

TC Document

I. Basic Information for TC

▪ Country/Region:	REGIONAL
▪ TC Name:	Strengthening Evidence-Based Policymaking on Citizen Security and Justice in Latin America and the Caribbean
▪ TC Number:	RG-T3757
▪ Team Leader/Members:	Alvarado, Nathalie Tatiana (IFD/ICS) Team Leader; Serrano Berthet, Rodrigo (IFD/ICS) Alternate Team Leader; Aguilar Blandon, Maria Alejandra (IFD/ICS); Cedillo Lopez, Barbara Paola (IFD/ICS); Forero Benavides, Daniela (IFD/ICS); Manzur Madariaga, Michelle (IFD/ICS); Mendoza Benavente, Horacio (LEG/SGO); Pena Arango, Norma Constanza (IFD/ICS); Posadas, Arnaldo Enrique (IFD/ICS); Rivera, Katia (IFD/ICS); Urquijo Vanegas, Lee Harvey (ITE/IPS); Villa Mar, Karelia (IFD/ICS)
▪ Taxonomy:	Research and Dissemination
▪ Operation Supported by the TC:	.
▪ Date of TC Abstract authorization:	09 Mar 2021.
▪ Beneficiary:	26 IDB borrowing member countries
▪ Executing Agency and contact name:	Inter-American Development Bank
▪ Donors providing funding:	OC Strategic Development Program for Institutions(INS)
▪ IDB Funding Requested:	US\$250,000.00
▪ Local counterpart funding, if any:	US\$0
▪ Disbursement period (which includes Execution period):	24 months
▪ Required start date:	July 2021
▪ Types of consultants:	Firms and individual consultants
▪ Prepared by Unit:	IFD/ICS-Innovation in Citizen Services Division
▪ Unit of Disbursement Responsibility:	IFD/ICS-Innovation in Citizen Services Division
▪ TC included in Country Strategy (y/n):	N/A
▪ TC included in CPD (y/n):	N/A
▪ Alignment to the Update to the Institutional Strategy 2020-2023:	Institutional capacity and rule of law; Social inclusion and equality

II. Objective and Justification of the TC

- 2.1 **Crime and violence are among the most important development challenges faced by Latin America and the Caribbean (LAC) region.** With only 8% of the world's population, LAC has been arguably the world's most violent region, as it accounts for 37% of the homicides of the entire planet. Data from 2018 indicates that LAC homicide rate of 20 homicides per 100,000 inhabitants is four times the global average homicide rate of 6.1 homicides per 100,000 inhabitants (UNODC, 2019). Additionally, the latest *Latinobarómetro* study reveals that 83% of the LAC population fear being a victim of crime and another 25% trusts that crime and violence is their main concern.
- 2.2 **In addition to the human toll, feelings of victimization and fear caused by violence, the region experiences high economic costs due to crime.** According to a recent study, crime imposes significant costs to the LAC economies, absorbing approximately 261 billion dollars a year, which is equivalent to 3.5% of the region's Gross Domestic Product (GDP). This conservative estimate is comparable to the

amount the region spends annually on infrastructure (Jaitman, 2017) and in comparison, the cost of crime in LAC is twice the average cost in developed countries (Jaitman, 2017).

- 2.3 **Unlike other development disciplines, like education or health, in which there is already a body of literature and a more advanced consensus of "what works" in LAC, crime is still an understudied area.** This relative lack of attention in our region contrasts with the significant rise in importance and prominence of research on crime and violence in more affluent and more developed countries. The overwhelming majority of "what we know about what works" in preventing crime comes from countries in the global north.¹ While much of this evidence-base is potentially relevant for LAC countries, institutional and other differences in context makes it imperative to adapt, test, and evaluate those programs as well as the ones created in the region, to generate our own evidence base.
- 2.4 **Criminological research conducted in LAC context has shown interesting but scant results.** In recent years, the Bank, Governments and scholars have invested in generating rigorous knowledge on key areas of the criminal justice sector. For example, hot spot policing programs have shown to be effective in reducing pedestrian robberies in Uruguay and car robberies in Colombia (Chainey, Serrano, & Veneri 2020; Collazos et al., 2020), and community problem-oriented policing has shown significant success in reducing homicides and fear of crime in Colombia (Garcia, Mejia & Ortega, 2013). A public health-based approach to youth violence has reduced gang and gun-related violence in Trinidad and Tobago (Maguire, Oakley & Corsaro, 2018), and violence prevention and care centers for women have reduced the likelihood of domestic violence in Peru (Aguero, 2013).
- 2.5 **Despite these efforts, many gaps in knowledge remain about crime prevention efforts and many strategies have yet to be rigorously tested.** For example, the COVID-19 pandemic changed the nature of social interaction, economic activity, exacerbated the dynamics of crime and generated new challenges for citizen security in the region. It has produced a rearrangement of illicit economies, criminal organizations and the incidence of certain types of crimes. For instance, human trafficking,² migration,³ illegal economies,⁴ cybercrime and the maintenance of public

¹ In the US, for instance, the Department of Justice developed a knowledge repository called Crimesolutions.gov, containing information about more than 500 programs and 150 practices whose impact has been rigorously evaluated.

² In 2018, for every 10 victims detected globally, about five were adult women and two were girls. About one third of the overall detected victims were children, both girls (19%) and boys (15%), while 20% were adult men. Poverty, unemployment, and inequalities exacerbated by the COVID-19 pandemic are likely to increase trafficking in persons, particularly from countries experiencing the fastest and most persistent drops in employment (UNODC, 2020).

³ Although the evidence is still inconclusive in relation to the effects of migratory flows on crime and violence levels, recent studies suggest that in Chile, these have not had an effect on the levels of victimization or the dynamics of crime, instead generated anti-immigration sentiment and increased crime-related concerns (Ajzenman, Dominguez, y Undurraga, 2020). In Colombia, the increase in violent crime is due to homicides involving Venezuelan victims, with no evidence of a statistically significant increase in Colombian victims (Knight y Tribin, 2020).

⁴ Illegal economies have been estimated to generate around US\$870 trillion in profits annually, which is equivalent to 1.5% of all the world's GDP. That is six times the official amount of development assistance and the equivalent of 7% of world merchandise exports (UNODC, 2011). The severe economic contraction and job losses caused by the measures to prevent the spread of the coronavirus can potentially translate into the search for negative coping mechanisms, if there are no other options to generate income (UNODC, 2020).

order. These new dynamics have widened the knowledge gaps about crime prevention efforts, and challenged government responses to effectively address them.

- 2.6 **In the post-pandemic context there is an urgent need to improve the way knowledge is developed and disseminated to facilitate the design and implementation of evidence-based crime prevention policies in the region.** The short-term and long-term impact of the pandemic on crime dynamics will require an extraordinary influx of financial resources. The decisions taken today and the strategies implemented to face the social, economic and public health crisis in LAC will shape citizen security and justice policies in the coming years. In this context, the Bank and governments of the region face challenging times in terms of effectively allocating limited resources. To be able to ration resources effectively while fostering policies and actions that contribute the most to human development and equality, governments more than ever, need to strengthen the link between research and policymaking. Thus, it is essential to generate methodologies and tools that allow greater expansion of the knowledge base in areas where the knowledge gaps are larger, quicker dissemination and easy access to existing empirical evidence and deeper collaboration networks of public and private actors.
- 2.7 **Objective.** The general objective of this TC is to support LAC governments in their efforts to improve evidence-based policymaking in citizen security and justice (CSJ). The specific objectives are: (i) to conduct rigorous research of crime prevention interventions; (ii) contribute to translate research into actionable evidence; and (iii) facilitate access to knowledge on what works and what does not in reducing violence and impunity. This operation will provide additional value added by: (i) developing the *CSJLab*, the first-ever IDB Evidence-Based repository on citizen security and justice for LAC; (ii) establishing elements for a comparative analysis of what works in crime prevention in the region and the world, and (iii) providing governments with updated, timely and relevant evidence that can inform policy decisions.
- 2.8 **Strategic alignment.** The proposed TC is consistent with the updated IDB Institutional Strategy 2020-2023 (AB-3190-2) and it is aligned with the development challenges of social inclusion and equality by introducing the use of technology tools to promote the generation of knowledge and improve access to evidence needed to directly improve policymaking in citizen security and justice. It is consistent with the cross-cutting issue of institutional capacity and the rule of law by providing citizen security and justice institutions with knowledge and more effective solutions to better face the challenges of citizen security and justice. It is aligned with the Strategic Development Program for Institutions (GN-2819-1) under the priorities of improving public policy and institutional strengthening for improving the delivery of public services. In addition, Citizen Security is also one of the main areas of the Strategy for Institutions for Growth and Social Welfare (GN-2587-2) and was identified as a priority area that contributes to the objectives of the Bank's ninth capital increase (AB-2764). The TC is aligned with the Citizen Security and Justice Sector Framework Document (GN-2771-7) which calls for the design and implementation of evidence-based citizen security policies and the generation and dissemination of knowledge and empirical evidence.
- 2.9 **Complementarity.** This TC builds upon results from previous operations aimed at mapping citizen security strategies, supporting national governments to advance knowledge through cutting-edge research as well as building local capacity and promoting knowledge exchange. For example, the IDB has funded the generation of new empirical knowledge by conducting impact evaluations at the local level in several

countries,⁵ and implementing robust research at the national and subnational levels.⁶ More recently the Bank doubled its efforts in building the public good of knowledge and research the region needs. For instance, the program “Evidence-based Public Security Policies Platform” (ATN/OC-17558-BR) is supporting Brazil to accelerate the accumulation and dissemination of scientific knowledge for policy formulation by creating the first national online repository of evidence-based public security interventions. The current TC will amplify and extend those efforts to other countries in the LAC region under the premise that policy decisions should be better informed by rigorous research by: (i) assessing evaluation methodologies of crime and violence prevention programs, not only at the local level but at the regional and national level; (ii) improving access to knowledge and facilitating south-south and north-south diffusion of innovations through a web-based clearinghouse; and (iii) creating multi-stakeholder partnerships to mobilize, generate and sustain the generation of new knowledge.

- 2.10 **Beneficiaries.** The knowledge and evidence produced under the *CSJLab* will prioritize the strategic areas in which the knowledge gaps are larger given the current knowledge and capacity of the region (¶2.5). Given the regional nature of this technical cooperation, all borrowing member countries of the IDB will be beneficiaries of the knowledge generated by this operation. To conduct the necessary studies in a specific country the following criteria will be considered: (i) knowledge gaps identified in specific countries are aligned with the IDB’s comparative advantages in the citizen security and justice sector (detailed in the Sector Framework Document [GN-2771-7]); (ii) studies alignment with citizen security and justice topics and priorities established between the IDB and beneficiary countries through Country Strategies; and (ii) availability and access to relevant data to conduct empirical evaluations, and internal capacity to conduct them. In addition, regional balance and countries’ interest in participating will be taken into consideration. Final beneficiaries of this analytical work will be governments, criminal justice organizations, policymakers, and practitioners. Specifically, practitioners and government officials from the Ministries of Security, Justice, Interior or Defense and policy makers working in these areas will be benefited by having access to rigorous research and evidence that can help them make decisions and build public policies based on evidence. Also, non-governmental and private sector actors will also benefit and are fundamental for innovation, experimentation, and learning. The *CSJLab* will support the generation, dissemination and use of knowledge related to the IDB’s borrowing member countries in LAC.
- 2.11 **Sustainability.** To ensure sustainability and implementation of the products and results of the TC, the project team will seek to create synergies with the operational and research agenda of the Bank in the countries. It is expected that strategies, reports, and instruments generated by this TC will support the design, implementation and/or evaluation of projects related to crime and violence prevention.

⁵ Just to name a few, Chile (ATN/OC-15731-CH), Colombia, (ATN/KP-13448-CO; ATN/JO-16002-CO), México (ATN/KP-14212-ME), Trinidad and Tobago (ATN/OC-13552-RG), Perú (ATN/OC-13940-RG), and Uruguay (2770/OC-UR).

⁶ The Cost of Crime and Violence in Latin America and the Caribbean (RG-K1109 and RG-K1198), Public Policies for the Reduction and Prevention of Urban Crime in Latin America and the Caribbean (ATN/OC-14165-RG and ATN/OC-15246-RG), Crime and violence in the Caribbean (ATN/OC-13652-RG), Strengthening data generation for correctional management in the Caribbean (ATN/OC-15621-RG), Violence against women in the Caribbean (ATN/OC-14725-RG), among others.

III. Description of activities and outputs

- 3.1 **Component 1: Taking stock of existing evidence-based crime prevention and violence reduction strategies in LAC (US\$30,000).** The *CSJLab* will foster the systematization of existing knowledge as well as the generation of new rigorous evidence on areas where there is still limited expertise and knowledge to inform CSJ policies. Specifically, this component will finance activities related to: (i) screening evaluations of CSJ interventions based on the robustness of the research methods and their potential for replicability and practical use for policymakers in the region.⁷ Interventions can include those supported by multilateral and bilateral agencies, government agencies, foundations, and private actors in the last two decades (2000-2020)⁸; and (ii) based on the results of the initial screening of the available evidence, a knowledge and evidence gap analysis will be conducted to identify and prioritize areas in which LAC governments could invest in the production of new knowledge or in refining and consolidating existing information to better inform evidence based CSJ policies. The *CSJLab* will provide the space both to experiment, produce knowledge, and take stock of the rigorous evidence to bridge the gap between research outputs and policymaking throughout the region.
- 3.2 **Component 2: Creation and consolidation of empirical knowledge in CSJ in LAC (US\$115,000).** The objective of this component is to facilitate the development of cutting-edge research studies in areas in which the generation of evidence has been much more limited (¶2.5). In addition, the *CSJLab* will foster and south-south and north-south knowledge exchange that will guide governments in their efforts to develop CJS policies based on scientific evidence. Specifically, this component will finance: (i) the management and launch of a series of calls for research proposals⁹ with targeted advertisement to identify technically rigorous projects and to produce high quality evaluations (including processes, implementation, cost-effectiveness, and impact) of citizen and justice interventions that will contribute to fill existing knowledge gaps, inform evidence-based policymaking and policy management; (ii) workshops to promote of multi-sector partnerships (governments, universities, private sector, NGOs, etc.) to engage in the generation and exchange of knowledge and policies; and

⁷ Robustness of impact evaluations will be determined by the Maryland Scientific Methods Scale (SMS). The SMS is a five-point scale ranging from 1 to 5, one being the lowest score and five the highest. A score of one is for evaluations based on simple cross-sectional correlations, two for evaluations measuring before and after the intervention with no control condition, three for measures before and after the program with comparable units of analysis, four for quasi-experiments, and five for randomized control trials. Evaluations with a score of three on the SMS or higher could potentially be shortlisted in the initial mapping of Evidence-based practices in LAC.

⁸ As part of the initial activities of the *CSJLab*, the Bank started to put together an inventory of empirical evidence generated between 1994 and 2014, in partnership with Igarape Institute. This first inventory included information on 1,354 citizen security interventions from LAC countries, including cities. From this sample, about 115 interventions were identified as having some kind of evaluation or reports of results, and only 7% had a formal evaluation with a scientific methodology and positive results of the intervention. Based on the results of this inventory, the Bank will be able to expand the screening from 2014 to 2020 and prioritize the search in countries with the largest investment in CSJ and largest number of interventions. These include Central America, Brazil, Colombia, Chile and Jamaica (Jaitman, 2017; Muggah & Aguirre, 2013).

⁹ The criteria under which the proposals will be evaluated are the following (i) quality of the data and the research methodology; (ii) policy relevance and the extent to which research responds to one or more of the thematic areas prioritized in the call; (iii) credentials of the research members; (iv) potential to be replicated and scalable; (v) can be completed during a maximum of 24 months including the production of a working paper; and (vi) proposals will be selected taking into account a balanced representation of different countries and geographic regions.

(iii) creation and active participation in an international scientific advisory committee¹⁰ and coordination group (government officials, scholars, practitioners, policymakers, and knowledge brokers) to ensure the quality in knowledge generation, as well as, enhancing the potential of research to impact policy through successful knowledge translation.

- 3.3 **Component 3: Implementation of the CSJLab evidence-based web-platform and strengthening evidence-based policymaking (US\$105,000).** The objective of this component is to assist government in policymaking by creating mechanisms for information sharing and facilitating timely access to knowledge about what works and what does not in preventing crime and reducing impunity. Specifically, this component will finance: (i) a series of working groups and dissemination workshops between IDB specialists, the scientific committee, government officials, and representatives from the private sector, in order to develop a methodological framework, and action plan for the CSJLab for the upcoming years, as well as sharing the results of the studies conducted in component 1 and 2; (ii) the design and implementation of the CSJLab website;¹¹ and (iii) scholarships for CJS public officials to attend the MOOC “Leaders for Citizen Security and Justice Management” which focuses on what we know about what works in citizen security and justice and cross-cutting knowledge to address post-pandemic challenges.

IV. Budget

- 4.1 The project’s total amount will be US\$250,000 through the OC Strategic Development Program for Institutions. The following table summarizes main activities and their estimated cost.

Indicative Budget (US\$)

Activity / Component	Description	Total Funding (IDB)
Component 1	Taking stock of existing evidence-based crime prevention and violence reduction strategies in LAC	30,000
	• Screening CJS evaluations	20,000
	• Knowledge and evidence gap analysis	10,000
Component 2	Creation and consolidation of empirical knowledge in citizen security and justice	115,000
	• Calls for research proposals.	50,000
	• Workshops for partnership creation	15,000

¹⁰ A scientific advisory committee (SAC) will be established to provide technical inputs, ensure the technical soundness, and the integrity of research activities proposed under component 1 and 2. The SAC will be comprised of IDB specialists, research scientists in the field of criminal justice, sociology, psychology, economics, and statistics, as well as practitioners and policy officials in the field. Ideally, members will be experts in key thematic areas such as, social prevention, policing, justice and rule of law, corrections and rehabilitation, immigration, organized crime, human trafficking, among others.

¹¹ This website is envisioned as a clearing house that will gather information on available evidence of effectiveness of CSJ programs in the region, including impact evaluations of citizen security interventions screened using the MSM. It will also include other materials to facilitate the translation of knowledge into practice and into evidence-informed policies, such as, policy briefs, systematic of the literature, plain language summaries of the research, white papers, reports, evidence maps, among others. The clearing house will also be an important mechanism to disseminate the call for papers, events, and new relevant evidence as it becomes available, and to strengthen strategic partnerships with policymakers, academics, donors and government officials. This platform will be hosted by the IDB and will be freely accessible to policy makers, practitioners, academics, government authorities, and the general public.

Activity / Component	Description	Total Funding (IDB)
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Scientific committee and coordination group 	50,000
Component 3	Institutionalizing a citizen security and justice evidence-based clearinghouse in LAC	105,000
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Working groups 	25,000
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Website development 	45,000
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Training workshops 	35,000
Total		250,000

V. Executing agency and execution structure

- 5.1 According to the section 1.1 of annex II of the OP-619-4 “Research and Dissemination” technical cooperation by definition are Bank initiatives, hence it is responsible for the selection and hiring of consultancy services. This TC will be executed by the IDB through its Innovation in Citizen Services Division (IFD/ICS) and will benefit all IDB member’s countries. The Bank has a unique comparative advantage, as a knowledge broker in the CSJ field in LAC, to lead and implement this regional effort and to articulate the efforts between countries. It will also contribute to develop a strategic vision to face insecurity and crime in the region and produce cutting-edge knowledge based on evidence. Based on the extensive reach of the TC to the members countries, as well as the capacity of the Bank to connect and coordinate with all of the countries in regard to access to the information and knowledge generated by this TC, the Bank has a unique comparative advantage. In addition, this operation will benefit from the Bank’s execution with regards to all the hiring and procurement processes, which will be done directly and exclusively by the Bank.
- 5.2 The Project Team Leader will be responsible for execution, in coordination with the other team members and the respective Country Offices. All administrative and technical supervision procedures will be the responsibility of IFD/ICS. The IDB will conduct the procurement of consulting services required for TC implementation, according to the Bank’s policies and procedures. The TC will be implemented over 24 months.
- 5.3 All activities to be executed under this TC have been included in the Procurement Plan (Annex III) and will be contracted in accordance with Bank policies as follows: (a) AM-650 for hiring of individual consultants; (b) GN-2765-4 and Guidelines OP-1155-4 for contracting of consulting firms for services of an intellectual nature; and (c) GN-2303-28 for contracting of logistics and other related services other than consulting.

VI. Project Risks and issues

- 6.1 There are three main risks identified for this TC. The first one, and most important one relates to the lack of stake holder buy-in due mainly to the lack of tradition among public security and justice policymakers in the region to base decisions and policy formulation in rigorous evidence. To mitigate this risk, and to ensure continuity and sustainability, the Bank has been working with different stakeholders, including government officials, scholars, and practitioners in the CSJ field who have expressed their interest in being part of the platform to build a knowledge bridge between policy making and academia. Particularly through the regional policy dialogues hosted yearly by the IDB have called up on the attention and need to have a one stop shop that allows a variety of users access evidence and practical tools that can better inform

policy making. In addition, the project team will use its regional platforms to present and disseminate the project objectives and activities and to ensure effective engagement.

- 6.2 The second risk is associated with the sustainability of the online platform, both in terms of content and financial resources after this TC has been executed. To mitigate this risk, the Bank will coordinate a fundraising strategy to approach donors, within the private sector, including academic institutions and technology corporations, and gather their interest and willingness to support knowledge generation efforts. For instance, preliminary conversations have taken place with universities, some of which have expressed interest in contributing with in-kind resources to support empirical studies and generate academic content for the *CJSLab*. In addition, the team is promoting through its loans and other Technical Cooperations the implementation of cutting-edge studies in citizen security and justice.
- 6.3 The third risk is associated with the COVID-19 pandemic and its effects on the timely implementation of the activities. The risks for inter-personal interaction in light of the COVID-19 pandemic will be managed using digital platforms, whenever appropriate and, in cases where in-person meetings and training is required, limits will be placed on the size of the cohorts of attendees and trainees to ensure effective social distancing and minimize contagion.

VII. Environmental and Social Classification

- 7.1 Given the characteristics of the project, no negative environmental or social risks are associated with the activities outlined in this TC, therefore no mitigation strategy is required to address any impact. According to the Environmental and Safeguards Compliance Policy (OP-703) the classification of this operation is "C". See Safeguard Policy Filter ([SPF](#)) and Safeguard Screening Form ([SSF](#)).

Required Annexes:

[Results Matrix - RG-T3757](#)

[Terms of Reference - RG-T3757](#)

[Procurement Plan - RG-T3757](#)