Document of the Inter-American Development Bank

**Haiti**

Temporary Social Safety net and Skills for Youth

**(HA-L1137)**

**monitoring and evaluation plan**

**Índice**

[**I.** **Introduction** 3](#_Toc362345750)

[**II.** **Monitoring** 4](#_Toc362345752)

[**III.** **Evaluation** 11](#_Toc362345771)

#### Annex I 14

#### Annex II 15

#### Annex III 16

Abbreviations

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
|  |  |
| AOP | Annual Operation Plan |
| CECI  FAES | Evaluation for internal control and institutional capacity  Fonds d'Assistance Économique et Sociale |
| FP | Financial Plan |
| ISTEAH | Sciences, Technology and Advanced Studies Institute |
| MAST | Ministère des Affaires Sociales et du Travail |
| PCR | Project Completion Report |
| PEP | Pluri-annual Plan |
| PMR | Progress Monitoring Report |
| PP | Procurement Plan |
| RM | Results Matrix |
|  |  |
|  |  |

1. Introduction
   1. This document presents the Monitoring and Evaluation Plan of the “Temporary Social Safety net and Skills for Youth”(HA-L1137). This plan will guide the monitoring, of implementation, by the Fonds d'Assistance Économique et Sociale (FAES) who will be executing the project and the Bank (monitoring and supervision); and also the evaluation, focused on identifying and documenting the achievement of its results. This plan indicates the scope of the activities planned under each function, the documents and products of those activities, as well as the responsible actors, time and resources for the implementation of the plan.
   2. The overall objective is to create a short term social safety net for vulnerable urban youth and to create long term opportunities for training and labor intermediation for youth. There are three specific objectives: (i) provide short term income opportunities to youth through short term employment in vulnerable neighborhoods; (ii) improve the skills of youth living in vulnerable neighborhoods to create long term economic opportunities; and (iii) strengthen FAES’ procurement, administration and project management capacity and MAST’s labor intermediation capacity. The operation is structured in three components: Temporary safety net through temporary employment in small community development projects (US$27.5 million), Training for youth (US$7 million), Institutional strengthening for FAES and MAST (US$2.7 million) and Monitoring, Evaluation and Administration (US$2.8).
   3. A project implementation unit will be formed in FAES which will be responsible for carrying out all the operational and fiduciary obligations for all components (including procurement, financial management and social and environmental safeguards), necessary for the project implementation as well as maintaining communication with the Bank.
   4. For Component I and II, the implementation requires diverse activities and multi disciplinary expertise such as, consultation methodologies; project planning and monitoring; identifying risk and their corresponding mitigation measures; monitor and reporting, financial reporting. Component II also requires a participatory process to engage communities in vulnerable areas and since FAES has experience in doing so, it was deemed appropriate that FAES will be responsible for these activities. The entrepreneurship activities of Component II will be carried out by University of Ottawa with L’ISTEAH. For Component III, MAST will be in charge of the technical implementation of strengthening of the labor intermediation activities.
   5. For component I, while FAES strengthens its institutional capacity, at first, FAES will contract operators. For component 1 operators will : (i) carry out a consultation process to identify and prioritize community projects in neighborhoods; (ii) estimate the costs and timeline for completion of the community projects; (iii) identify and register beneficiaries; (iv) verify attendance through the use of biometric fingerprint scanners; (v) request and process electronic payments for the beneficiaries; and (vi) monitor progress and prepare activity, and physical and financial reports. All beneficiaries will be included in the beneficiary registry.
   6. The responsibilities of operators regarding training activities of component II include: ((i) participate in the analysis of the demand for skills and of the training offer; (ii) participate in the identification of training centers; (iii) consolidate a catalogue of training centers and courses; (iv) prepare the diagnostic of training needs of eligible candidates; (v) identify and register beneficiaries; (vi) contract out and pay training centers; (vii) provide mentoring and complementary soft skills training; (viii) verify that beneficiaries are participating in the training; (ix) make payments to beneficiaries; (x) monitor, prepare activities and financial reports; (xi) share the list of training graduates with MAST to include in the job seeker registry; and (xii) share know how of the training model with INFP and MAST.
   7. Component II, also includes support to entrepreneurs. These activities will be implemented by the University of Ottawa in coordination with ISTEAH. Activities inlcude funding to: (i) design an incubation program; (ii) hire managers to manage the incubation space and provide services to young entrepreneurs; (iii) establish and provide equipment to a co-working space; (iv) launching awareness campaigns; (v) hire trainers; (vi) provide allowance to selected entrepreneurs.
   8. For component III, MAST will set up a work team in charge of: (i) the planning of activities related to institutional strengthening of the labour intermediation service; (ii) support FAES in procurement processes related to institutional strengthening of the labour intermediation service; (iii) coordinate the delivery of technical assistance activities related to the institutional strengthening of the labour intermediation service.

**In this plan, the terms are understood as follows:**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Monitoring** | This is the responsibility of the institution that runs the program, observing the progress compared to planned activities for a given period. |
| **Supervision** | External function in which the Bank as financier, verifies the implementation of the terms of the contract with the executor of the program, resulting in concrete actions to make adjustments to the implementation when necessary. |
| **Evaluation** | Periodic function, which seeks to assess whether the implementation of the program generated results and impacts. It can be carried out by the executor and the bank, but for the sake of greater objectivity should be recruited by independent experts, both for the collection of information as for initial analysis. |

1. Monitoring

#### Indicators

* 1. To determine the progress during the execution impact, outcome and output indicators will be monitored. See Results Matrix in Annex IV of this document.
  2. There are three impact indicators: (i) Pro-Social behavior among beneficiaries; (ii) Youth beneficiaries of training that worked during last week; and (iii) percentage of startups (of graduated entrepreneurs) that are still in operation 12 months after the graduation of the entrepreneur.
  3. The impact on socioemotional skills will be measured through the Prosocial Behavior scale, which is a subscale of the Strengths and Difficulties Questionnaire (SDQ). The SDQ is a 25-item behavioral screening questionnaire.[[1]](#footnote-2) The Prosocial Scale is made of the following five items, which can be self-administered if needed:

1. I try to be nice to other people. I care about their feelings.
2. I usually share with others, for example food or drink.
3. I am helpful if someone is hurt, upset or feeling ill.
4. I am kind to others.
5. I often offer to help others (family members, friends, colleagues).
   1. Each item can be assessed as not true (0), somewhat true (1) or certainly true (2). The value of the scale is equal to the sum of the scores of the five items, hence it varies between 0 and 10. Higher values are associated with more social behavior. The five questions will be asked in two instances: (i) at program entry, before the youth start temporary work or training, as part of the social registration form that collects information to be entered both in FAES project information system and in the SIMAST; (ii) at completion of temporary work or training, as part of a shorter project feedback questionnaire. The Prosocial Scale will be the subject of a simple before-after comparison, after standardization based on the baseline distribution parameters. The indicator will be disaggregated by gender.
   2. Youth beneficiaries of training that worked during last week. The indicator will be measured for youth 16-29 (the age group of the intervention). The definition of work last week takes into account that youth worked at least one hour. Operators will be in charge of the follow-up survey which will include questions on employment status, the type of contract and income level at 3 and 6 months after the participation in training (including the internship probation period if applicable. This indicator will be disaggregated by gender.
   3. Percentage of startups (of graduated entrepreneurs) that are still in operation 12 months after graduation of the entrepreneur.  This indicator looks at the % of startups that are still in operation 12 months after the entrepreneur 18-29 years of age has completed training. Numerator: Number of startups of the entrepreneurs 18-29 years of age who graduated 12 months before that are still operating. A startup is considered operating when it has generated sales during the last month before the implementation of the survey. Denominator: Number of startups of entrepreneurs 18-29 operating at the moment of graduation. The information will be collected through a survey, to be taken 12 months after graduation of each cohort. The Incubation program will be implemented twice a year for a total of 7 cohorts. Youngsters (cohort) are admitted to the Incubation Program based on the economic potential of their business proposition, during which they will learn various skills needed to develop and advance with their business ventures. With the survey information, it will be possible to see if, over the 4 years, the incubation program is improving in supporting the success of its graduated entrepreneurs with their start-ups.
   4. There are nine outcome indicators. Below find the explanation for each indicator.
   5. Percentage of beneficiaries 18-35 youth who receive income from temporary employment and who have remained employed in one community project for its entire duration. This indicator will be disaggregated by gender. The operators will provide to FAES both the list of projects as well as the beneficiary list. One of the project’s rules is that beneficiaries can only work in one project. It is important to remain in the project working as long as possible so that beneficiaries can be employed as long as the individual community project is being built to receive income and to receive the soft skills training. Numerator: youths 18-35 who have been temporarily employed and have remained in one community project for its entire duration. Denominator: All youths 18-35 who have been temporarily employed in one community project.
   6. Percentage of youth 16-29 participating in a skills development program who receive a certificate. This indicator will be disaggregated by gender. Training program registration does not guarantee successful completion or receiving a certificate. Only beneficiaries meeting the criteria of success defined by the centers (attendance level, average of minimum qualification, satisfactory performance during the labor practice phase in companies, among others), the beneficiaries will receive a certificate issued by the training centers. Social services and mentoring are included to support youth in meeting all the certification requirement. This indicator measures the percentage of beneficiaries who obtain a certificate at the end of the training and is calculated as "number of certified beneficiaries of training / the total number of youth participating in skills development \* 100". This information will be contained in the monitoring reports prepared by the different training centers. The operators will consolidate the information of the different training centers and will transmit to FAES and the Bank the value of the indicator and the necessary backups.
   7. Percentage of youth 18-29 who graduate from the Incubator. This indicator will be disaggregated by gender. The Numerator: # of youth 18-29 who graduate from the incubator. Denominator: # of youth admitted to entrepreneurship incubation program.
   8. Institutional assessment score of system of administration and procurement of goods and services. This indicator is generated by applying the questionnaire using the administration and procurement of goods and services (SABS) section of the Bank’s instrument for Evaluation for internal control and institutional capacity (SECI).
   9. Institutional assessment score of planning of activities. This indicator is generated by applying the questionnaire using the system for planning of activities (SPA) section of the Bank’s SECI. This portion of the questionnaire Includes activities for annual plans, timeline, risk management and project monitoring.
   10. Number of job seekers registered in Labor Intermediation Technological Platform. The Labor intermediation technology platform installed as part of output #3.11 will contain the information needed to calculate this indicator. The indicator will be calculated as the sum of the unique indentifiers[[2]](#footnote-3) of job seekers registered in the mentioned platform.
   11. Number of firms registered in the Labor Intermediation Technological Platform. The Labor intermediation technology platform installed as part of output #3.11 will contain the information needed to calculate this indicator. The indicator will be calculated as the sum of the unique identifiers[[3]](#footnote-4) of firms registered in the mentioned platform.
   12. Number of jobseekers referred to a job offer. The Labor intermediation technology platform installed as part of output #3.11 will send a notification to the jobseekers when their profile and skills meet the requirements of a vacancy registered in the system. The indicator will be calculated as the sum of references registered in the platform.
   13. Number of new households registered in the information system of the MAST (SIMAST). The Government of Haiti has indicated that SIMAST could become a single registry system for beneficiaries. The project will update the SIMAST in order to ensure that the beneficiaries of the project may be included in SIMAST. The SIMAST data base is held at MAST. The information of the household of the beneficiary of the project will be entered in the SIMAST database using their registry form. The information will be provided by Operators and consolidated by FAES who will send to MAST.
   14. There are 25 output indicators. All physical targets for the end of the project and annually have been calculated. Annual financial targets, and total costs have been calculated for all outputs. For output costs see [EEO#4](http://idbdocs.iadb.org/wsdocs/getDocument.aspx?DOCNUM=EZSHARE-801630256-50).

#### Monitoring Instruments and Data Collection

* 1. FAES is responsible for overall execution and oversight of the project, including: (i) administration of contracts; (ii) preparing an annual operational plan (AOP) and updating the Pluriannual Execution plan (PEP); (iii) preparing and updating the procurement plan (PP); (iv) consolidating chronogram of execution of activities implemented by operators and by University of Ottawa and MAST; (v) implementation schedule and expenditure plan; (vi) administration and monitoring of activities; (vii) preparation and submission of disbursement requests to the IDB and the corresponding justification of expenses; (vii) preparing and submitting to the Bank the final financial statements regarding Program’s expenses; (ix) preparing and submitting to the Bank the semi-annual progress reports, reporting on the financial execution of the project and the achievement of the targets set in the project Results Matrix; and (x) maintaining an adequate disbursement support documentation filing system.

**Monitoring instruments**:

* The **Results Matrix (RM)**, which is included in the Grant Proposal, focuses on the products, intermediate results or outcomes and impacts for each component. The RM is a key tool to guide the planning, monitoring and evaluation of the project. The RM will be referred to when the Annual Operational Plan is elaborated, and for the design, monitoring and evaluation of the project.
* **Pluri-annual Execution Plan (PEP)**: lists the procurement and activities that will be executed during the project. It specifies the amounts and timing assigned for each of the products and activities as well as the critical routes to complete the products. A draft will be requested by the end of November with a final version expected by the end of January.
* **Annual Operational Plan (AOP)**: is the annual planning instrument that needs to be completed once a year. It should include: (i) the proposed budget; (ii) the expected results and outputs as related to the Results Matrix; (iii) the planned activities; and (iv) the execution calendar. A draft will be requested to be submitted by the end of November, with a final version expected by the end of January.
* **Quarterly plans:** the quarterly plans will be prepared by operators and will be used to provide advances.
* **Procurement Plan (PP)**: lists the contracts and activities for the year and need to include the relevant terms of reference, as well as the technical characteristics of the procurements to be done. The PP is presented annually together with the AOP. A draft PP will be requested by the end of November with a final version expected by the end of January (to take into consideration the previous year’s implementation).
* **Progress Monitoring Report (PMR):** The PMR is a reporting tool that presents the annual targets for disbursements and completion of outputs and assesses the overall project performance in terms of scheduling, budgeting and quality. The PMR represents the agreement between the Bank and the executing agency on the physical and financial targets to be achieved every year. Once annual targets are set, they cannot be changed in the system for the current year.
* **Administration Missions and Inspection Visits:** The Bank will implement such missions and visits based on the relevance and complexity of the issues that may arise during project implementation, according to the calendar defined in the PEP. Two missions per year are expected as part of the supervision plan.
* **Technical audits.** The Executing agency will hire an external firm to carry out technical audits. The TOR for the audits needs to have the Bank’s no objection and need to include the review of processes for the execution of the project as well as the activities related to the Operators hired with project funds in order to achieve the outputs in the results matrix. Specifically, the audit needs to review the process by which projects were identified and prioritized in the communities, as well as how beneficiaries were selected and if the works were implemented in accordance with the standards described in the proposals presented by the operators.

**Data collection**

* 1. Monitoring data will be generated through the following sources: (i) administrative data; (ii) biometrics monitoring system; and (iii) beneficiary surveys.
  2. **Administrative data**. Data for reporting financial progress of the project will be collected through FAES system. Data for monitoring physical progress will be monitored by FAES and the operators that will be implementing community projects and training activities as part of their contracts with the Government. This includes entry and exit surveys of beneficiaries that will collect basic information to calculate the indicators included in the results matrix in annex 4 such as Socioemotional skills.
  3. **Biometrics monitoring system**. Biometric identification solution allows for the creation and use of a digital universal ID which is unique to each individual. To be able to use biometric identification the hardware required is a fingerprint scanner prepared to capture biometric templates. The company selected for single sources has experience in collecting imprints in tough outdoor conditions, as well as collecting imprints for construction workers who often have scare on their imprints. The device has lithium-ion battery that lasts for up to 4,000 identifications. The scanner is paired with Android devices. The software includes an android application. The technology is open source.
  4. Monitoring of project participation will be done through a biometrics monitoring system that will store information on beneficiaries and verify identity and participation of those enrolled in activities. Operators will be responsible to monitor participation using biometric scanners. Monitoring to verify compliance of work or training participation only needs to be measured twice a week for each participant (it is not necessary to measure participants on the same day of the week).
  5. For the training activities of component 2, biometric mechanisms will be installed in the selected training centers. The data collected through biometric mechanisms will feed the progress reports prepared by the training centers[[4]](#footnote-5). During the internship, companies will answer a brief questionnaire that will allow to monitor attendance and performance of the beneficiaries. Contracts for the Operators should include all expenses related to the implementation of the system. Data from monitoring will be hosted in a database administered by FAES but could be provided as Software as a Service (SAS).
  6. Biometrics solution will follow the following principles:

|  |
| --- |
| **1. Interoperability:** data should use interoperable standards such as the ISO 19749-2 standard. Doing so will allow an organization/government to use the same data and technology across projects |
| **2.Security:** solution should follow current best privacy-by-design practice like using modern data protection standards such as TLS 1.2, AES and OAuth 2.0, ensuring two factor authentication, and adopting data anonymization/pseudonymization across data sets. |
| **3.Privacy:** adhering to the highest available standard when it comes to privacy/data security, and embracing key principles such as informed consent, privacy impact assessments (PIAs), and data subject rights (e.g. the right to be forgotten). |
| **4. Accuracy:** using biometrics in developing country contexts is extremely challenging, particularly when dealing with scarred, worn, or burned fingerprints. The solution should be adapted to the conditions to be found in the project. |
| **5. Operator training:** adequate investments into capacity building. From training of trainers (ToT), to step down trainings for mobile operators in local language, to initial shadowing of the roll-out to catch the majority of mistakes. |

* 1. **Beneficiary surveys.** Operators implementing the activities for components 1 and 2 will also be required to collect information from all beneficiaries in at least two instances: (i) at program entry, before the youth start temporary work or training, as part of the social registration form that collects information to be entered both in FAES project information system and in the SIMAST; and (ii) at completion of temporary work or training, as part of a shorter project feedback questionnaire. For the participants in training, data will also be collected six months after the completion of participation in order to measure employment.
  2. The data collected at program entry (numeral (i) in the previous paragraph) will be an adaptation of the questionnaire used by the Kore Lavi project and must include the questions that allow calculating the National Index of Vulnerability and Deprivation (HDVI). All data will be entered to SIMAST. Both questionnaires used at program entry and at completion (numerals (i) and (ii) in the previous paragraph) will include the questions of the Prosocial Scale.

#### Reporting[[5]](#footnote-6)

* 1. **Reports by operators.** Operators will prepare quarterly chronograms in order to be able to provide advances for a period of 3 months. For component 1, they will submit progress reports every two months that will include the financial progress on each community project, with pictures of the project as well as the list of beneficiaries working in each project. The report will include the submission on data for justifying the expenses incurred.
  2. Reports to be generated for the entrepreneurship activities. The University of Ottawa will produce an initial report outlining the content (the modules) of the Incubation Program designed and to be delivered throughout the years. Then, quarterly reports will provide details of physical and financial progress of all outputs as well as a qualitative analysis of finding and recommendations for modification/improvement for the following months of implementation. The qualitative analysis of findings and recommendations will be based on continuous feedback from participating youngsters but also on feedback surveys that participants will fill out at the end of each cohort. These will be analyzed and will determine whether adaptations to the training program are needed. If needed, the proposals for adaptation will be presented in the reports. The Manual of Operation will detail the process for incorporation the adaptations to the training program. FAES will use the reports generated by the University of Ottawa for the generation of the annual and semi-annual reports. The Direction of Economic Inclusion of FAES will be responsible for approving the reports and the overall supervision of the Incubation Program activity.
  3. **Semi-Annual Report**: This report contains detailed information on the level of progress achieved in critical components, outputs and activities or milestones of the program, both in its physical and financial execution. The Semiannual Report is made up of: the level of progress in each output for the past six months (in the mid-year report) or the past year (in the end of year report), in physical and monetary execution; the difficulties encountered; and activities planned for the next six months. It also presents a consolidated review of lessons learned and recommendations to provide feedback to the program and the Government itself. The preparation of the Semester Reports will be the responsibility of the FAES. The report should include as an annex a table in the PMR format (to be provided by the Bank) with information on all progress for the relevant periods. FAES must present the Semi-Annual Report no later than the second week of February and the second week of August of each year that the program is in execution, in order to comply with the updating of the information in the Bank's systems at 30 June and December 31.
  4. **Risk management**. FAES will update the risk analysis and mitigation actions from the exercise carried out during the preparation of the program. The analysis will be updated once a year, taking advantage of the preparation and submission of one of the semi-annual reports.
  5. Financial **audit report**: For the first two years of execution, FAES will present to the Bank: semi-annual audits of the financial statements of the program to be submitted 90 days after the close of each semester. For subsequent years, the frequency of presentation of the audited financial statements (semi-annual or annual) will be based on financial management capacity of FAES determined from the financial supervision missions and the update of the risk assessment. date of the last disbursement. The audits will be carried out by a firm of independent auditors acceptable to the Bank.
  6. **Technical audit report**. These must be provided to the Bank 90 days after a 12- month period after operators have started to implement activities. Given the implementation timeline, it is expected that three technical audits will be carried out.
  7. **PMR**: The project team, with the information from the semiannual report, will update the PMR, in accordance with the current formats and information system.
  8. **Project Completion Report**: Upon completion of the program, the Bank team will prepare the Project Completion Report (PCR), with an expanded evaluation of the progress of the indicators established in the RM during the life cycle of the project.

#### Monitoring Coordination, Work Plan and Budget

* 1. The responsibility for the monitoring of the program based on the instruments, indicators and data identified in this plan will lie with FAES. For these activities, the budget is defined as follows:

| **Concept** | **Budget** | **Comments** |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Biometrics system implementation | $180,000 | This budget covers hiring a firm to install biometrics equipment, software and training for collection as well as identity verification services and monitoring by operators. |
| Development of monitoring system and hosting | $150,000 | This budget covers hosting of the data for the project as well as the design of the data collection tools and training for personnel. |
| Ex post surveys to beneficiaries (to be included in the budget for the operators in charge of works) | $60,000 | This budget includes hiring an external firm to conduct telephone followup interviews of approximately 2,000 individuals as part of the before and after evaluation of the project. |
| Consultancy for quality control of databases and evaluation of training and intermediation activities | $100,000 | This budget includes hiring a team of consultants in charge of i) the quality control of the program's databases and follow up surveys, ii) a process evaluation of labor intermediation system, iii) the final evaluation (before / after) of training activities. |
| Technical audits | $240.000 | Three technical audits will be implemented to monitor operations and execution of the project. |
| Workshops to prepare biannual reports | 25,700 | FAES will hold workshops with operators befor the preparation of each report in order to gather information on product completion. |
| **Total Budget for Monitoring Activities** | **$755,700** |  |

1. Evaluation
   1. The Project will implement a midterm process evaluation of execution of the activities of strengthening of the labor intermediation services, and a before and after evaluation of training activities of Component II.

**Before and after evaluation**

In order to measure the general effect of the program, we seek to answer the following questions:

What is the change in time on:

* Variation on the scale of Pro-Social behavior among beneficiaries;
* Youth beneficiaries of training that worked during last week;
* Number of trained youth entrepreneurs who are operating a firm in the market;

***Methodology:***

* 1. This method consists of a comparison of the outcome indicators before and after the program. The before and after evaluation will include: (a) validation of the vertical logic based on the Results Matrix; (b) comparison of the outcome indicators before and after; (c) literature review of similar programs and discussion of internal and external validity; (d) discussion of other factors that may have affected the intervention. Two main reasons justify this alternative:

1. The literature available in the region has relevant information on the effectiveness of the training programs and on the success factors of these programs. In this context, the realization of an impact evaluation of the training activities of component 2 would not add value to the existing literature. The main conclusions of the literature on similar programs is presented in the following sections.
2. The cost of the alternative combined to the high risks of failure. The realization of an impact evaluation implies important costs of information collection. Given the specific characteristics of the Haitian labor market (informality, high turnover and difficulty of finding participants and no participants after treatment) and the low installed capacities in the country for conducting experimental or quasi-experimental impact evaluations, there is a high risk that an evaluation of higher complexity would not be carried out successfully.

***Data Collection:***

* *Before treatment:* The baseline data will be collected through the application of an enrollment form. Operators will be responsible for collecting and storing this information in a single database. The information collected will allow knowing the labor situation of the beneficiaries before the intervention (employment situation, number of hours worked, level of labor income, among others).
* *After treatment:* Operators will conduct follow-up surveys 6 months after the internship to know the employment situation of the beneficiaries after the intervention (employment situation, number of hours worked, level of labor income, among others). The results of the surveys will be recorded in the single database of the program. For the measurement of impact indicator 1.2., will be considered as employed those who have worked at least one hour during the reference period (in the case of Haiti, the period of reference is the last week), or who have not worked for extraordinary reasons (sick leave, strike, vacation, etc.) etc.).
* *Additional data and quality control:* Additional information on the type of training received, attendance, notes and exams, will be provided by the biometric system and administrative data provided by training centers and employers. Two consultants will be hired to provide technical support for data collection and analysis: i) consultant in charge of supervising and overseeing the quality of the information registered and collected, ii) consultant in charge of analyzing the information and evaluating the program.

*Literature on similar programs:*

* 1. Governments of different countries have implemented a series of different Active Labor Market Policies (PAML) with the aim of generating more and better employment opportunities. Among the PAML, training programs seek to improve the skills of the labor supply. Training programs are based on the premise that the lack of technical skills is the reason why some individuals remain unemployed, and that these skills can be taught and learned in short periods of time (McKenzie, 2015). Training programs usually include job search assistance in order to improve the match between jobseekers and employers and, in some cases, salary subsidies with the objective of increasing the labor demand of companies (McKenzie, 2015). A significant part of these programs focuses on the low-income population, young people at "risk" between 15 and 29 years, depending on the country. These programs have been particularly common in Latin America (McKenzie, 2015).
  2. In general, the results of the PAML are, in the best of cases, positive, although with moderate impacts in most circumstances (Card et al., 2010 , McKenzie, 2015: Kluve , 2016 ). Results of evaluations of training policies are more auspicious in developing countries, particularly in Latin America (Betcherman , 2007, Ibarrarán & Rosas, 2008, Gonzales et al., 2012, Attanasio et al., 2011, Kluve 2014; Kluve , 2016).
  3. One possible explanation is that most of the programs evaluated incorporate some of the features the literature considers successful, including: (i) participation of private suppliers; (ii) demand driven nature; (iii) important guidance and/or labor intermediation component; (iv) strong emphasis on on-the-job training; (v) financial incentives for employers (subsidies during the on-the-job training phase) and beneficiaries (grants to facilitate participation) (Fares and Puerto, 2009; González-Velosa, Ripani and Rosas-Shady, 2012; Urzúa and Puentes, 2010; Hotz, Ahituv and Tienda, 2000; MIF, 2012; ILO, 2016b; Berniell and de la Mata, 2016). The design of the training activities of component 2 incorporates all these features and success factors.
  4. The attribution analysis is based on the analysis of impacts calculated for 6 similar programs implemented in the region. Regarding the impacts found in similar programs, there is evidence that training programs for young people have positive impacts on employment and income. The following is a summary of the impacts of some programs:

**Impact of similar training programs on employment and labor incomes**

| **Program** | **Country** | **Impact on employment** | **Impact detected on:** | **Impact on labor income** | **Impact detected on:** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Young Project | Argentina | 10% | women | 10%\* | Global |
| Chile Joven | Chile | 21% | Under 21 years old, women | 26% | Global |
| Youth in Action | Colombia | 5% | women | 18% (1), 35% (2) | 1. Men 2. Women |
| Youth and Employment | Dominican Republic | Not significant | Global | 10% | Global |
| ProJóven | Peru | 6% |  | 18%\*\* | Global |
| ProCaJoven | Panama | 10-12% | Women and residents of Panama City | Not significant | Global |

Source: Extracted from Kluve (2016)

\* monthly salary, \*\* income per hour

**ANNEX 1**

**Instruments for monitoring execution**

| **Instrument** | **Description** | **Frequency for reporting** |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Pluri-annual Execution Plan** | (i) the proposed budget, ii) the expected results and products as related to the Results Matrix, iii) the planned activities, and iv) the execution calendar | At least annual or when changes need to be made to agreed activities |
| **Procurement Plan** | Lists the contracts and activities for the year | At least annual or when changes need to be made to agreed activities |
| **Operator reports** | The operators (depending on component) will prepare progress reports on small community projects as well as number of beneficiaries who are working. The reports also include financial progress. | Every two months |
| **Progress Monitoring Report (PMR)** | The PMR is a reporting tool that presents the annual targets for disbursements and completion of outputs and assesses the overall project performance in terms of scheduling, budgeting and quality | Biannually as part of the semiannual report |
| **Administration Missions and Inspection Visits** | Meeting between the Bank’s and the Government’s teams to discuss execution of the project and remedial measures if needed. | At least biannually |
| **Semiannual report** | Report containing achievements of the last semester (year) and planned activities for the following year. It includes an updated version of the PMR matrix | Biannually |
| **Financial Audits** | The project will undergo financial audits of the eligibility of execution | For the first two years of the execution, semi-annual audits of the financial statements of the program will be required and submitted within 90 days after the close of each semester.  For subsequent years, the frequency will be based on financial management capacity of FAES. |
| **Technical audits** | The project will undergo technical audits the first three years to monitor execution and compliance with the Project’s contract | Annually the first three years |

ANNEX 2

M&E activities timeline

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Main activities** | **2018** | **2019** | | | | | **2020** | | | | | **2021** | | | | **2022** | | | | **2023** | | **Responsible** | **Cost (US$)** | **Source** | | |
| **4** | **1** | **2** | **3** | **4** | **1** | | **2** | **3** | **4** | **1** | | **2** | **3** | **4** | **1** | **2** | **3** | **4** | **1** | **2** |  |  | |  |
| AOP | **X** |  |  |  | **X** |  | |  |  | **X** |  | |  |  | **X** |  |  |  | **X** |  |  | FAES | - | | HA-L1137 |
| PEP | **X** |  |  |  | **X** |  | |  |  | **X** |  | |  |  | **X** |  |  |  | **X** |  |  | FAES | - | | HA-L1137 |
| Operator Reports |  |  |  | **X** | **X** | **X** | | **X** | **X** | **X** | **X** | | **X** | **X** | **X** |  |  |  |  |  |  | Operators |  | | HA-L1137 |
| PMR |  | **X** |  | **X** |  | **X** | |  | **X** |  | **X** | |  | **X** |  | **X** |  | **X** |  |  |  | IDB | - | | HA-L1137 |
| Biannual report (including PMR annex) | **X** |  | **X** |  | **X** |  | | **X** |  | **X** |  | | **X** |  | **X** |  | **X** |  | **X** |  |  | FAES | - | | HA-L1137 |
| Biometric monitoring (continuous, includes monitoring system for project) |  | **X** | **X** | **X** | **X** | **X** | | **X** | **X** | **X** | **X** | | **X** | **X** | **X** | **X** | **X** | **X** | **X** |  |  | FAES (Operators) | 330.000 | | HA-L1137 |
| Survey to monitor startups of graduate participants |  |  |  |  |  |  | |  |  | **X** |  | | **X** |  | **X** |  | **X** |  | **X** |  |  | UOttawa | -[[6]](#footnote-7) | | HA-L1137 |
| Ex-post survey (six months after training completed, continuous) |  |  | **X** | **X** | **X** | **X** | | **X** | **X** | **X** | **X** | | **X** | **X** | **X** | **X** | **X** | **X** | **X** | **X** |  | Operators | 60.000 | | HA-L1137 |
| Before after Evaluatiton (Traning Activities) |  |  |  |  |  |  | |  |  |  |  | |  |  |  |  |  | **X** | **X** |  |  | FAES | 25.000 | | HA-L1137 |
| Project Completion Report (PCR) |  |  |  |  |  |  | |  |  |  |  | |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | **X** | BID | 15.000 | | Transactional Budget IDB |
| Quality control of program’s data bases and ex-post survey |  |  |  | **X** |  |  | |  | **X** |  |  | |  | **X** |  |  | **X** |  |  |  |  | FAES | 25.000 | | HA-L1137 |
| Process evaluation of Labor Intermediation System |  |  |  |  |  |  | |  |  |  | **X** | | **X** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | FAES | 50.000 | | HA-L1137 |
| Technical audits |  |  |  |  |  | **X** | |  |  |  | **X** | |  |  |  | **X** |  |  |  |  |  | FAES | 240.000 | | HA-L1137 |
| Workshops to prepare biannual report |  |  | **X** |  | **X** |  | | **X** |  | **X** |  | | **X** |  | **X** |  | **X** |  | **X** |  |  | FAES | 25,700 | | HA-L1137 |
| **Total cost** | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | **US$770,700\*** | |  |

\* Total cost included within the project’s budget is $755,700.

**Annex 3. Results Matrix**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Project Objective:** | The overall objective is to create a short-term social safety net for vulnerable urban youth and to create long-term opportunities for training and labor intermediation for youth. There are three specific objectives: (i) provide short term income opportunities to youth through short term employment in vulnerable neighborhoods; (ii) improve skills of youth living in vulnerable neighborhoods to create long term economic opportunities; and (iii) strengthen FAES’ procurement, administration and project management capacity and MAST’s labor intermediation capacity. |

**Expected Impact**

| **Indicators** | **Unit of Measure** | **Baseline** | **Baseline Year** | **2019** | **2020** | **2021** | **2022** | **End of Project**  **(EOP)** | **Means of Verification** | **Observations** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **IMPACT STATEMENT # 1: SOCIOECONOMIC INTEGRATION OF YOUNG PEOPLE INCREASES** | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1.1 Pro-social behavior among beneficiaries. | Standardized Scale | Unavailable[[7]](#footnote-8) |  |  |  |  |  | + 0.05 sd | Document analyzing the results of the data. | The scale is a sub-set of 5 questions drawn from the strengths and Difficulties scale.  An entry and Follow-up survey at the end of participation in the temporary employment or training (including the internship period if applicable) will filled out. |
| Women | Standardized Scale |  |  |  |  |  |  | + 0.05 sd | Ibid. | Ibid.  Pro gender. |
| 1.2  Youth beneficiaries of training that worked during last week. | % | Unavailable[[8]](#footnote-9) |  |  |  |  |  | +0.20 sd | Follow-up survey. | Ages 16-29.  The target is based on previous experience in similar projects in Haiti. Operators will be in charge of the follow‑up survey which will include questions on employment status, the type of contract and income level at 3 and 6 months after the participation in training (including the internship probation period if applicable. |
| Women | % |  |  |  |  |  |  | +0.20 sd | Ibid. | Ibid.  Pro gender. |
| 1. 3 Startups (of graduated entrepreneurs) that are still in operation 12 months after the graduation of the entrepreneur. | % | 0 | 2018 | 0 | 5 | 10 | 13 | 15 | Survey to be taken 12 months after the graduation of each cohort to identify the % of startups of the entrepreneurs that are still in operation. | Incubation programs aim to support the launch of new businesses and, through training, make entrepreneurs more successful with their startups.  This indicator looks at the % of startups that are still in operations 12 months after the entrepreneur has completed training.  Numerator:  # of startups of the entrepreneurs 18-29 (who graduated 12 months before) that are operating.  A startup is considered operating when it has generated sales during the last month before the implementation of the survey  Denominator:  # of startups of the entrepreneurs 18-29 operating at the moment of graduation. |

**Expected Outcomes**

| **Indicators** | **Unit of**  **measure** | **Baseline**  **Value** | **Baseline**  **year** | **2019** | **2020** | **2021** | **2022** | **EOP** | **Means of verification** | **Observations** **2** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **OUTCOME # 1: SHORT-TERM INCOME OPPORTUNITIES CREATED** | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1.1. Beneficiaries 18‑35 who receive income from temporary employment and who have remained employed in one community project for its entire duration. | % | 0 | 2018 | 80 | 80 | 80 |  | 80 | Semester reports | Numerator: youths 18-35 who have been temporarily employed and have remained in one community project for its entire duration. Denominator: All youths 18-35 who have been temporarily employed in one community project  It is important to remain in the project working as long as possible so that beneficiaries can be employed as long as the individual community project is being built to receive income and to receive the soft skills training.. |
| Women | % | 0 | 2018 | 80 | 80 | 80 |  | 80 | Semester reports | Ibid,  Pro gender. |
| **OUTCOME# 2: EMPLOYABILITY OF VULNERABLE YOUNG PEOPLE IMPROVED** | | | | | | | | | | |
| 2.1 Percentage of youth 16-29 participating in a skills development program who receive a certificate | % | 0 | 2018 | 80 | 80 | 80 | 80 | 80 | FAES project monitoring reports | Numerator: number of youth who receive a certificate.  Denominator: number of youth participating in a skills development program |
| Women | % | 0 | 2018 | 80 | 80 | 80 | 80 | 80 | Ibid, among women.  Pro-gender. |
| 2 2 Percentage of youth 18-29 who graduate from the Incubator | % | 0 | 2018 | 40 | 40 | 40 | 40 | 40 | The program consists of a series of training modules on entrepreneurship and how to start an economic activity. Completed: participants must attend and complete all training activities.  Numerator: # of youth 18-29 years of age who graduate from incubator  Denominator: # of youth 18-29 years of age admitted to entrepreneurship Incubation Program |
| Women | % | n / a | 2018 | 40 | 40 | 40 | 40 | 40 | Ibid | Ibid, among women.  Pro-gender. |
| **Outcome # 3: FAES’ procurement, administration and project management capacity STRENGTHENED, and MAST’s labor intermediation capacity strengthenED** | | | | | | | | | | |
| 3.1 Institutional assessment score of system of administration and procurement of goods and services. | % | 41.9 | 2018 |  |  |  |  | 61 | Analysis using the SABS questionnaire of the SECI instrument | The baseline is taken form the institutional assessment carried out in June. |
| 3.2 Institutional assessment score of planning of activities. | % | 50 | 2018 |  |  |  |  | 62 | Analysis using the SPA questionnaire of the SECI instrument | Ibid.  Includes activities for annual plans, timeline, risk management and project monitoring. |
| 3.3 Job seekers registered in Labor Intermediation Technological Platform (LITP). | Number of persons | 0 | 2018 |  |  |  | 2,000 | 2,000 | LITP | Reports will be available once Platform (output 3.11 has been implemented). |
| 3.4 Firms registered in the LITP. | Number of firms | 0 | 2018 |  |  |  | 20 | 20 | LITP | Ibid. |
| 3.5 Jobseekers referred to a job offer. | Number of persons | 0 | 2018 |  |  |  | 500 | 500 | LITP | Ibid. |
| 3.6 New households registered in the Information System of the MAST (SIMAST). | Number | 255,000 | 2018 | 11,019 | 16,203 | 778 |  | 283,000 | SIMAST | The information for the household for each participant in component 1 will be included in SIMAST. |

**Outputs**

| **Outputs** | **Unit of measure** | **Baseline**  **Value** | **Baseline**  **year** | **2019** | **2020** | **2021** | **2022** | **EOP** | **Means of verification** | **Observations** **2** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **COMPONENT I.**  **Temporary safety net through temporary employment in small community development projects** | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1.1. Beneficiaries 18-35 years old who receive income. | Number | 0 | 2018 | 11,019 | 16,203 | 778 | 0 | 28,000 | Biometric information System (BIS) | Contributes to the Corporate Results Framework (CRF) indicator Beneficiaries of ani-poverty programs. Legal working age starts at 18. Youths are temporarily employed in community projects. |
| Women | Number | 0 | 2018 | 3,306 | 4,861 | 233 | 0 | 8,400 | Biometric information system | Ibid between women.  Target was based on recent community development projects.  Pro gender. |
| 1.2 Community Development projects completed. | Number | 0 | 2018 | 170 | 250 | 12 | 0 | 432 | FAES project monitoring reports | Projects are considered completed when FAES receives the reception acts which have been signed by the municipality. |
| 1.3 Biometric information system designed. | Number | 0 | 2018 | 1 |  |  |  | 1 | FAES project monitoring reports | The Biometric information system will be used for registering beneficiaries and for monitoring compliance. |
| **COMPONENT II. Training for youth** | | | | | | | | | | |
| 2.1 Beneficiaries registered in training program  between 16-29 years of age. | Number | 0 | 2018 |  | 710 | 990 |  | 1,700 | FAES project monitoring reports | Contributes to CRF: Beneficiaries of on-the-job training programs. |
| Women | Number | 0 | 2018 |  | 213 | 297 |  | 510 | FAES project monitoring reports | The target of 30% of women beneficiaries was based on previous experiences in the country. Specific actions will be undertaken to promote women's participation.  Pro gender. |
| 2. 2 Apprenticeship model designed. | Report | 0 | 2018 |  |  | 1 |  | 1 | Final report of the apprentice-ship model study validated by FAES and the IDB. |  |
| 2.3 Digital skills training model designed. | Report | 0 | 2018 |  |  | 1 |  | 1 | Final report of the Digital Skills Training Model Study Validated by FAES and the IDB. |  |
| 2.4 Incubation program for starting an income generating activity designed and adapted. | Report | 0 | 2018 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1\* | Report approved by FAES Direction of Economic Activities. | The report will include the description of professional profiles and roles of the trainers. It will also include the description of a six-month curriculum with training modules. Modules will be adapted after participants evaluations. |
| 2.5 Training Managers for incubation program hired, managing the space and providing services to participant youth entrepreneurs. | Number | 0 | 2018 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2\* | FAES project monitoring reports | Services include coordinating the design and implementation of beneficiary selection, identification of potential trainers, training of trainers and management of space facilities where training is provided. |
| 2.6 Co-working space established and equipped. | Number | 0 | 2018 | 1 |  |  |  | 1 | FAES project monitoring reports | An existing space will be adapted. Trainings will be provided on how to start a revenue generating activity. It is operational when it is equipped, and all services are under contract. |
| 2.7 Awareness campaigns launched to identify participants in incubation training program. | Number | 0 | 2018 | 1 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 7 | FAES project monitoring reports | Campaigns are carried out to attract entrepreneurs. They are considered launched when the social media broadcast is implemented via posts on different channels. Awareness workshops will also be used. |
| 2.8 Number of trainers hired to teach courses and specialized modules to entrepreneurs. | Number | 0 | 2018 | 5 | 7 | 9 | 11 | 11\* | FAES project monitoring reports | Incubation program lasts 6 months. Hired trainers will teach marketing, incorporation of companies, accounting, and legal issues. Specialized advisory services (e.g. legal, marketing) will be provided. This output is not auto calculated. The number increases over time as the pool of trainers and experts expands as the entrepreneurial ecosystem develops. |
| 2.9 Selected youth receiving an allowance to participate in training incubation program. | Number | 0 | 2018 | 30 | 70 | 80 | 80 | 260 | FAES project monitoring reports | Youth 18-29 will be selected by a panel composed of experts and entrepreneurs. Applicants are selected based on the quality of the business proposal presented. Each year there will be 2 cohorts of up to 50 individuals (except for 2019: one cohort).  The monthly allowance (US$300) will be paid to contribute to transportation and food to ensure full‑time engagement (equivalent to a scholarship). |
| **COMPONENT III:  Institutional strengthening for FAES and MAST** | | | | | | | | | | |
| 3.1 FAES Operations Manual updated and approved. | Study | 0 | 2018 |  | 1 |  |  | 1 | FAES Memo with Approved Operations Manual | The operations manual will be approved by the Executive Board of FAES. |
| 3.2 FAES Central Level and Regional Offices equipped. | Offices | 0 | 2018 | 3 | 1 |  |  | 4 | FAES monitoring reports | Central level and three Regional offices: Center, NE and NW will be equipped with: ITE equipment and printers, 1 vehicle for supervision, desk, chairs, filling cabinets and supervision kits (Camera, GPS, metric ribbon). |
| 3.3 Training courses carried out. | Courses | 0 | 2018 | 2 | 3 |  |  | 5 | FAES monitoring reports | Courses on: (i) procurement; (ii) project management; (iii) data management; (iv) Human Resource management; and (v) social engineering. |
| 3.4 Project and contract management system integrated with accounting system. | system | 0 | 2018 | 1 |  |  |  | 1 | FAES monitoring reports | SIIGPP is the project and contract management system and TOMPRO is the accounting system. |
| 3.5 Correspondence, filing and archiving systems designed. | System | 0 | 2018 |  | 2 | 1 |  | 3 | Consultancy reports | This includes procedures for information management. |
| 3.6 SIMAST updated. | System Version | 1 | 2018 |  | 1 |  |  | 1 | MAST report | SIMAST information system revised to ensure the feasibility of the recording of the information on the beneficiaries of temporary employment and training. |
| 3.7 Social Protection Strategy developed | Strategy | 0 | 2018 | 1 |  |  |  | 1 | Strategy document |  |
| 3.8 Service offer and attention model for jobseekers designed | Strategy | 0 | 2018 |  |  | 1 |  | 1 | Report with Service offer and attention model for jobseekers validated by FAES, MAST and the IDB |  |
| 3.9 Service offer and engagement strategy for employers designed. | Strategy | 0 | 2018 |  |  | 1 |  | 1 | Report with Service offer and engagement strategy for employers validated by FAES, MAST and the IDB |  |
| 3.10 Strategic management plan, including human resources and performance management strategies designed. | Strategy | 0 | 2018 |  |  |  | 1 | 1 | Report with Strategic management plan, including human resources and performance management strategies validated by FAES, MAST and the IDB |  |
| 3.11 LITP implemented. | Platform | 0 | 2018 |  |  | 1 |  | 1 | Report of the MAST systems are validated by FAES and the IDB |  |
| 3.12 Office of the Public Labor Intermediation Service equipped and operating. | Office | 0 | 2018 |  |  | 1 | 1 | 1\* | Physical inspection | Outputs 3.8, 3.9, 3.10 and 3.13 will be implemented when the Office of the Public Labor. Intermediation Service is operating. |
| 3.13  Labor market information system designed. | Study | 0 | 2018 |  | 1 |  |  | 1 | Report with the road map of the labor market information system by FAES, MAST and the IDB |  |
| \* EOP is not cumulative.  Note: A shorter version of the Results Matrix is placed on Annex II. | | | | | | | | | | |

1. See: Goodman, R. (1997). The Strengths and Difficulties Questionnaire. Journal of Child Psychology and Psychiatry, 40; p. 14 of <https://depts.washington.edu/dbpeds/Screening%20Tools/Strengths_and_Difficulties_Questionnaire.pdf>; and <file:///C:/Users/mstampini/Documents/DATA.IDB/Documents/SDQ_English(USA)_s17+full.pdf> [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
2. ID number or other identifier created by the system. [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
3. Tax number or other identifier created by the system. [↑](#footnote-ref-4)
4. Throughout the 6 months of training, the training centers will prepare bi-monthly progress reports in order to support the payments associated with the training. [↑](#footnote-ref-5)
5. Annex 1 details the instruments for monitoring and information on the frequency of delivery of each and Annex 2 has the Monitoring and Evaluation timeline for activities. [↑](#footnote-ref-6)
6. The costs to implement the survey are part of the contract with UOttawa. [↑](#footnote-ref-7)
7. This indicator was specifically created for the project, baseline data will be collected during the execution. [↑](#footnote-ref-8)
8. Ibid. [↑](#footnote-ref-9)