

SOCIAL STATISTICS AND POLICY ANALYSIS

(GY0070; 1516/SF-GY)

QUALITY AND RISK REVIEW

Results and Procedures Report

A. QRR PROCEDURE:

The Project Completion Report and its corresponding Annexes were distributed for comments to the QRR on Friday, October 2, 2009. A meeting was held on October 13, 2009, where Marco Nicola (CCB/CGY); Laura Profeta (LEG/SGO); Leslie-Ann Edwards (CCB/CCB); Katharina Falkner-Olmedo (VPC/PDP); (PDP-PFM); Carlos Herrera (FIN/FSV); Carola Alvarez (SPD/SDV); Cristian Santelices (SPD/SMO); Stephen Quick (OVE/OVE); Mario Marcel (ICF/ICF); Antoni Estevadeordal (INT/INT); Eduardo Lora (RES/RES); Alicia Ritchie (CAN/CAN); Carlos Hurtado (CSC/CSC); Gina Montiel (CID/CID); Dora Currea (CCB/CCB); Xavier Comas (ICF/ICS); Mario Sangines (ICF/ICF); María Mercedes Mateo (ICF/ICF); Leandro Alves (INE/ENE); José Agustín Aguerre (INE/TSP); Federico Basaños (INE/WSA); Héctor Malarín (INE/RND); Juan Pablo Bonilla (INE/ECC); Marcelo Cabrol (SCL/EDU); Hugo Florez (SCL/SPH); Flora Painter (SCL/SCT); Kei Kawabata (SCL/SCL); Carmen Pages-Serra (SCL/LMK); Vicente Fretes (ICF/FMM); Kurt Focke (ICF/CMF); Karen Mokate (KNL/KNM); Graciela Schamis (KNL/KNL); Jorge Lamas (ICF/ICS); Diego Buchara (LEG/SGO); Ethel Muhlstein (SCL/LMK); Alexandre Veyrat-Pontet (ICS/CGY); Javier Reyes (ICS/CEC); Leila Parris (CCB/CGY); Roy Parahoo (CCB/CGY) and Nathalie Hoffman (ICF/ICS), were invited.

The meeting was attended by Marina Massini (ICF/ICS); Nathalie Hoffman (ICF/ICS); and Xavier Comas (ICF/ICS) who chaired it. Marco Nicola (CCB/CGY); Alexandre Veyrat-Pontet (ICS/CGY); Leila Paris (Consultant) and Roy Parahoo (CCB/CGY); participated in the meeting connected by videoconference.

The comments received, as well as recommended next steps, have been documented in this Results and Procedure Report.

B. NON-RESOLVED ISSUES:

N/A

C. COMMENTS:

Name and Division	Topic	Comments	Answers
Laura Profeta LEG/SGO		Thank you for inviting me to the review meeting for the above-referenced Project Completion Reports (PCRs). Due to a scheduling conflict, unfortunately I will be unable to attend. Nevertheless, I confirm that we have reviewed these	

		PCRs and have no comments.	
Shakira Cossens SPD/SDV	Indicadores	Se solicita incluir las propuestas de indicadores que medirían de manera más adecuada el mejoramiento e incremento de la capacidad del país para generar información estadística, así como para monitorear la implementación y el impacto de la PRS.	This is not the purpose of a PCR. As a lesson learned a good indicator would be the Development Framework that is going to be useful for future interventions; nevertheless an outcome indicator would have the information for policy decisions.
Shakira Cossens SPD/SDV	Externalidades	Se deben especificar con mayor precisión las externalidades. Una forma podría ser resaltar en negritas la externalidad (positiva o negativa) y dejar sin resaltar el contexto.	The changes will be made in the document.
Shakira Cossens SPD/SDV	Indicadores	Los indicadores de componente marcados como “Partially Achieved”, si bien han tenido avances, no cumplen con la meta establecida por lo que se deberían marcar como “Not Achieved”. Verificar el último indicador de componente pues no es igual al de la propuesta de préstamo. De existir cambios en las métricas, es necesario explicar el porqué.	Regarding this comment, the description of the indicators will remain as partially achieved, since it didn’t make any sense to update data from census 2002 if in 2010 there is going to be a new census. There was a detailed review of the Loan Proposal and its indicators match with the PCR’s indicators. If not, please specify which of them is different.
Shakira Cossens SPD/SDV	(Sostenibilidad) Sustentabilidad de la Operación	En la sección de sustentabilidad, es necesario ser más específicos en términos de la sustentabilidad de los resultados de mediano y largo plazo. También es necesario ser más específicos en cuanto a cuáles son los elementos de sustentabilidad o no, que se perciben en materia de capacidad institucional.	Please see page 18.
Shakira Cossens SPD/SDV	Monitoreo y Evaluación	Finalmente, en la sección de monitoreo y evaluación, si bien se indica que el proyecto no tuvo un mecanismo formal de monitoreo y evaluación, en este apartado es necesario especificar cuáles son las fuentes (e instrumentos) precisas de información que se utilizaron para medir y reportar los resultados de los indicadores.	The changes will be made in the document.

D. MAIN TOPICS DISCUSSED DURING THE MEETING AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Topic	Recommendation
Project description	There is a need to include a reference to the Technical Cooperation GY-T1001.
Potential Risks – Minutes of the Exit Workshop	Projects that require concentration of IT have risk of maintenance; this needs to be included as a reference in the Risks Section. Also the issue of replacing equipment because technology changes so fast, updated versions, licenses, etc.
Project execution extensions	It is necessary to correct in the document Page. 14 the extension periods of the Project, which correspond to 14 months.
Lessons learned	The document does not include two important aspects that were specified in the minutes of the Exit Workshop which correspond to (i) technology and (ii) institutional strengthening, since it takes time to ensure it and to consolidate it. For future implementations and software spending, the Government will spend more money in statistical systems and the Bank is planning on giving them support. The most important thing is to use the data in the right way with the best quality.
Project achievements	There is a need to emphasize the importance to have longer presence of the Bank in the country in order to continue and consolidate the achievements of this Project, but not only in the area of census, but also in the area of Institutional Strength of the Government.

Concur: (Original Firmado)
Xavier Comas
Division Chief, ICF/ICS



Project Completion Report

PCR

Project Name: Social Statistics and Policy Analysis

Country: Guyana

***Sector/Subsector: Modernization of the State – Reform
and Public Sector Support***

Original Project Team: Jorge Lamas, Project Team Leader (RE3/SO3); Luis C. Antola (COF/CGY); Lorraine Blank (consultant); Diego Buchara (LEG); José A. Mejía (SDS); Ethel Muhlstein (RE3/SO3); and Adrienne Pratt (OD6).

Project Number: GY0070

Loan Number (s), TC(s): (1516/SF-GY)

QRR Date: October 13, 2009

Final Approval Date of PCR: October 21, 2009

PCR Team: Alexandre Veyrat-Pontet (ICS/CGY), Jorge Lamas (ICF/ICS); Leila Parris (Consultant) and Nathalie Hoffman (ICF/ICS).



Acronyms and Abbreviations

BOS	Bureau of Statistics
CDB	Caribbean Development Bank
CPI	Consumer Price Index
CH&PA	Central Housing & Planning Authority
DO	Development Objective
EA	Executing Agency
ED	Enumeration District
EOP	End of Project
FMMA	Fiscal Management and Accountability Act
FSO	Fund for Special Operations
FTP	File Transfer Protocol
GIS	Geographic Information System
GOG	Government of Guyana
GRO	General Registrar's Office
GPSU	Guyana Public Service Union
GWl	Guyana Water Inc.
HBS	Household Budget Survey
IDB	Inter American Development Bank
IT	Information Technology
KOI	Key Outcome / Output Indicator
LAN	Local Area Network
LMs	Line Ministries
L&S	Lands and Surveys
M&E	Monitoring & Evaluation
MH&W	Ministry of Housing & Water
MICS	Multiple Indicator Cluster Survey
MIS	Management Information System
MISU	Management Information System Unit
MLHS&SS	Ministry of Labour, Human Services & Social Security



MOE	Ministry of Education
MOF	Ministry of Finance
MOH	Ministry of Health
MOHA	Ministry of Home Affairs
MSF	Master Sample Frame
OP	Office of the President
PCPMU	Policy Coordination and Program Management Unit
PEU	Project Execution Unit
PPI	Producer Price Index
PRS	Poverty Reduction Strategy
UNDP	United Nations Development Program
USCB	United States Census Bureau
WAN	Wide Area Network



Table of Contents

I. Basic Information	1
II. The Project	2
A. PROJECT CONTEXT	2
B. PROJECT DESCRIPTION	2
C. QUALITY -AT- ENTRY REVIEW (IF APPLICABLE).....	3
III. Results	3
A. OUTCOMES	3
B. EXTERNALITIES	6
C. OUTPUTS.....	6
D. PROJECT COSTS	11
I. SUMMARY	11
IV. Project Implementation	11
A. ANALYSIS OF CRITICAL FACTORS	11
B. BORROWER/EXECUTING AGENCY PERFORMANCE	14
C. BANK PERFORMANCE	14
V. Sustainability	14
A. ANALYSIS OF CRITICAL FACTORS	14
B. POTENTIAL RISKS	16
C. INSTITUTIONAL CAPACITY	16
D. SCOPE OF PROJECT SUSTAINABILITY IMPERATIVES.....	17
VI. Monitoring and Evaluation	18
A. INFORMATION ON RESULTS	18
B. FUTURE MONITORING AND EX-POST EVALUATION	18
VII. Lessons Learned	18

Annexes

1. Project Cost Table
2. Minutes from Exit Workshop
3. Borrower Evaluation



I. Basic Information

BASIC DATA ()							
PROJECT NO: GY0070	TITLE: SOCIAL STATISTICS AND POLICY ANALYSIS PROGRAM						
Borrower: Cooperative Republic of Guyana	Date of Board Approval: December 8, 2003						
Executing Agency (EA): Office of the President / Ministry of Finance	Date of Loan Contract Effectiveness: March 24, 2004						
Loan(s): LO-1516/ SF-GY	Date of Eligibility for First Disbursement: October 8, 2004						
Sector: Modernization of the State –Reform and Public Sector Support	1) <u>Months in Execution</u>						
Lending Instrument: Investment	* From Approval: weeks: 263						
	* From Contract Effectiveness: 253						
	<u>Disbursement Periods</u>						
	Original Date of Final Disbursement: March 24, 2008						
	Current Date of Final Disbursement: May 31, 2009						
	Cumulative Extension (Months): 14 months						
	Special Extensions (Months):						
	<u>Loan Amount(s)</u>						
	* Original Amount: US\$3, 450,000.00						
	* Current Amount: US\$2, 862, 104. 50						
	* Pari Passu (if applicable):						
Poverty Targeted Investment (PTI):	<u>Disbursements</u>						
Social Equity (SEQ):	* Amount to date: US\$2, 862104.50						
Environmental Classification:	<u>Total Project Cost</u> (Original Estimate): US\$3, 450, 000.						
	<u>Redirectioning</u>						
	Has this Project?						
	Received funds from another Project [N/A]						
	Sent funds to another Project [N/A]						
	N/A [N/A]						
	<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>To/From Project Number</th> <th>From Sub-Loan Number</th> <th>Amount</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	To/From Project Number	From Sub-Loan Number	Amount			
To/From Project Number	From Sub-Loan Number	Amount					
	* Current amount (adjusted for re-direction):						
	<u>On Alert Status</u>						
	Is project currently designated "on alert" by PAIS: No						
	If yes then why is the project on alert (DO , IP Ratings and/or relevant PAIS indicators):						
	Comments on relevance of "on alert" status for this project (if applicable):						

Summary Performance Classifications				
DO	<input type="checkbox"/> Highly Probable (HP)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Probable (P)	<input type="checkbox"/> Low Probability (LP)	<input type="checkbox"/> Improbable (I)
IP	<input type="checkbox"/> Highly Satisfactory (HS)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Satisfactory (S)	<input type="checkbox"/> Unsatisfactory (US)	<input type="checkbox"/> Very Unsatisfactory (VU)
SU	<input type="checkbox"/> Highly Probable (HP)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Probable (P)	<input type="checkbox"/> Low Probability (LP)	<input type="checkbox"/> Improbable (I)



II. The Project

a. Project Context

i. Socio-Economic Environment

The economic policies that were pursued by the Government of Guyana during the 1980s led to serious declines in economic development. This was characterized by high levels of inflation, deterioration in the value of the country's currency resulting in higher levels of absolute and critical poverty, especially in rural areas. A change in policy was inevitable in the solution to reverse the economic situation. The structural reforms that were subsequently implemented included fiscal and monetary measures, a liberalized framework and an expanded role for the private sector as the free market economy model was embraced. These policy choices brought rewarding results but over time, the performance of the economy was mixed. Real economic growth began to emerge during the period 1991- 1997, averaging 7% annually, inflation declined, and poverty levels, while remaining significant, also reflected some level of reduction. The period following 1997 ushered in a marked reduction in economic growth, a widening of fiscal and external deficits all brought about by external and domestic environmental factors. The potential for considerable negative implications of these trends were mitigated by Guyana's participation in the HIPC initiatives and the consequential debt relief that was received. In keeping with the requirements of this program, a Poverty Reduction Strategy (PRS) was developed and this has since underpinned the policy and developmental agenda of the Government. The outcomes and impact of the related development projects/programs must be a part of the on-going review and analysis process if national and international poverty related objectives are to be realized. Such assessment demands a statistical culture where social, financial and other statistics are generated, maintained and disseminated in a timely and comprehensive manner and supports the monitoring and evaluation needs of the social sector.

ii. Statistical Capacity

The "Millennium Development Goals Progress Report: - An Agenda for Action, An Agenda for Partnership" (2003), produced jointly by the GOG and the UN Country Team stated categorically that "*Guyana's monitoring capacity for tracking the MDGs was generally weak across all categories, including data collection capability, quality of information, statistical follow-up capability, statistical analysis capability, capability for incorporation of statistical analysis into policies, plans, resource allotment mechanisms etc....*". This state of affairs has come about largely as a result of migration that has depleted the skill base of many state agencies and the country as a whole together with severe resource constraints¹.

A number of barriers to effective policy analysis in Guyana have been identified². These include (a) quality and timeliness of social statistics; (b) the lack of institutional capacity to assess the impact of policy interventions, and (c) the lack of formal mechanisms for Policy Dialogue between the social line ministries, the Bureau of Statistics (BOS) and the Office of the President, which up to recently, was in charge of the monitoring of the implementation of the Poverty Reduction Strategy.

These agencies all face systemic challenges. Key concerns include frequent turnover of staff; technical staff with limited experience; scarcity as well as the quality of statistics in the economic and social fields; outdated and obsolete computer equipment in the BOS, understaffed and poorly equipped statistical units in LMs, together with limited experience in data collection and data analysis for monitoring, evaluation and planning.

These concerns have presented a compelling case for the institutional strengthening that is the basis for this operation.

b. Project Description

The project consists of two areas of intervention. The first aimed at improving the collection and dissemination of timely and reliable social statistics for tracking PRS and MDG implementation through capacity

¹ GOG and UNDP – "Development of Institutional Social Statistics Capacities" (Revised version August 2005)

² Social Statistics and Policy Analysis Program – Project Report, 2003.



strengthening of the Bureau of Statistics (BOS). The second focused on the training of technical staff in line ministries (LMs) and other agencies involved in PRS implementation to promote the use of quantitative data analysis for monitoring, evaluation and public decision making. This Project was complemented by a parallel program in the form of a non-reimbursable grant – GY-T1001: Strengthening of Statistics and Social Policy Analysis Teaching and Research at the University of Guyana. The TC was in the sum of US\$500,000. It was intended to support this loan by providing a 'continuous supply of qualified professionals capable of undertaking social policy analysis in the public sector'.

i. Development Objective(s)

To improve and increase the capacity of the country to generate social and other relevant data to undertake evidence-based policy analysis and to monitor PRS implementation and impact.

ii. Components

The program design consisted of two components:

Component 1 – Strengthening the Bureau of Statistics: Was intended to strengthen the operational capability of the BOS to take full responsibility of its role as coordinator of the national statistics system and to ensure the generation of primary social data, including data collection, data processing and implementation of a basic set of household surveys. Several key activities were planned to be undertaken. These included the organizational assessment of the BOS; design and development of the Master Sample Frame based on the 2002 Census; design and implementation of a digitized cartography system; improvement in sample and questionnaire design; design and implementation of validation and data consistency procedures as well as data management; harmonization of concepts between BOS products and other data sources; development of data quality control systems; training in field and initial implementation of household surveys; website development; update of national accounts, consumer index and improvement of vital statistics.

Component 2. – Upgrading of Data management and Analysis in Social Sector Ministries: The objective of this component was to upgrade the capacity of line ministries and the PCPMU to monitor the PRS and to collect and analyze operational statistics. The Ministries identified to benefit from this institutional strengthening were those already involved in the implementation of the Poverty Reduction Strategy. They were Health; Education; Water and Housing; Labour, Human Services and Social Security. The Ministry of Home Affairs was later added to this list. The specific activities identified to be undertaken in this component were (i) elaborate a technical diagnosis of the existing data production processes; (ii) improve data collection and data management methods; (iii) identify the range of data to be collected by each Ministry as it related to the PRS and document procedures for collecting such data; (iv) training for staff in all related areas of this component to sustain the improved quality and analysis of reports; provision of computer equipment to support the reforms.

c. Quality -At- Entry Review (if applicable)

There was no Quality-at-Entry Review conducted in this Program.

III. Results

a. Outcomes

ACHIEVEMENT OF DEVELOPMENT OBJECTIVE (DO)		
Development Objective(s) (Purpose)	Key Outcome Indicators	
To improve and increase the capacity of the country to generate	End of Project 80% of relevant staff of	Achieved <u>Outcomes Achieved</u>



<p>social and other relevant data to undertake evidence-based policy analysis and to monitor PRS implementation and impact.</p>	<p>social sector ministries and BOS adequately trained in data generation, analysis and interpretation.</p>	<p>In BOS, at EOP, in excess of 80% (i.e. all 16 persons identified for training) – the technical staff (statisticians) from all of the Departments have been trained in statistical methodologies such as basic statistics, survey planning and sampling, statistical reporting and analysis, GIS, statistical software packages – DEVINFO, SPSS, STATA. [This training was not extended to senior management level staff since they possessed the desired skills.].</p> <p>In support of the DO, LMs also benefited from the statistical training that was provided to BOS staff 100% or all of the 31 identified statistical staff in LMs were trained in statistical methodologies including sampling methods & techniques, GIS, statistical software packages (SPSS; CSPRO; Microsoft Access and DevInfo); tabulation and data analysis. Sector specific data management training was also provided by two consultants who were recruited under the project to provide full time support to the statistical units for approximately 18 months. From the trained pool of staff at LMs, only 68% or 21 statisticians remain in post at EOP. During the project execution, a total of 17 statisticians resigned from the Government system but the Ministries of Health and Home Affairs were able to recruit and train replacements. There was no loss of staff at the MOE.</p> <p>The new persons have benefited from in-house training provided by Ministry consultants. This training was directed to the specialized data management needs of each ministry. Focus group sessions for the various trained personnel across LMs revealed mixed reactions. The relevance of most of the training was generally acclaimed; however, several beneficiaries felt that the training in the software packages such as DEVINFO, still remains to be utilized since these software are not available in their Ministries.</p> <p>Two LMs – MLHS&SS and Water& Housing did not benefit from the intended support from consultants to provide the required data management and institutional strengthening. Both ministries did however benefit through the provision of statisticians from those recruited by BOS under the Project, for LMs. In the case of MLHS&SS, the statistical unit continues to function, producing credible bulletins. However, in the Ministry of Water & Housing, specifically its two agencies – CH&PA and GWI, the initial attempts to strengthen the statistical function have not been sustained. The resignation of one of the statisticians who was attached to CH&PA, eventually led to the unit becoming defunct. In GWI, the remaining statistician has been integrated into the data center and contributes to the monthly reports that are sent to the Board. As a result, information is now available on a number of water-related statistics as a result of the efforts of the trained statistician and these are being used by both Bank and GOG officials in the development of policy and related developmental programs.</p>
	<p><u>End of Project</u> Complete reports on PRS performance indicators and other social sector data produced annually for at least three years after project completion.</p>	<p>Achieved</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ BOS has reported that with assistance from the USCB, it is now (at June 2009) in possession of the 2007 Report on PRS performance indicators. This document will be disseminated shortly. ▪ One Manual on the type of indicators and data to be generated when compiling PRS reports prepared by USCB for BOS. ▪ 34 Social sector statistical Bulletins / reports (annual and quarterly) were generated for the period 2004 – 2008. Details are as follows; MOE – 2004-2005 up to Year 2006 -2007, 2007 -2008 in progress; MOH – 2004 to 2006, 2007 is in progress; MOHA – first ever Bulletin was produced for Y2006. Y2007 is in publication stage; MLHS&SS – Guyana Labour Market Quarterly Statistical Bulletin is up-to-date – last publication – 2008, as well as a new Social Services Quarterly Statistical Bulletin that commenced in October 2006 with current published edition for period January – March 2008.
	<p><u>End of Project</u> Semi-annual meetings of the Board of Directors to coordinate activities of national statistical system and to apply newly generated information.</p>	<p>Partially Achieved</p> <p>The Board of Directors met three times during the life of the project. . In the light of the urgency of the several activities and benchmarks for the USCB consultancy, the preoccupation was on facilitating that process to ensure a successful project outcome. The focus on coordination activities for the national statistics system was consequently, indirect. Never-the-less important decisions that had implications for the National system were made. For instance, the Board influenced the rebasing of national accounts; the recruiting of a pool of statisticians under the BOS, training and then assigning them to</p>

		LMs; ensured that the BOS continued its recruitment process. A Draft Data Access Policy Document for internal data access was prepared and is now about to be approved by the new Board. The intention is to preserve the confidentiality of primary data in the context of the use of new technologies. Consequently, the document identifies levels of access to information by the categories of staff. After approval it will be shared with LMs. A new Board was constituted in March 2009. The preliminary agenda places a greater emphasis on the national statistical system and includes the advancement of recommendations from this PCR and the Exit Workshop Minutes. BOS has advised that these matters will be championed by the Vice Chairman of the Board – the Chief Statistician.
Reformulation. Nil		
PMMR Retrofitting. Indicate if and when the PMMR was retrofitted and explain any changes resulting from this exercise. [N/A] N/A		
Summary Development objective (s) Classification (DO):		
[] Highly Probable (HP)	[X] Probable (P)	[] Low Probability (LP) [] Improbable (I)
<p>Briefly justify DO classification, based on the degree to which planned targets were met, explaining the differences between planned and not achieved outcomes as well as any other relevant factors. Include references to evidence that can support these results.</p> <p>At end of project, the consensus of key informants at the Exit Workshop is that sufficient capacity exists across participating agencies to meet the demands of the DO, from the institutional strengthening interventions that were provided in this project. These interventions were delivered in the form of face-to-face training for all levels of statistical personnel as well as the development and dissemination of procedure manuals and desk manuals. The latter documentation is in place for reference in the various organizations. This evaluation is of the opinion that the existing benchmarks do not entirely capture the achievements of this program (e.g. closer collaboration/ linkages with LMs; as seen in increased requests for support from LMs and ready responses from BOS); electronic intra departmental communication – achievements that have placed the statistical system in a good position to now fulfill its mandate as the coordinator and leader of the national statistics system. In the BOS and in LMs there is every reason to believe that the generation and dissemination of PRS indicator performance reports and sector related statistical reports will continue on a timely basis in the light of BOS's/ Board's commitment to advance the remaining elements of this project, as well as the stated commitment of LMS and the pride displayed in their enhanced publications. Key decision makers have hailed the improved quality of the statistical Bulletins, which, they believe has added to the image of these LMs. Their interest and support, together with external demands for such statistical information augers well for continuity. In the MLHS&SS, outcomes have been particularly encouraging. This was one of two LMs that did not benefit from the planned in-depth support from a full time consultant, as a result of the limited availability of requisite statistical skills within the country and the wider region, at the point in time that such skills were required.</p> <p>However within that Ministry, a 'statistical culture' was in existence, born from years of previous support received from the ILO. This was readily visible in the continuous, timely dissemination of the Guyana Labour Market Quarterly Bulletin. It is the only LM with up-to-date statistical publications.</p> <p>After approximately 18 months of continuous technical support, the statistical staff in the LMs have become entrenched in the new data management and analysis methodologies and routines. They have all indicated quite firmly, throughout this evaluation, that these practices are now their preferred and only choice. The change appears to be now irreversible.</p> <p>In BOS, capacity exists through the extensive training undertaken; sustainability is supported by available procedure manuals with guidelines for the production of the major products that are demanded of that organization e.g. Household Surveys, National Census, and the actual related practical experience acquired in key areas under the guidance of the USCB.</p> <p>The classification given above – PROBABLE - reflects the small yet real risk of losing key statistical staff trained under this project, a trend that has begun to emerge during project execution and which has continued even at project close-out in all LMs and also in the BOS. A key reason is slated to be the issue of inadequate remuneration. While these achievements are encouraging, there is the need for a longer term presence of the Bank in continuing the support in this important area of governance. In order to consolidate the achievements of this project, there are still a number of areas that need advancement. Several have been identified in the minutes of the Exit Workshop of this project by key stakeholders in the national statistical system. These can be included in the agenda for continued dialogue with a view to determining a long term program of institutional strengthening commencing with the identification of priorities, many of which will be highlighted later in this report.</p>		
<p>Country Strategy. Given the results described above, briefly discuss how the project contributed to the Bank's strategy in the country.</p> <p>At the LM or sector level, the results of this project have positioned LMs to be able to produce more credible / accurate statistical reports through a strengthened position that adds value to their monitoring and evaluation efforts. The BOS is now in a stronger position to provide that leadership role for the national statistical system as a result of its enhanced capacity and the strengthened collaboration that has been realized with LMS. The improvement in the quality of data that is now available, (acclaimed by all stakeholders) can now be channeled into the decision-making processes of these organizations. In so doing, adjustments can be made to existing poverty related initiatives allowing for enhancements / new policies that would present a responsiveness that is evidence-based and therefore more relevant to the social problems on the ground. At the national policy making level, the stage is now set for enhanced decision making, based on the availability of current and better empirical evidence that has begun to emerge from the social and financial sector via the BOS. These early benefits link directly into the Bank's Country Strategy to support the achievement of medium-term poverty reduction through improved governance and public sector efficiency as well as strengthened social programs.</p>		

b. Externalities

A number of positive externalities have emerged from this project's execution. In the Bureau of Statistics, the technological advances brought about through the acquisition of a significant amount of computer equipment (30 computers, 6 laptops, 5 printers, 2 scanners, 1 server and central UPS) together with a LAN have caused the beginnings of a shift to an intranet mode of organizational functioning, since staff are now communicating on official matters electronically. This has begun to show clear signs of enhanced efficiency in departmental and intra-departmental communication thereby supporting coordination efforts within the organization.

A second benefit has surfaced in the form of closer linkages between the LMs and BOS. This has its genesis in the placement of seven statisticians at the beginning of this project's implementation in participating LMs. These officials were recruited by the BOS, under this project to form a pool of expertise necessary for the establishment of statistical units in the participating LMs. They were subsequently trained at the BOS for five months in basic statistical skills, and then assigned to the participating social sector LMs. The linkages formed from the initial relationships were sustained even with the change of workplace location. They were further strengthened by interactions arising from the joint training sessions conducted by BOS for LMs and its own staff. The subsequent unofficial networking between these staff members have unwittingly contributed to the project's implicit aim of greater inter- agency cooperation.

Another externality was the clearing-up of backlog data into the databases of the Ministries of Education, Health and Home Affairs. This issue became apparent during project execution and a decision was taken by the Steering Committee to employ five Data Clerks for a six month period to bring the database in each of the participating Ministries up-to-date. This decision was supported by the Bank and the entire exercise was successfully concluded after a six month extension.

On the downside, two of the five LMs identified for technical support by individual consultants to upgrade data management and analysis in their respective ministries, did not enjoy these benefits. Key informants offered several reasons for this unexpected situation. These included, difficulty in sourcing a sufficient number of consultants with the desired level of expertise; the unsuitability of the consultant who was actually hired for the MLHS&SS and whose services were subsequently terminated; administrative delays in trying to source an alternative consultant and an additional expert for W&H. Finally, there was just insufficient time left before the project ended, to allow for the fulfillment of the mandate of a LM consultant.

The final externality was a negative one. The GOG was able to mobilize additional assistance from the UNDP in support of the general thrust of this project. The UNDP agree to a technical assistance facility that included strengthening of statistical capacity at the regional level and to the SSPA, providing a pay supplement to all statistical staff in the beneficiary organizations as an incentive to promote/ encourage staff retention during the life of the project. After nearly two years of receiving a pay supplement, this incentive was abruptly removed as the UNDP funding came to an end. The result was disappointment and uncertainty, which the affected staff themselves claimed, significantly lowered staff morale. They declared that this situation led to a reduction in interest and consequently the pace of work. In some cases, persons actually resigned within two – three months after the pay supplement disappeared. While several efforts were made by the PEU in collaboration with the MOF and the IDB to source alternative funding, no progress was made at End of Project.

c. Outputs

IMPLEMENTATION PROGRESS (IP)		
Components (Outputs)	Key Outcome Indicators	
1. Component 1. Strengthening of the Bureau of Statistics.	Planned Outputs	Outputs Achieved
	1.1. Annual Report on PRS Performance Indicators published.	Annual Reports on PRSP published up to Year 2006. Report for 2007 completed, at the time of this evaluation, and about to be



<p>Total Cost of Component: US\$1,898,195.48</p> <p>IDB:US\$.1,898,195.48 IDB Disbursement:100%</p> <p><u>Classification:</u> HS, S, U, VU = S</p>		disseminated.
	<p>1.2. Mid-term: 40% of BOS staff trained in data collection and management</p> <p>EOP: 80% of BOS staff trained in data collection and management,</p>	<p>Achieved</p> <p>At EOP, 100% or 16 of technical staff identified by BOS were trained from every division in the organization. This percentage includes staffs who have since left the employ of the BOS. In the National Accounts Division, turnover has been 100% (3 out of 3). On the positive side, 100% (3 out of 3) of staff trained in the Cartography Division remain in post. At EOP, BOS is operating with just 16 out of 28 (57%) of its authorized number of statisticians. 56% or 9 out of the initial trained 16 staff remain in post.</p> <p>As a result of the Applied Learning Programme that was undertaken, together with the detailed procedure manuals for the core operational, training/orientation of new staff is a continuous process. Guidance is provided by the Heads of Departments who are still in post and who benefited from 'one-on-one' sessions with USCB consultants. The loss of the 7 experienced staff, however, cannot be understated, but the training / coaching exposure that was experienced together with the aforementioned tools have enabled the BOS to maintain much of the capacity built in this program.</p>
	1.3. Technical Assistance Reports Completed	<p>Achieved</p> <p>Several Technical Reports from USCB and other consultancies were completed and are available in the respective agencies.</p>
	1.4. National Master Sample Frame is made available for its potential users.	<p>Not achieved</p> <p>The national master sample frame was intended to be designed based on the 2002 Census. However, the reality at the point of the decision was (a) there was a 'universe' from the 2002 Census that had not been updated; (b) the BOS was planning only one survey between the time the proposed master sample frame was to be created and the 2010 Census. The policy decision to delay the creation of the Master Sample Frame, made in the light of the imminence of the 2010 Census, was therefore statistically and economically sound (it reduced costs and avoided compromise in the survey design) as well as pragmatic. Any MSF created around 2007/8 would have become obsolete, as a new one would have had to be created immediately after the 2010 Census. [N.B.: This is a very expensive process that requires up-to-date sampling units and is only cost effective if several surveys were planned. In Guyana, little updating is done in the years between censuses, presenting the real possibility of statistical 'Drift'].</p>
	1.5. Digital Map is made available to its potential users.	<p>Partially Achieved</p> <p>Equipment necessary for the conversion of hand-drawn maps to digital format is available at BoS. Trained staff members are also onboard. 6 EDs from within Region 3 and Region 6 were digitized during the period of training. Currently, hand-drawn maps and digital maps can be obtained from the Lands and Surveys Authority. The reason is that currently BOS staffs are unable to digitize ED independently since they feel that they still require initial supervision from an expert. The staff believes that although the training received was relevant, the shift from hand-drawn maps to digitized maps was significant. Additionally, in view of the limited time frame of the training, additional on-the-job support is necessary to allow for the level of confidence needed to work independently.</p> <p>The present decision reflects a short term solution. L&S will continue to convert paper maps to digital format. BoS will then insert the EDs. Because of the extent of the details that Lands and Surveys is including in the maps, only 2 such maps can be produced per year. L&S is scheduled to complete the production of all digital maps in 2012.</p>
	1.6. Procedures Manual to cover all aspects of data management functioning	<p>Achieved</p> <p>A hierarchical data management system, with identifying levels of access and channels for permission, was developed.</p> <p>7 Procedural Manuals are available in BOS. These include editing and imputation manuals to deal with data validation; sample and questionnaire design; digitization of ED maps; benchmarking GDP;</p>

	Household and NE surveys.
1.7. Official statistical catalogue of concepts and definitions completed and made available to the public.	Partially Achieved Document on data concepts and definitions was reportedly prepared, updating the National Statistical Catalogue. The Publication of this document represents a resuscitation of this important catalogue No reason was provided for the apparent delay in publication.
1.8. Mid-Term: One household Survey implemented EOP: Information on two Household Surveys applied and published.	Partially Achieved All tools and instruments were developed. Relevant manuals are available. The launching of the LFS was delayed as a result of a policy decision by the GOG to have it run concurrently with the 2010 Census. Monitoring of the PRS is linked to information collected from this survey. BOS has had the benefit of participating in the National Economic Survey as a part of the training received under the project. At the time of this evaluation, the BOS is currently undertaking the Demographic Health Survey in collaboration with the Ministry of Health. This information is relevant for the tracking of the PRS. The HBS will also be undertaken as soon as the green light is given. The results of the NES were used to rebase the GDP. Rebased Year is now 2006 (updated from 1988).
1.9. Mid-Term: Review of National Accounts implemented EOP: National Accounts updated.	Achieved National Accounts have been updated except for the PPI. CPI estimation was done based on household survey of 2005/2006. PPI was not updated because of the volume of work already involved in the updating of GDP, CPI and the demands of conducting the survey. However, updating PPI is reportedly in the agency's work Programme for 2010. Documentation of methodologies is reported to be under review and should be available in Mid-2009.
1.10. Mid-Term: Revision of Vital Statistics implemented. EOP: Availability of revised vital statistics	Not Achieved GRO is the legal custodian of vital statistics. BOS has access to data on Births, Deaths, Migration and Marriages. It was planned that GRO would enter the data into electronic form then transfer electronic copies to BoS upon request. To this end five computers were procured for GRO but the organization lacked the skills to move forward with data computerization. This caused delay. Reportedly, data is currently being entered for each of the categories listed even as efforts are being made to setup a computer network. The entry of data is in the early stages. BOS has experienced some difficulty in accessing the information from MOH on a timely basis and this has resulted in some delays. GRO is now sharing this data directly with BoS, a decision that will move part of the data gathering efforts forward.
1.11. 2002 Census Database	Achieved This was completed and information and summary data are available on the BoS website.
1.12. Mid-Term: BOS Website functioning and updated. EOP: BOS website with timely data and routine updating.	Achieved BoS website is functional and provides information on a wide variety of areas; marginality, disability, external trade. The site was last updated on February 11, 2009. The most recently added documents are GMICS 2006 Technical and Summary Reports; Population and Housing Census 2002 Guyana National Report; a selected core of social statistics at the level of the Village, Town and NDC. The GOG/ILO Child Labor Survey in Parika is also included. The website is still in need of some fine-tuning which is understandable at this stage of its upgrading. In addition, Quality Control could be improved to ensure correct descriptions of data sets The publication dates should be included in the descriptions of the documents and data sets. In one instance, the cover of the statistics bulletin is dated January – March 2006, the

		<p>introduction is closed with just the date "December 2008" but many of the charts within show data from the year 2006 – 2007. GDP data published has to be updated.</p> <p>No staff member is dedicated to updating the website at present as a result of staff turnover. The IS department does the updating as information is submitted by departments.</p>
	1.13. Semi-annual Bulletins from social sector ministries	<p>Achieved</p> <p>The BOS published a semi-annual statistical bulletin in 2008 with input from the LMs. This bulletin is available at the BOS website. The LMs have independently produced publications. These were previously listed in Section 3.1.</p> <p>On the wider issue of data sharing / exchange, the BOS has taken the lead in advancing this mechanism, as a first step towards an Open Access Policy. The BOS has resuscitated a Committee to pursue this matter. This committee has agreed to meet twice per month in work sessions until October 2009, by which time a proposed DSM, which will be linked to the MOF's IFMAS, will be ready for data sharing demonstrations to PSs in order to garner support for Cabinet's approval of a data access policy.</p> <p>Reportedly, already a Meta Data document – containing data concepts and definitions – was developed by the Committee, as part of the overall proposal.</p> <p>Currently, data conversion into Devinfo format, the data sharing software that has been agreed upon, is occurring via a WAN that was reconfigured with BOS as the hub. Funding was requested from UNICEF. The data include BoS's Census data as well as data from MICS. Both are relevant to the tracking of PRS implementation and the MDGs. Two individuals were contracted to do the data conversion. Both contracts expired before conversion was completed but one person was retained to continue the process. A key informant estimated that approximately two-thirds (2/3) of the data have been converted and that approximately one more month is needed for completion. LMs share data based on specific periodic requests by BOS as a result of an informal agreement on data sharing via FTP and/or emails and the use of BOS' website to view data.</p> <p>At EOP, despite the several setbacks that occurred, key informants are optimistic that the system is much closer to realizing the desired data access policy.</p>

Briefly explain differences between planned and actual outputs (if applicable).

The variances stem from a number of factors. First, the procurement of a suitable statistical firm to work with the BOS consumed the first year of project execution. The identified USCB then took some time – almost another year- before coming on the ground and during the first year of its support it was agreed that there was a disconnect between the precise needs of the BOS and the work plan that was negotiated with the GOG. Accordingly, a decision was made to have the Work Plan revised, complete with precise deliverables that were more tangible and responsive to the critical and immediate work challenges faced by the BOS. Following this decision, distinct progress was realized with regards to the KOIs, however, these final advances could not entirely redress the time that was lost in the early implementation, despite an initial extension of the project (January to March, 2009) to enable the USCB to complete their consultancy obligations. Another contributing factor to the variances in achievements was the fact that some initiatives required the completion of other associated activities [e.g. a WAN – a key element in the move to data sharing]. Other constraints such as administrative delays, policy decisions, the conclusion of World Bank funding that was necessary to continue support of the PCPMU – the unit in the OP that was the focal point in the EA; logistical and other IT considerations contributed to the EOP status of these benchmarks.

Restructuring. Indicate if this component was restructured (date and approval of managers). Briefly discuss the consequences of these changes. N/A

Component 2:	Planned Output	Outputs Achieved
Upgrading of Data Management and Analysis in Social Sector Ministries	Annual Social Sector ministries' reports produced mid-year to include quality and complete data	<p>Partially Achieved.</p> <p>A number of social sector statistical Bulletins / reports were completed and published. Details are as follows: MOE – from Y</p>



<p>Total Cost of Component: US\$ 589, 156.85</p> <p>IDB: US\$.589, 156. 85</p> <p>IDB Disbursement: %100%</p> <p>Classification : HS, S, U, VU.=S</p>	from previous calendar year.	<p>2004 up to Year 2006 -2007 (2007 -2008 in progress);</p> <p>MOH –from Y 2004 up to 2006;2007 about to be published; 2008 preparation in progress;</p> <p>MOHA – first ever Bulletin was produced for Y2006. Y2007 is in publication stage;</p> <p>MLHS&SS – Guyana Labour Market Quarterly Statistical Bulletin is up-to-date – last publication – 2008, as well as a new Social Services Quarterly Statistical Bulletin from October 2006 to - March 2008.</p> <p>MH&W: better quality of water reports is available. (such data now in use by IDB and GOG)</p> <p>Before the project Bulletins consisted of mere statistical tables. As a result of the project the quality was enhanced with the inclusion of graphs and analytical elements that made the publication more informative and user-friendly. Reports are slightly behind targeted time as a result of late releases of local funds and other minor administrative constraints.</p>
	Technical Assistance reports - elaborate a technical diagnosis of the existing data production processes.	<p>Partially achieved</p> <p>Technical Reports from relevant consultancies are available. These include Technical Diagnosis of Line Ministries, IT Assessment of Ministries' capacity to support the improved data management, Consultants Reports on the technical support provided for strengthening Data Management and Analysis in Ministries. The elaboration of a technical diagnostic of the existing data production processes was, however, not done.</p>
	Procedure Manual to cover all aspects of Data management	<p>Partially Achieved</p> <p>MOE: Three Instructional Manuals for Nursery, Primary, Secondary subsystems as well as Desk Manuals for staff</p> <p>MOHA: Instructional manuals for MOHA; Guyana Prisons, Fire and GRO in place, also a database for Ministry and an 'access' database for the GT Prisons only;</p> <p>MOH: Three out of four Manuals completed as well as Desk manuals for all levels of statistical staff; the fourth manual - M&CH manual is 80% completed at EOP; Standard operating procedures for the national syndromic, communicable & non-communicable disease surveillance system is also completed. Electronic data manual in place. [50% of Ministry's databases upgraded – rationalization of the remaining 50% is in progress at EOP. A consolidated database was developed and is populated with data covering period 2003-2006].</p> <p>No manuals are available in the MHW and MOLHS&SS.</p>
	Official statistical catalogue	<p>Partially Achieved</p> <p>Catalogues have been completed for the Ministries of Home Affairs, Education and Health.</p> <p>MH&W and MLHS&SS did not have the benefit of consultancy support and were therefore unable to realize these products.</p>
	80 % of relevant staff in social sector agencies adequately trained	<p>Achieved. 7 Statistical Units were strengthened /established, staffed and equipped in the Ministries of Education, Health, Home Affairs, Labour, HS&SS, Water and Housing . 100% of identified staff (31 persons across the five ministries) were trained in data collection, collation, aggregations and analysis; reporting and analysis under the Applied Learning Programme delivered by the USCB. In addition, 21 staff members in the MOE, MOH and MOHA benefited from on the job training provided by Individual Consultants as well as a Training of Trainers' course. In turn, these officers trained other staff involved in the capture of primary data in the region and in related agencies. MOE and MOH were unable to provide specific numbers, but MOHA's staff trained 28 Police ranks; 12 Prison Officers and 2 Fire officers.</p> <p>Head teachers of nursery, primary and secondary schools were trained in the use of the instructional manual. The HOD and District Education Officers were trained, through the GIS system, in the use of indicators to facilitate decision-making.</p> <p>In MOH, Regional statistical and surveillance staffs were also trained in the use of Epi Info.</p>

		The MLHS&SS and MH&W, unfortunately, did not enjoy similar technical support as a result of difficulties experienced in sourcing suitable expertise within the timeframe necessary to realize tangible benefits.
<p>Briefly explain differences between planned and actual outputs (if applicable).</p> <p>In this component, the Ministries that benefited from consultants' support have realized progress in their data management outputs. Skills were enhanced, not only at the center but also at the primary data entry points in the regions. Several factors speak to the differences that are evident in the project results. Unexpected operational difficulties with the consultant at MLHS&SS resulted in the termination of that contract. Other attempts to provide the required technical support were stymied by administrative delays that were so pronounced that there was eventually insufficient time to accommodate the amount of work that was expected to be done within the remaining duration of the project. Several factors led to the LMs being unable to have current annual bulletins published and available by EOP. These ranged from the prolonged absence of the statistical clerk at MOE for maternity reasons to delays in the release of funds and problems with some data sets at the MOH and MOHA.</p>		
<p>Restructuring: Indicate if this component was restructured. Briefly discuss the consequences of these changes. [N/A]</p>		
<p align="center">Summary Implementation Progress Classification</p>		
<p>[] Highly Satisfactory (HS) [X] Satisfactory (S) [] Unsatisfactory (U) [] Very Unsatisfactory (I)</p>		

d. Project Costs

i. Summary

Approved Original Loan ('000)	Cancelled ('000)	Approved Current ('000)	Actual Expenditure ('000)	Available Amount ('000)	% Difference (Approved Current/Actual)
US\$3,450,000.00	US\$587,895.50	US\$2,862,105.50	US\$2,862,104.50.	0.00	100%

iii. Details

Category ('000)	Approved Current ('000)	Actual Expenditure ('000)	% Difference (Actual vs. Approved Current) ('000)
Administration	340,252.17	340,252.17	0%
Project Coordination Unit	297,574.99	297,574.99	0%
Program Implementation	42,677.18	42,677.18	0%
Direct Costs	2,487,352.33	2,487,352.33	0%
Strengthening Bureau of Statistics	1,898,195.48	1,898,195.48	0%
Social Sector Ministries	589,156.85	589,156.85	0%
Concurrent Costs	0	0	0%
Audit	0	0	0%
Unallocated	0	0	0%
Contingencies	0	0	0%
Capitalization Charges	34,500.00	34,500.00	0%
F. I. V.	34,500.00	34,500.00	0%
Revolving Fund	0	0	-
Total	2,862,104.50	2,862,104.50	0%

IV. Project Implementation

a. Analysis of Critical Factors

Several critical factors contributed to the status of the project's targets at End of Project. These are discussed below:

The willingness of key decision makers in the project to be flexible and responsive during project execution to situations that were clearly not bringing about the best results. This occurred after the mid term review identified a misalignment between the current technical support requirements of the BOS and those that were negotiated in the initial work plan with the USCB. The discussions that were subsequently encouraged allowed for agreement between stakeholders regarding a revised work plan for USCB. This plan spoke to tangible and specific skills / 'know-how' needs in BOS. Key informants attest to a quickening of the pace of activities that flowed thereafter. During the period that followed the revision, it is said that much more was achieved by the USCB and the BOS. This progress is reflected in the deliverables that were completed in Component 1.

The competence, experience and dedication of the LM consultants and the demonstrated interest and commitment from staff have contributed to the successful results in the Line Ministries. According to the final report from LM consultants in the MOH and MOE, and from interviews with statistical personnel in both ministries, the monthly and quarterly reviews of work plans provided the impetus for senior statisticians to take ownership of the improvements that were being undertaken. Tasks were therefore consistently tracked and every effort made to ensure that where corrective action was indicated it was actually carried through. In addition, because training was directed to the improvement of familiar data management routines, the benefits were readily visible and therefore eagerly embraced.

Discussions with all levels of statistical staff throughout the participating organizations, revealed a sense of 'ownership' which has undoubtedly contributed to the achievements realized. It is clear that these LMs have strengthened capacity at EOP in terms of managing statistical data despite the hiccups that surfaced along the journey of this complex operation. From where statistical and policy analysis capacity in this sub sector was before the intervention, to the capacity that now exists and the products that have materialized from the project's execution, the growing statistical culture cannot be refuted. The evidence of these early impacts is seen in more timely statistical publications in all of the LMs – e.g. in MOE, the time lag of two years was eliminated; speedier and more accurate submission of primary data from the regions to the center; the fact that statistical staff at levels lower than that of statistician can now conduct data analysis. Another clear success story can be found in the Ministry of Home Affairs. This Ministry did not have a statistical Unit, and therefore their institutional capacity challenges were more pronounced than in other organizations. The strategy employed at the beginning of the project – recruiting and training a core of statisticians to fill slots in the BOS as well as to staff the nucleus of statistical units in the designated participating ministries – bore fruit. In the case of the MOHA, while this Ministry did benefit from a LM consultant, seniors insist that staff '*created their own innovations*' (statistical templates) and a number of important strides were made. Flagship outputs were the Ministry's 2006 Bulletin which was its very first statistical report, the creation of a new position in the structure - *Head, Research and Policy Analysis* – and the filling of that post that sent a strong signal of the Ministry's commitment to the objectives of this project. The Ministry is now better positioned to support a number of statistically related reforms in another IDB funded Loan – the Citizens' Security Program. Other innovations include an access database for prisoners, developed as a pilot at the Georgetown Prison; statistical support for the production of annual reports for the Ministry and other reports from the agencies that fall under the purview of the Ministry, e.g. Prisons, Police, Fire and GRO.

The Steering Committee's proposal that a pay supplement should be given to statistical staff in the BOS and across participating LMs, provided an incentive that resulted in sustained interest and high motivation levels. This was ultimately translated into a smooth and ready pace of reforms and achievements across the system. Through the sustained efforts of the UNDP, this supplement was paid up to February 2008. Unfortunately, the abrupt cessation of this supplement led to high levels of dissatisfaction and disappointment, as the UNDP support came to an end, and the GOG was unable to source funds to continue these payments, Statistical staff informed this evaluation that the momentum of staff support to the reforms reduced and of even more concern, led to the resignations. During the evaluation, a few other resignations surfaced while some other staff openly indicated that they were seeking similar job opportunities outside of the public service.

It should be noted that retention of trained staff was an assumption in the project's log frame and while the incentive presented mitigating action, unfortunately it could not be sustained.

The achievements of Component 2 fell short of the target of five LMs in the KOI since two Ministries did not benefit from the planned in-depth capacity building from the support of full time statistical consultants. This situation resulted from difficulties in sourcing competent experts; delays in decision –making, procurement processes and, finally there was insufficient time left in the project for meaningful work to be undertaken.

The long standing statistical culture of the MLHS&SS, derived from previous institutional strengthening support from UNICEF and CDB, together with the technical guidance and leadership offered by the statistician who was assigned to the Ministry from the BOS resulted in several achievements. Under this project, the hitherto sole publication – the Guyana Labour Market Quarterly Statistical Bulletin- is up-to-date (up-to-December 2008) and for the very first time, a Social Services Quarterly Statistical Bulletin began publication of social data in 2006. This publication is also up-to-date, as at the last quarter of 2008. However, other critical benchmarks under the program, including an official statistical catalogue for the Ministry and data management training, was not attained since external support was needed. The same level of underachievement occurred in the MH&W, for similar reasons.

Despite the fact that Government agencies have always tended to be reluctant in sharing data as a result of their roles as custodians of related information, at EOP, there has been some encouraging advancements regarding the Open Access Data Policy. The adoption of new technologies has highlighted the need to deal with issues of primary data security and confidentiality. Accordingly, the BOS has developed an internal data access policy and this is now awaiting the approval of the Board. Details of the action that is in progress are highlighted in Section 3.3, subsection 1.13

During project implementation, coordination between the participating agencies was enhanced more as a result of informal relationships rather than deliberate, formally planned and executed mechanisms. The USCB and the LM consultants had informal periodic discussions on various issues of common interest to both parties in an attempt to have the two components more aligned. USCB also, from time to time, invited the LM Consultants to some of their training sessions. With most senior staff still in post at BOS and LMs, the alliance formed will most likely continue, resulting in a more integrated national statistical system.

On the issues of monitoring and coordination, information sharing within the project, many informants felt that these are areas that had some weaknesses which should be reviewed and improved in future operations. Several key informants were unaware of the mid-term evaluation report and had no idea that there were recommendations aimed at improving the project's performance for the remaining duration of the project.

Finally, the most critical factor that impacted significantly on the results of the Project was the lengthy time it took to both source a suitable statistical firm and to have the firm began the consultancy. Approximately almost two years had elapsed from project start up before the selected firm – the USCB- commenced its work. In the initial procurement process, steering committee minutes indicated that the PEU had expected to have the statistical firm contracted by the end of July 2005. Due to inadequate response to the initial advertisements, and the move to a selected competitive process, the USCB was contracted in May 2006 but, as a result of its own challenges in mobilizing a team, the consultancy did not commence until September 2006. These time lags reduced the period of execution, although the project in the final analysis benefited from two extension periods totaling fourteen months. The first extension – January to March 2009, was intended to enable the USCB to complete its work, following a revision of its work plan.

The previous sections have described the achievements that were realized in this project at EOP. At the 'Outcome' level, of the three KOIs extracted from the Log Frame, two were met and one partially met, at the level of Outputs, 9 out of 18 KOIs have been fully met; 6 partially met and 2 not met. A quick perusal of the "partially met" benchmarks reveal that the only requirement for 100% achievement was in the case of 2 benchmarks, where policy decisions by the Government were being awaited(e.g. publication of the official

statistical catalogue; and for pragmatic reasons, the date for the conduct of the Household Survey was postponed). Of the remaining 4 “partially met” benchmarks, 2 relating to the institutional strengthening within 5 LMs. In excess of 60% achievement was realized although 2 LMs did not benefit from the planned level of technical support. Finally, one of the two benchmarks that are categorized as “not met” – National Master Sample Frame- did not realize 100% achievement only because the planned Census (upon which its finalization depended) was deferred to 2010. All of its preparatory activities were completed. The preceding narrative and this simple qualitative perspective supports the consensus of stakeholders at the Exit Workshop that sufficient progress has been realized to conclude that the national statistical system is poised to realize the Development Objective of this project. It is clear that while 100% achievement has not been reached, important advancements have been made and their contribution to the overall modernization of the statistical system cannot be denied.

b. Borrower/Executing Agency Performance

The collective views of key informants have resulted in the following conclusions regarding the Borrower’s performance during project execution:

Borrower / Executing Agency			
<input type="checkbox"/> Highly Satisfactory (HS)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Satisfactory (S)	<input type="checkbox"/> Unsatisfactory (U)	<input type="checkbox"/> Very Unsatisfactory

c. Bank Performance

The Bank’s performance was assessed from the experiences captured from members of the PEUs and participating agencies. This conclusion is tabled below:

Bank Performance			
<input type="checkbox"/> Highly Satisfactory (HS)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Satisfactory (S)	<input type="checkbox"/> Unsatisfactory (U)	<input type="checkbox"/> Very Unsatisfactory (VU)

V. Sustainability

a. Analysis of Critical Factors

The national social statistics systems, in recent years, have begun to reflect some improvements from the several technical cooperation programs provided by the World Bank, UNDP, UNICEF and CDB. These improvements have gathered even more momentum from this IDB supported SSPA Program.

Several organizational elements were strengthened by the Project. From where the capabilities of the institution were, prior to the project, to the present position at EOP principals at BOS have declared, that the BOS is now in a much better position to execute its mandate as the leader of the national system. Focus group interviews with staff from both the BOS and LM, by and large, have confirmed that statistical staff believes that the training received has been relevant to their work demands – improving the data collection and analysis methodologies employed. Staff also indicated that they feel more empowered both in their operational areas and as trainers. The collective effect of these efforts has been demonstrated into a better quality of annual statistical publications that is now available to the public, such quality is reflected in a more informative and user-friendly presentation.



According to a rapid survey among LMs, heads of statistical units affirm that efficiencies in day-to-day statistical operations have begun to emerge. These have been measured by the speed with which staff can now respond to queries and the period within which publications, reports are completed. All agree that the factors leading to these positive changes hinge around the training received the upgraded and updated computerized systems as well as the empowerment of junior statistical staff who are now confident enough to execute more analytical work. In addition, there is general recognition from superiors and end-users that statistical units are now providing an enhanced level of service that is more timely, technically solid and relevant.

Through training in cluster workshop delivery methodologies, LM staffs were in turn able to instruct front line data collectors in the regions. Consequently, a better quality of data output is being received from the various satellite data collection centers/ points in several regions. Both regional units/ teams and center ministry staff in the education and health sectors now have supporting operational documentation in the form of procedure, instructional and desk manuals. While approximately 32% (10 out of 31) of staff in the participating LMs have since left and there is the possibility that there may be some more resignations, the detailed procedure manuals, desk manuals and revised job descriptions will certainly contribute to continuity of the new work practices and therefore help to sustain the capacity of these ministries as new persons are recruited. In the MOHA, all of the 3 statisticians who benefited from the generic statistical training provided by the BOS, have now resigned. However, in this LM /sector, capacity was built beyond the Ministry, through in-house training provided to other service departments such as, GRO, Police, Fire and Prisons. These departments have also been equipped with instructional manuals so that the new data management practices could be sustained. Staffs are now in a position to better collect and manage data that relates to PRS and MDG indicators. Despite the fact that LMs, although trained, are not as yet utilizing the DEVINFO software, most officers in the focus groups agree that there is enough data to justify the use of more complex software packages. The monitoring and evaluation methodologies, also captured in the manuals, have strengthened oversight of data capture especially at primary sources in the regions and these systems are now firmly entrenched in the routines of the LMs that benefited from consultancy support over an eighteen month period. There is now greater collaboration between statistical Units and MIS units in social sector ministries, where these exist.

The capacity of BOS, notwithstanding the attrition experienced, was strengthened. Proficiency was fortified on several fronts, including production and analysis of tabulated data; logic and programming flows; program analysis and forms analysis; data collection; questionnaire design and sample design; analytical report writing skills and the use of complex statistical packages. These skills have now equipped BOS with increased capability to conduct surveys with enhanced validity, relevance and accuracy. Its current increased proficiency in statistical analysis will now contribute to the desired evidence-based policy analysis that underpins the objective of this project's design. All of the BOS's work practices have now been made more efficient (in terms of accuracy and timeliness) through their collective ability to use state-of-the-art statistical software that can better handle census and survey data. The agency has advanced technologically as a result of the hardware and software component of this project. BOS is therefore positioned to produce the kind of reports that are widely recognized as being on the cutting edge. Finally, this evaluation established the existence of manuals that are detailed and well documented for all functional areas. Key examples include coding, edit and imputation specifications to improve the quality of data; guidelines for training in cartography and for collecting data needed for use in LFS.

Despite the significant advances that have occurred at organizational level in BOS and LMs; the question may well be asked: 'is there now a national system that allows for free, systematic exchange of information between the agencies concerned, in order to facilitate the generation of reports of national import, such as, the PRS and MDG? How has policy analysis been affected during or after the project?

There are a number of considerations to enable a national statistical system to be truly functional and effective. Key elements, according to statisticians in BOS and LMs are, in summary, (i) standardization of data definitions in keeping with international standards; (ii) preparation and dissemination of these definitions; (iii) publishing of data concepts and definitions; (iv) developing a data sharing protocol for participating agencies:

(v) establishing the data management system with WAN and LAN connections; (vi) populate the system and maintain.

Progress has been encouraging but there was a mixed scorecard. The DMS was already in place at the MOF- its connectivity linked to the national financial management system. The software – Devinco- was selected and all staff at BOS and LMs have been trained in its use; at the time of the final evaluation, 75% of data had been populated and completion was envisaged to be end of October; Data concepts and definitions were harmonized between LMs and Bos but not published, A draft open access policy was being studied at BOS, in-house but yet to be ratified. Data was being exchanged between BOS and LMs 'on demand' frequently enough to keep the process going but not formally. After four years of working across organizational boundaries, sharing information, however, a culture of cooperation and information sharing has evolved. Since there is a plan to have this matter resolved by year end, a national statistical system is in existence, albeit, informally. Primary data collection has been improved in LMs and this is updated regularly from public servants from the related region, Staff in both LMs and BOS have affirmed that as a result of their training in advanced statistical analysis, better analysis have emerged in the PRS related reports. The national statistical system now has capacity to contribute much more soundly to the monitoring of PSR and MDG indicators. According to consultants' and other project reports, at EOP, there are now more indicators than the 27 that existed at the onset of this project. In the administrative regions, data collection/conversion to output profiles is taking into account PRSP and MDG indicators. This work is continuing as a result of the capacity built during this project.

b. Potential Risks

The potential risks to the sustainability of project outputs and early outcomes are as follows:

- i. Continued turnover of trained technical staff at BOS and LMs with limited replacements can eventually erode the gains realized from this intervention.
- ii. Prolonged time lapse between training and the conduct of activities / programs that require these skills can result in a loss of effectiveness.
- iii. Delays in pronouncing on important policy matters, such as (a) the 'open data access policy'; (b) formal administrative edict restating roles and responsibilities of BOS and social sector LMs; (c) formal protocols to ensure timely information sharing /transfer between the BOS and LMs can restrict further advancements in the national statistical system. Early action on these matters can also contribute to the response to governance concerns relating to 'openness' and 'transparency'.
- iv. If social statistics do not continue to be a priority on the agenda of LMs, the availability of resources necessary to support the work of the statistical units can become insufficient.
- v. The continued relevance and usage of the significant IT infrastructure. The effectiveness of the IT system across the BoS and LMs can be at risk if a comprehensive and integrated maintenance system is not speedily developed and provision made for its early implementation through appropriate budgetary allocations. This must of necessity include replacing equipment as well as acquiring updated versions and licenses for necessary statistical software packages.
- vi. Delays in building up the institutional knowledge and other required competencies necessary for the new M&E Unit in the MOF, to speedily undertake and discharge the functions of the former PCPMU in the OP, can restrict the timely monitoring of critical poverty related indicators and policies.

Strategies to address these risks should be pursued with alacrity if the momentum of the results of this project is not to be lost.

c. Institutional Capacity

This project's execution saw an unusual phenomenon where there was a change in the executing Agency towards the end of project execution. The original Executing Agency – the PCPMU, Office of the President –



was funded through a World Bank Project and this came to an end in November 2008. A policy decision was taken to transfer the functions of the PCPMU, the PEU and responsibility for this project to the MOF. Discussions with a few key informants, however, including one person from the now defunct M&E Unit and another from the MOF revealed some insights into this new arrangement. MOF is ideally suited to assume this responsibility as a result of its extensive experience in policy monitoring and evaluation. Moreover, its management of the national development agenda includes perhaps an indirect monitoring and analysis of the progress of the implementation of the PRS and MDGs.

In addition, a new unit within the Office of the Budget has been identified to execute the monitoring and evaluation of the PSR and MDG implementation and impact. During the evaluation, further insight into the status of the Unit was provided by reports from LMs that the MOF had recently requested agencies to update information pertaining to the PRS and MDG indicators in a specific format. This would seem to confirm that the MOF is already discharging its new responsibility.

d. Scope of Project sustainability imperatives

Discussions with key stakeholders have resulted in a substantial list of actions/services that are believed to be essential in order to ensure the sustainability of products, services and actions initiated by this project. These are presented at two levels (i) the immediate actions required to complete the activities of this project that remain incomplete at the end of this project; (ii) the medium term actions that will promote sustainability of the present project results.

This evaluation has identified the most recurrent across the BOS and LMs based on the assessments made, and the following recommendations are offered:

Immediate actions required:

- i. The unit that is charged with responsibility for monitoring PRS and MDGs in the MOF should organize a task force, including BOS (as Leader of the statistical system), to ensure that all incomplete activities are concluded within an agreed specified period.
- ii. The preparation of a detailed action plan/ short-term sustainability plan by each participating LM to guarantee that all outstanding activities from this operation are completed within the agreed time frame. The Plan should include responsibilities, timelines and an internal policy level oversight body and mechanism to track progress until completion, reporting to the Task Force recommended above.

Medium term actions

The MOF and the BOS should develop an agenda for further reforms that would improve the sustainability of this project's results. Such an agenda should include, as priorities, the following elements:

- i. Mobilization of funds to replicate the upgrading of data management skills and analytical skills in the Ministries of H&W; LHS&SS and possible Agriculture, which was previously mentioned during project design, as a possible candidate for this technical support.
- ii. Review of the institutional arrangements in the statistical system as a whole, considering integration options together with a range of issues such as centralization vis-à-vis decentralization; realignment of structural (organizational) statistical requirements at LMs and regions; possible integrated career path; pay incentives etc.
- iii. Continued institutional strengthening at both BOS and LMs: implementation of the proposed integrated M&E system, for the measurement of PRS and MDG indicators, completing the remote connectivity, responding to the harmonization of data and open access policy proposals commenced in this project. Other recommended features are additional training in the statistical software packages; continuous training and upgrade programmes; software upgrades etc.



- iv. Develop a scheme for bilateral skills support, in the area of statistics considering sources such as India, Commonwealth Volunteer Scheme, etc as an interim measure to respond to the continued staff attrition rates in the system.
- v. In conjunction with the University of Guyana, design and implement a progressive statistical development program from certificate level to graduate level.

VI. Monitoring and Evaluation

a. Information on Results

There was inadequate access to a wide range of internal project documents since the PEU was closed at the time of this evaluation. While some key documentation was shared electronically with the evaluators, there were insufficient project records to make a definitive assessment of the project management processes. From interviews with key informants and a perusal of the final reports from LM consultants, it would appear that this project did not have a formal monitoring and evaluation mechanism. This matter was also highlighted in the Mid-term Evaluation Report. Despite this omission, the PEU did meet all of the reporting requirements of the Bank as well as the monthly progress reports and quarterly reports for the Steering Committee. As a result, the evaluation was able to assess the final results of the project, based on credible project information. Sources included project progress reports in particular, the semi-annual reports and the final project 'close out' report submitted by the PC; consultants' reports regarding the support provided in line ministries; diagnostic reports from consultants; minutes of Steering Committee where these were available; the mid-term evaluation report. Complementing these sources that pointed largely to quantitative achievements, some degree of qualitative assessment was achieved through the several interviews with key informants from the BOS and participating LMs. The information from both streams of inquiry was collated and compared. There was no significant disconnect between the several findings.

b. Future Monitoring and Ex-Post Evaluation

The Loan Document states that the borrower has elected not to carry out a formal ex-post evaluation of the Program.

VII. Lessons Learned

A number of lessons can be derived from the execution of this operation. These may be considered for possible application/ adaptation to future similar projects. Key examples are listed hereunder:

- i. In developing contexts where institutional strengthening projects require a stable workforce in the transfer of technology/ 'know-how' and incentives, such as pay supplements are considered, every effort should be made by executing agencies to develop, prior to project execution, sustainable solutions that are practical, non controversial and economically feasible so that once granted, they can be maintained over time. This is critical if staff is to remain committed to the organization. Alternatively, pay supplements, designed to attract and retain critical staff in interventions where project success is contingent on a stable workforce, should not be paid as a regular adjunct to normal emoluments. Rather, the same incentive can be awarded in the form of an honorarium annually across the life of the project, based on agreed project targets. This would eliminate the need for sustainability beyond the project's life, dispensing with issues of disappointment and 'demoralization' that follow the cessation of such incentives.
- ii. The strategy of mobilizing and training a pool of persons that are needed to form the core group of change agents, particularly in programs with multiple participating agencies/beneficiaries, is a useful approach prior to the execution of the intended initiatives. In this Project it had the utility of creating ownership and commitment to the total range of reforms. It also promoted the desired



collaboration across institutional boundaries, providing a force that advocates change and thereby increasing the probability for project success.

- iii. In programs that require collaboration among participating agencies, formal protocols, such as Memorandum of Understanding should be agreed upon and established, prior to project execution. This has the advantage of defining the respective roles, facilitates the effective discharge of individual agency responsibilities and sets the groundwork for a truly participatory approach to project execution.
- iv. Capacity building initiatives that require an IT knowledge base should seek to establish this competence in the persons who are expected to be the beneficiaries of the planned initiatives, prior to the implementation of the specialized interventions. Remedial activities for persons without the requisite base IT skills should be mandatory and undertaken before the primary initiatives. This would maximize the benefits of the core capacity building initiatives reducing delays through related problems during project execution, and increasing the probability of a successful outcome.
- v. In the case of projects that produce a heavy concentration of IT equipment, there should be an early identification, and development of maintenance and upgrading plans for which budgetary provision should be secured before the project comes to an end. Mechanisms should be developed to ensure that this occurs. Such steps would better position the relevant beneficiary agencies to sustain the levels of technological advancement achieved in the project.
- vi. The design of similar statistical projects should include an activity that allows staff in the various sector ministries to actually analyze a policy and present viable alternatives. This would present a direct link to the issue of policy analysis, building a culture where such responses would be automatic and contributing in a small way to better and more relevant public policies.
- vii. In projects of this nature good indicators for the future measure of impact can be gleaned from the development framework. This would enable generators of statistical data to collect information that would measure the progressive incremental improvement of the country to (a) generate appropriate statistical information that can better monitor the impact of PRS interventions allowing for policy decisions that enable choices and are more responsive to alleviating social problems on the ground.
- viii. In development projects generally, institutional strengthening will remain a challenge unless there is a programmatic approach to this important issue. Since such interventions require time for effective operation and consolidation, a longer term, sector oriented, programmatic approach is indicated to address issues of sustainability. The Bank is already engaged in dialogue with the various sectors regarding such approaches, using a combination of instruments. This is certainly indicated in this national statistical system and the Bank has signaled its willingness to continue this kind of support in this subsector.

Annexes:

1. Project Cost Table
2. Minutes from Exit Workshop
3. Borrower Evaluation



ANNEXES



ANNEX 1:

Project Cost Table



ANNEX 1:
Social Statistics and Policy Analysis
Project Cost Table by Component and Funding Source.

Category ('000)		Approved Current (Revised Budget) ('000)			Actual Expenditure ('000)			Balance on Budget ('000)			% Balance on Budget		
		IDB	GOG	TOTAL	IDB ³	GOG	TOTAL	IDB	GOG	TOTAL	IDB	GOG	TOTAL
1.	<u>INVESTMENT COMPONENT</u>												
CODE	Project Administration	340,252.17	0	340,252.17	340,252.17	0	340,252.17	0	0	0	0	0	0
01.00.00													
01.01.00	Project Coordination Unit	297,574.99	0	297,574.99	297,574.99	0	297,574.99	0	0	0	0	0	0
01.02.00	Project Implementation	42,677.18	0	42,677.18	42,677.18	0	42,677.18	0	0	0	0	0	0
02.00.00	Direct Costs	2,487,352.33	0	2,487,352.33	2,487,352.33	0	2,487,352.33	0	0	0	0	0	0
02.01.00.00	Strengthening Bureau of Statistics	1,898,195.48	0	1,898,195.48	1,898,195.48	0	1,898,195.48	0	0	0	0	0	0
02.02.00.00	Social Sector Ministries	589,156.85	0	589,156.85	589,156.85	0	589,156.85	0	0	0	0	0	0
03.00.00	Concurrent Costs	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
03.01.00	Audit	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
04.00.00.00	Unallocated	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
04.01.00.00.	Contingencies	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
	Sub-total	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
2.	<u>Capitalization Charges</u>												
87.00.00.00		34,500.00	0	34,500.00	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
87.01.00.00.	FIV	34,500.00	0	34,500.00	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
87.01.01.00	FIV	34,500.00	0	34,500.00	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
TOTAL		2,862,104.50	0.00	2,862,104.50	2,862,104.50	0.00	2,862,104.50	0.00	0.00	0.00	0	0	0



Annex 2.

Minutes from the Exit Workshop



SOCIAL STATISTICS AND POLICY ANALYSIS PROGRAMME

MINUTES OF THE EXIT WORKSHOP

May 14, 2009

1. Introduction

The participatory project evaluation workshop for the Social Statistics and Policy Analysis Project was held on May 14, 2009 at the Grand Coastal Inn, Le Ressouvenir, and East Coast Demerara. Forty (40) persons were invited from the participating agencies, namely, Ministry of Education, Ministry Of Health, Ministry of Home Affairs, Ministry of Housing and Water, Ministry, Ministry of Labour, Ministry of Finance, Bureau of Statistics and the Inter American Development Bank. Of this number, twenty seven (27) persons including the Minister within the Ministry of Finance, senior officials, the IDB Resident Representative and several other key officials from the Bank, attended the Opening Session. The persons who remained to interact in the workshop's participatory evaluation numbered 19. Details of the attendance are captured in Annex A of this document.

The objectives of the Workshop were:

- Assess the results of the program in keeping with its key performance indicators and its contribution to the achievement of the Development objective
- Identify the challenges to the sustainability/ institutionalization of project outputs and early impacts and the critical actions needed to improve sustainability.
- Assess the appropriateness of the project design as well as the project management practices employed
- Identify lessons learnt that can be applied to the design of future similar projects.

The participatory evaluation was addressed at two levels: at the group level where participants were organized into four working groups and tasked with the responsibility of assessing the program in terms of achievements, sustainability, project design and management and identification of lessons learnt. Secondly, at the wider workshop level, groups were given the opportunity to present their conclusions to the entire workshop stimulating discussions among all participants that led to additions to the ideas that were presented, clarifications, and finally consensus.

In order to encourage informed and meaningful interactions, and in accordance with the Bank's guidelines for such project 'close out' activities, a copy of the draft Project Completion Report (PCR) was circulated to all of the invitees, prior to the workshop. In addition, Guide Questions were provided for each evaluation element in order to better focus the group discussions.

The following represents the conclusions of the workshop:



2. Assessment of Project Results:

2.1. Participatory Group Assessment

Component 1: Strengthening of the Bureau of Statistics: Assessment of Project Results (Outcome and Output) & the Sustainability of these Results.

2.1.1. Outcomes and Outputs

The workshop agreed that the key project outcomes that relate to the strengthening of the BOS were as follows:

- The BOS was able to develop a policy paper on internal information dissemination; at present the statistical act addresses only the external dissemination of information and while data collection is done under the law, the need to protect its confidentiality in this technologically advanced age has become an imperative. This document now awaits the board approval after which it is intended that it should be shared with the line ministries.
- Strengthening of institutional memory through the production of procedure manuals (National Economic Survey, GIS mapping, labour force survey, rebasing, sampling) which would help to reduce the possible negative effects on the performance of the agency that can result from a rapid staff turn-over.
- Training in planning and executing of the national economic and labour force surveys as well as the improvement in the IT department with the acquisition of new software.
- Improved culture of documentation within departments of BOS.

2.1.1.1. Critical influencing factors

The workshop agreed on the following key factors that influenced the final results in this component:

Positive factor:

- The physical presence of USCB consultants, following the review after the first year of the project, allowed for a better transfer of knowledge and skills not only on the job but in the informal encounters after work. This proved much more beneficial than relating to consultants who were not physically present at the BOS.

Negative factors:

- Loss of staff throughout project life. Of the 15 persons recruited by the BOS at project start up in 2005, only 3 are still with the agency.
- Shortly after the project execution commenced some disruption was brought about by the need of the BOS to relocate to allow for the rehabilitation of the existing building. The BOS is now housed in three separate locations. Apart from the disruptions to the work processes the BOS suffered losses of material and data during the relocation process.
- The absence of full-time physical presence of USCB consultants at BOS during the first year of the consultancy mitigated against the anticipated/required level of knowledge and skills transfer. This situation was however corrected after a review session.



- There was an uneven platform among BOS and LMs with regard to salaries of technical staff. Both salaries on offer were unable to attract the required skills to fill critical vacancies. An attempt was made to address this by providing both BOS staff and line ministry staff with a pay supplement for the duration of the project that was funded by the UNDP. Notwithstanding this, at EOP, the differential between BOS and LMS staff remains the same with BOS at a higher level.

2.1.1.2. Realization of developmental objective

The participants agreed that the Development Objective of this Program was realized in terms of the corresponding Key Outcome Indicators that are listed in the Log frame.

- Through exposure of all staff to training, there has been an improvement of their skills in all of the key areas such as economic-statistics, social statistics, demography, survey planning and sampling. Most important was the application of the training to the work that they were doing.

2.1.1.3. BOS capacity to function as the coordinator of a national statistical system

- Based on exposure and training received by staff, BOS is now positioned to execute its legal mandate as the coordinator of a national statistical system. It is helped in this function by the existence of strong units at the Ministry of Health, Ministry of Education and the Ministry of Labour. At the moment, however, key units such as Ministry of Agriculture, Ministry of Finance and Ministry of Housing & Water are out of the loop. Concrete proposals are being developed to strengthen these ministries through a similar type project since the current project emphasis was on the social sector ministries

2.1.2. Externalities

Participants identified the following unexpected results following project execution:

- Wider awareness in the community regarding the availability of information. Via its website and advertising when in the fields, the BOS has created a greater awareness of the information it has and the services it offers. This is manifested by the increased requests for information and suggestions on improvements to its web site with respect to available information. Specifically, a heightened awareness has been noted in the business community.
- BOS received from the USCB assistance in the planning and execution of the household budget survey.
- Loss of staff by BOS and LMs has led to a corresponding gain by local non governmental agencies and the Caribbean community

2.1.4. SUSTAINABILITY

The workshop identified the following conditions that exist at End of Project that will enable the products realized in this component to be sustained:

- Senior management and senior technical staff that were there from project inception and thus were able to absorb all the training are still in place at project completion



- All areas have detailed technical manuals thus ensuring the preservation of the institutional memory.
- On going work e.g. census 2010 preparations and national surveys have allowed for the immediate application of skills acquired during the project execution.

2.1.5. Factors that can threaten sustainability

The following factors were identified by participants as potential threats to the sustainability of project results:

- The non application of new skills and techniques learnt on the short to medium term.
- Erosion of salary and benefits base of staff.
- Cut back on budgetary provisions.
- Lack of a permanent physical location which would allow for the housing of the full complement of staff i.e. 135 positions.
- Continued attrition of skilled staff.
- Negative media. (The need to build relationship with the media rather than avoid it).
- A shift in Government's policy priorities, away from the area of statistics.

2.1.6. Steps needed to improve sustainability

The workshop identified the following as the next steps that should be undertaken in order to improve the sustainability of the project's results:

- Re-establishment of a supply chain of graduates from the University of Guyana both at the degree and diploma level in the area of statistics. This is was felt was essential to provide a continuous supply of statistical skills to service the needs of BOS and line ministries.
The participants felt that attempts to remold graduates from related fields such as mathematics, economics, sociology etc, into statisticians have not proven successful as evidenced by the very low retention rate. The IDB did support a one year Masters program in social statistics at UG during the life of the project. A recent welcome sign is that UG has signaled its intention to recommence the statistics program at the undergraduate level in the coming academic year.
- Eliminate salary differentials between Line Ministries and BOS staff.
- Continuous training in all areas of statistical analysis.

2.1.7. FURTHER ASSISTANCE FROM THE BANK

Further assistance by the Bank was identified as follows:

- Financing for continuous training and ,
- Sustaining 'in- house' support consultants for BOS in areas such as demography and IT to bridge existing skills' gaps.



2.2. Component 2: Upgrading of data Management & Analysis in Social Sector Ministries.

2.2.1. Results

The workshop identified the following key results from the project execution of Component 2:

- Enhanced skills from training interventions. Over 80% of line ministry staff received generic training conducted by BOS, while staff of the Ministries of Health, Education and Home Affairs benefited from in house training by consultants in specific work related activities.
- Improved data collection and data management methods. New and revised forms were developed for primary data collection in the regions by Health and Education Officials. Staff of the Ministries of Education, Health and Home affairs was also trained in data analysis.
- Establishment of statistical units at the Ministries of Home Affairs, Housing and Water. Previously no statistical units existed in these agencies.
- A higher quality of statistical bulletins in LMs. Statistical bulletins produced by the Ministries of Education and Health were of a distinctly improved quality and more user friendly. In the case of MOHA and the social services department of MLHS&SS, statistical bulletins were produced for the first time.
- Production of operational manuals. These manuals have helped to develop the institutional memory and could be used as orientation guides by new employees thus allowing them to get a quick grasp of their duties and responsibilities.

2.2.2. Realization of Development objectives

The participants agreed that the Development Objective of this Program was realized. They affirmed their belief that the national statistical system now has the capacity to generate social and other relevant data that can be used by several stakeholders to undertake policy analysis and monitor the PRS implementation and MDGs achievement. Examples quoted by the workshop are presented hereunder:

- Improved access to data by policy makers and other interested parties; production of up to date and a better quality of statistical bulletins in the Education, Health and Labour sectors.
- Production of statistical data on water production and distribution in all ten administrative regions from GWI.
- Production of statistical data on house lot allocation and corresponding occupancy by CH&PA.
- Production of Social Statistical bulletin by the Ministry of Labour Human Services and Social Security covering topics such as public assistance, old age pension and the distribution of school uniform. These data sets allow for an indirect measure of poverty.

2.2.3. BOS

The participants opined that there is now a better communication link between the BOS and Line Ministries thus placing the BOS in a better position to execute its function as the coordinator of the national statistical system.



2.2.4. Unexpected results

Participants believed that the resignation of a number of trained staff after project completion was an unexpected negative result of this project.

2.2.5. Sustainability

The workshop identified the following conditions that exist at End of Project that will enable the products realized in this component to be sustained:

- Existence of procedures manuals covering all aspects of the data management process at the Ministries of Health, Education and Home Affairs.
- Retention of 50 % of staff trained under the project at the Ministry of Labour, Human Services and Social Security.
- One hundred percent (100 %) staff retention at the Ministry of Education
- In excess of 90% retention of trained staff at the Ministry of Health.
- One hundred percent (100 %) staff retention of in-house trained staff at Ministry of Home Affairs.

2.2.6. Factors that can threaten sustainability

The following factors were identified by participants as potential threats to the sustainability of project results:

- Absence of or inadequate budgetary allocations.
- Shifting of priority focus from the area of statistics by policy makers. This could result in reduced support and resources necessary to maintain the momentum generated by this project. Already the units that were created under the project at the Ministry of Housing and Water have been disbanded. No specific reason was given, but the resignation of the trained statistician created a critical skills gap. In the absence of technical support and guidance available to the junior staff to enable meaningful work, a decision was taken to reassign the residual staff to other duties in the Ministry and its agencies. In GWI, the lone statistician has continued to contribute to the statistical system, notwithstanding the several constraints that exist. Reports on basic water data is now available in a more user-friendly form and is being used by planners as well as by the in-country IDB specialists in the development of policies, plans and programmes at the sector level.
- Boss has experienced a high rate of staff turn over at junior levels, while in LMs, there has been some turnover at senior technical levels as well.

2.2.6.1. Positives

A positive that was identified was the fact that policy makers in the decision-making process in the several ministries and agencies are using data / reports, generated by the various statistical units.



2.2.6.2 Special incentives

Participants felt that special incentives ought to be given to statisticians. Incentives need not necessarily be monetary but could be in other forms as well. One example cited was 'opportunities to attend related overseas training and conferences should be granted to statisticians'.

2.2.6. Steps needed to improve sustainability

The next steps that were identified to improve the sustainability of the components' results were as follows:

- An incentive scheme should be developed and implemented for statistical staff in BOS and LMs.
- Creation of a career path in statistics for persons; commencing with undergraduate training at the University of Guyana.
- Recruitment of consultants to the Ministries of Housing and Water, Labour, Human Services and Social Security so that these agencies can benefit from the institutional strengthening that was undertaken in the other ministries. Specific activities should also include development of procedures and training manuals, conducting in-house training, reviewing existing data collection processes.
- Continued identification of social and other indicators from all LMS and in particular, Ministry of H&W where little work in this area has been pursued.

2.2.7. Further assistance from the Bank

The following areas were identified as possibilities for requesting further assistance from the IDB:

- Support for the recruitment of consultants to the Ministries of Housing and Water, Labour, Human Services and Social Security to undertake institutional strengthening as was done in the other ministries.
- Support for statisticians from LMS and BOS to undertake work study in high performance statistical units in other countries.

Recommendations:

The following recommendations were made by the group:

- i. In recruiting consultants the selection criteria should employ a heavier weight to 'considerable practical experience' in similar type agencies as opposed to purely academic achievement.
- ii. On the question of staff retention consideration should be given to moving employees from the bottom of the scale to a position closer to the top so as to mitigate the effects of inadequate remuneration.

3. Assessment of project management / implementation:

The participants identified the following factors that, in their opinion, constituted key challenges during project implementation:



i. Procurement

The procurement process was generally good with some measure of consultation with the agencies. However it was noted that in this project, the procurement of consultants was a bit tardy with long intervals between the training by Staff and commencement of actual technical work that required consultancy support.

ii. Disbursements

With the exception of minor difficulties relating to monitoring and evaluation, funds were readily available for workshop training, traveling etc.

iii. Coordination

Coordination was generally good at the level of the project steering committee that comprised Permanent Secretaries. However, on occasions, the representation at meetings was not always at the desired level that would have allowed for speedy decision making.

iv. Communication

Throughout the Project, good communication lines existed between the BOS, line ministries and the project executing unit. However, at the regional level, communication appeared less effective in sensitizing local officials in LMs' regional divisions with respect to project activities.

v. Institutional Capacity

- It was opined that generally at the centre ministries institutional capacity was fair in terms of readiness to implement project activities. A noted exception however was the GRO where there was weak capacity both in terms of required skills and technological capacity.
- At the regional level, the capacity to readily respond to the demands of the project was lacking. The MOH had the regional human resource base that was needed but no equipment while the opposite obtained for the MOE where there was equipment in the region but inadequate human resources. Notwithstanding these constraints, both ministries were able to make some advances in the region by continuing to build capacity through the use of their enhanced skill base at the central level.
- While the Project Steering Committee allowed for feedback it was felt that not enough analysis of constraints and of issues affecting the project was done. As a result, many problems that were identified were not adequately addressed.

4. Assessment of Project Design

The workshop concluded that:

- The project design was adequate with logical links between inputs, activities, outputs and outcomes; however more emphasis should have been given to regional outputs and associated activities.



- The key output and outcome indicators were fair and adequate. However, participants felt that in some instances, these indicators were not clearly nor specifically / explicitly stated e.g. even though the GRO was a primary source of data there was no clearly stated indicator to monitor its performance or indeed to state the desired state at EOP.
- All indicators referred to institutions at the centre, with no consideration for what was happening at the regional level.
- Resource allocation appeared reasonable with the bulk of the allocation going to BOS. This was expected since it was the institution of primary focus in this project.

Recommendation

The participants agreed that:

- In the first few years of the project the project steering committee met regularly but this was reduced significantly with the departure of Dr. Coby Frimpong. A formal monitoring and feedback mechanism should have been developed and implemented throughout the life of the project. This would have kept the Line Ministries staff abreast with project developments while ensuring that emerging problems were resolved in a timely manner.

5. Lessons learnt

The workshop identified a number of lessons learnt from the execution of this project and which they believe is worthy of consideration in the design of future similar projects. These are listed under the following themes:

- **In statistical oriented projects that speak to an entire national system, structural considerations are very important for project success.** The recruitment and training of staff at the beginning of this project built a nucleus of trained statisticians who were able to maintain an effective base for the more in-depth institutional strengthening that followed. Even in cases, where such training was not realized, the initial capacity allowed for improved data collection and dissemination; prior to BOS's involvement many of the statistical units operated in a less systematic manner. This approach has certainly enhanced the image of BOS as the coordinator of the national statistical system and has resulted in greater collaboration among staff of line ministries and BOS.
- While fairly substantial pay supplements, have undoubtedly contributed to some level of retention of critical skills needed for the successful execution of some programs, **care should be taken prior to the implementation of these incentives to ensure that they can be sustained beyond the project.** In this particular project, the cessation of such payments has jeopardized the stability of the workforce and by extension, can pose some threat to the sustainability of project outcomes. **In cases where a stable work force is vital to the project, other forms of non-monetary incentives, which would have more permanent impacts, should be considered.**



- **In the case of projects that produce a heavy concentration of IT equipment, there should be an early identification, and development of maintenance and upgrading plans for which budgetary provision should be secured before the project comes to an end.** Mechanisms should be developed to ensure that this occurs. Such steps would better position the relevant beneficiary agencies to sustain the levels of technological advancement achieved in the project.
- **In statistical projects that have technological elements, there should be greater timeliness in links between training interventions and programs where such training is indicated.** While this was not a problem at BOS since the training received was applied to real life problems, at the line ministries this was not always so. Statisticians who were employed and trained by the BOS prior to being assigned to line ministries were not always able to utilize their training particularly in software applications since the packages that were in use in their agencies at the point of training and afterwards were different.
- **Risk management strategies should be robust enough and systematically monitored to contain the potential threats to the successful attainment of project outputs and outcomes.** In the case of this project, while it was obvious to all that there was a potential risk of staff turn over if their conditions were eroded, not enough was done to manage this risk since at project close out there is some element of threat to project sustainability if the high rate of staff turn over that has started, continues.
- In developing the project execution plan, **attention should be given to ensuring that adequate provision is made for the several stages in procurement and financial management processes** in order to have sufficient lead time, so as to prevent potential project delays.
- **Stakeholder engagement and commitment should be rigorously pursued** in order to ensure that all stakeholders are fully on board. The aim would be to avoid related problems, e.g. cooperation, buy-in etc., which will occur at various stages of project execution if these issues are not dealt with adequately prior to project execution.

ANNEX 'A'

SSPA Exit Workshop – May 14, 2009

List of Participants

Senior Government Officials:	Ms. Jennifer Webster, MP, Minister within the MOF Mr. Lennox Benjamin, Chief Statistical Officer Mr. Tarachand Balgobin, Head PCMD, MOF
Bank Officials:	Mr. Marco Nicola, Resident Representative Mr. Alexandre Veyrat-Pontet, International Specialist Mr. Roy Parahoo, Procurement Specialist Ms. Derise Williams, Administrative Officer, IDB Mr. Jorge Lamas, Principal Social Development Specialist
Representatives of Participating Institutions:	
Bureau Of Statistics	Mr. Dharam Seelochan, Deputy Statistics Ms. Michellene Carter, Statistician Ms. Sharon Kreuter, Head, National Accounts Mr. Ian Manifold, Head Surveys Department Ms. Maxine Bentt, Head Trade Department
Ministry of Health	Ms. Alvah Mack, Statistical Officer Ms. Karen Haynes, Statistical Officer Ms. Winifred Goodridge, Snr. Statistician
Ministry of Labour, Human Services and Social Security	Mr. Ivelaw Henry, Chief Statistical Officer Ms. Carole Blenman, Statistical Officer Ms. Abike Benjamin, Statistical Officer Ms. Saskia Onyeka Onwuzirike, Statistical Officer
Ministry of Home Affairs	Ms. Indrawattie Manohar, Statistician Ms. Elizabeth Frank, Research Officer
Ministry of Housing & Water	Ms. Sasha Layne, Statistical Officer Ms. Cheryl Jones, Statistical Officer, Guyana Water INC.
Ministry of Education	Ms. Evelyn Hamilton, Chief Planner
Ministry of Finance	Ms. Ronette Hertsberger – Murray, Economic & Financial Analyst
PEU	Mr. Colin Cyrus, Procurement Officer
Workshop Facilitator	Ms. Leila Parris, Final Evaluation Consultant Mr. Troy Thomas, Statistical Consultant (Final Evaluation) Mr. Gladwin Tait, Assistant Facilitator



ANNEX 3:

Borrower's Evaluation





**Inter- American Development Bank
Project Completion Report –
Borrower's Evaluation**

Project Name: Social Statistics and Policy Analysis.	
Executing Agency(ies): Office of the President – Policy Coordination and Programme Management Unit (PCPMU).	
Borrower: Government of Guyana (GOG).	
Date of Project Approval: March 24, 2008	Date of Contract Effectiveness: October 8, 2004
Date of Borrower Evaluation: August 03, 2009	Expected Date of Exit Workshop: June, 2009

Borrower Project Performance Ratings

Probability on Achieving its Development Objective(s):

☐ Highly Probable (HP) ☒ Probable (P) ☐ Low Probability (LP) ☐ Improbable (I)

Project Implementation:

☐ Highly Satisfactory (HS) ☒ Satisfactory (S) ☐ Unsatisfactory (US) ☐ Very Unsatisfactory (VU)

Sustainability of Project Results:

☐ Highly Probable (HP) ☒ Probable (P) ☐ Low Probability (LP) ☐ Improbable (I)

Comments:

The project has achieved its objective as most of the activities were satisfactorily completed, except for challenges such as: the lengthy time it took to source a suitable statistical firm for **component one** and to have the firm commence the consultancy, a duration of approximately two years from project start up elapsed before a firm was selected. This resulted in the project being extended in order to address the time lag.

In addition, two Ministries did not benefit from the support of full time statistical consultants in **component two** for the planned in-depth institutional strengthening. This situation may have impacted negatively on this component not achieving its full objective as a result of a number of administrative and technical challenges faced by the PEU to source competent persons to provide the required services.

As a result of the training in cluster workshop delivery methodologies, LM staff were in turn able to instruct data collectors in the regions. Consequently, a better quality of data output is being received from the various regions. The Ministry of Education and Health along with the regional staff now have supporting operational



documentation in the form of procedure, instructional and desk manuals.

Notwithstanding the Challenges, the Government of Guyana (GOG) was successfully able to realize the main objectives of the project in relation to capacity building within the Bureau of statistics (BOS) and three of the five line ministries.

The Monitoring and Evaluation methodologies, also captured in the manuals, have strengthened oversight of data collection especially at primary sources in the regions. These systems are now firmly entrenched in the routines of the LMs that benefited from consultancy support over an eighteen month period. There is now greater collaboration between statistical Units and MIS units where these exist.

The capacity of the BOS has been strengthened. Proficiency was fortified on several fronts, including production and analysis of tabulated data; logic and programming flows; program analysis and forms analysis; data collection; questionnaire design and sample design; analytical report writing skills and the use of complex statistical packages. These skills have now equipped BOS with increased capability to conduct surveys with enhanced validity, relevance and accuracy. Its current increased proficiency in statistical analysis will now contribute to the desired evidence-based policy analysis that underpins the objective of this project's design. The BOS has made significant strides in its ability to use state-of-the-art statistical software that can better handle census and survey data. This has been enabled by the procurement of appropriate computer systems under the project. BoS is therefore positioned to produce the kind of reports that are widely recognized as being on the cutting edge.

Borrower Project Performance During Project Preparation

Please rate your own performance during Project Preparation:

[☐] Highly Satisfactory (HS) [☒] Satisfactory (S) [☐] Unsatisfactory (US) [☐] Very Unsatisfactory (VU)

Comments:

The BOS has responsibility for national income accounts and consumer indices, trade and balance of payments statistics, migration statistics, household and population surveys, demographics and vital statistics, social statistics and decennial census operations.

Several shortcomings have reduced the effectiveness of the statistical system's contribution to the policy dialogue and resultant policy choices across key government institutions. Key concerns have been quality and timeliness of available statistics; weak institutional capacity to assess impact of policy choices, and an absence of formal mechanisms to enable ongoing dialogue between statistical offices – BOS, social sector LMs and the Office of the President, the agency with responsibility for oversight of the implementation of the PRS.



The Social Statistics and Policy Analysis Program emerged in response to the internal and external demands for credible and evidence-based data, as a pre-requisite for the effective tracking of the progress of the Poverty Reduction Strategy and the Millennium Development Goals. This was and continues to be, a very important issue in order to measure the impact of policy interventions, donor / IFIs supported programs and to guide future choices all aimed at reducing poverty levels and supporting the Government's pursuit of economic growth.

The status of the national statistical system highlighted the need for significant improvements that constituted the Program. A brief review of the profile of the system will set the basis for an understanding of the context and will also assist in the summative evaluation of the SSPA intervention.

Borrower Project Performance During Project Execution

Please rate your own performance during Project Execution:

☐ Highly Satisfactory (HS) ☒ Satisfactory (S) ☐ Unsatisfactory (US) ☐ Very Unsatisfactory (VU)

Comments:

The PEU despite the challenges did realized most of the deliverable in the project log frame, except for a few unavoidable delays which were not within the control of the Project Execution Unit. Several organizational elements were strengthened by the Project. Significantly, institutional capacity was built in the BOS and across participating LMs through the competence of the United States Census Bureau (USCB) and the LM consultants. The staff from both the BOS and LMs, received training relevant to their work demands which saw marked improvement in the data collection and analysis methodologies employed. The collective effect of these efforts has been demonstrated into a better quality of annual statistical publications that is now available to the public.

Bank Performance During Project Preparation

Please rate the Bank's performance during project preparation. Factors to be considered include the extent to which the Bank facilitated a participatory design, proposed adequate technical solutions to be the problems identified, and responded to the needs of the Borrower (timeliness, selection of instrument type).

☐ Highly Satisfactory (HS) ☒ Satisfactory (S) ☐ Unsatisfactory (US) ☐ Very Unsatisfactory (VU)

Comments:

The Bank provided a very competent and committed team to support the GOG in the preparation of the project. Every support was given to ensure that key stakeholders were engaged and their views of various aspects of the program framework sought and included in the design. Several drafts were discussed with both the Government Team and other stakeholders on a needs' basis. During the preparation, there was some amount of pressure to complete the details of the design within, what at times seemed to be, a relatively short time frame.



Bank Performance During Project Supervision

Please rate the Bank's performance during project supervision. Factors to be considered include technical assistance (including formal and informal training) to Executing Agency, timeliness of Bank response and the Bank's flexibility to respond to emergency situations during project implementation.

[] Highly Satisfactory (HS) [X] Satisfactory (S) [] Unsatisfactory (US) [] Very Unsatisfactory (VU)

Comments:

Technical assistance was given to the Executing Agency in the procurement process leading to the contracting of an international consulting firm for component #1. The PEU staff also benefit from training opportunities provided by the Bank.

Also, during the early implementation of the project, the Bank was able to offer advice and possible solutions that could be applied to early problems that arose, in a more or less timely fashion. In addition, the Bank's support and flexibility was also evident in the decision by the GOG to extend the project with a revised work program after the mid-term evaluation on the project.

The assistance of the mid-term evaluation mission certainly went a long way in reshaping the project in a way designed to bring about the best outcomes under difficult circumstances.

Additional Suggestions for Improving Bank Performance

Additional comments / suggestions for improving Bank performance in the future.

- The Bank could provide additional support to the Executing Agencies by incorporating in their in-country training program, in order to further support the building of local capacity, a few modules in the areas of (a) the preparation of Terms of Reference and (b) negotiation skills.

