

## STRENGTHENING OF BILINGUAL EDUCATION

(TC-97-10-43-6-PR)

### EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

**REQUESTER:** Ministry of Education and Worship

**EXECUTING AGENCY:** Ministry of Education and Worship

**BENEFICIARIES:** Ministry's technical and teaching staff

**FINANCING:**

IDB:	US\$570,000 (FSO, foreign exchange)
	US\$130,000 (FSO, local currency)
Local counterpart funding:	US\$ 75,000
Total:	US\$775,000

**TERMS:**

Execution period:	24 months
Disbursement period:	30 months

**ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW AND SPECIAL CONSIDERATIONS:** No comments were made.

**OBJECTIVES:** The general objective of this technical-cooperation operation is to improve and consolidate, in the context of education reform, the implementation of a bilingual education plan for the Guaraní as mother tongue modality at the primary and middle-school level (grades 1 through 9).

**DESCRIPTION:** To achieve the proposed objective, the program has been divided into four components.

1. **Education research** (US\$263,150): the purpose of this component is to provide feedback for decision-making on bilingual education and the teaching process, with a new approach and better understanding of Paraguayan sociolinguistic and education realities. To achieve this goal, studies will be conducted on Paraguayan sociolinguistic issues, the Guaraní language, and the execution and evaluation of Guaraní-Spanish bilingual education programs.
2. **Teacher training and refresher courses** (US\$317,600): the purpose is to help teachers improve their performance in schools where

classes are taught in Guaraní by offering them opportunities for study, reflection, and sharing of experiences.

3. **Information and awareness campaigns on Paraguayan bilingualism** (US\$17,650): the purpose is to help generate support for education reform and policies, particularly those related to bilingual education and the use of Guaraní as the principal tool of school-based education for Guaraní-speaking children.
4. **Production of educational materials** (US\$84,000): this component consists of promoting the production of teaching materials to help children learn Guaraní, either as a first or second language, for use in schools participating in this project.

**BENEFITS:**

The program's expected benefits are as follows: (i) individual personality and national identity will be strengthened, in that children will gain in self-esteem as the value of their native language is recognized, and that language is legitimized and institutionalized in the schools; (ii) school management and relations among the members of the school community (parents, children, teachers, community) will be enhanced; and (iii) the children's learning processes will be more fluid and dynamic (spontaneity and participation will help children learn more quickly and retain what they have learned more readily).

**RISKS:**

The implementation of this operation does not involve significant risk. The Ministry of Education and Worship (MEC) has been working closely in the design of the program and has a strong sense of ownership, which provides a high level of confidence that the operation will be conducted within the planned time periods and that the proposed objectives will be achieved. However, because some of the proposed activities will be conducted through other institutions (universities), some difficulties in coordinating the efforts may crop up. For this reason, an internal monitoring committee will be set up and will play an important role of interinstitutional coordination.

**POVERTY-TARGETING  
AND SOCIAL  
CLASSIFICATION:**

This operation automatically qualifies as poverty-targeted, inasmuch as it supports activities in the primary education sector (document GN-1964-3, II.1.b).

**ROLE OF THE  
PROJECT IN THE  
BANK'S COUNTRY AND  
SECTOR STRATEGY:**

The Bank's strategy for Paraguay is to support social and rural development programs with a view to reducing poverty and improving living standards, particularly for the neediest population segments. In terms of formal education, the Bank's strategy is to improve preschool and primary education by: (i) strengthening the community base for preschool and primary education; (ii) decentralizing responsibility for preschool and primary education to communities and municipalities; (iii) training educational staff; (iv) improving access of the monolingual Guaraní-speaking population to primary and middle-school education; and (v) linking schools more closely with the workplace.

**SPECIAL  
CONTRACTUAL  
CONDITIONS:**

None.

**EXCEPTIONS TO  
BANK POLICY:**

In the case of some specialized services, direct contracting without competition will be used, in view of the needs and specifications of the operation (see paragraph 3.9 of the document).

**PROCUREMENT:**

The consultants will be contracted pursuant to the Bank's guidelines and procedures.

## I. FRAME OF REFERENCE

### A. Changes in the sociolinguistic situation

- 1.1 Under its Constitution, approved in 1992, Paraguay is a multicultural country with two official languages: Guaraní and Spanish. This is a reality-based provision: only 7% of the population is monolingual in Spanish; 50% uses Spanish and Guaraní to communicate daily; 37% uses only Guaraní; and the remaining 6% speaks foreign languages or native languages other than Guaraní.
- 1.2 According to the 1992 National Population and Housing Census, 50% of Paraguayan women are monolingual speakers of Guaraní. Guaraní is the predominating language in rural areas where 60% of women use Guaraní as their sole language, compared with only 15% in urban areas. However, urban areas have been heavily influenced by migration over the last few years. In 1950, 34.6% of the population lived in urban areas, compared with 50% in 1992. Women comprise 60% of this migratory movement. As a result, Guaraní may become more common in urban areas either because of (i) intense internal migration from rural areas to cities; or (ii) the key sociolinguistic role women have played, ever since the colonial era, in preserving and disseminating Guaraní as a mother tongue, to the point that today 87% of the population uses Guaraní.

### B. National bilingual education plan

- 1.3 Within the context of education reform, the national bilingual education plan was developed in 1994, and has the following objectives: (i) generate equal opportunities; (ii) promote greater social equity, by allowing access to education without linguistic discrimination; (iii) make better and faster use of educational resources and the cultural potential of students and educators; and (iv) strengthen cognitive-emotional development of future citizens by enabling them to use two different sociolinguistic systems. This plan has been implemented under two modalities: in one, Guaraní is treated as the mother tongue, and in the other as a second language. In short, the purpose of the plan is for boys and girls in either situation to know both official languages fluently.
- 1.4 Under the plan, the Guaraní as mother tongue program is currently offered in 400 schools, where schoolbooks and some educational materials have been published in Guaraní. Recent research on the effectiveness of this program <sup>1/</sup> shows that Guaraní-speaking children are more successful in school when their native language is used and the content is consistent with their world view and

---

<sup>1/</sup> Centro Paraguay de Estudios Sociológicos [Paraguay Center for Sociological Studies] "Study on Bilingualism in the Context of Education Reform", (March 1998), Asunción, Paraguay (in press).

daily life. The approach also helps develop feelings of personal self-worth and a positive self-image among students. In addition, this study found that students perform better on tests of linguistic competence in Guaraní and Spanish than peers who do not participate in such programs, whether in rural or urban areas.

- 1.5 According to educators and principals in the schools involved in this experiment, students participate more actively in class, communicate better, have a higher academic success rate, and exhibit higher self-esteem. However, this success should not obscure the difficulties - particularly in terms of methodology - that have been detected in teaching a second language. According to the aforementioned study, most of those teachers do not recognize methodological differences between teaching in Guaraní and teaching in Spanish and assume the only difference is the time spent on each in the classroom.
- 1.6 The above data are significant not only in terms of bilingual education but also for the education system in general. This is because functional illiteracy is to be expected among the population that only uses Guaraní, since the language is predominantly oral. All researchers have drawn attention to the peculiar character of bilingualism in Paraguay, where there is a high degree of homogeneity. If this factor is not taken into account, there will be difficulties in schooling children from monolingual homes, and social practices and values not always consistent with the country's development could take permanent root.
- 1.7 In 1992, 45.2% of the population was functionally illiterate. One of the main characteristics of Paraguayan bilingualism is diglossia (the effect two languages has on a society as well as on the status and social recognition enjoyed by those who speak both). This effect can result in: (a) fluency in neither language - Spanish or Guaraní; (b) the indiscriminate and nonsystematic mixture of syntax and semantics from each language, to meet specific needs; and (c) the cultural shock that occurs in two situations - when speakers of a predominantly oral language (Guaraní) are schooled in another oral and written language (Spanish), and when sociocultural distance is created between speakers of popular versus academic Guaraní (which of course comes up and affects the country's entire political and educational system).

C. The Bank's strategy in the area of the proposed program

- 1.8 The Bank's strategy for Paraguay is to support social and rural development programs with a view to reducing poverty and improving living standards, particularly among the neediest population segments.
- 1.9 In terms of formal education, the Bank's strategy is to improve preschool and primary education by: (i) strengthening the

community base for preschool and primary education; (ii) decentralizing responsibility for preschool and primary education to communities and municipalities; (iii) training educational staff; (iv) improving access of the monolingual Guaraní-speaking population to primary and middle-school education (grades 1 through 9); and (v) linking schools more closely with the workplace. In this regard, the proposed technical-cooperation operation takes up the challenges faced by Paraguay and is consistent with the strategy identified by the Bank and the mandates of the Eighth Replenishment.

- 1.10 In 1993, the Bank approved two loans for Paraguay (770/OC and 908/SF) for the implementation of a primary education improvement program, whose objective was to improve the quality of primary education and increase the internal efficiency of primary and preschool education. The program's activities included the introduction of the new primary and middle-school curriculum, preparation and distribution of teaching materials, basic and refresher training of educators, strengthening of the Ministry of Education and Worship (MEC), and upgrading of the physical plant. In order to improve the quality of education in rural areas where Guaraní prevails and promote equal opportunity in education, the program also included a pilot program for monolingual Guaraní-speaking children in 400 primary schools.
- 1.11 Despite these actions, difficulties in consolidating a broader policy in bilingual education remain, including: (i) lack of information on the country's sociolinguistic reality, particularly as regards Guaraní and Spanish; (ii) lack of a specific communication media strategy on Paraguayan bilingualism; and (iii) lack of greater variety in educational materials that address the particularities of bilingual education and the need for an evaluation of textbooks currently in use.
- 1.12 The goal of the proposed technical-cooperation operation is to resolve these difficulties, by supplementing efforts already under way, conducting new studies, and carrying out activities that will serve as input not only to strengthen the bilingual education plan, but also to prepare a new operation for consolidation of education reform, included in the Bank's operations program for 1999.

## II. OBJECTIVE

- 2.1 The general objective of this technical-cooperation operation is to improve and consolidate, in the context of education reform, the implementation of a bilingual education plan for primary and middle-schools where Guaraní is taught as a mother tongue. Annex I contains the logical framework for the program.

- 2.2 It is estimated that the project will directly benefit technical staff of the MEC (Policy Unit and primary education, teacher training, and curriculum departments) as well as 20 teachers at the higher institute of education, 80 teachers at teacher training centers, 70 supervisors and 400 teachers at schools with bilingual education programs. The project will indirectly benefit 28,000 Guaraní-speaking children attending the 400 schools that are currently implementing this modality at the primary and middle-school level and approximately 1,500 teachers currently working at these schools.

### III. DESCRIPTION

#### A. Activities to be conducted

- 3.1 To achieve the proposed objective, the program has been divided into four components: (i) education research; (ii) teacher training and refresher courses; (iii) information and awareness campaigns on Paraguayan bilingualism; and (iv) production of educational materials.
- 3.2 **Component 1. Education research (US\$263,150).** The purpose is to provide feedback for decision-making on bilingual education and for the teaching process, with a new vision and better understanding of the Paraguayan sociolinguistic and education reality. To achieve this goal, studies will be conducted on Paraguay's sociolinguistic issues, the Guaraní language, and the execution and evaluation of Guaraní-Spanish bilingual education programs. Such studies will reveal the particularities of Paraguayan bilingualism and provide inputs that will help improve the conditions under which education is provided in predominantly Guaraní-speaking areas. The findings of the studies will be analyzed and discussed with senior educational authorities and members of the MEC's Policy Analysis Unit, to permit their use by decision-makers in the formulation and review of policies. The following activities will be conducted: (i) national sociolinguistic mapping; (ii) exploratory study for a linguistic atlas and for the development of standard Guaraní; (iii) evaluation of innovative experiences in bilingual education; and (iv) design and validation of a language competency test.
- 3.3 **Component 2. Teacher training and refresher courses (US\$317,600).** The objective of this component is to help educators improve their job performance in schools where Guaraní is taught as a mother tongue, offering opportunities for study, reflection and sharing of experiences. The following activities will be conducted: (i) design of new teacher training strategies; (ii) design and production of new training materials; (iii) scholarships for undergraduate and graduate studies in the country; (iv) traineeships in bilingual intercultural education; (v) trainer

training; and (vi) outreach and sharing of experiences among bilingual educators.

- 3.4 **Component 3. Information and awareness campaigns on Paraguayan bilingualism (US\$17,650).** The objective of this component is to help generate a favorable climate for education reform and related policies, particularly those involving bilingual education and the use of the Guaraní language as a principal instrument of school-based education for Guaraní-speaking children. It includes actions aimed at designing a communication strategy and the preparation of methodological tools to launch a national information and awareness campaign to promote Guaraní-Spanish bilingual education. A pilot program will be carried out in order to test the proposed information strategies. The activity under this component is the design and formulation of a publicity strategy.
- 3.5 **Component 4. Production of educational materials (US\$84,000).** The objective of this component is to encourage the production of teaching materials to help children learn Guaraní, either as a first or second language, for use at the schools participating in this project. It includes the evaluation and review of the textbooks being used at the Guaraní modality schools and the production of complementary educational materials to enrich bilingual teaching practices. The following will be carried out under this component: (i) a review and redrafting of textbooks currently used in primary and middle-school education under the Guaraní modality; and (ii) a bilingual education school kit.

B. Cost and financing

- 3.6 The total cost of the program is estimated at US\$775,000. The Bank will contribute up to US\$700,000, of which US\$570,000 will be in foreign currency drawn from the Fund for Special Operations, while US\$130,000 will be drawn in local currency from the same source. The MEC will provide the local counterpart funding of US\$75,000. The following table breaks down the costs and proposed financing.



Table I. Cost Table				
CONSOLIDATED BUDGET (in US\$000)				
Budget category	IDB	MEC	TOTAL	%
<b>A. Education research</b>				
1. Consulting services	121,050	15,750	136,800	18.0
2. Travel and per diem	49,150	-	49,150	6.0
3. Publications	37,900	2,670	40,570	5.0
4. Seminars/workshops	3,450	3,000	6,450	1.0
5. General support	29,100	1,080	30,180	4.0
<b>SUBTOTAL</b>	<b>240,650</b>	<b>22,500</b>	<b>263,150</b>	<b>34.0</b>
<b>B. Training and refresher courses</b>				
1. Consulting services	111,480	9,750	121,230	16.0
2. Travel and per diem	90,810	-	90,810	12.0
3. Publications	18,470	4,050	22,520	2.5
4. Scholarships and traineeships	62,800	-	62,800	8.0
5. Seminars/workshop	1,140	2,000	3,140	0.5
6. General support	2,100	15,000	17,100	2.0
<b>SUBTOTAL</b>	<b>286,800</b>	<b>30,800</b>	<b>317,600</b>	<b>41.0</b>
<b>C. Information and awareness campaigns</b>				
1. Consulting services	16,000		16,000	1.8
2. Seminar/workshop	1,150	500	1,650	0.2
<b>SUBTOTAL</b>	<b>17,150</b>	<b>500</b>	<b>17,650</b>	<b>2.0</b>
<b>D. Production of educational materials</b>				
1. Consulting services	48,000	-	48,000	6.0
2. Travel and per diem	32,700	-	32,700	4.5
3. Seminar/workshop	3,300	-	3,300	0.5
<b>SUBTOTAL</b>	<b>84,000</b>	<b>-</b>	<b>84,000</b>	<b>11.0</b>
<b>E. Indirect costs</b>				
1. General coordinator	30,000	-	30,000	4.0
2. Overhead	-	21,200	21,200	3.0
3. Contingencies	41,400	-	41,400	5.0
<b>SUBTOTAL</b>	<b>71,400</b>	<b>21,200</b>	<b>92,600</b>	<b>12.0</b>
<b>SUBTOTAL FOR CATEGORIES</b>	<b>628,600</b>	<b>53,800</b>	<b>682,400</b>	<b>88.0</b>
<b>OVERALL TOTAL</b>	<b>700,000</b>	<b>75,000</b>	<b>775,000</b>	<b>100.0</b>
<b>Percentages</b>	<b>90%</b>	<b>10%</b>	<b>100%</b>	

C. Coordination and execution

- 3.7 This technical-cooperation operation will be executed by the Ministry of Education and Worship (MEC) through the same program coordinating unit (PCU) that is currently managing the primary

education improvement program (770/OC and 908/SF), in order to take advantage of the unit's technical and operational capacity. The operation will be executed over a 24-month period and disbursements may extend to up to 30 months from the signature of the technical-cooperation agreement.

- 3.8 For this operation, the MEC has appointed the current general coordinator of the aforementioned program to be in charge of organizing, supervising, and evaluating the agreed activities; his first 12 months of activities will be financed with resources from the primary education improvement program, inasmuch as it still has about a year to go before it is completed. This coordinator will be assisted by MEC technical staff and specialists in bilingualism as well as local and international consultants. The PCU will provide its installed capacity in terms of computer systems and equipment, availability of specialized information, and logistical support so that the operation will be properly executed.
- 3.9 The consultants will be responsible for preparing the terms of reference for contracting out, on the basis of a call for proposals, the various activities included in the program components. The Bank's guidelines and procedures will be followed for study and consulting contracts. However, in view of the special nature and requirements of the operation, the PCU may hire institutions conducting component 2 activities in the area of scholarships for undergraduate studies in bilingual education directly, without a call for proposals. These institutions are: (i) the Universidad Evangélica del Paraguay, for a bilingual education undergraduate program; (ii) the Universidad Católica (UCA), for a master's program in bilingual education; and (iii) Bolivia's bilingual intercultural education program (PROEIB-ANDES), for an internship program in bilingual intercultural education. The PCU is being given this authority because these institutions are the only ones offering this service.
- 3.10 For the purposes of disbursement, the project team considers it appropriate to set up a revolving fund with up to 25% of the resources needed to cover costs during the first six months of the operation.

D. Monitoring and evaluation

- 3.11 The program will be supervised by the Bank's Country Office in Paraguay, with support from Division SO1. Three types of reports will be prepared: (i) **initial**, to be submitted within 60 days of the start of the program; (ii) **semiannual**, to be submitted within 30 days following the end of each six-month period; (iii) **final**, to be submitted within 90 days of the end of the program. The first two reports should contain: (a) progress of the activities planned under the program; (b) progress of disbursements in relation to planned disbursements, and expenditures applied to the counterpart;

(c) a summary of the recommendations of consultants contracted with program resources; and (d) the plan of activities for the following six-month period. The final report will specify the main achievements and prospects for implementing an education strategy to strengthen this method of teaching. All the reports will be submitted to the Bank and discussed to ensure that the goals are met. The Bank will also participate in the various scheduled events and seminars, through participation of technical staff from the Country Office and Headquarters.

- 3.12 An internal monitoring committee will be set up within the PCU, comprising technical staff from the MEC and specialists in bilingualism, who will be responsible for approving all research work and evaluating the textbooks stipulated by this technical-cooperation operation.

#### IV. BENEFITS AND RISKS

##### A. Benefits

- 4.1 The program's expected benefits are as follows: (i) individual personality and national identity will be strengthened, in that children will gain in self-esteem as the value of their native language is recognized, and that language is legitimized and institutionalized in the schools; (ii) school management and relations among the members of the school community (parents, children, teachers, community) will be enhanced; and (iii) the children's learning processes will be more fluid and dynamic (spontaneity and participation will help children learn more quickly and retain what they have learned more readily).

##### B. Risks

- 4.2 The implementation of this operation does not involve significant risk. The MEC has been working closely in the design of the program and has a strong sense of ownership, which provides a high level of confidence that the operation will be conducted within the planned time periods and that the proposed objectives will be achieved. However, because some of the proposed activities will be conducted through other institutions (universities), some difficulties in coordinating the efforts may crop up. For this reason, an internal monitoring committee will be set up and will play an important role of interinstitutional coordination.

## LOGICAL FRAMEWORK

OBJECTIVES	INDICATORS	MEANS OF VERIFICATION	ASSUMPTION
Design of bilingual education policies and primary and middle-school education (grades 1	<p>Policy Unit of the MEC improves its capacity to design bilingual education policies and strategies in primary and middle-school education.</p> <p>Existence within the MEC of research, data, and criteria supporting the design of national bilingual education policies at the primary and middle-school levels.</p>	<p>Policy and strategy documents on bilingual education.</p> <p>MEC database (Department of Bilingual Education).</p>	Continuity in the development of policy and strategy regarding bilingual education on the part of the MEC.
of education reform, improve and strengthen of the bilingual education plan for the Guaraní language modality in primary and middle-school	<p>Program involving Guaraní as mother tongue modality strengthens its planning capacity by targeting its actions.</p> <p>Formulation of new strategies for training of specialized human resources in bilingual education — Guaraní as mother tongue modality.</p> <p>Formulation of a strategy to publicize bilingual education.</p>	<p>Socioeducational map. Development of standard Guaraní.</p> <p>Document on training strategies. Programs of training courses.</p> <p>Document with results of pilot experience.</p>	The new evidence emerges as a result of this operation (national findings, strategy design, specialized human resources training, etc.) is possible to improve policies regarding bilingual education at the primary and middle-school level.

S			
research	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Studies conducted on (i) sociolinguistic mapping; (ii) development of standard Guaraní; (iii) innovative experiences; and (iv) sociolinguistic test. Discussion of findings with 20 bilingual education specialists.</li> </ul>	<p>Research reports.</p> <p>Sociolinguistic tests.</p>	<p>The findings of the study, training strategies, and dissemination of newly developed and redrafted educational materials make it possible to improve bilingual education plans.</p>
training and refresher courses	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Production of two videos (10 copies each) with guides for their use</li> <li>- 20 teachers awarded scholarships for graduate studies in bilingual education at UCA</li> <li>- 10 teachers awarded scholarships for training at PROEIB-Andes, Bolivia</li> <li>- Two trainer training courses for 80 teachers</li> <li>- 500 educators participate in bilingual education fair</li> </ul>	<p>Videos</p> <p>Agreement with universities</p> <p>Agreement with PROEIB-Andes, Bolivia</p> <p>Agreement with ISE</p> <p>Program of courses</p> <p>Terms and conditions for organization of fair</p>	<p>The universities are interested in working on the research in this technical-cooperation operation, provide advisory services and monitoring for these activities.</p> <p>The schools and teachers in the bilingual education participate in the training offered under this operation.</p>
information and awareness campaigns	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Design of a strategy for these campaigns and testing at the pilot level.</li> </ul>	Report on findings.	
production of educational materials	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Bilingual education textbooks are prepared (primary and middle-school levels)</li> <li>- Kits are designed</li> </ul>	<p>Textbooks are redone.</p> <p>Proposed kit</p>	

istic mapping	\$89,100	Accounting system designed by PCU to administer this operation.	
d validation of a test on linguistic competence	\$37,700		
y study for a linguistic atlas and development of Guaraní	\$65,750		
of innovative experiences in bilingual	\$70,600		
new training strategies	\$28,700		
ps for undergraduate and graduate studies	\$64,500		
ining	\$87,500		
d production of training materials	\$51,750		
ps in bilingual intercultural education	\$42,250		
and sharing of experiences among bilingual	\$42,950		
on of publicity strategy	\$17,650		
d redesign of textbooks	\$72,000		
education school kit	\$12,000		

PROPOSED RESOLUTION DE- /98

PARAGUAY. NON REIMBURSABLE TECHNICAL COOPERATION FOR  
THE STRENGTHENING OF BILINGUAL EDUCATION

The Board of Executive Directors

RESOLVES:

1. That the President of the Bank, or such representative as he shall designate, is hereby authorized, in the name and on behalf of the Bank, to enter into such agreements with the Republic of Paraguay and to adopt such other measures as may be pertinent for the execution of the plan of operations referred to in Document \_\_\_\_ with respect to a non reimbursable technical cooperation for the strengthening of bilingual education.
2. That up to this sum of US\$570,000 or its equivalent in other convertible currencies, and up to the equivalent of US\$130,000 in guaranies, is authorized for the purposes of this resolution, chargeable to the net income of the Fund for Special Operations of the Bank.
3. That the above-mentioned sum is to be provided on a non reimbursable basis.