

DOCUMENT OF THE INTER-AMERICAN DEVELOPMENT BANK

## **HAITI**

### **SUPPORT TO THE HAITI EDUCATION SECTOR PLAN (SHESP)**

**(HA-L1102)**

#### **GRANT PROPOSAL**

This document was prepared by the project team consisting of: Marie Evane Tamagnan (SCL/EDU) Project Team Leader; Sabine Rieble-Aubourg (SCL/EDU) Alternate Team Leader; Ana Gonzalez Vidales and Marie Marcelle Orisme (VPC/FMP); Monica Centeno Lappas (LEG/SGO); Aurelie Gilles and Laura Giles Alvarez (CID/CID); Rosangela Bando Grana (SPD/SDV); Marie Edwige Baron and Kemberly Chaudry (CID/CHA); Ivana Blasco; Christian Ubertini; Josephine-Evelyn Margron; Zoe Routhier-Drab; and Medjy Pierre-Louis (SCL/EDU).

In accordance with the Access to Information Policy, this document is being released to the public and distributed to the Bank's Board of Executive Directors simultaneously. This document has not been approved by the Board. Should the Board approve the document with amendments, a revised version will be made available to the public, thus superseding and replacing the original version.

## CONTENTS

<b>PROJECT SUMMARY.....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>I. PROJECT DESCRIPTION AND RESULTS MONITORING .....</b>	<b>2</b>
A. Background, problem addressed, and justification .....	2
B. Objective, components, and cost .....	9
C. Key results indicators.....	11
<b>II. FINANCING STRUCTURE AND MAIN RISKS .....</b>	<b>12</b>
A. Financing instruments.....	12
B. Environmental and social safeguard risks .....	13
C. Fiduciary risk .....	13
D. Other risks and key issues.....	14
<b>III. IMPLEMENTATION AND MANAGEMENT PLAN .....</b>	<b>15</b>
A. Summary of implementation arrangements .....	15
B. Summary of arrangements for monitoring results .....	18

ANNEXES	
Annex I	Summary Development Effectiveness Matrix (DEM)
Annex II	Results Framework
Annex III	Fiduciary Arrangements

REQUIRED ELECTRONIC LINKS (REL)	
REL#1	<a href="#">Pluriannual Execution Plan (PEP)</a>
REL#2	<a href="#">Monitoring and Evaluation Arrangements</a>
REL#3	<a href="#">Procurement Plan</a>

OPTIONAL ELECTRONIC LINKS (OEL)	
OEL#1	<a href="#">Analysis of Project Cost and Economic Viability</a>
OEL#2	<a href="#">Draft Project Operations Manual (POM)</a>
OEL#3	<a href="#">Lessons learned used in the design of the HA-L1102</a>
OEL#4	<a href="#">Bibliography</a>
OEL#5	<a href="#">Donor Coordination Matrix</a>
OEL#6	<a href="#">PDEF + PAPDEF Results Area</a>
OEL#7	<a href="#">Fragility, Conflict and Violence Strategy</a>
OEL#8	<a href="#">2863/GR-HA Execution Status Summary</a>
OEL#9	<a href="#">Implementation scheme</a>
OEL#10	<a href="#">Safeguard Policy Filter (SPF)</a> and <a href="#">Safeguard Screening Form (SSF)</a>

ABBREVIATIONS	
BNC	<i>Banque National de Cr�dit</i>
BND	<i>Bureau de Nutrition et de D�veloppement</i>
CEEC	<i>Commission Episcopale pour l'Education Catholique</i>
CNSA	National Coordination on Food Security
COVID-19	Coronavirus Disease of 2019
CRF	Corporate Results Framework
DDE	Regional MENFP Office ( <i>Direction D�partementale d'Education</i> )
DEM	Development Effectiveness Matrix
EFA	Education For All
EMIS	Education Information Management System
EPT	<i>Education Pour Tous</i>
ESHS	Environmental, Social and Health and Safety
ESMR	Environmental and Social Management Report
ESPIG	Education Sector Plan Implementation Grant
ESS	Environmental and Social Strategy
EU	Executing Unit
FY	Fiscal Year
GPE	Global Partnership for Education
GoH	Government of Haiti
IBE	International Bureau of Education
ICT	Information Communication Technology
IDB	Inter-American Development Bank
IEA	International Association for the Evaluation of Educational Achievement
LAC	Latin America and the Caribbean
LaNA	Literacy and Numeracy Assessment
LAS	Learning Assessment Systems
MENFP	<i>Minist�re d'Education National et de Formation Professionnel</i>
OEL	Optional Electronic Links
PAPDEF	<i>Projet d'Appui au Plan Decenal d'Enseignement Fondamental</i>
PDEF	<i>Plan D�cennal d'�ducation et de Formation</i>
PEP	Pluriannual Execution Plan
POD	Proposal for Operation Development

POM	Project Operation Manual
PPP	Public Private Partnerships
PREPOC	Plan de Relance Economique Post Covid-19
PSUGO	<i>Programme de Scolarisation Universelle Gratuite et Obligatoire</i>
SAQ	Quality Assurance System
SBMC	School Based Management Committee
SIP	School Improvement Plan
SPF	Safeguard Policy Filter
SSF	Safeguard Screening Form
TWP	Tuition Waiver Program
UCP	Project Coordination Unit
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
UNOPS	United Nations Office for Project Services
WAL	Weighted Average Life
WB	World Bank
WFP	World Food Program

**PROJECT SUMMARY**  
**REPUBLIC OF HAITI**  
**SUPPORT TO THE HAITI EDUCATION SECTOR PLAN (SHESP)**  
**(HA-L1102)**

Financial Terms and Conditions				
<b>Beneficiary</b>				
Republic of Haiti			<b>Amortization Period:</b>	N.A.
<b>Executing Agency</b>			<b>Disbursement Period:</b>	5 Years
Ministère de l'Education et de la Formation Professionnelle (MENFP)			<b>Grace Period:</b>	N.A.
<b>Source</b>	<b>Amount (US\$)</b>	<b>%</b>	<b>Interest rate:</b>	N.A.
<b>IDB (Grant Facility for Haiti):</b>	50,000,000	100	<b>Credit Fee:</b>	N.A.
			<b>Inspection and supervision fee:</b>	N.A.
			<b>Weighted Average Life (WAL):</b>	N.A.
<b>Total:</b>	50,000,000	100	<b>Currency of Approval:</b>	Dollars of the United States of America
Project at a Glance				
<p><b>Project Objective/Description:</b> The objective of the project is to improve basic education attainment. The specific objectives of the project are to: (i) strengthen the MENFPs governance and increase its capacity to implement the PDEF; (ii) maintain enrollment in selected primary schools; and (iii) strengthen capacity of schools to improve quality and promote gender equality.</p>				
<p><b>Special Contractual Clauses prior to the first disbursement:</b> The Beneficiary, through the Executing Agency, shall provide evidence: (i) of the approval and entry into effect of the Program Operating Manual (POM) (<a href="#">OEL#2</a>) according to the terms and conditions previously agreed with the Bank; and (ii) the approval of the terms of reference in connection with the Project Coordination Unit (UCP) procurement specialist, an additional junior financial management specialist, and an additional monitoring and evaluation specialist (¶3.5).</p>				
<p><b>Special contractual condition of execution:</b> see special conditions included in Annex III, Section II.</p>				
<p><b>Exceptions to Bank Policies:</b> None</p>				
Strategic Alignment				
<b>Challenges<sup>(a)</sup>:</b>		SI <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	PI <input type="checkbox"/>	EI <input type="checkbox"/>
<b>Cross-Cutting Issues<sup>(b)</sup>:</b>		GE <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> and DI <input type="checkbox"/>	CC <input type="checkbox"/> and ES <input type="checkbox"/>	IC <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>

<sup>(a)</sup> SI (Social Inclusion and Equality); PI (Productivity and Innovation); and EI (Economic Integration).

<sup>(b)</sup> GE (Gender Equality) and DI (Diversity); CC (Climate Change) and ES (Environmental Sustainability); and IC (Institutional Capacity and Rule of Law).

## I. PROJECT DESCRIPTION AND RESULTS MONITORING

### A. Background, problem addressed, and justification

- 1.1 **Haiti continues to face persistent chronic poverty and inequality.** In 2019, Gross Domestic Product (GDP) per capita was US\$772 versus US\$10,454 in Latin America and the Caribbean (LAC). Almost 60% of the population lives below the national poverty line and 28.9% live in extreme poverty (less than US\$2 a day), compared to less than 10% in LAC.<sup>1</sup> As a result Haiti ranks 170th out of 189 countries in the 2020 United Nations Human Development Index Report. The Haitian population faces a series of structural socioeconomic vulnerabilities, including a life expectancy at birth of 64 years, (compared to 75.6 years in LAC) and 5.6 mean years of schooling (compared to 8.7 mean years of schooling in LAC).<sup>2</sup> Furthermore, 88% of the population work in the informal sector and depend on day-by-day incomes to meet their basic consumption needs.
- 1.2 **COVID-19 has negatively impacted a fragile state, where political instability and a deteriorating economic environment were already threatening post-earthquake gains.**<sup>3</sup> Reconstruction efforts after the 2010 earthquake started to bring some improvements as extreme poverty fell, infrastructure and private sector activity expanded, and health and education indicators improved, however, starting in 2018, Haiti's economy has deteriorated due to a reduction in access to external financing, fuel shortages, social unrest, high inflation, and poor conditions for agriculture. In addition, 2019 was marked by the *Peyi-Lok*, a two-month period characterized by persistent social unrest which resulted in the paralysis of economic activities, the suspension of school classes and shortages of fuel, water, food, and medicines. The combination of these factors resulted in a real GDP contraction of 1.2% in the fiscal year of 2019 (FY2019) and an estimated contraction of 4% in FY2020. The arrival of COVID-19 and the ensuing actions that the government had to undertake to contain its spread, such as the closing of factories, businesses, and schools for several weeks, further deteriorated the economy and the education sector.
- 1.3 **Access to education remains an issue.** Over the last decade, the Haitian Ministry of National Education and Professional Development (MENFP) has improved its education sector. The period of the early 2000's to 2015 was characterized by growing net primary enrollment rates, from 60% to about 70% respectively<sup>4</sup> however there is a limited access to education in public schools. At all levels of education, the public sector plays a limited role in the provision, quality assurance, and regulation of the sector. Public supply of education is insufficient to meet demand and private providers have stepped in to fill the gap, operating over 90% of preschools and more than 80% of primary schools.<sup>4</sup> Most families struggle to finance education costs which, on average, represent about 52% of the income of households with children in basic education.<sup>5</sup>
- 1.4 **Tuition waivers.** The MENFP's implementation of tuition waivers contributed to enrolment gains and showed that access can be achieved quickly through financing non-public tuition fees. The GoH has financed tuition waivers for students enrolled in non-public schools through the donor-funded Education for All-EFA Projects' Tuition Waiver Program

---

<sup>1</sup> <https://data.worldbank.org/country/haiti>

<sup>2</sup> <https://data.worldbank.org/country/haiti>

<sup>3</sup> Presidential Decree led to closures of factories and schools starting March 20, 2020.

<sup>4</sup> Haiti Education Sector Analysis, 2019, IIEP.

<sup>5</sup> Internal IDB report on private school choice financing, publication pending.

(*Education Pour Tous*) (TWP)<sup>6</sup> since 2007 and the government-funded Universal, Free, and Obligatory Education Program (PSUGO) since 2011. At their combined peak between 2011 and 2014, these two programs financed the school fees of over 60% of all primary students in Haiti, with PSUGO representing about 20% of domestic public spending on education.<sup>[20][19]</sup> The end of the donor-financed programs in 2017, however, has effectively shifted the financial burden of primary education back to households. In fact, since the end of the tuition waiver programs, Haiti faces a growing out-of-school children crisis.<sup>7</sup> A 2017 UNICEF and MENFP study indicates that of the approximate 4 million primary aged children, nearly 500,000 children aged 5 to 18 were completely excluded from the school system in Haiti and about 1 million were at risk of leaving the system without having finished their schooling.<sup>[2]</sup>

- 1.5 **The COVID-19 pandemic** further puts at risk the previous achievements in access; therefore, programs are needed to allow that children can return to school to ensure that the country does not lose more human capital. Indeed, out-of-school children estimates in Haiti have significantly increased due to *Peyi-Lok* and *COVID-19*. A recent MENFP report estimates that at least 3 million children across the country did not have access to primary school in 2019 due to the *Peyi-Lok* with 60% of establishments closing during that time across the country. Then, on March 20, 2020, the GoH made the decision to close all schools in the country to prevent the spread of COVID-19, affecting 4 million school-aged children. As a result, most students missed the entire 2019-2020 academic year. Available data indicates that approximately 50% of children have not reenrolled in schools in the 2020–2021 school year, and over 80% of families interviewed declared not having the financial means after the multiple crises to send their children to school, indicating that the out of school children crisis will continue in the coming years.<sup>8,9</sup>
- 1.6 **The impact of the crises on food security.** The National Coordination on Food Security (CNSA)<sup>[21]</sup><sup>10</sup> projected that the number of people facing acute food insecurity would increase to 3,988,968 million people (42% of the population) between August 2020 and February 2021. At the national level, 12% of children are experiencing malnutrition or at risk of malnutrition (ENUSAN, 2019). At the start of the 2020/21 school year, it was estimated that approximately 2,000,000 school-aged children were enrolled in primary school in the six departments in which the IDB education projects operate (¶1.28), of which only about 400,000 were receiving school meal assistance from a donor or government financed program in the 2019/20 school year.<sup>11</sup> This situation is particularly worrying considering that the school meal is often the only regular meal a child receives in a day and is a key activity for school enrolment and regular attendance. Evidence demonstrates that, with the estimated value of school meals equivalent to about 10% of a households' income, school feeding programs can support a reduction of poverty by freeing that income for households to use on other goods and services and are proven mechanisms to bring back children to schools.<sup>[3]</sup>
- 1.7 **Poor and rural children have the lowest levels of access and student achievement.** Among primary school-age children, only 86% of poor, rural children are enrolled,

<sup>6</sup> 3355/GR-HA contributed to the TWP.

<sup>7</sup> Definition of Out of School Children as the *Educate a Child (EAC) foundation*.

<sup>8</sup> UNICEF, GPE Emergency Project Document 2020–Accessed March 21, 2021.

<sup>9</sup> The proportion of students that complete 4<sup>th</sup> and 6<sup>th</sup> grade out of those that enroll in the northern six departments targeted by IDB investments is 65 and 55 percent respectively. Source: 2015- 2016 school census data.

<sup>10</sup> The Integrated Food Security Phase Classification (IPC) is an exercise led by the NCFS and is a global scale for classifying the severity and magnitude of food insecurity and malnutrition.

<sup>11</sup> Data for the 2021–2022 school year is pending.



compared to 96% of the non-poor urban. Among 10- to 14-year-olds who are in school, over 70% of poor, rural children are two or more years over age for their grade, compared to 32% of their non-poor, urban counterparts. Long distances to school and family needs for children's agricultural labor are among the main causes cited by rural parents for children being over age.[\[4\]](#)

- 1.8 **Gender Gaps.** At the same time, while there are no significant gender gaps in primary school enrolment, data indicates that most girls in primary classrooms are significantly overaged, with the average 4<sup>th</sup> grade girl being 13 years old (compared to the average age of boys in 4<sup>th</sup> grade of 11 years), which is a barrier to regular school attendance.[\[18\]](#)<sup>12</sup>. While a specific diagnostic of overaged girls in schools has yet to be conducted, a variety of contextual factors are likely contributing to this high rate of overaged girls in primary schools, including security concerns, parents prioritizing limited resources for sons' education, domestic servitude, as well as menstruation and teen pregnancy.[\[5\]](#) Given the frequency of overaged girls in primary schools, special attention must be paid to encouraging regular school attendance for girls through sharing gender specific information with girls and boys in primary schools, as well as addressing barriers through simple inputs such as trash bins in latrines, providing female role models, which have been shown to increase enrolment in school.[\[6\]](#)
- 1.9 **Quality of teaching and learning.** The GoH has prioritized the improvement of public schools, which are often seen as lower quality and disproportionately serve the poor. After decades of unfettered growth in the non-public sector, the MENFP has taken initial steps to put in place a set of quality standards (the Quality Assurance System (SAQ))<sup>13</sup> and minimum physical criteria related to safe infrastructure, water, and sanitation, that non-public and public schools must meet to be able to operate. For public schools, decentralizing decision-making authority to parents and communities can strengthen accountability, while building school management capacity with a focus on data can improve student performance. [\[7\]\[8\]\[23\]](#) The SAQ has been implemented in public schools at the national scale and those experiences have informed the continued improvement and growth of the system, which will further need to grow to respond to new quality areas such as socio-emotional development and support and hybrid education. Longitudinal data from 2017 to 2020 show that quality indicators improved for all schools which received SAQ interventions, implying that the SAQ interventions are successful.<sup>14</sup>
- 1.10 Nevertheless, with an average national illiteracy rate of 23%, the quality of teaching and learning remains very weak.[\[18\]](#) Classroom observations of primary school teachers in the Nord and Nord-Est departments found that most teachers use ineffective pedagogical approaches and do not master the content of the subject they are teaching.[\[9\]](#) Student achievement in turn, remains poor. The average Haitian child enters first grade nearly two years late, due to a combination of household financial constraints that delay school entry and schools often demanding that children receive at least one year of pre-primary to prepare for first grade. Once in school, 13% of first graders repeat the year, and only about half will reach the sixth grade.[\[4\]](#)
- 1.11 **Student learning is weak.** A 2016 pilot of a fourth-grade math assessment by the MENFP found that student scores were only slightly above what would be achieved by random

---

<sup>12</sup> The gender gap in the proportion of students that complete 6<sup>th</sup> grade on time in the northern six departments targeted by IDB investments is 20 percent. Source: 2015-2016 school census data.

<sup>13</sup> The Quality Assurance System (SAQ) is a system developed and validated by the MENFP for measuring and tracking school quality.

<sup>14</sup> Internal IDB data (CID) – Technical paper 2021.

guessing.<sup>15</sup> In the six target departments, students only answered between 32% and 43% of items correctly. Students in private schools scored slightly better than public school students, with overall averages of 39% and 37% respectively. Similarly, girls scored only slightly better than boys, with overall averages of 39% and 38% respectively.

- 1.12 The low average quality of education provided by both public and non-public schools, coupled with the deprivations associated with poverty contribute to the low levels of learning achievement. Physical and social environments are inadequate, and schools often do not provide safe, healthy contexts for learning. For example, only 56% of primary schools had a source of drinking water according to the 2013-14 national school census. In seven of the ten departments of the country, the rate of school electrification is under 25%, compared to the Sub-Saharan Africa average of 28%. Haitian schools are also poorly equipped, and teachers must make do with insufficient pedagogical materials (table, notebook, manual). Students do not always have the necessary resources such as textbooks given the associated costs.[\[18\]](#)
- 1.13 **Strengthening the Ministry of Education's governance is critical for maintaining oversight over the quality of education provided to its students.** A growing body of evidence shows that education outcomes can be substantially improved by improving governance, aligning decision-making authority, capacity, and financing.[\[10\]](#) Regulation of the education sector is weak and has not advanced since 2014. The Quality Assurance System (SAQ) was developed in 2015 to not only establish a set of quality standards for improving the quality of teaching and learning in schools, but also as a tool to regulate the largely unregulated non-public education sector. Nevertheless, while the SAQ has been widely implemented for quality improvement in the public sector, the SAQ system remains nascent in its regulatory use. The available instruments/guides have not yet been standardized as the tool for regulation resulting in a non-public sector that operates without much regulation from the MENFP. As stated earlier, the non-public sector represents 80% of the educational offer, however, MENFP's capacity to monitor school accreditation and track school input, quality, or learning is very limited. Therefore, a regulation and accreditation strategy need to be designed and implemented using the standardized SAQ as a regulatory tool.
- 1.14 **The lack of reliable, valid, and relevant data on the education sector is at the center of the complex web of challenges** in providing access to high quality learning opportunities to students in Haiti.[\[11\]](#) The Haiti Education Information Management System (EMIS), a system designed to collect and produce data on the education sector, is in its first year of operationalization. However, due to management challenges within the MENFP and the limited intra-and-inter ministerial coordination, the presence of the EMIS has yet to be fully maximized to effectively support the policy development and programming work of the wider ministry.
- 1.15 **High quality Learning Assessment Systems (LAS) are a key element of effective and efficient education systems.**[\[16\]](#) In Haiti, an inter-ministerial technical team on national and learning evaluations was established in 2021. Guidance from the Ministry to teachers and schools on the use of classroom and formative assessments to improve teaching and learning is limited. In a previous operation, the IDB financed an agreement with the International Association for the Evaluation of Educational Achievement (IEA) to develop instruments for 4th grade evaluation of literacy and numeracy competencies. Those instruments were tested in 2015, and in 2016 the evaluation was implemented at a national level. The implementation of the 4th grade evaluations contributed to

---

<sup>15</sup> IEA. *l'Evaluation Nationale 2016 en Haïti*. Unpublished.

strengthening MENFP central and decentralized staff skills and knowledge on the logistics of standardized evaluations. These evaluations also contributed to the development of an item bank for the 4<sup>th</sup> grade evaluation adapted to the Haitian context. Experience with the 4<sup>th</sup> grade evaluation contributed to the country's preparation for participation in international standardized tests. In 2020, The MENFP, participated in The Literacy and Numeracy Assessment (LaNA) pre-pilot. LaNA provides internationally comparable achievement results and is designed for countries where other assessments, such as The Trends in International Mathematics and Science Study (TIMSS) or The Progress in International Reading Literacy Study (PIRLS), are too difficult. The Ministry of Education has gained significant experiences from the successful experiences with national evaluations, however, there is still a lot to be done to institutionalize initiatives and advance effectively toward the development of a sound and coherent evaluation system in which data is used for efficient decision-making.

- 1.16 **In response to the multiple shocks to the education system resulting in frequent school closures (including COVID-19), the MENFP has begun to develop a distance education system.**<sup>[15]</sup><sup>16</sup> Global evidence demonstrates that distance education and interactive radio instruction is associated for higher levels of student achievement <sup>[12][13]</sup>. Considering Haiti's connectivity challenges with only about 40% of households having access to electricity and 32.5% to the internet with the help of smart phones,<sup>17</sup> the MENFP has begun developing low technology solutions and content including the use of interactive radio programming, cell phones <sup>[17]</sup><sup>18</sup> and television programming which need to be expanded. However, a comprehensive strategy and system is needed to ensure that these solutions are available throughout the country.
- 1.17 **Finally, a need for curricular reform** is highlighted by the fact that the curriculum has had no significant updates to any of its dimensions whether it be the programs, textbooks, or teacher training since its development in 1980. To better prepare its students to meet the challenges of the 21<sup>st</sup> century and prepare the sector to adapt to emerging technological needs and opportunities, the MENFP approved the Haitian Curriculum Orientation Framework in January 2021, which will serve as a framework for the desired curricular reform in the coming years.
- 1.18 **Education Sector Plan.** Recognizing the importance of governance and access to a quality primary education as an urgent objective, the MENFP has developed in close coordination with donors and major stakeholders, the Decennial Education Sector Plan (*plan decenal d'Enseignement Fondamental* (PDEF)) covering the period 2020-2030. The PDEF has prioritized the development of sustainable, effective systems for increasing the quality of education and ensuring and expanding access to education. The PDEF identifies three priority areas for improving primary education: (i) institutional strengthening and governance; (ii) access to teaching and learning; and (iii) quality of teaching and learning.
- 1.19 **For the recovery from the COVID-19 pandemic, the Government of Haiti (GoH) has developed a Post-COVID-19 Economic Recovery Plan (PREPOC) which highlights human capital as one of the most binding constraints to sustainable and inclusive growth.**<sup>[22]</sup><sup>19</sup> In terms of immediate response and long-term recovery, support from Haiti's partners for improvements in the quality and delivery of human development services is critical, and the government has announced that 26% of the budget available

---

<sup>16</sup> Global experiences, including data from Haiti, demonstrate a positive correlation between children's access to internet at home and GDP per capita.

<sup>17</sup> IDB Energy division internal calculations.

<sup>18</sup> 42% of people urban areas and 18% of people in rural areas.

<sup>19</sup> Government of Haiti: Post-COVID-19 Economic Recovery Plan.

for PREPOC will go towards human capital and social inclusion. Indeed, without universal acquisition of basic literacy and numeracy, and a skilled and healthy labor force, improvements in human capital is less likely to create real opportunities to improve the well-being of Haitian citizens. The GoH and its partners agree that improving the social service delivery is a key entry point to improve trust between citizens and the State while improving the living conditions and economic opportunities of existing and future generations. To this end, past administrations have moved actively towards increasing the government's role in ensuring the provision of primary education. This effort needs to be sustained.

- 1.20 **The Bank's strategy to provide better quality of and access to primary education.**<sup>20</sup> Since 2010, the IDB has approved four education investment grants (2464/GR-HA, 2643/GR-HA, 2863/GR-HA, and 3355/GR-HA), together amounting to US\$174 million ([OEL#7](#)). Despite challenges in the construction of school infrastructure, 91 schools were constructed. Moreover, tuition waivers have helped 35,000 children attend primary school annually since 2011; the SAQ has been successfully piloted in target departments in 48 schools and has effectively supported these schools in improving school quality along the SAQ indicators since 2017;<sup>21</sup> and the EMIS, school planning and key national evaluations groundwork have been established.
- 1.21 **The project is designed to continue operationalizing and scaling interventions previously financed by the Bank.** This approach ensures: (i) a continuity of financing for critical inputs which require a long-term approach to operationalize and make sustainable; (ii) a continuity of the Bank's vision in the education sector; and (iii) sustainability of previous and current financing in the sector ([OEL#7](#)). Under the proposed project, the MENFP would develop, implement, and refine replicable models for supporting public and non-public schools in providing free, quality primary education to vulnerable children. The MENFP's capacity would be strengthened to develop and implement these models, and to manage the sector more broadly. Through these models, financial and technical support would be consolidated in a limited number of public and non-public schools. By supporting the development of effective systems, the project aims to produce measurable results in terms of both ensuring access for beneficiary children and improving the learning conditions in schools, both of which are intermediate outcomes critical to the higher-level objective of increasing learning and human capital in Haiti. Given the challenges with school construction, the project will not include an infrastructure component, choosing rather to focus on activities that have shown high impact and efficient execution in Haiti.
- 1.22 **Donor Coordination.** To implement a systemic approach in Haiti, the MENFP and the donor community have agreed to coordinate interventions. Donor coordination in Haiti has greatly improved in recent years, and the following processes will continue: (i) geographic targeting between the IDB and World Bank (WB); (ii) regular informal technical discussions; and (iii) coordination to ensure a more efficient use of time and funds. Following the development and approval of the PDEF, several partners in Haiti will finance support to the sector plan. As such, the IDB will continue to work in close coordination with all donors to reduce duplication of technical assistance and financing to the MENFP ([OEL#5](#)). In fact, the design and planning of the proposed project have been closely coordinated with the WB and technical and financial partners in the education sector.

---

<sup>20</sup> Primary education in Haiti includes 2 levels of preschool and 3 cycles of basic education from 1<sup>st</sup> to 9<sup>th</sup> grade. Cycle 1: grade 1–4; Cycle 2: grade 5–6; Cycle grade 7–9. The proposed operation will work within this universe.

<sup>21</sup> Internal IDB data (CID)–Technical paper 2021.

- 1.23 **Lessons learned.** The proposed project is based on numerous well documented lessons learned from the implementation of the previous operations 2464/GR-HA, 2643/GR-HA, 2863/GR-HA,<sup>22</sup> and 3355/GR-HA, as well as best practices for programming in Fragility, Conflict and Violence([OEL#3](#)). Lessons learned include: (i) the need for one executing unit rather than multiple (taken into account in the design of the execution scheme); (ii) the advantages of using interventions that are proven to work for improving access and quality in Haiti and for efficient disbursement such as the TWP (Component 2) and the SAQ (Component 3); (iii) the need to have an agile project design that allows for flexibility in implementation regardless of socio-political or natural catastrophes; and (iv) the importance of robust monitoring and evaluation systems such as independent external verifications as well as regular monitoring and grievance redress mechanisms such as a call center. By drawing from FCV operational recommendations as well as extensive lessons learned, the project is designed to operate in a context of political instability and pandemic. Specifically, Component 1 can operate regardless of school closures or political instability and is aligned with the ten-year sector plan therefore execution is more likely to be resistant to potential institutional changes. Component 3 can operate at a basic level through remote modalities for school feeding, technical assistance and training through hybrid or distance modalities and community engagement, and data collection activities. Components 1 and 3 activities must be tackled together to support the implementation of mechanisms for stronger sector management in the medium and long term which will contribute to future resistance to shocks and the current crisis recovery. The proposed project design is aligned with the Fragility, Conflict and Violence (FCV) World Bank 2020-2025 Strategy and considers the operational recommendations for programming in FCV countries ([OEL#7](#)).<sup>[14]</sup>
- 1.24 **Strategic Alignment.** The program is consistent with the Second Update to the Institutional Strategy (UIS) 2020-2023 (AB-3190-2) and is strategically aligned with the development challenge of Social Inclusion and Equality by targeting vulnerable regions and expanding students' access to quality basic education. The program is also aligned with the cross-cutting themes of: (i) Gender Equality by promoting actions to decrease the gap between boys and girls in public primary school progression (Component 3, implementation of a gender pilot initiative); and (ii) Institutional Capacity and Rule of Law by improving the state's capabilities to provide public services with adequate supply, accessibility, and quality. The operation is consistent with the Skills Development Sector Framework Document (GN-3012-3) by (i) ensuring access to high quality and relevant learning opportunities throughout life; and (ii) strengthening quality and relevance assurance mechanisms. Additionally, the program will contribute to the Corporate Results Framework (CRF) (GN-2727-12) since it seeks to improve the following indicator: students benefited by education projects. Moreover, the operation is fully aligned with the current IDB Haiti Country Strategy 2017-2021 (GN-2904), which prioritizes improved access to quality education and institutional strengthening. The program is included in the 2021 Operational Program Report (GN-3034).
- 1.25 In addition, as indicated in paragraph 1.18, the project is aligned with the MENFPs Decennial Education Sector Plan (PDEF). The project is designed in line with the three key priorities of the PDEF, access, quality and governance and responds to the PDEFs impact indicators ([OEL#6](#)).

---

<sup>22</sup> [OEL#8](#) for 2863/GR-HA execution status summary.



## B. Objective, components, and cost

- 1.26 The objective of the project is to improve basic education attainment. The specific objectives of the project are to: (i) strengthen the MENFP's governance and increase its capacity to implement the PDEF; (ii) maintain enrollment in selected primary schools; and (iii) strengthen capacity of schools to improve the quality of education and promote gender equality.
- 1.27 **Component 1: Improving Governance of the Education System (US\$10 million).** Building upon the foundations set by previous IDB projects ([OEL#7](#)) this component<sup>23</sup> will finance consulting and technical assistance services from individuals, firms and non-governmental organizations as well as goods to support the following key governance and institutional capacity activities outlined in the PDEF, *inter alia*: (i) continuing the implementation of an integrated EMIS to enable planning and quality assurance at various levels of the system; (ii) strengthening national learning assessments by continuing the implementation of national assessments in grade 4 as well as international assessments; (iii) supporting the development of a distance education strategy including modalities for hybrid education, adapted to the Haitian context;<sup>24</sup> (iv) continuing regulatory activities in line with the accreditation strategy for non-public schools including the development of relevant tools and mechanisms; (v) support to curricular reform; (vi) continuing the growth of the SAQ by strengthening dimension, tools and formative assessments; and (vii) support to the execution of the PDEF by working with the responsible MENFP departments and units on the monitoring and implementation of the plan.
- 1.28 **Component 2: Access to non-public primary education (US\$19 million).** In response to the educational and economic crises caused by the 2019 socio-political unrest and COVID-19 pandemic, this component will finance tuition waivers (via cash transfers) to selected primary, non-public schools for a minimum of three (3) school years.<sup>25</sup> Tuition waivers will be transferred to schools on a per capita basis to cover the costs of approximately 60,000<sup>26</sup> students enrolled in the first two (2) cycles<sup>27</sup> of selected schools on the condition that schools comply with program participation criteria, including the provision of textbooks for enrolled students, not charging parents enrolment fees and compliance with fiduciary requirements. For more information on school selection and participation criteria, refer to the Project Operations Manual (POM) ([OEL#2](#)).
- 1.29 In addition to the tuition waivers, the component will finance consulting services of an external technical verification firm which will be responsible for verifying program enrolment and respect of program's participation conditions.
- 1.30 **Component 3: Quality Assurance System in public primary schools (US\$18.5 million).** The project will support the long-term vision of the MENFP in increasing the quality of education services by continuing the execution of the SAQ in public primary schools. The component will finance quality interventions to support 150 public school improvement plans within the SAQ framework. The component will finance consulting and technical assistance services from individuals, firms and non-governmental organizations, and goods.

<sup>23</sup> The term "governance" does not refer directly to the PDEF governance pillar but rather governance in the larger sense including pillars of access and quality of the PDEF.

<sup>24</sup> The distance education strategy will include modalities for hybrid education, adapted to the Haitian context.

<sup>25</sup> 2021/22, 2022/23, and 2023/24 school years.

<sup>26</sup> TWP program represents 2.5% of eligible universe.

<sup>27</sup> Grades 1-6. Non-public schools disproportionately do not have a 3<sup>rd</sup> cycle of primary.

- 1.31 Specifically, the component will finance a standardized package of quality interventions for all beneficiary primary schools as detailed in the POM. The package of services will include, *inter alia*: (i) development of annual school profiles;<sup>28</sup> (ii) acquisition and distribution of textbooks and learning materials; (iii) provision of school feeding and health interventions;<sup>29</sup> (iv) teacher and director professional training; and (v) hybrid education interventions.<sup>30</sup>
- 1.32 The component will also finance school community centered approaches through individual school improvement plans<sup>31</sup> for a pilot number of schools<sup>32</sup> which will receive interventions in addition to the standardized quality package, including *inter alia*: (i) school grants allowing the implementation of individualized school improvement plans (SIPs); (ii) technical assistance for the monitoring of individual SIPs; and (iii) technical support to the regional MENFP offices (DDE).
- 1.33 The component will include a focus on gender and diversity through (i) implementation of a gender pilot initiative to encourage regular school attendance and reduce gender related barriers through, for example, after school programming and gender-sensitive teacher training;<sup>33</sup> and (ii) a pilot initiative for more inclusive education by seeking to support children with visual impairments through, for example, access to eye-glasses.<sup>34</sup>
- 1.34 Lastly, the component will finance the monitoring and evaluation of the component activities, including *inter alia*: (i) the external technical data collection of the SAQ and technical verification of service delivery; (ii) the call center for regular monitoring and open hotline as a grievance redress mechanism;<sup>35</sup> and (iii) supervision by the Ministry DDEs.
- 1.35 **Project Monitoring and Management (US\$2.5 million).** The project will finance annual audits and project management expenses. This component would provide support to MENFP for project implementation through, *inter alia*: (i) strengthening MENFP's existing monitoring and evaluation functions; (ii) carrying out the annual financial audits; (iii) financing of operating costs; and (iv) financing project communication activities.
- 1.36 **Beneficiaries and Targeting:** The direct project beneficiaries will include current and future students attending primary public and non-public schools<sup>36</sup> supported under the project components. These students would benefit from the elimination of school fees and from improvements in the learning conditions in their schools. Additional direct beneficiaries include current and future school directors and teachers who would benefit from trainings. Other beneficiaries include MENFP staff who would benefit from institutional capacity improvement activities. The selection of schools participating in components 2 and 3 will be based on the following inclusion criteria: (i) geographically

---

<sup>28</sup> School profiles display yearly information on school performance based on the 5 dimensions of the SAQ and student learning outcomes.

<sup>29</sup> School feeding interventions will be identical to the 2863/GR-HA and 5068/GR-HA. The scale of school feeding interventions will be determined during project execution and detailed in the POM.

<sup>30</sup> Hybrid education interventions will be used to inform the development of the distance education strategy in Component 1 and will then be consisted with said strategy.

<sup>31</sup> Individualized school SIP template will be designed to facilitate the implementation of the SIP pilot, and to standardize documentation across beneficiary schools. The SIP template is expected within the first three (3) months of project eligibility and will be included into the POM.

<sup>32</sup> Pilot size will be scaled from approximately 10% to 25% of total schools throughout the life of the project.

<sup>33</sup> Girls clubs under the project would be informed by previous MENFP experiences during project execution.

<sup>34</sup> The diversity intervention would be designed during project execution.

<sup>35</sup> The call center serves as a monitoring, communication, and grievance redress tool for all project components.

<sup>36</sup> Non-public schools include for-profit and non-profit institutions. Public schools include institutions owned and operated: (i) by MENFP; (ii) cooperatively by communities with support from MENFP; and (iii) by non-public organizations that have signed agreements with MENFP and in which MENFP supplies teachers and other inputs.

located in the targeted departments (¶1.37); and (ii) adequate basic infrastructure.<sup>37</sup> Schools having previously benefitted from IDB COVID-19 operations,<sup>38</sup> as well as schools built through IDB financing ([OEL#7](#)) will be included in the intervention. In the case of Component 2,<sup>39</sup> only non-public primary schools will be eligible. Schools receiving tuition waivers funded by other actors or donors will be excluded from the intervention. Specific targeting of out of school children will be undertaken to re-attract children to schooling, as detailed in the POM. In the case of Component 3<sup>40</sup> only public primary schools will be eligible. Schools receiving holistic school support funded by other actors or donors will be excluded from the intervention.<sup>41</sup> All children in selected schools will benefit from the program.

- 1.37 The project will target six departments in Northern Haiti (Nord, Nord-Est, Nord-Ouest, Ouest, Centre and Artibonite), where the IDB is already investing heavily across the sector.<sup>42</sup> These departments are home to 23% of Haiti's preschools (2,512 of 10,836) and 28% of primary schools (4,855 of 17,036) with a total of 1,032,123 students.<sup>43</sup> These departments are where the most vulnerable populations are located. The Nord-Ouest and Nord-Est have the highest poverty (77%, 72%) and extreme poverty (57%, 52%) rates in the country,<sup>44</sup> and all target departments have poverty rates exceeding 48%.<sup>45</sup>

### C. Key results indicators

- 1.38 **Expected results.** The expected project impact indicators are: (i) proportion of students that complete 4<sup>th</sup> grade out of those that enrolled (baseline 65%); (ii) proportion of students that complete 6<sup>th</sup> grade out of those that enrolled (baseline 55%); and (iii) gender gap in proportion of students that complete 6<sup>th</sup> grade on time (baseline 30%). The expected project results are: (i) the institutionalized education management and information system (EMIS) providing timely data; (ii) the share of schools that use national evaluation data for school improvement planning; (iii) the number of students enrolled in school (including previously out of school children); (iv) the share of schools showing improvements in SAQ indicators; and (v) schools with functioning school-based management committees (SBMC). Proposed project indicators are aligned with the PDEF indicators ([OEL#6](#)).
- 1.39 **Economic Analysis.** After comparing the estimated benefits and costs of the project, the model yields a NPV of the project of USD\$54 million, with an IRR of 11.1% and a B/C ratio of 2.1 (at a discount rate of 7%).<sup>46</sup> A sensitivity analysis was also carried out and even in the most conservative scenario, the economic analysis yields a positive NPV. These results lead to the conclusion that the project is viable ([OEL#1](#)).

<sup>37</sup> Infrastructure norms are defined by the MENFP and integrated in the SAQ dimensions and indicators. These include latrines, access to WASH, and student to classroom and student to teacher ratios, etc.

<sup>38</sup> 5068/GR-HA and second COVID-19 operation.

<sup>39</sup> A baseline of preselected non-public primary schools is being conducted under the 2863/GR-HA.

<sup>40</sup> Ibid.

<sup>41</sup> The program will continue previously established methodology of working closely with other the WFP in the target departments.

<sup>42</sup> Schools in the departments of the Nippes, Grande Anse, Sud and Sud-Est will be excluded from the proposed project to avoid duplication with the World Bank. Schools in the Centre will be limited to those included in the 2863/GR-HA to avoid duplication with the Caribbean Development Bank (CDB).

<sup>43</sup> 2013 School Census Data.

<sup>44</sup> IDB calculations.

<sup>45</sup> The lowest poverty rate is in the department of the Ouest, however when data is disaggregated between the capital and the rest of the department the rates are vastly different, 44% and 63% respectively.

<sup>46</sup> A 7% discount rate is at the upper boundary of the social discount rates recommended for developing countries (López, 2008; Warusawitharana, 2014).



- 1.40 **Institutional Analysis.** The results of the institutional analysis show that the MENFP has the necessary knowledge to manage IDB projects. The selected executing unit has reached a certain level of organizational maturity as demonstrated for example in the adaptation of the team in the face of the socio-political and COVID-19 crises to deliver expected 2863/GR-HA results, which suggests that the executing unit has within it several strategic resources on which the proposed project can rely. The presence of these resources at the level of coordination, financial planning is the very basis of its performance. Nevertheless, given its current structure and human resources, it is recommended that the unit strengthen its team by adding key human resources (¶2.3 and ¶3.2), and increase its space and its use of planning technology to improve its organizational capacity.

## II. FINANCING STRUCTURE AND MAIN RISKS

### A. Financing instruments

- 2.1 The project is a specific investment operation to be financed by the IDB Grant Facility. The operation has three components and will disburse US\$50 million over a period of five years. The five-year execution period is determined as adequate based on previous experiences, as well as the project design of scaling of activities in Component 3. The project is designed to start at the onset of the 2021-2022 school year and end at the end of the 2025 – 2026 school year, thereby covering five entire school years.<sup>47</sup>

**Table 1. Summary of Program Costs (in US\$)**

Components	IDB	%
Component 1. Improving governance of the education system	10,000,000	20
EMIS	3,150,000	
Curriculum Support	1,600,000	
Distance Education Support	2,250,000	
PDEF support	2,000,000	
National Evaluations and learning assessments	1,000,000	
Component 2. Access to non-public primary education	19,000,000	38
Tuition Waiver Program (TWP)	18,400,000	
TWP verification	600,000	
Component 3. Quality assurance system in public primary schools	18,500,000	37
Quality service delivery package	10,400,000	
Technical support NGOs	4,350,000	
Improvement Plan	1,430,000	
Data collection and call center	2,320,000	
Project monitoring and management	2,500,000	5
Executing unit costs	1,980,000	
Midterm and end-term evaluation and audit	440,000	
Contingency	80,000	
<b>Total</b>	<b>50,000,000</b>	<b>100</b>

<sup>47</sup> School infrastructure works which were previous causes of delays in project execution have been excluded from this project.

**Table 2: Yearly Disbursements (US\$)**

Source	2021	2022	2023	2024	2025	2026	Total
IDB	10,920,000	13,400,000	11,360,000	7,075,000	4,455,000	2,790,000	50,000,000
% per year	22	27	22	14	9	6	100

**B. Environmental and social safeguard risks**

2.2 According to the IDB's Environment and Safeguards Compliance Policy (OP-703), the project's net social impact is expected to be positive, as communities will benefit from increased access to quality education. The Project is classified as a Category "C", given that there are no potential negative environmental, social and health and safety (ESHS) impacts. The project will exclude category B investments. As part of the preparation a framework Environmental and Social Management Plan (ESMP) is being developed for the non-structural works to be financed through the school improvement grants under Component 3 to ensure the contractors follow basic environmental and social guidelines such as waste management, and COVID-19 guidelines. The project has not identified significant social and environmental risks, however, should unexpected conditions arise the executing unit will revise and update the ESMP to address the situation. The ESMP for the potential works within the SIPs will be included in the POM. UCP will be responsible for supervising compliance with the ESMP by beneficiary schools and will hire a part time safeguarding consultant to support in this supervision. A communication and grievance redress mechanism is planned by the project in the form of a call center and hotline which the executing unit is responsible for monitoring and addressing concerns.<sup>48</sup> The mechanism is resistant to potential insecurity or COVID-19 shocks as it will be managed and executed remotely.

**C. Fiduciary risk**

2.3 Based on the results of the recent institutional analysis of the UCP-MENFP, the project has a medium fiduciary risk. The main risks identified are: (i) Weakness in the procurement planning process, which leads to delays in the execution of the processes; and the implementation of the new procurement policies (medium low risk); (ii) heavy procurement workload resulting from the new operation and lack of delegation on technical procurement inputs from UCP leadership due to insufficient procurement staff (medium low risk); and (iii) delays and bottlenecks due to administrative and financial management workload and internal control weakness (medium low risk). The proposed mitigation measures for the program are: (i) increase the financial management and procurement staff by hiring a junior financial management specialist and procurement specialist and train them on Bank policies and requirements; (ii) at least two training sessions will be conducted to help the UCP-MENFP and UPM-MENFP master the new policies; and (iii) strengthen the internal control functions of the unit by hiring an internal controller.

<sup>48</sup> The UCP M&E specialist is responsible for managing the call center and hotline information.

## D. Other risks and key issues

- 2.4 The proposed project has identified the following medium high and high risks and response plan measures ([Appendix I](#)). First, if socio-political instability persists, temporary school closures may occur, and activities planned specifically under Components 2 and 3 may experience delays (political, medium-high). To mitigate this risk the project would pivot to remote implementation arrangements, and the use of an established call center for remote/distance data gathering. Additionally, if there is not a strong coordination between different MENFP departments and regional offices, implementation of activities of Component 1 will be delayed and the project will experience delays in the completion of Component 1 activities (planning, medium- high). To mitigate this risk, the project would engage the MENFP departments more closely by having them provide feedback or validate specific outputs when necessary. If there is a depreciation in the value of the Gourde the budget available for interventions will not be sufficient and activities will not be completed, and project results may not be achieved (economic, high risk). To mitigate this risk the project would renegotiate contracts and downsize the package of interventions, as necessary. If the external tuition waiver verification firm cannot collect yearly data in time, the number of beneficiaries for the TWP cannot be verified and delays in the advance of funds for the next school year may occur (planning, medium-high). To mitigate this risk, the project would map difficult access areas and ask the Call Center to cross-check the information provided by the external verification. Lastly, if there is incorrect data on selected tuition waiver schools, and schools receive unjustified amounts of waiver grants, then fewer students may benefit from the program than planned (planning, medium-high). To mitigate this risk, an additional technical verification and/or financial audit may be planned to accompany the at-risk schools more closely.
- 2.5 **Sustainability.** The alignment of the project with the PDEF key priorities and ten-year commitments ensure that actions taken under the project will contribute to the longer-term vision of the MENFP (¶1.25). Technical assistance provided to the SAQ will put in place mechanisms for stronger sector management in the medium and long term. The proposed project will continue to finance holistic quality education packages to provide access to quality primary schools through the SAQ. While sustainable access options continue to be developed through Components 1 and 3, many students require external financing to ensure their access to primary education. In response to the post COVID-19 economic emergency, the project will finance tuition waivers for all students in the first two cycles of selected non-public primary schools for three (3) full school years. Active policy dialogue on sector financing and options for long-term solutions to the lack of access will continue, but in the interim the continuation of support to tuition waivers and to access in vulnerable communities remain important commitments under the short-term emergency support of Component 2. To ensure a continuity of services and sustainability of IDB financed interventions in schools and communities, the proposed project will: (i) integrate public primary schools built with Bank funds into the project; (ii) integrate schools benefiting from the 5063/GR-HA and 2863/GR-HA school feeding interventions into the project; and (iii) continue using the systems and tools developed and piloted in previous operations. Gender and diversity activities piloted under Component 3 of the project will serve to inform future interventions in the SAQ.

### III. IMPLEMENTATION AND MANAGEMENT PLAN

#### A. Summary of implementation arrangements

- 3.1 The beneficiary is the Republic of Haiti and the executing agency will be the MENFP, the Ministry in charge of all levels of education in Haiti. The *Unité de Coordination de Projet* (UCP) is embedded within MENFP's existing structures and would be responsible for implementing the Project. The UCP will be responsible for the management and execution of all project components and will coordinate with MENFP technical directors and technical teams. The UCP is led by a Project Coordinator located within the MENFP Director General's office and has all key staff including the financial management specialist, chief of operations, a junior monitoring and evaluation specialist as well as technical and administrative staff on-board. Regarding procurement, UCP works with the *Unité de Passation des marchés* (UPM) which is responsible for project procurements and is fully staffed. The Coordinator will regularly communicate with the Director General and ensure that Project activities are aligned and well-integrated with related Ministry activities and PDEF.
- 3.2 In line with the recommendations of the institutional analysis, additional staff will be brought on board to complement the existing team, notably a monitoring and evaluation specialist, a procurement specialist to serve as a focal point between UCP and UPM and to support the technical team of UCP with planning and preparing technical activities in line with procurement guidelines, a junior financial management specialist, an internal controller, and various external consultants.<sup>49</sup> External consultants will be contracted for the various technical directorates / line units of the MENFP supporting the Project at the central level, and for the various departmental offices (DDE) supported under the Project,<sup>50</sup> to work with departmental MENFP staff and coordinate implementation at the local level. The roles of MENFP staff and external consultants will be clearly defined in the POM. Each consultant will report to the Project Coordinator and maintain active communication with his or her respective Technical Department/ Unit and DDE. These executing arrangements will build knowledge and experience among MENFP's staff and lay the groundwork for eventual scale-up of the models developed and implemented under Components 2 and 3 of the Project to other regions.
- 3.3 UCP will be responsible for the implementation and operationalization of all project components as outlined in the POM. Regarding Component 1, UCP will: (i) work directly with responsible ministerial departments; and when necessary (ii) contract individuals or firms for specialized support and procurement of goods. In Component 2, UCP will be responsible for transferring the tuition waivers to schools and hiring the external verification firm. Regarding Component 3, UCP will rely on both the MENFP existing structures and public private partnerships with specialized operators as needed for the implementation of technical assistance activities as outlined in the POM (see [OEL#9](#) for project implementation scheme).
- 3.4 UCP staff will be hired on *protocole d'accords* from the MENFP and in the case of consultants, on contracts, with clearly defined responsibilities and expected outputs, to keep the focus on results rather than on processes. Consultants working for technical units/ departments would be based in Port au Prince and would be co-located with their

---

<sup>49</sup> The project will not finance salaries for MENFP staff outside of the executing unit.

<sup>50</sup> Supported DDEs are those of the target departments (¶1.36).

units whenever feasible. The physical location of the UCP staff is important to their ability to engage with and support MENFP staff. Consultants working for regional offices would be based in each region with periodic visits to Port-au-Prince for Project reporting and coordination.

- 3.5 **As special conditions prior to the first disbursement, the Beneficiary, through the Executing Agency, shall provide evidence of: (i) the approval and entry into effect of the Program Operating Manual (POM) ([OEL#2](#)) according to the terms and conditions previously agreed with the Bank; and (ii) the approval of the terms of reference in connection with the UCP procurement specialist, an additional junior financial management specialist, and an additional monitoring and evaluation specialist.** These conditions are determined based on the institutional analysis and fiduciary recommendations and are essential given that project execution will begin immediately after project effectiveness in order to be operational for the 2021/22 school year. The first disbursement conditions ensure that the executing unit is prepared for beginning the execution of key activities with a detailed guide and key staff immediately following first disbursement. The POM includes: (i) the project management organigramme; (ii) the technical directives for execution of Components 1, 2 and 3; (iii) the UCP supervision plan; and (iv) the environmental and social safeguarding procedures as relevant.
- 3.6 **Procurement.** Procurement of works, goods, and services, as well as contracts for consulting services will be executed in accordance with the Bank's procurement policies, rules, and procedures (GN-2349-15 and GN-2350-15). There will be no exception to Bank rules.
- 3.7 **Single Source Selection.** Single Source Selection is proposed for the implementation of key project areas, as follows:<sup>51</sup>
- 3.7.1 The United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) will be responsible for the technical assistance support to curricular reform under Component 1. The International Bureau of Education (IBE) is the UNESCO global center of excellence in curriculum matters. The mission of the IBE is to support and promote innovative solutions to the problems facing ministries of education and governments in their complex work of improving equity, quality, relevance, and efficiency. UNESCO will be hired under GN-2349-15 clause 3.10. Specialized agencies can be contracted through single-source selection if they fulfill the criteria set forth in paragraph 3.10 of the aforementioned policies. The rationale for this method of selection is based on the general interests of the client and the project. It is also based on the Bank's obligation to ensure that the basic procurement principles are met and that equal opportunities are offered to all qualified consultants, and when only one agency is qualified or has experience of exceptional worth for the assignment.
- 3.7.2 The United Nations Office for Project Services (UNOPS) will be responsible for Component 2 TWP external verification and Component 3 SAQ data collection and technical verification. Since 2019, UNOPS has been contracted by the MENFP to support the SAQ data collection, in line with MENFP requirements and aligned with the EMIS system. Given UNOPS experience with the same terms of references and

---

<sup>51</sup> The paragraph presents single source selection greater than US\$750,000. Please refer to [REL#3](#) for SSS less than US\$750,000.

responsibilities, UNOPS will be hired under GN-2349-15 clause 3.10. Specialized agencies can be contracted through single-source selection if they fulfill the criteria set forth in paragraph 3.10 of the aforementioned policies. The rationale for this method of selection is based on the general interests of the client and the project. It is also based on the Bank's obligation to ensure that the basic procurement principles are met and that equal opportunities are offered to all qualified consultants, and when only one firm is qualified or has experience of exceptional worth for the assignment.

- 3.7.3 The *Bureau de Nutrition et de Développement* (BND) will be responsible for school feeding activities under Component 3. The BND was contracted by the IDB most recently in the 2863/GR-HA and 5068/GR-HA and is committed to providing school feeding to the schools and following an approach aimed at guaranteeing sustainable development in the areas served by the Project. In order to benefit from this same approach, from this highly satisfactory performance and from this expertise the Project deems it appropriate to contract BND under the GN-2349-15 clause 3.7 (a). The rationale for this method of selection is based on the general interests of the client and the project and is because opening a new competitive selection process would not have a competitive or financial advantage.
- 3.7.4 Textbook publishing houses of Maison Deschamps, ZEMES, C3, KOPIVIT and CEEC (*Commission Episcopale pour l'Education Catholique*) will be contracted under GN-2349-15, clause 3.7 (c) for Component 3. The rationale for this method is that the publishing houses have exclusive rights to the textbooks, and indeed, the textbooks that will be purchased by the Project are distributed by publishers that are the main seller of the titles therefore any buyer would have to go through these publishers to buy these manuals.
- 3.8 **Project Financial Management.** Project financial management will be executed according to OP-273-12. UCP will open separate bank accounts for the management of the grant provided under this operation. UCP will maintain proper financial management systems and will prepare and Annual Operation Plan, a procurement plan ([REL#3](#)) and a twelve-month detailed financial plan indicating cash flow needs for the project execution and serving as the basis for advance of funds disbursements. Advances of funds for the execution of components 1, 3 and 4 will be for the equivalent of funding needs required for up to six months for UCP. Advances of funds for component 2 will be made based on subsidies approved for up to each scholar year. Refer to Annex III.
- 3.9 **Tuition Waiver Program will be executed as in the previous operations.** Payments will be based on established procedures for providing funding for the tuition program (See Annex III and [OEL#3](#)). Advances will be made for the tuition waivers agreed for up to the school year. During the first year of execution the Bank will advance 60% and once that advance of funds has been justified the advance of the second 40% will be made; in successive years depending on the performance of the project and at the Bank's discretion the percentage of the advance may be increased. Disbursement of the first 60% will be subject to the receipt of the signed contracts and approved list of beneficiary schools. Payment of the following 40% will be subject to the receipt of the technical verification firm report and justification of the first disbursement as required by established procedures. SBMCs which will have complied with established procedures will receive the second payment.

- 3.10 **Financial Audits.** The MENFP through UCP will be responsible for contracting an external auditor eligible to the Bank to perform the financial audit of the program according to the Bank procedures and to be submitted within 120 days of the end of each fiscal year, and a final financial audit to be submitted within 120 days after the last disbursement date. Additionally, for Component 2, an independent audit of the use of funds for schools financed by the Bank) and will be performed based on agreed upon procedures and will be submitted to the Bank within 90 days following the disbursement of the full payment of the tuition waivers agreed to for the school year.

**B. Summary of arrangements for monitoring results**

- 3.11 A comprehensive set of monitoring and capacity building activities has been integrated into project design and funds have been budgeted accordingly. The individual evaluation frameworks are described in the M&E plan ([REL#2](#)) and include, *inter alia*: (i) the external verification of the TWP; (ii) a mid-term evaluation; (iii) a final evaluation; (iv) a call center and hotline for the continuous monitoring of Component 3 activities; and (v) the annual data collection of the SAQ in Component 3.
- 3.12 The MENFP has increased its data collection activities in recent years, but continues to face fractured, outdated, and incomplete information systems. Data collection and processing approaches affect the reliability and timeliness of the information, limiting its usefulness. Several major databases, including the school registration database and the tuition waiver database, are independently managed by different units within MENFP and are not linked. As described under Component 1, the project will provide support to establishing a unified management information system that builds on existing initiatives in coordination with other development partners.
- 3.13 Building on the monitoring and evaluation arrangements developed under the 2863/GR-HA, UCP will present to MENFP and the Bank biannual progress reports on the indicators included in the results framework. In terms of monitoring project results, the Monitoring & Evaluation Specialist within the UCP will be responsible for coordinating closely with other members of the UCP and MENFP staff working on strengthening the management information system of the Ministry, to leverage existing data and to provide technical support to their efforts.
- 3.14 Strategic use of data at all levels is critical for improving MENFP's institutional capacity, ensuring effective implementation of all project activities, and strengthening implementation support from the Bank. Integral to the support provided under Component 1 is the enabling of MENFP staff, particularly at the local level, to use existing data, including the national school census and school mapping, to inform their work. Newly collected data under the Project will be linked to existing data in support of the EMIS. The Project will leverage information and communication technology (ICT) to collect new types of data to monitor Project activities. As part of monitoring and evaluation, periodic phone surveys of key stakeholders (including school directors, teachers, parents, and potentially some older students) in schools and communities served by the Project will provide a relatively low-cost and direct tool to gauge progress on key activities, and to identify and address challenges early.



Development Effectiveness Matrix		
Summary		HA-L1102
I. Corporate and Country Priorities		
Section 1. IDB Group Strategic Priorities and CRF Indicators		
Development Challenges & Cross-cutting Issues	-Social Inclusion and Equality -Gender Equality and Diversity -Institutional Capacity and the Rule of Law	
CRF Level 2 Indicators: IDB Group Contributions to Development Results	-Students benefited by education projects (#)	
2. Country Development Objectives		
Country Strategy Results Matrix	GN-2904	Enhance access and quality of education
Country Program Results Matrix	GN-3034	The intervention is included in the 2021 Operational Program.
Relevance of this project to country development challenges (If not aligned to country strategy or country program)		
II. Development Outcomes - Evaluability		Evaluable
3. Evidence-based Assessment & Solution		9.5
3.1 Program Diagnosis		2.5
3.2 Proposed Interventions or Solutions		3.2
3.3 Results Matrix Quality		3.8
4. Ex ante Economic Analysis		9.0
4.1 Program has an ERR/NPV, or key outcomes identified for CEA		1.5
4.2 Identified and Quantified Benefits and Costs		3.0
4.3 Reasonable Assumptions		2.5
4.4 Sensitivity Analysis		2.0
4.5 Consistency with results matrix		0.0
5. Monitoring and Evaluation		8.3
5.1 Monitoring Mechanisms		4.0
5.2 Evaluation Plan		4.3
III. Risks & Mitigation Monitoring Matrix		
Overall risks rate = magnitude of risks*likelihood		Medium High
Environmental & social risk classification		C
IV. IDB's Role - Additionality		
The project relies on the use of country systems		
Fiduciary (VPC/FMP Criteria)		
Non-Fiduciary		
The IDB's involvement promotes additional improvements of the intended beneficiaries and/or public sector entity in the following dimensions:		
Additional (to project preparation) technical assistance was provided to the public sector entity prior to approval to increase the likelihood of success of the project	Yes	The FMP Bank team has been working with the public sector entity most recently in the 2863/GR-HA and 3355/GR-HA by providing technical fiduciary assistance and training to increase likelihood of project success

**Evaluability Assessment Note:**

The main goal of the operation is to contribute to improve basic education attainment. The proposal diagnoses 55 percent of students that enroll in elementary school complete 6th grade and a gender gap of 30 percent in 6th grade completion on time (School Census Data 2015-2016). To achieve this end, the proposal proposes to work in three areas. The first area aims to to strengthen the MENFPs governance and increase its capacity to implement the PDEF. The Education Information Management System (EMIS) faces management challenges within the Ministry and limits its use by schools (Cassidi, 2016). The second area aims to maintain enrollment in selected primary schools. The COVID-19 pandemic along with social unrest associated to the Peyi-Lok have led to school closures in 2019 and 2020, which specially impacted vulnerable households. Forty two percent of the population faced acute food insecurity (ENUSAN, 2019), which added to the fact that 80 percent of schools are non-public (IDB forthcoming) have led to 50 percent of children enrolled in the 2020-2021 school year (UNICEF 2021). The third area aims to strengthen the capacity of schools to improve quality and promote gender equality. The government developed a Quality Assurance System (SAQ) to regulate the quality of supply, specially in non-public schools. However, the instruments have not been standardized and schools lack the regulation to guide improvement plans. Schools lack the mechanisms to address gender barriers to school attendance.

The cost benefit analysis estimates a net present value of US\$53 million and an internal rate of return of 11%. Benefits are quantified by market labor premiums to additional attainment (Heidelk, 2019). Benefits also derive from savings by a reduction in repetition rates. These benefits are not consistent with baseline and target values for key results indicators in the results matrix. The costs are those of the project. The discount rate used is 7 percent.

Monitoring relies on reports by the Project Coordination Unit, who will rely on external firms to collect data, and publications on the Ministry's website. Targets are not supported by evidence. The ex post evaluation plan relies on a before-after comparison, which is not appropriate to determine attribution.

The project identifies eleven risks out of which one is classified as high and two as medium high. The risks classified as high include a depreciation of the budget to complete activities. The risks classified as medium high include delays due potential socio-political instability and weak achievement of results due an inefficient use of funds.



## Annex II. Results Matrix

<b>Project Objective</b>	The specific objectives of the project are to: (i) strengthen the MENFPs governance and increase its capacity to implement the PDEF; (ii) maintain enrollment in selected primary schools; and (iii) strengthen capacity of schools to improve quality and promote gender equality. The achievement of these objectives will contribute to the general objective to improve basic education attainment.
--------------------------	---

### General Development Objective

Indicators	Unit of measurement	Baseline value	Baseline year	Expected year for achievement	Target	Means of verification	Comments
	General development objective: Improve basic education attainment.						
Proportion of students that complete 4 <sup>th</sup> grade out of those that enrolled.	[Students]/ [Students]-(%)	65%	2016	2026	70%	Annual External verification firm data; UCP.	4 <sup>th</sup> grade is equivalent to 4AF (end of cycle 1).
Proportion of students that complete 6 <sup>th</sup> grade out of those that enrolled.	[Students]/ [Students]-(%)	55%	2016	2026	60%	Annual External verification firm data; UCP.	6 <sup>th</sup> grade is equivalent to 6AF (end of cycle 2).
Gender gap in proportion of students that complete 6 <sup>th</sup> grade on time.	(Male Students/ Male Students) - (Female Students/ Female Students)	30%	2021	2026	25%	Annual External verification firm data; UCP.	The gap will be measured in schools benefitting from the gender pilot.

## Specific Development Objectives

Indicators	Unit of measurement	Baseline value	Baseline year	Year 0 (2021)	Year 1 (2022)	Year 2 (2023)	Year 3 (2024)	Year 4 (2025)	Year 5 (2026)	End of Project	Means of verification	Comments
Specific development objective 1: Strengthen the MENFPs governance and increase its capacity to implement the PDEF.												
Institutionalized Education management and information system (EMIS) providing timely data.	[Report]	0	2021	0	0	0	1	1	1	1	UCP bi-annual monitoring report.	Timely data is defined as data which is derived from the EMIS when the UCP requires it to inform, at least, its monitoring reports.
Percentage of schools that use national evaluation data for school improvement planning.	[Schools]/[Schools]	0	2021	0	0	20	30	40	50	50	School improvement plans; UCP.	
Specific development objective 2: Maintain enrollment in selected primary schools.												
Grade 1 to 6 students enrolling in schools.	[Students]	60,000	2021	60,000	51,000	42,000	0	0	0	60,000	Annual External verification report; UCP semi-annual reports.	CRF indicator. Indicator to be disaggregated by gender and out of school children.  Baseline information on gender disaggregation will be collected in Q2 2021. See PME  Y0 corresponds to students grades 1 – 6 joining the

Indicators	Unit of measurement	Baseline value	Baseline year	Year 0 (2021)	Year 1 (2022)	Year 2 (2023)	Year 3 (2024)	Year 4 (2025)	Year 5 (2026)	End of Project	Means of verification	Comments
												<p>program. Y1 and 2 correspond to following the initially enrolled cohort.</p> <p>Intervention is only active in Y0, Y1 and Y2 of the program.</p>
Specific development objective 3: Strengthen capacity of schools to improve quality and promote gender equality.												
Percentage of beneficiary schools with an increase in at least one of the five quality dimensions.	[Schools]/[Schools]	0	2021	0	30	50	60	80	80	80	Data from annual external report; UCP.	The school quality dimensions are defined by the QAS instruments. See PME.
Percentage of schools with improvement reports approved.	[Schools]/[school]	0	2021	0	0	0	10	15	20	20	Approval reports; UCP.	Approval for improvement reports demands development and implementation of school plans.
Schools with functioning school-based management committees (SBMC).	[Schools]	0	2021	0	40	50	100	150	150	150	External annual SAQ report; UCP.	See PME for definition of SBMC.
Schools with functioning gender pilot.	[schools]	0	2021	0	0	5	5	10	10	10	Bi-annual report; UCP.	Pro-gender flag indicator.

## Outputs

Indicators	Unit of measurement	Baseline value	Baseline year	Year 0 (2021)	Year 1 (2022)	Year 2 (2023)	Year 3 (2024)	Year 4 (2025)	Year 5 (2026)	End of Project	Means of verification	Comments
Component 1. Improving Governance of the Education System												
Annual Education Statistics Reports published.	[Report]	0	2021	0	0	1	1	1	0	3	MENFP Website; MENFP.	The report and associated data must be published by August of the corresponding year.
Unique student identification codes assigned as percentage of the student population.	[Codes]/ [students]	0	2021	0	10	30	50	70	80	80	EMIS data reported by UCP	Cumulative targets.
Departmental school maps published.	[Maps]	0	2021	0	0	3	4	5	6	6	MENFP website; MENFP.	Cumulative targets. Project target departments
Documents for the curriculum technical assistance validated.	[Document]	0	2021	0	1	0	1	0	1	3	Validation report, UCP.	
Document for the national evaluation report published.	[Document]	0	2021	0	0	1	0	1	0	2	MENFP website, MENFP.	Target schools: national representative sample.  The report publication demands the national assessment is effectively

Indicators	Unit of measurement	Baseline value	Baseline year	Year 0 (2021)	Year 1 (2022)	Year 2 (2023)	Year 3 (2024)	Year 4 (2025)	Year 5 (2026)	End of Project	Means of verification	Comments
												implemented and is data analyzed.
Documents from the technical assistance provided on distance education are validated.	[Document]	0	2021	0	1	1	1	1	1	5	UCP bi-annual progress reports.	The report submitted by UCP will include details on the progress of distance education activities.
Documents for PDEF execution validated	[Document]	0	2021	0	1	1	1	1	1	5	UCP bi-annual progress reports.	The report submitted by UCP will include details on the progress PDEF implementation and execution activities.
Component 2. Access to non-public primary education.												
Tuition waivers distributed.	[Tuition waivers]	60,000	2021	60,000	41,000	32,000	0	0	0	133,000	External verification of delivery report; UCP.	One waiver represents a tuition subsidy for one student per year.  See PME.
Milestone: percent of tuition waivers distributed to 4 <sup>th</sup> grade students.	[Tuition waivers to 4 <sup>th</sup> grade] / [all tuition waivers]	16%	2016	14%	14%	14%	0	0	0	14%	External verification of delivery report; UCP.	One waiver represents a tuition subsidy for one student per year.  Baseline information from 2015/16 school census. Targets have been adjusted to be realistic.  See PME.

Indicators	Unit of measurement	Baseline value	Baseline year	Year 0 (2021)	Year 1 (2022)	Year 2 (2023)	Year 3 (2024)	Year 4 (2025)	Year 5 (2026)	End of Project	Means of verification	Comments
Milestone: percent of tuition waivers distributed to 6 <sup>th</sup> grade students.	[Tuition waivers to 6 <sup>th</sup> grade] / [all tuition waivers] [Tuition waivers]	11%	2016	9%	9%	9%	0	0	0	9%	External verification of delivery report; UCP.	One waiver represents a tuition subsidy for one student per year.  Baseline information from 2015/16 school census. Targets have been adjusted to be realistic.  See PME.
Tuition waivers distributed to previously out of school children.	[Tuition waivers]	0	2021	0	10,000	10,000	0	0	0	20,000	External verification of delivery report; UCP.	One waiver represents a tuition subsidy for one student per year.  See PME for definition.
Component 3 – Quality Assurance System in primary public schools												
Students with quality assurance system package delivered.	[Students]	13,000	2021	25,000	25,000	25,000	40,000	40,000	0	40,000	External annual SAQ report; UCP.	The SAQ package consists of textbooks learning materials sufficient to endow one school per school year; school feeding and health <sup>1</sup> ; and a school profile See PME.

<sup>1</sup> Determined on a school-by-school basis during execution. See POD.

Indicators	Unit of measurement	Baseline value	Baseline year	Year 0 (2021)	Year 1 (2022)	Year 2 (2023)	Year 3 (2024)	Year 4 (2025)	Year 5 (2026)	End of Project	Means of verification	Comments
Primary school directors trained.	[Directors]	0	2021	0	40	50	100	150	150	150	Semester training reports; UCP.	The training modules have the goal of building leadership and management capacity.
Schools implementing pilot to foster regular school attendance of girls.	[Schools]	0	2021	0	0	5	5	10	10	10	Bi-annual report; UCP.	Pro-gender flag indicator.

Country: Haiti

Division: EDU

Operation No.: HA-L1102

Year:2021

### Fiduciary Agreements and Requirements

**Executing Agency (EA):** Ministère de l'Education Nationale et de la Formation Professionnelle (MENFP) - Unité de Coordination de Projet (UCP)

**Operation Name:** SUPPORT TO THE HAITI EDUCATION SECTOR PLAN (SHESP)

#### I. Fiduciary Context of Executing Agency

1. Use of country system in the operation (Any system or subsystem that is subsequently approved may be applicable to the operation, in accordance with the terms of the Bank's validation).

<input type="checkbox"/> Budget	<input type="checkbox"/> Reports	<input type="checkbox"/> Information System	<input type="checkbox"/> National Competitive Bidding (NCB)
<input type="checkbox"/> Treasury	<input type="checkbox"/> Internal audit	<input type="checkbox"/> Shopping	<input type="checkbox"/> Others
<input type="checkbox"/> Accounting	<input type="checkbox"/> External Control	<input type="checkbox"/> Individual Consultants	<input type="checkbox"/> Others

#### 2. Fiduciary execution mechanism

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Particularities of the fiduciary execution	<p>Component 2, Access to non-public primary education (38% of the project), will finance tuition waivers to primary non-public schools. The Bank will disburse based on the needs for up to the scholar year and the technical verification firm expenses; therefore, the justification process takes up to the end of each scholar year. During the first year of execution the Bank will advance 60% and once that advance of funds has been justified the advance of the second 40% will be made; in successive years depending on the performance of the project and at the Bank's discretion the percentage of the advance may be increased.</p> <p>Tuition waivers will be transferred twice by the Executing Agency to the approved list of schools for each scholar year in 60% at the beginning of the scholar year and 40% at the end and upon reception of the needed technical verification (this document must be approved by the Bank before the disbursement of the following 40% by UCP).</p> <p>To avoid blockages in the components 1,3 and project management and evaluation, and to ensure an efficient fiduciary supervision of the whole operation, this component will be managed separately from components 1,3 and project management and evaluation.</p>
-------------------------------------	--	---

#### 3. Fiduciary Capacity

Fiduciary Capacity of the EA	<p>An evaluation of the National Procurement System (NPS) was carried out in 2013, applying OECD/DAC methodology. An action plan to address weaknesses identified and to improve the NPS is still pending implementation. In consideration of, at the present time, no national system will be used. Instead, the Bank's procurement policies will regulate the activities of the procurement under the program.</p> <p>Ministère de l'Education Nationale et de la Formation Professionnelle (MENFP) - Unité de Coordination de Projet (UCP) will be responsible for the implementation of the program. The latest assessment of UCP-MENFP's institutional capacity performed during the last quarter of 2020 determined that</p>
------------------------------	--



	the level of development of its financial, procurement management systems and internal control processes present medium risk.
--	---

#### 4. Fiduciary risks and risk response

Area (Financial Management / Procurement)	Risk	Risk level	Risk response
Procurement	Weakness in: (i) the procurement planning process, which leads to delays in the execution of the processes; and (ii) implementation of the New Procurement Policies	Medium Low	(i) A new PEC consultant has just been recruited by the Bank. With the support of the Bank's PM team, she will assist the Procurement Unit (UPM) in the implementation of improved a planning; and (ii) at least two training sessions will be conducted to help the UCP-MENFP and UPM-MENFP master the new policies.
Procurement	Heavy procurement workload resulting from the new operation may negatively impact procurement activities and lack of delegation on technical procurement inputs from UCP leadership due to insufficient procurement staff.	Medium Low	Recruitment of a procurement specialist, who will be trained in Bank's rules and procedures, to consolidate the structure and support coordination between UCP technical inputs and UPM procurement responsibilities, as reflected in the POM.
Financial Management	Delays and bottlenecks due to administrative and financial management workload and internal control weakness	Medium Low	Hiring of a junior financial management specialist, a junior accountant, and an internal controller.

#### 5. Policies and Guides applicable to operation:

Financial Management of the project will be in accordance with the Financial Management Guidelines for IDB-Financed Projects (OP-273-12).

Procurement activities under the Project will be undertaken in accordance with the Procurement Policies for Goods, Works, and non-consulting: GN-2349-15 or future revised version; and the Policies for Selecting and contracting Firms Bank-Financed:GN-2350-15 or future revised version.

#### 6. Exceptions to Policies and Rules: Not identified

### **II. Aspects to be considered in the Special Conditions of the Loan Agreement**

Prior to the first disbursement for component 2, the Beneficiary, through the Executing Agency, shall provide evidence to the satisfaction of the Bank of the approval of terms of references in connection to the tuition waiver program external technical verification.
The exchange rate valid at the day of transactions will be used to record all expenses made in local currency. The Central Bank of Haiti exchange rate will be used as the reference rate.
Financial Audit Reports will be submitted within 120 days of the end of each fiscal year, and a final financial audit to be submitted within 120 days after the last disbursement date. Additionally, for Component 2, an independent audit of the use of funds for schools financed by the Bank) and will be performed based on agreed

upon procedures and will be submitted to the Bank within 90 days following the disbursement of the full payment of the tuition waivers agreed to for the school year.
The Beneficiary, through the Executing Agency, shall open separated bank accounts at the Central Bank of Haiti for the management of grant resources for components 1, 3 and project management and evaluation and one different for component 2.

### III. Agreements and Requirements for Procurement Execution

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Bidding Documents	For procurement of Works, Goods and Services Different of Consulting executed in accordance with the Procurement Policies (document GN-2349-15), subject to ICB, the Bank's Standard Bidding Documents (SBDs) or those agreed between EA and the Bank will be used for the particular procurement. Likewise, the selection and contracting of Consulting Services will be carried out in accordance with the Policies for the Selection and Contracting of Consultants (document GN-2350-15) and the Standard Request for Proposals (SRP) issued by the Bank or agreed between the EA and the Bank will be used for the particular selection. The revision of the technical specifications, as well as the terms of reference of the procurements during the preparation of selection processes, is the responsibility of the sectorial specialist of the project. This technical review can be ex-ante and is independent of the procurement review method.
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Alternative Procurement Arrangements	In compliance with policy GN-2350-15; Clauses 3.10, two international specialized agencies: UNOPS, and UNESCO will be contracted by direct agreement under this program. The Policies, particularly those relating to prohibited practices and the bank's sanctions procedures, may be applied.
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Direct Contracting and Single Source Selection	<p>The following direct contracting's and single source selections have been identified:</p> <p><b>I- Bureau Nutrition et Développement (BND)</b></p> <p>Amount: USD 3,150,000</p> <p>GN-2349-15 Clause 3.7 (a)</p> <p>The clause is in compliance with Bank policy for the following reasons:</p> <p>1)The school canteen program in Haiti is a critical service and a market with a high level of complexity where the range of competitors is quite limited. The management of school canteen services requires proven expertise that BND has extensively, taking into account its effectiveness in previous contracts.</p> <p>This performance is reflected in:</p> <p>a) Compliance with contractual clauses relating to the quality and quantity of food rations indicated in the contracts. The reports submitted by FONHEP as part of this service show that BND respects contractual timelines, this is a significant factor in the management of school canteens. Since nutrition and food are crucial to every child in this program, the food must arrive in the school's place on time, regardless of the existing constraints. In this sense, BND has achieved a high level of goals.</p> <p>b) Effective management of its relations with schools and its knowledge of the field. The departments targeted for this school canteen service are mostly difficult to access and cannot be reached during difficult times without perfect control of the region.</p> <p><b>II- Four (4) textbook publishing houses:</b></p> <p>Maison Henry Deschamps S.A C3 Editions; Editions Zémès; Kopivit l'Action Sociale.</p>

		<p>Amount: USD 4,000,000.00</p> <p>GN 2349-15, Clause 3.7 (c)</p> <p>Justification:</p> <p>These textbooks meet the requirements of the Ministry of National Education. They will be purchased with the objective of standardizing the textbooks already available in the PAPDEF schools of the above ACEQH project (2863/GR-HA) in the targeted departments.</p> <p>A new competitive bidding process would not bring any advantage to the Project. Indeed, since the implementation of the ACEQH Project, these textbooks are purchased by the Project to the satisfaction of the MENFP.</p> <p><b>III- UNOPS</b></p> <p>Amount: USD 2,640,000.00</p> <p>GN-2349-15, Clause 3.10</p> <p>This United Nations agency has exceptional qualifications to provide technical assistance, training, and support to consulting or technical services in the education sector. For the years 2019-2020 and 2020 - 2021, the MENFP has worked with UNOPS on an identical mission and services to the one required under the PAPDEF, highly satisfactory performance was provided. In order to benefit from this same approach and expertise, the MENFP has deemed it appropriate to contract the Consultant without competitive bidding, as a new process will not bring any added value.</p> <p><b>IV- UNESCO</b></p> <p>Amount: USD 1,200,000</p> <p>GN-2349-15; clause 3.10</p> <p>This United Nations agency has exceptional qualifications to provide technical assistance, training, and support to consulting or technical services in the education sector specifically in the domain of curriculum. UNESCO has been working in the education sector in Haiti since 1947 and has over the years contributed to multiple curriculum reform technical work with the MENFP. The International Bureau of Education (UNESCO BIE), a global center of excellence in curriculum, is one of the 8 Specialized Institutes of UNESCO. The mission of the IBE is to support and promote innovative solutions to the problems that ministries of education and governments face in their complex work of improving the equity, quality, relevance and effectiveness of their curriculum, their teaching and learning, and their assessment and outcome process.</p>
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Training	To strengthen their capacity, training sessions will be organized for UCP-MENFP staff responsible for the execution of procurement activities
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Recurrent Expenses	<p>The recurrent expenses required to put the project into operation approved by the Project Team Leader, which are financed, will be made following the executing agency's administrative procedures. Such procedures will be reviewed and accepted by the Bank, provided that they do not violate the principles of value for money, economy, efficiency, equality, transparency and integrity:</p> <p>(i) all expenses required and agreed with the Bank for the execution of the project;</p> <p>(ii) all executing unit individual consultants' contracts required for the execution of the project; and</p> <p>(iii) per diem (if any) and if agreed with the Bank. Operational costs do not include the salaries of public workers.</p>

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Procurement supervision	Procurement activities foreseen under this operation will be subject to Ex ANTE review by the Bank. The Bank staff will conduct semi-annual procurement inspection visits to review the processes and following up on audit firm recommendations.		
		Works	Goods/Services	Consulting Services
		EX-ANTE	EX ANTE	EX ANTE
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Records and Archives	The Executing Units will keep records in an orderly and according to the bank's policies. All project procurement should be classified by contract, including all relevant documents of its procurement process.		

#### Main Acquisitions

Description of the procurement	Selection Method	New Procedures/Tools	Estimated Date	Estimated Amount 000'US\$
Goods				
Textbooks and school textbooks (Henry Deschamps...)	SSS		July 2021	4,000,000
Non-consulting services				
Bureau de Nutrition et de Developpement (BND) School Feeding	SSS		July 2022	3,150,000
Consulting Firms				
UNOPS TWP verification and SAQ data collection	SSS		July 2021	2,640,000
UNESCO - Curriculum technical support	SSS		July 2021	1,200,000
Individuals				
Monitoring and evaluation specialist	CI		July 2021	90,000
Procurement specialist	CI		July 2021	90,000
Internal controller	CI		July 2021	50,000
Junior financial management specialist	CI		July 2021	90,000

#### IV. Agreements and Requirements for Financial Management

☒	Programming and Budget	The UCP/MENFP prepares annual operations plans together with its annual budget. Programming and budget planning, execution and monitoring at the project level will rely on IDB's project financial management procedures.
☒	Treasury and Disbursement Management	<p>The Project Cash Flow for component 2 Access to non-public primary education will be planned, monitored, and executed independently of components 1 Improving Governance of the Education System, 3 Quality Assurance System in primary public schools and finally Project Monitoring and Management.</p> <p>The UCP MENFP will prepare annual planning of the project cash flow and will update it, quarterly. The projected cash flow of the project will be based on activities planned, the procurement plan and payment terms agreed with suppliers and project beneficiaries. The projected annual cash flow will be the basis for determining the advances of funds to be disbursed by the Bank to the UCP.</p> <p><b>For components 1,3 and project management and evaluation</b> each advance of funds will cover the financial needs for up to 4 months based on the updated financial plan and needs required for the execution of project's activities planned as approved in the AOP and updated on the procurement plan. After the first year of execution and upon performance, advances of funds might cover the needs for up to 6 months.</p> <p><b>For component 2</b>, Access to non-public primary education the advances will be made based on the tuition waivers agreed for up to the entire scholar year. During the first year of execution the Bank will advance 60% and once that advance of funds has been justified the advance of the second 40% will be made; in successive years depending on the performance of the project and at the Bank's discretion the percentage of the advance may be increased.</p> <p>The first advance will be subject to the receipt of the approved school listing and will be deposited in the UCP Central Bank of Haiti Account opened to that effect. The UCP would then transfer funds from the Central Bank account to accounts of the approved School Management Committee (SMC) opened at <i>Banque Nationale de Crédit (BNC)</i>. The tuition waiver payments will be made twice by the executing unit to the schools (60% and 40%) each school year. Payment of the first 60% will be subject to the receipt of the approved school listing. Payment of the following 40%, will be subject to the receipt of an interim financial report and the integrated technical report of the SMC as required by established UCP procedures. Only SBMCs which will have complied with established procedures will receive the second payment.</p> <p>UCP will use the exchange rate valid at the day of transactions to record all expenses made in local currency. The Central Bank of Haiti exchange rate will be used at the reference rate.</p> <p>The operation is expected to justify 80% of accumulated balances pending of justification in order to receive a new advance of funds.</p>
☒	Accounting, information systems and reporting	Quickbooks will be the platform used for the accounting of the operation using the cash basis method. In addition to the policies and guides applicable to the operation, the MOP will be used with the documented definition of internal workflows and controls.
☒	Internal Control and Internal Audit	The internal control of the unit is based on the unit procedures as well as the operations manual and donor policies, according to the most recent Institutional Capacity evaluation, it is recommended to reinforce the internal control in the unit and to hire an internal controller to reinforce its structure.

		<p>Regular supervisions reports and recommendations will be used to monitor and strengthen the internal controls within the unit.</p> <p>The unit does not have an internal audit service. Regular inspection visits are made by the Bank including review of supporting documentation. This will continue for this operation as planned on the fiduciary supervision plan.</p>
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	External control: external financial audit and project reports	<p>The UCP will select and contract the independent external audit services in accordance with the terms of reference previously agreed with the Bank. These will establish the type of review, opportunity, and scope.</p> <p>External financial audits will be performed in accordance with the Bank's policies and Handbooks. The annual project financial statements will correspond to the Haitian fiscal year and will be audited by an independent firm eligible to the Bank.</p> <p>The firm will also conduct ex-post verification disbursement requests based on specific terms of reference to be agreed between the UCP and the Bank.</p> <p>Ex-post verifications will be held annually and might be concurrently performed with the annual audit of the financial statements of the project.</p> <p>The project audited financial statements will be submitted annually to the Bank 120 days after the closing of Haiti fiscal year or the last disbursement date.</p> <p>For Component 2, an independent audit of the use of funds by the SMCs for schools financed by the Bank will be performed based on agreed upon procedures by the audit firm to be submitted to the Bank within 90 days following the the full payment of the tuition waivers agreed to for the school year.</p>
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Project Financial Supervision	<p>Bank Fiduciary staff will conduct semi-annual financial inspection visits to review execution of financial plan.</p>

DOCUMENT OF THE INTER-AMERICAN DEVELOPMENT BANK

PROPOSED RESOLUTION DE-\_\_\_/21

Haiti. Nonreimbursable Financing \_\_\_/GR-HA to the Republic of Haiti  
Support to the Haiti Education Sector Plan (SHESP)

The Board of Executive Directors

RESOLVES:

That the President of the Bank, or such representative as he shall designate, is authorized, in the name and on behalf of the Bank, as Administrator of the IDB Grant Facility (hereinafter referred to as the "Account"), to enter into such contract or contracts as may be necessary with the Republic of Haiti, as beneficiary, for the purpose of granting it a nonreimbursable financing to cooperate in the execution of the project "Support to the Haiti Education Sector Plan (SHESP)". Such nonreimbursable financing will be for an amount of up to US\$50,000,000, which form part of the Account, and will be subject to the Terms and Financial Conditions and the Special Contractual Conditions in the Project Summary of the Grant Proposal.

(Adopted on \_\_\_ 2021)