waiver accordingly. The Program would also ensure the participation of women teachers in the training. Coordination with other donors would be maintained to ensure that at the very least, the sponsorship program supports the elimination of discrimination based on sex.

D. Poverty Targeting

- 4.12 The proposed Program is a poverty targeted investment. A significant majority of the beneficiaries of the operation belong to low income families and the program is aimed at primary education, in accordance with the criteria set out by the Bank.
- 4.13 The Program will seek to improve and promote equity in the basic cycle of primary education by reducing the dropping out of children considered to be at risk of leaving school in two critical years in

^{11/} La Situation des Femmes Haitienes Comité Inter-Agences Femmes et Developpement. Systeme des Nations Unies. Port-au-Prince, Haiti. 1991.

the cycle due to the poverty of their parents. It also seeks to increase the quantity and quality of learning, especially for poor children who would not otherwise have access to books and supplies. It will increase the participation among the poor by reducing the financial obstacles to school attendance. Although the Program does not target the poorest of the poor in Haiti, it does target the poor who are already in school, particularly girls who are at higher risk of dropping out and children coming from female headed households.

LOGICAL FRAMEWORK

ANNEX I
Page 1 de 2

Narrative Summary (NS)	Measureable Indicators (OVI)	Means of Verification (MOV)	Important Assumptions
Sector Goal:			(Sector Goal to Supergoal)
1 Improve the efficiency of education	1.1 Improved relevance 1.2 Reduced wastage	1.1 Evaluative study 1.2 Enrollment data	1.1 none
2 Increase participation in education	2.1 Enrollment	2.1 Enrolment data	2.1 Economic stability & growth
Project Objective:			(Project Obj. to Sector Goal)
1 Increase the internal efficiency of basic education	1.1 Reduced dropping out in grades IV & VI 1.2 Increased quality & quantity of learning	1.1 Enrollment data, FPN monitoring system 1.2 Pupils tests, teacher tests & formative evaluation	1.1 none 1.2 none
2 Improve the external efficiency of education	2.1 Wider use of approved relevant texts 2.2 Wider consultation about the ends & means of ed'n	2.1 Observation of sales & use of approved texts 2.2 Observation on use of Creole	2.1 Distribution incentives sufficient for publisher 2.2 none
3 Improve equity in education	3.1 Bigger gains in cognitive performance of poor 3.2 Improved knowledge of poor parents about rights to & means of ed	3.1 Measures of book use in poorer schools/areas, tests, reduced repeating & failure of poor 3.2 Observed participation in the consultative process 3.3 Growth in interest in school enrollment	3.1 The poor have funds & knowledge to buy the right books (publicity will be widespread) 3.2 Participation in consultation leads to participation in ed 3.3 Poverty will not prove insurmountable obstacle 3.4 Increased demand will not be met by "Ecoles Borlettes"
Outputs:			(Output to Project Objective)
1 Improved retention of poor but able children in grades 4 & 6 in 1995-6	1.1 Enrollment figures on basis or preidentified poor children	1.1 FPN records & computerised tracking of kids, national enrollment data	1.1 none
2 Improved availability and use of efficient, approved texts.	2.1 Sales of 2.5 million texts and teacher / moniteur observation	2.1 Sales returns, teacher & principal reports, dept. supervision records	2.1 Illiteracy of book buying parents will be overcome by publicity
3 Improved subject knowledge & teaching skills of teachers, improved school management better ped'l support for teachers, & more skillful supervision	3.1 Improved learning by pupils, improved skills of teachers, better use of materials, attainment of higher cognitive skills by pupils, better school management, more community participation in education	3.1 Pupil Tests (improved). Classroom observation & testing of teachers. Types of pupil activity observed. School / community meetings, support etc	3.1 none
4 Improved knowledge of the use of Creole as a medium of instruction. Evaluation of reform of 1980. Public familiarity with National Education Plan, thus improved acceptance. Incorporation of a wider spectrum of lay & tech'l opinion thus better plan. Realistic idea of plan feasibility, better donor coordination.	4.1 Report & dialogue on the use of Creole (int & ext implications). Summative evaluation & strategy for change. Public meetings held, popular support for plan Technical contents of published plan within deadline. Report and contents of plan, lending program & aid commitment.	4.1 Publication of report, newspaper reporting. Publication of report. Observation Reading of plan by IDB & other specialists. CHA monitoring of UPED, MENJS & FONHEP support from donors.	4.1 none none none Credibility of GOH to donors. Agreement about larger role of MENJS in planning public ed'n. Patience of donors to allow consultation to run its course
Activities/Components:	Inputs/Resources:		(Activity to Output)
1.1 80,000 means tested scholarships for needy children in years 4 & 6 in year 1995-6	Funds to be distributed via Fonds de Parrainage National	1.1 Applications approved, disbursement to schools, FPN records & external audit	1.1 none

LOGICAL FRAMEWORK

Narrative Summary (NS)	Measureable Indicators (OVI)	Means of Verification (MOV)	Important Assumptions
2.1 Subsidy to make 2.5 million approved texts available at 20% of normal price in 1996-7 & thereafter via used sale	Funds to pay publishers, contracts between GOH & publishers, sales outlets informed and ready for sales, parents informed	2.1 Accounts & audit, sales figures, random observation of sales, supervisors observation of text availability	2.1 poor illiterate parents will hear of the books & buy the correct ones
3.1 Training - 5800 teachers of grades preschool to 4 in content & pedagogy, 2000 school directors, 200 teacher trainers & dir's of Ecole Normales, 500 ped'g supervisors & moniteurs	Trainers, per diems, travel & subsistence, materials managed by FONHEP	3.1 Monitoring of training process by FONHEP, observation of teacher performance by supervisors, improved pupil performance	3.1 teachers available on scale needed (demands of second jobs etc)
4.1 Support for the National Education Plan - popular consultation, review & "operationalization"	Funds disbursed for public meetings, meetings of experts, publication of findings, preparation of execution plan & project support	4.1 Observation by IDB CHA and HQ in anticipation of project preparation dialogue. News reporting	4.1 political participation will lead to enrollment, agreement will be reached, process will survive change in gov't.

EXTENSION OF PRIMARY AND TEACHER EDUCATION PROGRAM II

Procurement Plan

PRINCIPAL PROCUREMENT PROJECTS	Financing (%)			Method	Prequalification Yes/No	Date of publication of SPN
	BID		Local			Semester/Year
YEAR 1995						
A. Procurement of goods:						
1. Teacher's guides 1 lot US\$56,250	100			NCB	No	11/95
2. Notebooks, pens, pencils, chalk and geometry instruments 5 lots US\$1,490,000	100			ICB	No	11/95
YEAR 1996						
A. Procurement of goods:						
1. Teacher's guides 1 lot US\$56,250	100			NCB	No	11/96
2. Notebooks, pens, pencils, chalk and geometry instruments 5 lots US\$1,490,000	100			ICB	No	11/96
3. Textbooks* Various lots US\$6,500,000	100			ICB	Yes	11/96

Notes:

ICB - International Competitive Bidding

NCB - National Competitive Bidding

* - May require direct procurement of copyrights of textbooks

**EXTENSION OF PRIMARY AND TEACHER EDUCATION
PROGRAM II (EXENP II)**

LIST OF PROJECT DOCUMENTS

Fass, Simon M. Political Economy in Haiti: The Drama of Survival.
Transaction Publishers, New Brunswick. 1980

Annuaire Statistique des Ecoles Primaires Privees - 1993-1994.
FOHNEP, Port au Prince. August 1994

Weinstein, B. and Segal A. Preager. Haiti: The Failure of Politics.
New York. 1992

World Bank Estimates, LATHR. Washington, DC. 1980.

Bourdon, J. et Perrott J. Analyse Economique et Financiere du Secteur de
l'Education en Republique d'Haiti. Universite de Bourgogne,
MENJS, UNDP & UNESCO. October, 1990

Tardif, Francine. La Situation des Femmes Haitiennes. Document prepare
por le Comite Inter-Agences Femmes et Developpement, System de
Nations Unies. Port au Prince. September, 1991

Mann, Judy. "Literacy's Amazing Domino Effect." The Washington Post
(Washington, D.C.) March 8, 1995.

"Different Roads to Development." The Economist, 19 August, 1995, pp. 35-36.

PROPOSED RESOLUTION

HAITI. LOAN CONTRACT No. ____/OC-HA.
EXTENSION OF PRIMARY EDUCATION AND TEACHER EDUCATION,
PROGRAM II (EXEMP II)

The Board of Executive Directors

RESOLVES:

That the President of the Bank, or such representative as he shall designate, is authorized, in the name and on behalf of the Bank, to enter into such contract or contracts as may be necessary with the République d' Haïti as Borrower, for the purpose of granting it a financing to cooperate in the execution of a program of extension of primary and teacher education. Such financing will be for the amount of up to US\$17.600.000 or its equivalent in other currencies, except that of Haiti which are part of the Fund for Special Operations of the Bank, and will be subject to the "Special Contractual Conditions" and the "Terms and Financial Conditions" of the Executive Summary of the Loan Proposal.