

## TC Document

### I. Basic Information for TC

▪ Country/Region:	BRAZIL
▪ TC Name:	Improvement of Efficiency and Service Delivery of Education in Brazil in times of COVID19
▪ TC Number:	BR-T1447
▪ Team Leader/Members:	Duenas Herrera, Ximena (SCL/EDU) Team Leader; Cossi Fernandes, Joao Paulo (SCL/EDU) Alternate Team Leader; Blasco, Ivana (SCL/EDU); Celeste Marzo, Cristina (LEG/SGO); De Freitas Severino, Ligia (CSC/GBR); Duarte Salcedo, Catalina (SCL/EDU); Holguin Madrinan, Alejandra (SCL/SCL); Perez, Marcisgley Vieira (CSC/GBR); Scannone Chavez, Rodolfo Andres (SCL/EDU) Marcisgley Vieira (CSC/GBR); Scannone Chavez, Rodolfo Andres (SCL/EDU)
▪ Taxonomy:	Client Support
▪ Operation Supported by the TC:	.
▪ Date of TC Abstract authorization:	26 Aug 2020.
▪ Beneficiary:	Manaus, Brazil
▪ Executing Agency and contact name:	Inter-American Development Bank
▪ Donors providing funding:	OC Strategic Development Program for Social Development(SOC)
▪ IDB Funding Requested:	US\$200,000.00
▪ Local counterpart funding, if any:	US\$0
▪ Disbursement period (which includes Execution period):	18 months
▪ Required start date:	November, 2020
▪ Types of consultants:	Individuals; Firms
▪ Prepared by Unit:	SCL/EDU-Education
▪ Unit of Disbursement Responsibility:	CBRCSC/GBR-Country Office Brazil
▪ TC included in Country Strategy (y/n):	Yes
▪ TC included in CPD (y/n):	No
▪ Alignment to the Update to the Institutional Strategy 2010-2020:	Productivity and innovation; Social inclusion and equality

### II. Objectives and Justification of the TC

- 2.1. 58 million students and 2.2 million teachers in Brazil are affected by schools' closure due to the COVID-19 (CV) pandemic. The objective of this TC is to support the federal and local governments, led by a coalition of Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs) denominated *Aprendendo Sempre* (AS)<sup>1</sup>, to give continuity to Brazilian students' learning process. Additionally, the TC will support the preparation of a Conditional Credit Line for Investment Project (CCLIP), ProSocial, to identify potential projects and to identify the best use of resources for an investment loan given the effect of the pandemic on education spending. To meet this objective, the TC will finance (1) events and dialogue with the AS coalition; (2) field trials of projects that promote increase in efficiency of spending; and (3) research on the implementation of the "Aprendamos

---

<sup>1</sup> <https://aprendendosempre.org/>

Todos a Leer” (ATAL) program for early literacy in Brazil and research on how has CV affected students and families.

- 2.2. Brazil's school year started (officially) on the first week of March. Classes were suspended because of CV two weeks after the school year began. Brazil's education system is fragmented and diverse as reflected by heterogeneous responses by local governments to the crisis. For example, according to two survey results presented by CIEB (*Centro de Inovação para a Educação Brasileira*), during the first weeks, 40% of states and municipalities suspended classes, 40% anticipated holidays and 20% offered remote learning strategies that include: TV broadcast of classes, class videos using social media, online class videos, online platforms, radio broadcast, printed material sent to students' homes, and sending material through email or WhatsApp application.
- 2.3. Without certainty of the extent of school closures, states and municipalities requested teachers to switch to remote learning using the available resources they had, and 60% of municipalities had the capacity to do so. Instituto Peninsula in Brazil, an NGO focused on teachers, reached out to teachers to understand their feelings and fears, and to support demands. Teachers' responses after schools were closed showed the following priorities: (i) focus on well-being; (ii) be cautious with the content they shared; and (iii) establish a communication channel with their students.
- 2.4. As the country realized this was not a short-term closure, and with the support of the civil society, structured solutions were designed and have been implemented since. Still there is no clear date for schools' reopening and although there have been efforts in reaching out to students, the school systems and the civil society have concerns about attrition, students' and teachers' socioemotional well-being, and students' learning outcomes. Unfortunately, given the remote learning strategies' multiplicity, monitoring and assessment are still challenging because remote learning has been guaranteed from the supply side, but little information has been recorded from the students' side.
- 2.5. The Brazilian civil society formed a coalition –*Aprendendo Sempre* (AS)– comprise of 34 institutions<sup>2</sup> to accompany the states and municipalities education sector through the crisis caused by CV. They endeavor to streamline the initiatives offered by the members or identify best practices implemented by states and municipalities. This unified front has insisted on the need to promote collaboration between states and municipalities because, as identified by the CIEB survey and by *Movimento Colabora*, the municipalities' response capacity is fragile<sup>3</sup>. The objective of the AS coalition is to support the education secretariats by minimizing the negative effects of this pandemic on the gains made during the last years and to continue working towards attaining the National Education Plan (PNE) indicators by 2025.

---

<sup>2</sup> Taking advantage of the solid communication bridge between Brazil's civil society and the states and municipalities; Lemann Foundation led the creation of the *Aprendendo Sempre* coalition to join forces and support Brazil's education during the pandemic. <https://aprendendosempre.org/sobre/>

<sup>3</sup> Brazil is a federative country where the responsibility for education is a shared among different levels of governments. Regarding basic education, federal government is mainly responsible for policymaking, while state and municipal governments for implementation and provision of the actual services.

- 2.6. AS coalition, working with the education sector in Brazil, has divided the response to the CV pandemic in three phases: (i) emergency declaration; (ii) provision of education (and social) services; and (iii) return to classes. Organizations and institutions that joined this initiative have to declare interest in one of the phases and actively participate in the actions related to it. The Bank, through the Education Division, joined phase three (return to classes) subgroup due to its focus on the mid and long-term effects of CV on education linked to the preparation of the ProSocial CCLIP<sup>4</sup>.
- 2.7. **Diagnostic Activities.** Given the heterogeneity of Brazil's school system due to their autonomy regarding school closure and reopening, our task force (*Fundação Lemann, Itaú Social, BID, Instituto Natura, and Fundação Roberto Marinho*) has been discussing with international and local assessment institutions options to offer a diagnostic assessment once students return to schools. This comprehensive package is intended for teachers use with the overarching objective of reducing the learning gaps caused by CV.
- 2.8. Furthermore, focusing on the mid and long-term effects of CV on education will also allow for synergies with ProSocial CCLIP's preparation, Brazil's SCL multisector approach to operations focused on increasing the efficiency in the administration of social spending. One of the great challenges that Brazil will face in the coming years will be to achieve a profound modernization in the administration of social spending without compromising the important social advances achieved in recent decades that will allow it: (i) to ensure the provision of fundamental social services for high quality, (ii) achieve a spending path that ensures the country's fiscal sustainability and (iii) contribute to a sustained growth model. Brazil's priorities in education were established in 2014 through the National Education Plan (PNE) that establishes goals for 2025. Through ProSocial, the Bank will focus on the following goals:
- 2.9. **Increase early education coverage in the 0-3-year-old age group.** The National Education Plan's goal is to attain 50% coverage by 2025; the country is still behind (35.6% in 2018). To reach the objective there is a need for additional infrastructure and more teachers. This requires important investments of municipal governments.
- 2.10. **Improve childhood literacy.** 54.7% of students in Brazil did not meet the minimum expected level in reading comprehension by third grade according to the national literacy assessment applied in 2016. The MEC has implemented several short duration initiatives and thus no impact. In 2019 the national literacy policy was launched but no programs have been moved forward. Manaus's education secretary asked for BID's support in adapting the Aprendamos Todos a Leer Program to Portuguese in an effort to implement the national policy and we will work together with them in this project.
- 2.11. **Implement High School reform.** In 2017, the MEC passed a law that reformed high school education centered on curriculum flexibilization with special interest in TVET. This will create a demand in the states for: i) the implementation of distance education systems to provide flexibility; ii) the construction of some regional schools with more technology and programs based on the need of each region (technology, agriculture, tourism, etc). This agenda would be aligned with Brazil's strategy to improve the efficiency of companies, through more skilled labor, and entrepreneurship.

---

<sup>4</sup> BR-O0009

Additionally, the Paraná education loan that is being prepared (BR-L1551) focuses on the implementation of the Technical Education for High School (TEHS) pathway in the state of Paraná which will be key to collect evidence for further operations.

- 2.12. **Improve management systems at the local level.** During 2018, through a Regional Technical Cooperation (RG-T3008), an instrument to measure the maturity level of information and management systems (SIGED for its initials in Spanish) was developed and 10 case studies<sup>5</sup> (two in Brazil) were developed revealing interesting findings and recommendations. Due to Brazil's level of decentralization we are adapting (financed through BR-T1425) the instrument in order to reach local governments. We expect to gather helpful information that will allow us to help governments create action plans to become more efficient.
- 2.13. **Promote a culture of innovation.** Brazil faces challenges in education related with how to get quality education to remote areas, teacher allocation, management, and data quality that allows for decision making that can be tackled with innovative solutions. For example, we are working with Pernambuco, through a regional TC (RG-T2997), to implement a centralized student admission system that uses efficient matching algorithms and artificial intelligence paired with behavioral economy insights to improve the efficiency and equity of student assignment. Another TC in Ecuador and Peru (RG-T3443) is working with nudges to incentivize teachers to choose to work in hard-to-staff schools. The regional SIGED TC helps improve management systems. These and other initiatives in the country should be compiled or incubated to scale them up, and field trials are paramount to bring evidence of their success or failure.
- 2.14. **Support the civil society's effort to foster collaboration among federal entities.** The Colabora Movement is gathering information on the vertical and horizontal cooperation country initiatives. Cooperation among the federal entities has shown evidence of generating efficiencies in public spending (economies of scale in government purchases, aligned goals in educational attainment, synergies in transportation for schools, among others). The IDB will support the research by documenting cooperation cases in Brazil and in other federal countries.
- 2.15. This TC is consistent with the 2010-2020 Institutional Strategy Update (UIS) (AB-3008) and is aligned with the development challenge of: (i) social inclusion and equality, by promoting equal access to better social services; and (ii) productivity and innovation, by promoting improvement and innovation in educational management processes. Furthermore, it is also consistent with the Country strategy with Brazil 2019-2022 (document GN-2973) as it addresses issues to "Build a more effective public sector that promotes fiscal sustainability" and "Reduce social inequality and inequality of opportunity by enhancing public policy efficiency." Additionally, the program will contribute to the Corporate Results Framework (CRF) (GN-2727-12) since it seeks to improve the indicator: (i) students benefited by education projects. Additionally, this TC will benefit government entities to improve CRF indicators such as "Government agencies benefited by projects that strengthen technological and managerial tools to improve public service delivery" and "Projects supporting innovation ecosystems". The TC will also contribute to the following objectives of the Ordinary Capital Strategic Development Program For Social Development (GN-2819-

---

<sup>5</sup> A total of 18 case studies have been carried out to date, and a report on regional findings has been produced.

1): “(i) enhance the relevance, quality, and volume of Bank lending in support of the social sector; (ii) strengthen public institutions' efforts to become more effective and efficient in social programming, group targeting, and social sector project execution.” Furthermore, it is framed within the priority dimensions of the Bank’s intervention in education, according to the Sector Framework Document for Early Childhood Development (document GN-2966) that draws three lines of action: (i) promote efficient management and well-informed public policy; (ii) implement development services or early infant programs with quality at scale; and (iii) strengthen the quality of the workforce and improve its working conditions. Finally, the program is consistent with the Education and Early Childhood Development Sector Framework Document (GN-2708-5) in Dimension 5 that “all children and young people acquire the necessary skills to be productive and contribute to society,” and with the Labor Sector Framework Document (GN-2741-7) in Dimension 1 “the region’s citizens have more, and more equitable, opportunities to access formal jobs with better wage expectations” and Dimension 2 “workers are more productive and, consequently, obtain higher wages and more stable employment.”

### III. Description of activities/components and budget

- 3.1. **Component I:** Events/Dialogue. The objective of this component is to provide technical assistance and enhance experiences exchange between Brazilian states and municipalities related to the CV pandemic response, High School Reform, and Innovation and Assessment task forces. TC funding would finance: (i) design and implementation of the diagnostic activities proposed for teachers to measure student learning once students return to classes; (ii) technical assistance to states and municipalities during the adjustment process due to the suspension of the academic calendar; (iii) technical assistance to coordinate the CONSED and UNDIME<sup>6</sup> innovation task force meetings; and (iv) organize an event in 2021 with *Função Itaú Social*, the NGO that leads the TVET dialogue, to share national and international experiences for the implementation of the Technical Education High School track.
- 3.2. **Component II:** Field trials. The TC will finance activities aligned with the challenges associated with the promotion of a culture of innovation, including innovation on-site trials to improve efficiency in transportation, meal programs, teacher assignment, and security for schools identified by the CONSED task force. Additionally, due to the CV pandemic, the CONSED’s innovation task force has received innovation solutions, and as part of this component the methodology to evaluate these proposals will be financed, so that force members and municipalities can identify which should be tested and/or escalated. Products related with this component will include on-site trials reports and the methodology to evaluate innovation proposals to help municipalities decide which programs are most appropriate based on their needs.
- 3.3. **Component III:** Evidence. The TC will finance: (i) a qualitative and quantitative study on the impact of CV on the learning gaps of Brazilian students; the quantitative component will use administrative data from the education census and state based assessments, and qualitative information will be gathered from phone interviews in

---

<sup>6</sup> Conselho Nacional de Secretários de Educação – national education secretaries council and União Nacional dos Dirigentes Municipais de Educação – national education municipal leaders union. CONSED is an institution created by law that brings together Education Secretaries from all states where its members revise the strategic objectives following the National Education Plan and, as a group, they have leverage both in their states and at the federal level.

Brazil, and (ii) adaptation of the *Aprendamos Todos a Leer* material to Portuguese and a route to implement it in Brazilian municipalities. Products of this component include a report on CV impacts on Brazilian education and *Aprendamos Todos a Leer* materials in Portuguese.

- 3.4. The total cost of this TC will be US\$200,000, which will be financed by the Strategic Program for Social Development Financed with Ordinary Capital.

**Indicative Budget**

Activity/Component	IDB/Fund Funding	Total Funding
Events/Dialogue	95,000	95,000
Field Trials	30,000	30,000
Evidence	75,000	75,000
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>200,000</b>	<b>200,000</b>

**IV. Executing agency and execution structure (estimated length: 1 page)**

- 4.1. This TC will be executed by the IDB as established in the request letter from the Manaus Education Secretariat and approved by Brazil's Treasury Department (SAIN). Design, coordination and supervision of this TC and its disbursement will be tasked to the IDB's Education Division (SCL/EDU), in accordance with the requirements established in the Bank's Policy for Technical Cooperation (GN-2470-2) and the Operational Guidelines for Technical Cooperation (GN-2629-1). Disbursement will be tasked to the Brazil Country Office (CSC/CBR). Under the fiduciary and technical responsibility of SCL/EDU through the project leader in accordance with the provisions of the TC request letter from the government.
- 4.2. *Fiduciary arrangements:* All disbursements will be executed through the Bank's systems and will require approval from SCL/EDU. All activities to be executed under this TC have been included in the Procurement Plan (see Annex IV) and will be contracted in accordance with Bank policies as follows: (a) AM-650 for Individual consultants; (b) GN-2765-4 and Guidelines OP-1155-4 for Consulting Firms for services of an intellectual nature and; (c) GN-2303-28 for logistics and other related services. Since products will be procured by the IDB, previous the negotiation of terms of reference with the contractors, there are no external causes that can cause delay on delivery.
- 4.3. Direct contracts. Due to the activities to be executed and their values, there will be several direct contracts. Contracting will follow the Policy for Selection and Contracting of Consultant Companies for Operative Work Executed by the Bank (GN-2765-3) and, for the case of contracting NGOs, in accordance with the Policies for Selection and Contracting of Consultants Financed by the Inter-American Development Bank (GN-2303-28).
- 4.4. Each of the following four contracts' amounts do not exceed US\$100,000 and include non-governmental organizations (NGOs), a firm, and the National Council of Education Secretaries (CONSED). In addition to GN-2765-3, paragraph 3.17 of GN-2350-15 refers to the hiring of NGOs. These NGOs meet "certain unique conditions to assist in the preparation, administration and implementation of projects, essentially due to their participation and the knowledge of local problems, the needs of the

community and the participatory approaches". These contracts are identified as "consultancy services" in the procurement plan.

- 4.5. First, *Movimento Colabora*, an NGO that brings together institutions recognized for their work in education around the topic of promoting collaboration between states and municipalities and between municipalities. This is the only NGO working on collaboration in Brazil, more so during this sanitary crisis where the municipalities' fragility is evidenced by weak institutions and fiscal constraints.
- 4.6. Second, IDB as a member of the CONSED innovation task force will support both the assessment and technology and innovation task force meetings that include representatives from the 27 states. Collaboration activities between local governments, IDB and civil society are initiated to move forward field trials aimed at future scaling up. If possible, UNDIME will also be hired to plan and hold the assessment task force meetings. Working with these two organizations is an opportunity to reach vulnerable communities and support them in the recovery process due to CV.
- 4.7. Third, Renan Sargiani: Educação Baseada em Evidências, will be hired for the adaptation to Portuguese of the *Aprendamos Todos a Leer* material. As identified in the background, one of Brazil's National Education Plan objectives is early literacy, and during 2020. The Bank hired the local consultant, Renan Sargiani, who was part of the team that designed the early literacy national policy both to facilitate the workshops with the Manaus team and to adapt the phonological table to Portuguese. Given his expertise in early literacy, his knowledge of the national policy and his familiarity with the *Aprendamos Todos a Leer* material, he is uniquely qualified to continue working on this project.
- 4.8. Finally, *Fundação Lemann* led the creation of the AS coalition during the CV crisis. The IDB has joined the coalition and has been actively supporting phase three initiatives, specifically the design of a diagnostic assessment instrument to help teachers identify students' learning achievement during schools' closure and define strategies to close the learning gaps exacerbated during this period in a joint effort with Center for Public Policy and Education Assessment (CAEd) and Instituto Reúna this contract will support the design and implementation of Diagnostic Activities, this is focused on embracing students and teachers once schools reopen with a proposed socioemotional skills assessment, language and math assessments from 2<sup>nd</sup> to 12<sup>th</sup> grade based on the essential curriculum (mapas de foco), a guide for results interpretation and pedagogical suggestions for teachers.

## **V. Major issues**

- 5.1. The risks associated with this operation are low. The Bank, through SCL/EDU, has extensive experience in the development of the issues requested by the Government of Brazil, in addition to maintaining a permanent dialogue with both local counterparts with organizations, and with local and international experts to obtain the technical assistance required.
- 5.2. The delay in the delivery of products is a potential risk that can be mitigated by establishing a feasible schedule. Additionally, given the CV pandemic and its unpredictable nature, some flexibility and adaptation to varying conditions should be expected which will require permanent supervision in contracts execution.

## **VI. Exceptions to Bank policy**

6.1. None.

## **VII. Environmental and Social Strategy**

7.1. The ESG classification for this operation is "C".

### **Required Annexes:**

[Request from the Client - BR-T1447](#)

[Results Matrix - BR-T1447](#)

[Terms of Reference - BR-T1447](#)

[Procurement Plan - BR-T1447](#)