

Basic Information			
Approval Year	: 2021	Region	: REG
Team Leader	: Naslund-Hadley, Emma Ingrid	Country	: Regional
Taxonomy	: Research and Dissemination	Department	: SCL
Fund	: COF	Sector	: ED - Preschool & Early Childhood Education
Approval Number	: ATN/CF-18564-RG	Sub Sector	: PRE
Execution Agency	: US-IDB		
Execution Status	: Closed		
Operation Objective	: COVID-19 related school closures have revealed that distance learning is uniquely challenging for students of initial education and Early Childhood Development (ECD) services. The proposed TC will respond to this challenge by addressing two areas of ECD. The overall objective is twofold: (i) expand a regional survey and behavioral economics pilot to one additional country; and (ii) develop and pilot a model for growth mindset among caregivers and young children in vulnerable communities.		
Financial Information			
RG-T3828			
ATN/CF-18564-RG:COF	Original	Current	% of Current Amount Financed
Amount Financed	\$203,184.00	\$205,103.50	
Disbursed Amount	N/A	\$203,280.18	99.11 %
Commitments not yet disbursed Amount	N/A	-	0.00 %
Available Amount	N/A	\$1,823.32	0.89 %
Final Disbursement Date	Mar 24, 2023		
Status Update			

Guatemala was included in the regional survey about initial education in times of COVID-19, as well as in the ongoing regional behavioral economics pilot. The survey target of reaching 4,000 households was surpassed. The final number was 4,133 households surveyed, providing invaluable information for the ministry of the situation of young children in the COVID-era. The behavioral economics study provides new evidence on the effectiveness of large-scale messaging (SMS) campaigns to improve children's skills during emergencies. We carried out an experiment to evaluate the effectiveness of two types of messaging campaign: the first that contains messages with activities to develop cognitive skills; and the second that contains messages to develop social-emotional skills, and to a lesser extent than above, messages to develop skills cognitive. The result shows that both versions of the campaign were effective when it came to increase parental investments in productive activities, with the cognitive campaign having a additional impact on mathematical activities due to the greater number of messages addressed to this learning area. In El Salvador, an experimental evaluation of Parent-child transmission of mindset attitudes has been designed and implemented, including treatment learning videos and complementary materials. The Randomized Control Trial had two treatment arms: (i) one group is learning about growth versus fixed mindset theory through a video; and (ii) a second group receives a more intense treatment with biweekly mentoring meetings with community educators over the course of 4-5 months. The results of the impact evaluation show that the program produced an increase of 0.22 standard deviations in the growth mindset index of caregivers. An impact was also found on some behaviors associated with a growth mindset, such as the adult's feedback strategy and the child's achievement expectation.

Advance in the Achievement of Outcome and Outputs

Advance in the Achievement of Outcome

1 . A model developed and tested for promoting children's cognitive and socioemotional development.

The outcome has been successfully achieved. The model was developed and rigourously put to the test through a randomized control triel. The results from the Guatemala nudging experiment show a 0.08 standard deviation improvement in the cognitive skills of students whose parents were assigned to the text message campaign These results suggest the effect to have been driven by increased parental involvement through the proposed activities from the text messaging campaign.

2 . A model developed and tested for growth mindset among caregivers and young children in vulnerable communities.

The outcome was successfully achieved. The model was developed and rigourously put to the test through a randomized control triel. The Growth Mindset project in El Salvador evaluated Parent-Child transmission of mindset attitudes. It employed various tools: in an initial visit parents viewed videos discussing the differences between growth versus fixed mindset theory; after the visit they received 4-5 months of biweekly meetings through community educators using a curriculum in mindset theory. Each group expanded their growth mindset attitudes by 0.22 standard deviations compared with their peers in the control group.

Advances in Execution

1. Guatemala’s Participation in Regional Study of ECD Distance Learning

Component Cost: \$87,000

Output Indicator	Indicator Detail	Unit Of Measure	Baseline	Baseline Year	Means Of Verification	Theme	Year	P	P(A)	A
1.1 ^s Surveys conducted	Regional COVID-19 survey conducted in Guatemala (COF)	Surveys (#)	0	2021	Surveys	Education	Physical			
							2021	1	1	1
							2022	0	0	0
							2023	0	0	
							EOP 2023	1	1	1
							Financial			
							2021	50000	50000	50000
							2022	0	0	0
							2023	0	0	
							EOP 2023	50000	50000	50000

Advances In Execution: In Guatemala, an online survey of households with young children was contextualized and validated including the following child development outcomes: (i) MELQO-EGMA based remote test to measure cognitive skills, applied to children (for endline data collection). This instrument was developed, tested and validated during 2020 due to COVID-19, and measure skills related to SMS campaign ; (ii) CDC checklist of children development. The CDC checklist of children development will be used to generate a development index ; (iii) SDQ (for endline data collection). SDQ will be considered to measure socioemotional skills reported by caregivers. To measure caregiver wellbeing, an online survey was contextualized adn validated, including (i) CESD-R to measure caregiver depression and socioemotional status; and (ii) indicators to create a parental stress index. To measure caregiver behavior, the survey also included : (i) Family care indicators to develop parental involvement index based on caregivers’ responses about specific activities performed with children at home from the Unicef Multi Instrument Child Survey (MICS) ; (ii) Child discipline indicators form the MICS ; and (iii) items related to educational process during pandemic at home. The target of reaching 4,000 households was surpassed. The final number was 4,133 households surveyed.

Output Indicator	Indicator Detail	Unit Of Measure	Baseline	Baseline Year	Means Of Verification	Theme	Year	P	P(A)	A
1.2 ^s Pilot interventions implemented	Parental SMS ECD campaign piloted through an RCT (COF)	Pilots (#)	0	2021	Pilots	Education	Physical			
							2021	0	0	0
							2022	1	1	1
							2023	0	0	
							EOP 2023	1	1	1
							Financial			
							2021	0	0	0
							2022	37000	37000	37000
							2023	0	0	
							EOP 2023	37000	37000	37000

Advances In Execution: Together with the Ministry of Guatemalan education adapted a messaging campaign was Developed and implemented. The messaging campaign lasted 12 weeks. This took place from September 13, 2021 to September 4, 2021. December 2021 (approximately 11 weeks). Caregivers received 3-4 text messages per week. The text messages were scheduled to take place during certain days of the week between 3 and 5 in the afternoon. In total, each participating caregiver received a total of 53 messages..

2. Growth Mindset Study in El Salvador

Component Cost: \$100,000

Output Indicator	Indicator Detail	Unit Of Measure	Baseline	Baseline Year	Means Of Verification	Theme	Year	P	P(A)	A
2.1 ^s Pilot interventions designed	Mindgrowth study designed (COF)	Pilots (#)	0	2021	Pilots	Education	Physical			
							2021	1	1	1
							2022	0	0	0
							2023	0	0	
							EOP 2023	1	1	1
							Financial			
							2021	10000	10000	10000
							2022	0	0	0
							2023	0	0	
							EOP 2023	10000	10000	10000

Advances In Execution: An SMS campaign for caregivers was designed, including 53 text messages with tips to develop cognitive and socioemotional skills at home. The content of these messages varied according to the treatment group to which the caregivers belonged. A first group (Cognitive Group) was made up of caregivers who received messages that they contained proposals for learning activities aimed at promoting cognitive development. The content of these messages was guided by the educational curriculum of the Ministry of Education of Guatemala, and included math and communication activities. On the other hand, the second group of treatment (Cognitive-Socio-Emotional Group) received, in addition to these messages, others with advice aimed at promoting secure attachment, positive parenting, healthy habits (movement, play), and adult self care.

Output Indicator	Indicator Detail	Unit Of Measure	Baseline	Baseline Year	Means Of Verification	Theme	Year	P	P(A)	A
2.2 ^s Pilot interventions implemented	Mindgrowth pilot implemented (COF)	Pilots (#)	0	2021	Pilots	Education	Physical			
							2021	0	0	0
							2022	1	1	1
							2023	0	0	
							EOP 2023	1	1	1
							Financial			
							2021	0	0	0
							2022	90000	90000	90000
							2023	0	0	
							EOP 2023	90000	90000	90000

Advances In Execution: Growth mindset learning videos and complementary materials and communication scripts have been designed, tested in focus groups and validated. In 2022, the growth mindset experimental pilot was fully implemented. The implementation of the experimental evaluation shows that the "Empodera tu mente en familia" program is effective in increasing the growth mindset of caregivers of children from 4 to 7 years of age, and that the magnitude of this effect may be associated with the level of compliance of the different components of the program. Caregivers in the treatment group increased their growth mindset by 0.24 s.d. according to the Dweck index (growth mindset as an individual) and at 0.46 s.d. according to the Attanasio index (growth mentality with respect to the child's capacity). These results are robust to alternative measurement strategies such as the use of vignettes. The magnitude of this effect is greater as the caregiver completes the components of the program.

3. Dissemination

Component Cost: \$7,576

Output Indicator	Indicator Detail	Unit Of Measure	Baseline	Baseline Year	Means Of Verification	Theme	Year	P	P(A)	A
3.1 Presentations delivered	Presentations of survey and pilot (COF)	Presentations (#)	0	2021	presentations	Education	Physical			
							2021	0	0	0
							2022	0	0	1
							2023	1	0	
							EOP 2023	1	1	1
							Financial			
							2021	0	0	0
							2022	0	0	2500
							2023	1130	0	
							EOP 2023	1130	2500	2500

Advances In Execution: The findings were presented to the counterparts in each country. Both Ministries, in Guatemala and El Salvador, expressed interest in scaling the interventions. In particular, the cost effectiveness of behavioral economics interventions appeals to the counterparts. Once the working papers are published, the team hopes to organize additional presentations together with the Bernard Van Leer Foundation.

Output Indicator	Indicator Detail	Unit Of Measure	Baseline	Baseline Year	Means Of Verification	Theme	Year	P	P(A)	A
3.2 ^s Discussion papers developed	White Paper Developed (COF)	Papers (#)	0	2021	Papers	Education	Physical			
							2021	0	0	0
							2022	0	0	1
							2023	1	0	
							EOP 2023	1	1	1
							Financial			
							2021	0	0	0
							2022	0	0	5076.18
							2023	5000	0	
							EOP 2023	5000	5076.18	5076.18
Advances In Execution: A draft discussion paper has been developed and will be published in 2023 of the Empodera Tu Mente project. A second paper is under development of the SMS project in Guatemala. The Team also plans to disseminate the findings through blogs and in dialogue with different ministries of educaiton in the region.										